

REORIENTING ECONOMICS

Tony Lawson

Routledge

Taylor & Francis Group

LONDON AND NEW YORK

CONTENTS

Preface and acknowledgements

xv

Part I

The current orientation of the discipline and the proposed alternative

1

1 Four theses on the state of modern economics

3

Thesis 1 3

Deductivism 5

Thesis 2 8

Thesis 3 11

Ontology 12

Closed systems 12

Atomism and isolationism 13

A theory of social ontology 16

Fictions 18

Modelling successes 20

The nature of the argument 22

Thesis 4 22

Science 24

The mainstream project and science 25

Implications for the discipline of economics 27

2 An ontological turn in economics

28

Context and philosophical method 28

Contending approaches to economic methodology 29

Critical realism in economics 32

Transcendental analysis and social theory 33

Specific strategies 34

CONTENTS

<i>A theory of social ontology</i>	35
<i>Social rules</i>	36
<i>Social positions</i>	38
<i>Internal relationality</i>	39
<i>Transformation and reproduction</i>	39
<i>Reproduction over space and time</i>	40
<i>Emergence and process</i>	43
<i>Human being and subjectivity</i>	44
<i>Habitus</i>	45
<i>Consciousness</i>	46
<i>Agency/structure interaction</i>	49
<i>Forward-looking behaviour</i>	50
<i>Personal identities and meaning</i>	52
<i>Limitations of perspective</i>	53
<i>Implications of the ontological enquiry</i>	53
<i>Errors and dangers</i>	54
<i>Clarification</i>	58
<i>Directionality</i>	59
<i>The context of ontology</i>	61

3 What has realism got to do with it?

63

<i>Realist as a contrast to non-realist</i>	64
<i>Realist: more rather than less</i>	65
<i>Competing programmes</i>	65
<i>The problem with modern mainstream economics</i>	66
<i>A realist alternative</i>	68
<i>The situation in 'economic methodology'</i>	69
<i>Hausman and economics</i>	70
<i>Hausman and critical realism</i>	73
<i>Concluding remarks</i>	74

Part II

Possibilities for economics

77

4 Explanatory method for social science

79

<i>Conditions of social explanatory endeavour</i>	79
<i>Causal explanation and retroduction</i>	80
<i>The central problem of social explanation</i>	81
<i>A point of departure</i>	84
<i>Contrasts and interest</i>	86

An illustrative example 87
Scientific experiments once more 87
Plant breeding 88
Conditions of possibility of successes 89
Moving towards the social domain 89
Contrast explanation 92
Initiating the explanatory process and interest relativity 93
Directing the explanatory process 94
Discriminating between causal hypotheses 97
Facilitating explanatory research in the social domain 98
A seemingly general explanatory model 102
Demi-regularities 105
Enduring or widespread social processes 106
The feasibility of social explanation 107

5 An evolutionary economics? On borrowing from evolutionary biology

110

The allure of an evolutionary economics 110
The biological and social connection 113
Evolutionary theory and metaphor 114
*Advantages of the evolutionary model for social understanding:
a preliminary orientation* 116
The nature of social material 116
The biological model and mainstream economics 118
Natural selection 119
A biological example: the beaks of Darwin's finches 120
Towards a general evolutionary model 121
The PVRS model 123
^ *The natural selection mechanism* 125
Back to social processes 125
*The PVRS evolutionary model as a transformational model of
social activity* 126
*Disanalogies between evolutionary biology and evolutionary
social science* 129
*The distinctiveness of the natural selection or biological
evolutionary model* 130
Evolutionary explanation as a limited epistemological case 131
Economics and metaphor 133
Memes and memetics 134
Tailoring to context 139

6 Economics as a distinct social science? The nature, scope and method of economics	141
<i>A background of competing conceptions of economics</i>	141
<i>A conception of science: previous residts</i>	143
<i>Retroduction</i>	145
<i>Different aspects of science</i>	146
<i>Social science</i>	147
<i>The study of social phenomena as a distinct science?</i>	149
<i>The nature and scope of economics?: Towards a synthesis</i>	150
<i>A reassessment of Robbins' essay on the Nature and Significance of Economic Science</i>	152 i
<i>Robbins' opposition to the 'materialist' or wealth-based, formulations</i>	153
<i>Robbins and scientific generalisations</i>	154
<i>Robbins and the generalisations of economics</i>	156 >
<i>Robbins' conception arid', its mainstream interpretation as 'the science of choice or rational action</i>	158
<i>Economics as a separate or distinct social science?</i>	161
<i>A final, argument for separation</i>	162
<i>A conception of economics</i>	164
 Part III	
Heterodox traditions of modern economics	165
 7 The nature of post Keynesianism and the problem of delineating the various heterodox traditions	168
<i>The question of coherence</i>	169
<i>The more prominent features of post Keynesianism</i>	169
<i>Towards coherence</i>	170
<i>Keynes' realist orientation</i>	173
<i>Competing theories and policies within post Keynesianism</i>	177
<i>Implications of the sort of coherence found</i>	179
<i>The range of heterodox traditions: commonality and distinctions</i>	180 •
<i>A suggested basis for distinguishing amongst the heterodox traditions</i>	180
<i>The place of economics in social science</i>	181
<i>The place-of the heterodox traditions within economics</i>	182
 8 Institutional economics and realist social theorising	184
<i>Evolutionary science and ontology</i>	185
<i>Method, theory of knowledge and judgemental orientation</i>	188'
<i>Veblen's evolutionary epistemology</i>	189

Veblen as a thoroughgoing evolutionist 190
*The textual evidence for the claim that Veblen is a thoroughgoing-
evolutionist* 192
Veblen's evaluative orientation 195
Critical ontology and determinate negation 196
Veblen's support for the evolutionary method. 198
*The puzzle of Veblen's reticence about supporting
the evolutionary approach* 200
Coherence of meaning 201
The legacy of a constructive programme 202
The nature of Veblen's contribution 204
A transformational social ontology 204
Veblen's evolutionary economics 205
The place of the evolutionary method within economics 208
Evolutionary science, institutions and natural selection 210
Habits, institutions and the transformational model 212
Implications for modern old institutionalism 214
Making the most of Veblen 217

9 Feminism, realism and universalism

218

The practice of a priori universalising 218
Feminism and realism 220
An indication that realism/ontology matters 221
Illustration 1: the formalistic modelling of social processes 221
, *The particularity of formalistic modelling* 222
A structured ontology 223 ,
Conditions for closure 224
The social domain 225
Social positions and relations as integral to social reality 226
The importance of internal relations 227
Formalistic modelling as a generalised tool of social science 228
Illustration 2: positioned interests as essential to epistemic practice 229
An epistemology for an open system 229
Contrastive explanation 231
Situated knowing 233
Contrastive explanation and feminist epistemology 233
Illustration 3: the possibility of human emancipation 237
There is more to reality than the course of events and states of affairs 238
Human nature 239
Needs 240

CONTENTS

Grounding the possibility of human emancipation 241
Final comments 243

Part IV

A historical perspective on economic practice 245

10 An explanation of the mathematising tendency in modern mainstream economics 247

The phenomenon to explain 247

An explanatory first step 248

A further puzzle 250

The nature of the expanded explanatory thesis 251

Evolutionary explanation 251

The natural selection model 252

The PVRs model 254 ' '

Modern mainstream economics 256

Basic components of the social evolutionary story 256

Interactors and replicators 257

Origins 259

The drive to mathematise economics in France 260

The culture of mathematics in France 263

The environment: orientations to the mathematisation of social phenomena 264

The Impact of Jean-Baptiste Say 265

The reception of Walras 269

A shifting environment: reinterpreting mathematics 271

The political environment 273

The post-World War II US context 274

Feed-forward and feed-backward mechanisms 277

Overview and further questions 280

Notes 283

Bibliography 347

Name Index 370

Subject Index 376