

# The Human Rights Impact of the World Trade Organisation

James Harrison



• HART -  
PUBLISHING

OXFORD AND PORTLAND, OREGON

2007

# Summary Contents

<i>Acknowledgments</i>	v
<i>Contents</i>	IX
<i>List of Abbreviations</i>	vii
<b>PART 1 Key Conceptual Issues of the International Trade Law and International Human Rights Systems</b>	1
1 The Justice Dimension of the WTO	3
2 A Human Rights Methodology for Analysis	17
3 The Rationale for a Human Rights Methodology in the WTO Context	33
<b>PART 2 Key Legal Issues in Assessing the Human Rights Impact of the WTO</b>	49
4 A Legal Framework for the Analysis of the Human Rights Impacts of the WTO	51
5 Some Background Issues on Conditionality-Based Measures	69
6 Conditionality-Based Measures in Multilateral Frameworks	83
7 Unilateral Conditionality-Based Measures	97
8 A Legal Framework for Assessing Compliance and Cooperation-Based Measures	123
9 A Case Study of Compliance and Cooperation-Based Measures: The TRIPS Agreement and the Access to Essential Medicines	149
<b>PART 3 Future Strategies for the Protection and Promotion of Human Rights in the International Trade Law Context</b>	173
10 Reappraising the Protection and Promotion of Human Rights in the WTO	175
11 Raising Explicit Human Rights Arguments in WTO Dispute Settlement Proceedings	187
12 Broader Strategies for Ensuring Trade Law Rules do not Negatively Impact upon Human Rights	225
Concluding Remarks	247
<i>Bibliography</i>	253
<i>Index</i>	265

# Contents

<i>Acknowledgments</i>	v
<i>Summary Contents</i>	vii
<i>List of Abbreviations</i>	xv

<b>PART 1 Key Conceptual Issues of the International Trade Law and International Human Rights Systems</b>	1
1 The Justice Dimension of the WTO	3
I. Introduction	3
II. The Broader Context	4
III. The Development of the International System — History and Ethos	7
IV. The Formation of the WTO	9
V. Concepts of Justice in the WTO	10
VI. International Human Rights Law Obligations in a Trade Law Context	14
2 A Human Rights Methodology for Analysis	17
I. Introduction	17
II. A Legal Positivist Approach to Human Rights	17
III. Differentiating Human Rights from Other Moral Theories	19
IV. Challenges to the Use of a Human Rights Methodology for Assessing Trade Law Rules	21
V. The Importance of a Conception of Human Rights that Includes Equal Recognition of Economic, Social and Cultural Rights	26
VI. Conclusions	32
3 The Rationale for a Human Rights Methodology in the WTO Context	33
I. Introduction	33
I. Traditional Hostility to Human Rights and Trade Linkage	33
III. The Need for a Re-evaluation of the Human Rights and Trade Relationship?	35
IV. The Potential of International Trade Rules to Enhance Human Rights	38
V. The Importance of an Explicit Human Rights Discourse	41
A. Does Open Trade Work in All Situations?	41
B. The Reality of the Current WTO System	43
C. The Added Value of a Human Rights Approach to International Trade	45

D. The Importance of an Explicit Human Rights Discourse for a Holistic Conception of Human Rights	46
VI. Conclusions	47
 PART 2 Key Legal Issues in Assessing the Human Rights Impact of the WTO	49
4    A Legal Framework for the Analysis of the Human Rights Impacts of the WTO	51
I. Introduction	51
II. International Trade Law, International Human Rights and the International Legal System	51
III. Accounting for Human Rights in the Trade Law Context	54
IV. Disputed Hierarchies: Human Rights and Trade Law Norms and Standards	56
V. <i>ius Cogens</i> and <i>Erga Omnes</i> Obligations	58
VI. A Methodology for Dealing with Human Rights in the Trade Law Context	61
A. Conditionality-Based Measures	62
B. Compliance-Based Measures	62
C. Cooperation-Based Measures	63
VII. A Rationale for the Proposed Methodology for Dealing with Human Rights In the Trade Law Context	64
VIII. Conclusions	67
 5    Some Background Issues on Conditionality-Based Measures	69
I. Introduction	69
II. Typologies of Conditionality-Based Measures	70
III. General Trade Restrictions	73
IV. Tailored Trade Restrictions	76
V. Conclusions	81
 6    Conditionality-Based Measures in Multilateral Frameworks	83
I. Introduction	83
II. Trade Restrictions Authorised by the United Nations	84
III. Trade Restrictions Authorised by the International Labour Organisation	87
IV. The Kimberley Process Certification Scheme	92
V. Conclusions	95
 7    Unilateral Conditionality-Based Measures	97
I. Introduction	97
II. Treatment of Unilateral Trade Restrictions Under General International Law and International Human Rights Law	97

III. Treatment of Unilateral Trade Measures under WTO law	102
IV. The Potential for WTO Rules to Prevent Unilateral Trade Restrictions	102
V. The Potential for WTO Rules to Allow Unilateral Trade Restrictions	105
A. Human Rights Linkage in Regional and Bilateral Trade Agreements and Generalised Systems of Preferences	107
B. Regional and Bilateral Trade Agreements	108
C. Generalised Systems of Preferences	111
1. The US's Generalised System of Preferences	112
2. The EU's Generalised System of Preferences	113
D. India's WTO Challenge to the EU's Generalised System of Preferences	114
E. The EU's Generalised System of Preferences 2006-2015	117
VI. A Role for the WTO in Overseeing Unilateral Conditionality-Based Measures?	119
VII. Conclusions	121
8 A Legal Framework for Assessing Compliance and Cooperation-Based Measures	123
I. Introduction	123
II. Particular Issues Relating to Compliance and Cooperation-Based Measures	124
III. The General Methodology of the Reports of the Office of the High Commissioner for Human Rights (OHCHR)	127
IV. Analysis of the OHCHR Approach to Assessing the Human Rights Impact of WTO Agreements	128
V. Interpretation of Obligations that Arise from Provisions of the International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights	131
VI. Different Methodological Approaches of International Trade Law and International Human Rights Law	136
VII. Differing Principles of Non-Discrimination	140
VIII. Mechanisms in the International Trade Agreements for Overcoming Potential Human Rights Violations	143
IX. Limitations of These Mechanisms	145
X. Conclusions	147
9 A Case Study of Compliance and Cooperation-Based Measures: The TRIPS Agreement and the Access to Essential Medicines	149
I. Introduction	149
II. The Effect of Intellectual Property Protection on Access to Essential Medicines	149
III. A Human Rights Approach to Essential Medicines	153
IV. A Trade Law Approach to Essential Medicines	155

V. Use of the TRIPS Agreement to Enforce Intellectual Property Rights	157
VI. The Doha Declaration Negotiations	159
VII. The Impact of a Human Rights Discourse on the TRIPS and Access to Medicines Debate	163
VIII. Can the Doha Declaration and Decision on Paragraph 6 Effectively Protect Developing Countries' Right to Protect the Public Health of Their Populations?	165
IX. Conclusions: Lessons to be Learned for other WTO Agreements	168
 <b>PART 3 Future Strategies for the Protection and Promotion of Human Rights in the International Trade Law Context</b>	 173
 10 Reappraising the Protection and Promotion of Human Rights in the WTO	 175
I. Introduction	175
II. Different Approaches for Different Types of Human Rights Measures	175
III. Similarities in the Treatment of All Trade-Related Human Rights Measures	179
IV. WTO Trade Rules Versus Rules Negotiated Outside the WTO Framework	180
V. Strategies for a More Systematic Human Rights Approach to International Trade Law Rules	182
 11 Raising Explicit Human Rights Arguments in WTO Dispute Settlement Proceedings	 187
I. Introduction	187
II. The Jurisdictional Competence of the WTO Dispute Settlement Bodies	188
III. Methodologies for Raising Human Rights Arguments in WTO Dispute Settlement Proceedings	189
IV. Mechanisms for Raising Human Rights Issues through WTO Agreements	192
V. Non-Discrimination Provisions of WTO Agreements	192
VI. General Exception Clauses	197
VII. Key Features of the General Exception Clauses	197
VIII. The Human Rights Applicability of the Public Morals Exception	200
A. Determining the Scope of Article 31.3(c)	200
B. An Assessment of the 'Ordinary Meaning' to be given to the term 'Public Morals'	205

C. Relevant 'Context' including the Preamble to the Treaties and WTO Case Law on the Terms	205
D. Supplementary Means of Interpretation	209
E. Conclusions on the Potential Applicability of the Public Morals Exception for Human Rights Arguments at the WTO	211
F. Approaches to Different Types of Human Rights Measures and Their Jurisdictional Context	212
IX. Human Rights Interpretation of the Public Morals Exception	214
A. Problems of a Trade Law Methodology for Raising Human Rights Law Arguments	215
B. Mechanisms for Advancing a Human Rights Interpretation	219
X. Conclusions	221
12 Broader Strategies for Ensuring Trade Law Rules do not Negatively Impact upon Human Rights	225
I. Introduction	225
II. Monitoring the Impact of Trade Agreements on the Protection and Promotion of Human Rights	226
III. Improving the Specificity of Human Rights in the Trade Law Context	234
IV. Clarifying the (Potential) Impact of Trade Agreements on the Protection And Promotion of Human Rights	235
V. The Value of Express Reference to Human Rights in the WTO Context	238
VI. Procedural WTO Issues in the WTO Context	242
VII. Conclusions	245
Concluding Remarks	247
I. Complex Inter-Linkages Require Multi-Faceted Future Strategies	247
II. Exploration Beyond Conflict Resolution	249
III. A Policy-Orientated Approach to Future Strategies	250
<i>Bibliography</i>	253
<i>Index</i>	265