

Markets for Clean Air

The U.S. Acid Rain Program

A. DENNY ELLERMAN

*Massachusetts Institute of
Technology*

RICHARD SCHMALENSEE

*Massachusetts Institute of
Technology*

ELIZABETH M. BAILEY

*National Economic Research
Associates, Inc.*

PAUL L. JOSKOW

*Massachusetts Institute of
Technology*

JUAN-PABLO

MONTERO

Catholic University of Chile

Contents

<i>List of illustrations</i>	<i>page xi</i>
<i>List of Tables</i>	<i>xiii</i>
<i>Preface</i>	<i>xvii</i>
<i>Acknowledgments</i>	<i>xxi</i>
 Part I. Background	 1
1 A Market-Based Experiment	3
A Star Is Bom (?)	3
The U.S. Acid Rain Program	5
Overview of the Book	9
2 A Political History of Federal Acid Rain	
Legislation	13
Early History of Federal Regulation of SO ₂	
Emissions	13
Legislative History of the 1990 Acid Rain	
Program	21
3 The Political Economy of Allowance	
Allocations	31
Competing Theories of Distributive Politics	31
The Allowance "Pie"	36
Phase I Allowance Allocations	39
Phase II Allowances	43
Alternative Phase II Allocation Rules	48

Gainers and Losers from Alternative Phase II Allocation Rules	53
Hypothetical Votes on Phase II Allocations	61
Estimating Political Determinants of Allowance Allocations	64
A Majoritarian Equilibrium	75
4 The Pre-1995 Trend in SO ₂ Emissions	77
Expected versus Actual SO ₂ Emissions	77
The Economics of Coal Choice	80
Historical Patterns in Rail and Coal Prices	82
Econometric Analysis	89
Rail-rate Deregulation Reduces SO ₂ Emissions	104
Part II. Compliance and Trading	107
5 Title IV Compliance and Emission Reductions, 1995-97	109
Perfect Compliance and Significant Emission Reductions	109
Counterfactual Emissions	110
Emissions Reductions Resulting from Title IV	118
6 Emissions Trading: The Effect on Abatement Behavior	141
Unit-level Emissions Trading	141
Some Classifications and Definitions	143
Overcompliance	149
Excess Allowances	151
Current Demand for Allowances	154
Banking of Allowances	161
From Internal to External Trading	165
7 Emissions Trading: Development of the Allowance Market	167
Annual EPA Auctions	169
Emergence of the Private Allowance Market	172
Influence of State Electric Utility Regulation on Allowance Trading	190
The Allowance Market Works	195
8 Title IV's Voluntary Compliance Program	197
Patterns of Voluntary Compliance	198

The Decision to Volunteer	203
Effects on the SO ₂ Market	213
Implications for Program Design	215
Adverse Selection Is a Problem	219
9 Cost of Compliance with Title IV in Phase I	221
Confusion about Control Costs	221
Assumptions and Data Sources	223
Estimates of Phase I Costs of Compliance	228
The Cost of Abatement by Scrubbing	235
The Cost of Abatement by Switching to	
Lower-Sulfur Coal	242
Monitoring Costs	248
Part III. Questions and Implications	251
10 Cost Savings from Emissions Trading	253
Cost Savings Is the Goal	253
Evidence of Cost Savings	254
Basic Analytic Framework	260
Positioning the Title IV Cost Curves	270
Cost-Saving Estimates	280
Substantial and Real Cost Savings	294
11 Errors, Imperfections, and Allowance Prices	297
Unexpected Behavior at Allowance Prices	297
Some Unconvincing Hypotheses	299
Expectation Errors and Overinvestment	302
Puzzles and Future Price Trends	309
A Better Alternative Policy?	312
12 Concluding Observations	314
Trading Can Work	315
Politics Don't Matter	316
Markets Can Develop	317
Trading Handles Surprises	319
Opt-in Provisions Are Tricky	320
Extrapolate with Care	321
<i>Appendix: Effect of Title IV on SO₂ Emissions and</i>	
<i>Heat Input</i> by Susanne M. Schennach	323
Introduction	323

Contents

Data	324
Specification of the Model	324
Results	329
Effect of Title IV on Utilization	334
Conclusion	341
<i>Bibliography</i>	343
<i>Index</i>	353