
RESCUING JUSTICE AND EQUALITY

G. A. Cohen

Harvard University Press

Cambridge, Massachusetts

London, England

2008

C

LONG TABLE OF CONTENTS

Preface	xv
Introduction	1
1 <i>The Big Issue</i>	1
2 <i>Rescuing Equality and Justice</i>	2
3 <i>Some Methodological Disagreements</i>	3
4 <i>Justice and Fairness</i>	6
5 <i>The Two Standpoints</i>	8
6 <i>The Greatness of John Rawls</i>	11
7 <i>An Outline of the Book</i>	14

I

RESCUING EQUALITY FROM . . .

1 The Incentives Argument	27
I The Incentives Argument, the Interpersonal Test, and Community	27
1 <i>Incentives, the Difference Principle, and Equality</i>	27
2 <i>Nigel Lawson's Tax Cut</i>	34
3 <i>On Uttering Arguments in Variable Interpersonal Settings</i>	35
4 <i>The Kidnapper's Argument</i>	38
5 <i>Community, and the Interpersonal Test</i>	41
6 <i>Does the Incentives Argument Pass the Interpersonal Test?</i>	46

II	Testing the Incentives Argument	48
7	<i>What Makes the Minor Premise of the Incentives Argument True?</i>	48
8	<i>Why the Incentives Argument Fails the Interpersonal Test</i>	54
9	<i>The Incentives Argument and Bad Faith</i>	63
10	<i>Should the Poor Reject the Incentives Argument?</i>	64
11	<i>First Persons and Third Persons</i>	65
III	Incentives and the Difference Principle	68
12	<i>Strict and Lax Readings of the Difference Principle</i>	68
13	<i>Why Just People Must Practice the Strict Difference Principle</i>	69
14	<i>The Difference Principle and "Daily Life"</i>	74
15	<i>Dignity, Fraternity, and the Difference Principle</i>	76
16	<i>The Difference Principle and "Mutual Indifference"</i>	80
17	<i>The Difference Principle and the Unjust Society</i>	82
2	The Pareto Argument	87
1	<i>Introduction</i>	87
2	<i>The Argument Expounded</i>	91
3	<i>The Argument Challenged</i>	97
4	<i>The Argument Rejected</i>	101
5	<i>Labor Burden in the Metric of Equality</i>	106
6	<i>Inconsistent Metrics</i>	107
7	<i>Raising the Baseline</i>	109
8	<i>Impartiality and Mutual Advantage</i>	110
9	<i>Inequality: A Necessary Evil?</i>	113
10	<i>Conclusion</i>	115
3	The Basic Structure Objection	116
1	<i>"The Personal Is Political"</i>	116
2	<i>Incentives and the Difference Principle: A Review of the Argument</i>	118
3	<i>The Basic Structure Objection</i>	124
4	<i>The Basic Structure Objection: A Preliminary Reply</i>	129
5	<i>The Basic Structure Objection: A More Fundamental Reply</i>	132
6	<i>Who Is to Blame?</i>	140
7	<i>Coercive and Noncoercive Social Structures</i>	144
	<i>Appendix I: More on Coercion and the Basic Structure</i>	146
	<i>Appendix II: The Basic Structure Is a Structure</i>	149

4	The Difference Principle	151
1	<i>Introduction</i>	151
2	<i>Reconsidering the Difference Principle</i>	152
3	<i>The Moral Arbitrariness Case for the Difference Principle Contradicts Its Content</i>	156
4	<i>A Recent Argument for the Difference Principle</i>	161
5	<i>A Contractarian Argument for the Difference Principle</i>	163
6	<i>What Is the Moral Arbitrariness of Talent Differences Supposed to Show?</i>	166
7	<i>Chamberlain and Pareto</i>	169
8	<i>"Can't" or "Won't"</i>	170
9	<i>Human Nature and Constructivism</i>	177

5	The Freedom Objection	181
1	<i>Introduction</i>	181
2	<i>Equality, Pareto, and Freedom of Choice of Occupation</i>	183
3	<i>Equality, Pareto, and Rawlsian Liberty</i>	196
4	<i>Equality, Pareto, and Freedom in Work</i>	205
5	<i>The Unequal-Income Inference</i>	214
6	<i>Blood, Kidneys, and Sex</i>	223

II

RESCUING JUSTICE FROM . . .

6	The Facts	229
1	<i>A Statement of My Thesis</i>	229
2	<i>Facts, and Some Meta-Ethical Questions</i>	230
3	<i>What Most Philosophers Think about Facts and Principles</i>	231
4	<i>My Thesis: Ultimate Principles Are Fact-Insensitive; and the Clarity of Mind Requirement</i>	232
5	<i>An Illustration of the Thesis</i>	233
6	<i>More Illustration of the Thesis</i>	234
7	<i>The Argument for the Thesis</i>	236
	7(i) <i>A Defense of the First Premise of the Argument</i>	237
	7(ii) <i>A Defense of the Second Premise of the Argument</i>	239
	7(iii) <i>A Defense of the Third Premise of the Argument</i>	241
8	<i>Still Further Illustration and Defense of the Thesis</i>	244

9	<i>The Clarity of Mind Requirement</i>	245
10	<i>The Merely Logical Priority of Fact-Insensitive Principles</i>	247
11	<i>The Conditional Character of the Thesis</i>	247
12	<i>On "Is" and "Ought"</i>	248
13	<i>On "Ought" and "Can"</i>	250
14	<i>Possible Misunderstandings of the Thesis</i>	254
15	<i>The Thesis Is Not a Causal Thesis</i>	254
16	<i>The Thesis Is Not a Psychological Thesis</i>	256
17	<i>The Thesis Is Neutral with Respect to Central Meta-Ethical Disputes</i>	257
18	<i>Some Bad Rawlsian Arguments That Reject My Thesis</i>	258
19	<i>Utilitarianism, and the Difference Between Fundamental Principles and Rules of Regulation</i>	263
20	<i>The Interest of My Thesis</i>	268
	<i>Appendix: God</i>	272
7	Constructivism	274
1	<i>Introduction, and Preliminary Overview</i>	274
2	<i>Fundamental Principles of Justice and Constructivism</i>	279
3	<i>Fundamental Principles of Justice and Constructivism: Matters Arising</i>	292
4	<i>Is Justice the First Virtue of Social Institutions?</i>	302
5	<i>Two Illustrations: Social Insurance, Property Taxation</i>	308
6	<i>Justice and the Pareto Principle</i>	315
7	<i>Justice and Constraints, Notably Publicity, on Choice of Optimal Rules of Regulation</i>	323
8	<i>Justice and Stability</i>	327
9	<i>The "Circumstances of Justice"</i>	331
10	<i>Conclusion</i>	337
	<i>Appendix: Is the Original Position Justification of the Two Principles Contractarian?</i>	337
8	The Publicity Argument	344
1	<i>Andrew Williams on Publicity and the Egalitarian Ethos</i>	344
2	<i>An Anatomy of Williams's Argument</i>	346
3	<i>Racism, Justice, and Assurance</i>	348
4	<i>Does Assurance Require Williams-type Determinacy?</i>	351
5	<i>Does Justice Require Precision?</i>	354
6	<i>Egalitarian Ethoses at Home, in the Market, and in the State</i>	359
7	<i>Publicity as a Desideratum of Justice</i>	364
8	<i>Publicity and Occupational Choice</i>	368

General Appendix: Replies to Critics	373
1 <i>Public and Private Action</i>	374
2 <i>The Site of Justice Is Not Where It Gets Caused</i>	377
3 <i>Prior Principles, Self-Respect, and Equality</i>	381
4 <i>Incentives and Prerogatives</i>	387
5 <i>Pogge's Mastergoals and Supergoals</i>	394
6 <i>Pogge's Failure to Address the Standard Case</i>	398
7 <i>The Currency of Distributive Justice and Incentive Inequality</i>	403
8 <i>Earlier Discussions of Rawls on Incentives</i>	406
 Bibliography	 413
Credits	422
Name Index	423
Subject Index	425