

Fritz Breuss, Stefan Griller,
Erich Vranes (eds.)

The Banana Dispute

An Economic and Legal Analysis

SpringerWienNewYork



Summary of Contents

I. Substantive Issues under WTO Law

Erich Vranes

From *Bananas I* to the 2001 *Bananas* Settlement:
A Factual and Procedural Analysis of the WTO
Proceedings 1

Erich Vranes

The *Banana* Dispute: Fundamental Issues under WTO
Law 39

II. The *Bananas* Cases and WTO Enforcement: Labour Pains or a Misconceived System?

Erich Vranes

Cross Retaliation under GATS and TRIPS - An Optimal
Enforcement Device for Developing Countries? 113

Fritz Breuss

WTO Dispute Settlement in Practice -
An Economic Assessment 131

III. The *Banana* Dispute and Fundamental Issues under EC Law

Erich Vranes

Introduction to the Problems of EU Fundamental Rights
Protection, the Status of WTO Law within the EU, and
Community Liability for Infringements of WTO Law 185

Erich Vranes

European Human Rights Protection and the Contested
Relationship of the ECJ and National Courts -
Convergent Solutions under International, European and
National Law? 195

<i>Stefan Griller</i> Enforcement and Implementation of WTO Law in the European Union	247
<i>Birgit Schoißwohl</i> The ECJ's <i>Atlanta</i> Judgment: Establishing a Principle of Non-Liability?	309
IV. Economic Implications	
<i>Harald Badinger / Fritz Breuss / Bernhard Mahlberg</i> Welfare Implications of the EU's Common Organization of the Market in Bananas for EU Member States	357
V. Summary and Conclusions	
<i>Harald Badinger / Fritz Breuss / Stefan Griller / Bernhard Mahlberg / Birgit Schoißwohl / Erich Vranes</i> The Overall Perspective: Legal, Economic and Policy Conclusions	419
Abbreviations	439
List of Authors	443

Table of Contents

Part I

Substantive Issues under WTO law

Erich Vranes

**From *Bananas I* to the 2001 *Bananas* Settlement:
A Factual and Procedural Analysis of the WTO Proceedings**

I.	Economic and Political Background	1
A.	The Situation before the Introduction of the EC Common Banana Market Organisation	1
B.	The Framework: Common Agricultural Policy and Common Market Organisations.....	4
II.	Outline of the EC Banana Regime	6
A.	International Commitments	6
B.	The EC Common Market Organisation for Bananas	9
1.	Quotas and "Types" of Bananas	10
2.	The Administration of the Quotas: Licensing Procedures	17
III.	Overview of WTO Proceedings	20
A.	Bananas I (1993).....	21
B.	Bananas II (1994)	21
C.	Bananas III (1997) - The Substantive Decisions.....	22
D.	Bananas III - Enforcement Impasses	22
E.	Authorisation of First Cross Retaliation	29
F.	The New Import Regime	29
	References.....	34

Erich Vranes

The Banana Dispute - Fundamental Issues under WTO Law

I.	Bananas I and II.....	39
II.	Procedural Preliminary Questions Raised in the <i>Bananas III</i> Context	40



A. Requirement of Legal Interest: The Right of the US to Bring a Claim	41
B. Adequacy of Consultations	44
C. Specificity of the Request for Panel Establishment.....	48
D. Presence of Outside Counsel.....	53
III. Substantive Issues under GATT and other Multilateral Trade Agreements.....	56
A. The Allocation of Quota Shares: GATT Articles XIII and I, the Lomé Waiver and the Agreement on Agriculture in Focus.....	58
1. Infractions of the Allocation Rules under GATT Article XIII.....	59
2. Relationship between Article XIII and the Lomé Waiver on Article I Commitments	62
3. Relationship between the GATT and Schedules on Agricultural Products	66
4. Relationship between GATT and the Agreement on Agriculture	67
B. Tariff Issues: Infractions of Article I.....	68
C. Licensing Procedures: Infractions of GATT, the Licensing Agreement and the TRIMs Agreement.....	70
1. Scope of the Licensing Agreement	71
2. The Inter-relationship of GATT, the Licensing Agreement and the TRIMs Agreement	72
3. Operator Categories and MTA disciplines	73
a) Infractions of GATT Article III:4	73
b) The Relationship between GATT Article III:4 and the TRIMs Agreement.....	76
c) Infractions of Article I GATT and the Application of the Lomé Waiver	82
d) Infractions of Article X:3(a) of the GATT.....	85
4. Activity Functions and MTA Disciplines	86
5. Export Certificates and MFN Treatment.....	88
6. Hurricane Licences and MTA disciplines	89
a) Infractions of GATT Articles I:1 and III:4	90
b) Infractions of Article 1.3 of the Licensing Agreement.....	91
7. Other Claims	92
IV. Substantive Issues under GATS.....	93
A. Preliminary Issues of Precedential Value	94
1. The Scope of GATS - Is there an Overlap with GATT?.....	94
2. Wholesale Trade Services and the Coverage of GATS.....	96
3. The Scope of the MFN Clause under GATS - de jure or de facto Discrimination?	97

B. The EC Licensing Regime and GATS MFN and National Treatment Requirements	98
1. Operator Categories and National Treatment under GATS.....	98
2. Operator Categories and Most-Favoured-Nation-Treatment under GATS	102
3. Activity Functions and GATS Non-Discrimination Disciplines	103
4. Export Certificates and GATS Non-Discrimination Disciplines	104
5. Hurricane Licences and GATS Non-Discrimination Disciplines	104
References.....	105

Part II

The *Bananas* Cases and WTO Enforcement: Labour Pains or a Misconceived System?

Erich Vranes

Cross Retaliation under GATS and TRIPS – An Optimal Enforcement Device for Developing Countries?

I. Background	113
II. The Precedent.....	116
A. General Principles.....	116
B. Application of the Principles to the Case at Issue.....	118
III. Emerging Problems	122
A. Is Cross Retaliation compatible with WIPO Law and Public International Law?	122
B. Problems under Domestic Law	127
C. Economic Problems	127
References.....	128

Fritz Breuss

WTO Dispute Settlement in Practice – An Economic Assessment

I. Introduction	131
-----------------------	-----

XII Table of Contents

II. Is the WTO Dispute Settlement System Biased?	133
III. From Trade Talks to Trade Wars.....	140
A. An Economic Theory of WTO.....	140
B. Political-Economy of Trade Wars.....	146
C. Who Wins Tariff Wars?	151
IV. Towards an Economic Theory of Dispute Settlement	155
V. The Dimension of the Actual "Trade Wars": <i>Hormones</i> , <i>Bananas</i> , and <i>FSC</i>	161
A. The <i>Hormones</i> Case	161
B. The <i>Bananas</i> Case.....	167
C. The <i>FSC</i> Case.....	174
VI. How to Improve the WTO-DSU Sanctions Mechanism?	178
References	182

Part III

**The *Banana* Dispute and Fundamental
Issues under EC Law**

Erich Vranes

**Introduction to the Problems of EU Fundamental Rights
Protection, the Status of WTO Law within the EU, and
Community Liability for WTO Infringements**

I. General Remarks	185
II. Supremacy of EC Law, National Funda- mental Rights Protection, and the Status of GATT/WTO Law in the EU	186
A. Proceedings Initiated by Germany	186
B. The Challenge of Supremacy of EC Law by German Tribunals.....	187
1. Actions by T-Port.....	187
2. Actions by Atlanta.....	190
III. Community Liability for Violations of WTO Law?	192
References	193



Erich Vranes

European Human Rights Protection and the Contested Relationship of the ECJ and National Courts

Convergent Solutions under International, European and National Law?

I. Introduction	195
II. Van Gend and Costa/ENEL: The Building Blocks of European Constitutionalisation and the Integration Dynamics.....	198
A. Direct Effect of Community Law	198
B. Supremacy of EC Law	200
C. Van Gend and Costa/ENEL: The Fundaments of Constitutionalization and Potential Constitutional Clashes.....	200
III. Solange I, Solange II and the Maastricht-Judgment.....	203
A. Solange I - Judicial Euroscepticism.....	203
B. Solange II - Judicial Re-orientation	206
C. The Maastricht Judgment - Additional Barriers to Integration.....	208
1. The Human Rights Barrier.....	209
2. Limits to EC Competences and the Final Arbiter Problem.....	210
IV. Alcan and Bananas	212
A. Alcan - Prelude to a Change in Jurisprudence?	212
B. The June 2000 Bananas Decision - A Redefined Approach to Human Rights Protection?	215
V. Critical Analysis and Comments	219
VI. Further Thoughts: The "Reserve" Competence and the Appropriate Standard of Review	224
A. Preconditions of Review	224
B. Standard of Review and Additional Procedural Requirements	235
VII. Summary of Results and Concluding Remarks	237
References	239

Stefan Griller

**Enforcement and Implementation of WTO Law
in the European Union**

I. Introduction.....	247
II. The Jurisprudence Regarding the Old GATT 1947	248
A. Main Features and Exceptional Characteristics.....	248
B. Criticism and WTO Perspectives	252
III. The Cornerstone of Continuity: <i>Portugal vs. Council</i>	254
IV. Consequences and Palliatives	259
A. Direct Effect	259
B. Extra-Contractual Liability	261
C. The Intention to Implement and Express Reference to WTO Law	262
D. WTO Compliant Interpretation.....	268
E. Actions Against EU Member States.....	270
V. Some Critical Remarks.....	273
A. The Binding Force of Dispute Settlement Decisions Revisited.....	273
B. Reciprocity.....	279
C. Interim Conclusions	288
D. Individual Rights	294
VI. Conclusions.....	300
References	301

Birgit Schoißwohl

**The ECJ's *Atlanta* Judgment: Establishing a Principle
of Non-Liability?**

I. Introduction.....	309
II. Direct Effect as a Precondition of Liability?	315
A. Recent Case Law	315
B. Critical Comments.....	316
C. Function of the Direct Effect Criterion.....	318
D. Parallels to <i>Francovich</i>	320
E. Evaluation	322
III. Reasons Favouring Acknowledgment of the EC's Liability.....	324
A. Legal Protection	324
B. Binding Effect of WTO Law.....	326
C. Duty of Loyalty Pursuant to Article 10 TEC.....	327

D. Intentional and Knowing Injury	330
E. Overall Evaluation	330
IV. Community Liability Pursuant Article 288 para 2 TEC	331
A. Introductory Remarks	331
B. WTO Law as "Schutznorm"?	332
C. Sufficiently Serious Breach of Law	334
D. Causal Link	339
E. Atlanta: No Liability	340
V. Liability for Legal Acts	341
A. Comparative Overview	342
B. Doctrine of „Special Sacrifice“ in EC Law	344
C. Liability for Special Sacrifice Suffered as a Consequence of the EC's Policy in External Relations	346
VI. Outlook	349
References	349

Part IV

Economic Implications

Harald Badinger, Fritz Breuss, Bernhard Mahlberg

Welfare Implications of the EU's Common Organization of the Market in Bananas for EU Member States

I. Introduction	357
II. The Banana Trade Regimes in the EU	359
A. Import Regulation before the EU's Common Market Regulation	359
1. Free Trade Countries	359
2. Tariff Imposing Countries	360
3. ACP Supplied Countries	360
4. Countries with Own Production	362
B. The EU's Common Organization of the Market in Bananas since 1993	368
III. Welfare Effects of the EU Banana Market Regime	368
A. The Theoretical Model	368
B. Empirical Implementation	371
1. The General Procedure for the Free Traders	372
2. Specific Procedure for the Non-Free Traders	374
3. Data	378

IV. Empirical Results.....	380
A. Free Trade Countries	381
B. Tariff Imposing Countries.....	384
C. ACP Supplied Countries	387
D. Countries with Own Production	389
E. Welfare Impact on All Groups and the EU	393
F. The World-Wide Impact of the EU's Banana Import Regime – Some Illustrative Figures	398
V. Conclusions.....	405
References	407
Appendices	409

Part V

Summary and Conclusions

*Harald Badinger, Fritz Breuss, Stefan Griller, Bernhard Mahlberg,
Birgit Schoißwohl, Erich Vranes*

The Overall Perspective: Economic, Legal and Policy Conclusions

I. Procedural and Substantive WTO Law Issues	419
A. Preliminary Procedural Issues	419
B. Substantive Issues under GATT and other MTAs.....	421
C. Substantive Issues under GATS	426
II. Issues in WTO Enforcement.....	427
A. Cross Retaliation	427
B. Economic Assessment of Dispute Settlement	429
III. Issues in EC Law	430
A. Human Rights Protection and the "Final Arbiter in Europe" Problem.....	430
B. Judicial Enforcement of WTO Law in the EC	433
C. (Non-)Liability for Violations of WTO Law?	435
IV. Welfare Effects	437
V. Concluding Remarks.....	437
Abbreviations	439
List of Authors	443