

TIM JOSLING DONNA ROBERTS DAVID ORDEN

Food Regulation and Trade

Toward a
Safe and Open
Global System

INSTITUTE FOR INTERNATIONAL ECONOMICS
Washington, DC
March 2004

Contents

Preface	ix
Acknowledgments	xiii
1 Food Regulation in an Open Economy	1
Globalization of the Food Supply	3
Objectives and Organization of This Book	7
2 Trade-Related Regulations in the Global Food System	13
Economic Rationales for Food Regulation	14
Classification of Regulations	16
Risk Analysis and Appropriate Degrees of Caution	25
Trade Effects of Food Regulations	26
Science and Economics in Risk-Reducing Regulations	28
Capture of Regulations by Producers or Consumers	31
Welfare-Enhancing Regulation of Food Trade	32
3 Global Food Regulatory Framework	35
Multilateral Governance of Food Regulation	35
The SPS Agreement	40
The TBT Agreement	51
The TRIPS Agreement	56
Enforcement of the Multilateral Disciplines	59
The Doha Development Agenda Negotiations	75
4 Control of Animal and Plant Pests and Diseases	77
Animal and Plant Pests and Diseases and Their Control	78
Trade Issues Related to Agricultural Pests and Diseases	80

Animal and Plant Regulations in Practice	82
Managing Agricultural Trade in the Presence of Risks	98
5 Food Safety and Control of Human Health Hazards	101
Food Safety Regulation	102
Trade Issues and Food Safety	104
Controlling Natural Food-Borne Pathogens	106
The Health Effects of Yield-Enhancing Inputs	114
Managing Trade-Related Food Safety Issues	125
6 Regulating Quality Through Labeling and Standards	127
Private and Public Provision of Information	128
Food Quality Regulations in Practice	131
Impacts of Labeling and Standards on Trade	146
7 Emerging Food Regulation Issues	151
Scope for Trade Conflicts	152
Labeling Process Attributes	155
International Regulation of Process Attributes	156
Recent Regulatory Developments: Genetically Modified Foods, Organics, and Animal Welfare	160
The Challenges Ahead	181
8 Toward a Safe and Open Global Food Supply	185
Assessment of the State of Food Regulation	187
Role of the WTO in the Food Regulatory Framework	193
Recommendations for Improving Regulation	199
Seizing the Opportunities from Trade	205
References	207
Acronyms	217
Index	219
Tables	
Table 1.1 Trade patterns in agricultural, forestry, and fishery products	4
Table 2.1 Classification scheme for food regulations	18
Table 3.1 Number of complaints about regulations brought before the WTO's SPS Committee, 1995–2001	61
Table 3.2 WTO disputes over regulation of agricultural product safety and quality, 1995–2002	64
Table 3.3 Decisions in the four SPS cases heard by WTO panels and the Appellate Body	70
Table 4.1 Risk reduction under a systems approach to Mexican avocado imports	84

Table 4.2	Cases of BSE, 1989–2002	93
Table 6.1	Private and public roles in four quality labeling regimes	131
Table 6.2	Multilateral conventions for the protection of geographical indications	134
Table 6.3	Government country-of-origin labeling requirements, selected countries, 1998	141
Table 7.1	Private and public roles in three process-attribute labeling regimes	156
Table 7.2	TBT Committee discussions on process-attribute regulations, 1997–2001	158
Table 7.3	Examples of animal welfare regulations in selected countries	177

Figures

Figure 2.1	Regulatory underprotection and overprotection	29
Figure 3.1	GATT/WTO legal infrastructure for food regulations and standards	38

Boxes

Box 2.1	Trade-based food regulatory instruments	22
Box 5.1	Common bacteria that can cause food-borne illnesses	107
Box 6.1	Nutritional labeling components in the United States and Canada	145