

THE HUMAN RIGHT TO WATER

A Legal Comparative Perspective
at the International, Regional
and Domestic Level

Jimena MURILLO CHAVARRO

intersentia

Cambridge – Antwerp – Portland

CONTENTS

<i>List of Abbreviations</i>	xiii
<i>Table of Cases and Other Materials</i>	xv
<i>Table of Treaties and Other Instruments</i>	xxiii
Chapter 1.	
General Introduction	1
1.1. Research questions	3
1.2. Methodology	4
1.3. Structure of the study	6
Chapter 2.	
Emergence, Definition and Core Content of the Human Right to Water	7
2.1. Introduction	7
2.2. Emergence of the human right to water	8
2.3. Definition and core content of the human right to water	17
2.3.1. Elements of the Right to Water	19
2.3.1.1. Availability	19
2.3.1.2. Quality and acceptability	22
2.3.1.3. Accessibility	25
2.3.1.3.1. Information accessibility	25
2.3.1.3.2. Physical accessibility	25
2.3.1.3.3. Affordability	27
2.4. State's obligations concerning the human right to water	29
2.4.1. Typology of human rights obligations at national level	29
2.4.1.1. Obligation to respect	31
2.4.1.2. Obligation to protect	32
2.4.1.3. Obligation to fulfil	36
2.4.1.4. Core obligations	38
2.5. Conclusions	40
Chapter 3.	
Recognition of the Human Right to Water at the International Level	43
3.1. Introduction	43
3.2. Recognition of the right to water	44
Intersentia	vii

3.2.1.	Implicit recognition of the right to water	44
3.2.1.1.	Universal Declaration of Human Rights (1948)	44
3.2.1.2.	International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights (1966)	46
3.2.1.3.	International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights (1966)	48
3.2.2.	Explicit recognition of the right to water	54
3.2.2.1.	Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women (1979)	55
3.2.2.2.	Convention on the Rights of the Child (1989)	58
3.2.2.3.	Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities (2006)	60
3.2.2.4.	Reports, guidelines, and studies on the right to water within the UN bodies	65
3.2.2.5.	UN General Assembly Resolutions	69
3.2.3.	Interaction between soft law and hard law instruments	72
3.3.	Implementation of the right to water in international human rights law	73
3.3.1.	Reporting under universal human rights conventions	74
3.3.1.1.	Reporting under the International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights	77
3.3.1.1.1.	Functioning	77
3.3.1.1.2.	Practice	78
3.3.1.2.	Reporting under the International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights	84
3.3.1.2.1.	Functioning	84
3.3.1.2.2.	Practice	86
3.3.1.3.	Reporting under the Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women	94
3.3.1.3.1.	Functioning	94
3.3.1.3.2.	Practice	94
3.3.1.4.	Reporting under the Convention on the Rights of the Child	99
3.3.1.4.1.	Functioning	99
3.3.1.4.2.	Practice	100
3.3.1.5.	Reporting under the Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities	105
3.3.1.5.1.	Functioning	105
3.3.1.5.2.	Practice	105
3.3.2.	Contentious cases under universal human rights conventions..	109
3.3.2.1.	Individual communications under the International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights	111

3.3.2.2.	Individual communications under the Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights	113
3.3.2.3.	Individual communications under the Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women	114
3.3.2.4.	Individual communications under the Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities	114
3.4.	Independent right to water in customary international law?	115
3.5.	Conclusions	125
Chapter 4.		
Recognition of the Human Right to Water at the Regional Level		127
4.1.	Introduction	127
4.2.	European human rights system and UNECE	130
4.2.1.	Recognition of the right to water at the European level in regional declarations, statements, resolutions and action plans	131
4.2.1.1.	Council of Europe	131
4.2.1.2.	United Nations Economic Commission for Europe....	134
4.2.2.	Recognition of the right to water in conventions adopted at the European level	136
4.2.2.1.	European Convention on Human Rights	137
4.2.2.2.	European Social Charter (Revised)	137
4.2.2.3.	The European Convention on the Prevention of Torture and Inhuman and Degrading Treatment or Punishment	139
4.2.2.4.	Protocol on Water and Health to the 1992 Convention on the Protection and Use of Transboundary Watercourses and International Lakes	140
4.3.	Inter-American human rights system	142
4.3.1.	Recognition of the right to water in regional declarations, statements, resolutions and action plans	146
4.3.2.	Recognition of the right to water in conventions adopted under the Inter-American system	148
4.4.	African human rights system	149
4.4.1.	Recognition of the right to water in regional declarations, statements, resolutions and action plans	151
4.4.2.	Recognition of the right to water in conventions adopted under the African system	152
4.4.2.1.	African Charter on Human and Peoples' Rights	153

4.4.2.2.	Protocol to the African Charter on Human and Peoples' Rights on the Rights of Women in Africa	153
4.4.2.3.	African Charter on the Rights and Welfare of the Child	153
4.5.	Implementation of the right to water in regional human rights law....	154
4.5.1.	Contentious procedures under regional human rights instruments	155
4.5.1.1.	European human rights system	155
4.5.1.1.1.	Cruel inhumane or degrading treatment	155
4.5.1.1.2.	Right to respect for private and family life...	158
4.5.1.1.3.	Right to fair trial (right to property)	163
4.5.1.1.4.	Right to housing	164
4.5.1.2.	Inter-American human rights system	168
4.5.1.2.1.	Cruel inhuman or degrading treatment	168
4.5.1.2.2.	Right to life	175
4.5.1.3.	African human rights system	182
4.5.1.3.1.	Right to dignity (cruel, inhuman or degrading treatment)	183
4.5.1.3.2.	Right to health	184
4.5.1.3.3.	Right to a healthy environment	187
4.5.1.3.4.	Right to development	188
4.6.	Independent right to water in regional customary law?	190
4.7.	Conclusions	195

Chapter 5.

Recognition of the Human Right to Water at the Domestic Level: a Case Study Approach

199

5.1.	Introduction	199
5.2.	Recognition of the human right to water in national legal systems	201
5.2.1.	Argentina	201
5.2.1.1.	Recognition of the right to water	203
5.2.1.2.	Mechanisms to protect the right to water	206
5.2.2.	Chile	207
5.2.2.1.	Recognition of the right to water	213
5.2.2.2.	Mechanisms to protect the right to water	215
5.2.3.	Colombia	218
5.2.3.1.	Recognition of the right to water	220
5.2.3.2.	Mechanisms to protect the right to water	223
5.2.4.	Bolivia	226
5.2.4.1.	Cochabamba and the water war	230
5.2.4.2.	Recognition of the right to water	234
5.2.4.3.	Mechanisms to protect the right to water	236

5.3. Implementation of the right to water at domestic level	239
5.3.1. Contentious cases in domestic courts	240
5.3.1.1. Argentina	241
5.3.1.1.1. Access to water	241
5.3.1.1.2. Availability and disconnection of water services	244
5.3.1.1.3. Economic access	248
5.3.1.1.4. Water quality	252
5.3.1.1.5. Public participation	254
5.3.1.2. Chile	255
5.3.1.2.1. Access to water	255
5.3.1.2.2. Availability and disconnection of water service	257
5.3.1.2.3. Economic access	259
5.3.1.2.4. Water quality	261
5.3.1.3. Colombia	262
5.3.1.3.1. Access to water	262
5.3.1.3.2. Availability and disconnection of water services	263
5.3.1.3.3. Economic access	266
5.3.1.3.4. Water quality	269
5.3.1.4. Bolivia	270
5.3.1.4.1. Access to water	270
5.3.1.4.2. Availability and disconnection of drinking water services	271
5.3.1.4.3. Economic access	274
5.3.1.4.4. Water quality	275
5.4. Independent right at the domestic level?	275
5.5. Conclusions	278

Chapter 6.

Extraterritorial Application of the Human Right to Water in a Transboundary Watercourse Context **283**

6.1. Introduction	283
6.2. Typology of human rights obligations at the international level	284
6.2.1. Legal basis for the international human rights obligations of the economic, social and cultural rights	285
6.2.1.1. The UN Charter	286
6.2.1.2. Universal Declaration on Human Rights	288
6.2.1.3. International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights	289

6.2.2. Authoritative interpretation of the CESCO concerning international obligations	293
6.2.2.1. International obligation to respect	295
6.2.2.2. International obligation to protect	296
6.2.2.3. International obligation to fulfil	297
6.3. The human right to water in a transboundary watercourse context	299
6.3.1. Extraterritorial causes that impact the human right to water ...	300
6.3.2. International water law as the legal framework for cooperation in the management and use of transboundary watercourses	302
6.3.2.1. Principle of equitable and reasonable utilisation of waters	302
6.3.2.2. The no significant harm rule	307
6.3.2.3. The obligation to cooperate	311
6.3.3. Are international obligations on the human right to water conflicting with the principles of international water law?	312
6.3.4. Remedies	323
6.3.4.1. Mechanisms used by states	323
6.3.4.1.1. Inter-state mechanisms in international water law	323
6.3.4.1.2. Inter-state mechanisms in human rights law	325
6.3.4.2. Actions initiated by individuals against foreign states	331
6.3.4.2.1. Individual complaints under international water law	331
6.3.4.2.2. Individual complaints under human rights law	335
6.4. Conclusions	337
Chapter 7.	
General Conclusions	341
7.1 Recognition of the human right to water under human rights law	341
7.2. Extraterritorial application of the human right to water and its relationship with international water law	348
7.3. Overall conclusion	353
<i>Bibliography</i>	355
<i>Index</i>	377