

A History of National Accounting

André Vanoli

Translated from the French original by
Marion Pinot Libreros and Gayle H. Partmann

IOS
Press

Amsterdam • Berlin • Oxford • Tokyo • Washington, DC

Contents

Foreword	xv
Acknowledgments	xix
Part I. Emergence	
Chapter 1. From Estimates of National Income to Construction of Accounts for the Nation	3
1. 1665–1929: Two hundred and sixty years of intermittent estimates of national income	3
1.1. General overview of the works	3
1.2. The concept of productive activity	11
1.3. Methods of estimation	13
2. 1930–1945: The fifteen-year transition towards a system of national accounts	15
2.1. Towards the accounting approach	16
2.2. The 1929 crisis and the trend towards official status	17
2.3. World War II and the take-off	20
2.4. A digression on Leontief's work	23
2.5. The early stages of international normalization: the Stone memorandum (1945)	24
Outlook	26
Annotated bibliography	28
Appendix. The accounting system proposed by Richard Stone in 1945	32
Box 1. The first estimate of national income, by William Petty	4
Box 2. Gregory King, an outstanding pioneer	6
Box 3. Why this English innovation at the end of the 17th century?	11
Box 4. François Quesnay: Formula of the "Tableau Economique"	12
Box 5. A retrospective comparison of two estimates of British national income around 1800	14
Box 6. The three approaches to national income according to Meade and Stone	21
Part II. Systems and International Harmonization	
Chapter 2. French National Accounting Follows its own Path	43
1. The SEEF's choice for autonomy	43

2. A critical review of the first standardised system	45
3. The SEEF's conceptual framework	56
4. Growth and extension of French national accounting (CNF)	61
4.1. Tables of financial transactions	65
4.2. Production and goods and services	68
4.3. "Tableau économique d'ensemble" [Overall Economic Account]	69
4.4. Enterprise accounts	71
4.5. Household accounts	71
5. Among the most advanced countries	76
Outlook	77
Annotated bibliography	80
Appendix. Diagrammatic representations of National Accounts	82
Box 7. First schemes of national accounts (1941-1952)	47
Box 8. Ingvar Ohlsson's comments on the 1952 Standardised System	55
Box 9. Flowchart presented by Claude Gruson in his July 1950 Note	58
Box 10. Classification of social groups in the "Principles", September 1952 (p. 818)	60
Box 11. The elementary economic table or square table of the September 1952 "Principles" (Annexe 4, insert between pages 818 and 819)	62
Box 12. From Copeland's <i>moneyflows accounts</i> to the <i>flow-of-funds accounts</i> of the Federal Reserve Board	64
Box 13. Main steps followed by the former French National Accounting (1950-1975)	66
Box 14. The "Tableau économique d'ensemble" [Overall Economic Account] for 1959	72
Box 15. Household appropriation accounts according to their socio-economic category (France 1956)	75
Chapter 3. Achievements in the International Harmonization of Accounting Frameworks	87
1. The wave of the 1960s	87
1.1. The European Communities of Six hesitates. Stone's decisive intervention	88
1.2. The 1968 SNA	90
1.3. The 1970 ESA	96
1.4. Nothing new in the East?	100
1.5. Drastic change in the French national accounts system: The 1976 SECN	102
1.6. The USA standing aside	103
2. The wave of the 1980s and 1990s	104
2.1. The 1993 SNA/1995 ESA	104
2.2. Towards universalization	124
Outlook	126
Annotated bibliography	127
Appendix. Investigating the decision process	130
Box 16. General schedule of international harmonization	88
Box 17. The 1968 SNA presentation in matrix form	92
Box 18. Valuation of transactions on commodities (market goods and services) in the 1968 SNA	97
Box 19. GDP and GNP. Resident production units and resident production factors	98

Box 20. Sector accounts sequence and balancing items, from 1952 SNA to 1993 SNA/1995 ESA	106
Box 21. From the "Tableau économique d'ensemble" (TEE) of French National Accounts to the Integrated Economic Accounts of the 1993 SNA/1995 ESA	110
Box 22. The input-output framework of the 1993 SNA/1995 ESA	118
Box 23. Accounts for key sectors	123
Chapter 4. Trend towards Unification, and Persistent Accounting Problems	147
1. Exchanges or "operations" (transactions)? What is recorded?	147
2. The problem of the extent of imputations	151
2.1. The case of financial intermediation services indirectly measured	154
2.2. Reality and appearance	158
3. A single system or multiple systems?	164
4. Micro/macro relationships	167
5. Disputes about SAMs	169
6. Broadening the scope of national accounts	171
Outlook	173
Annotated bibliography	177
Appendix. Broadening and flexibility of the system: satellite accounts and intermediate systems	181
Box 24. "Imputations"	150
Box 25. From the opposition between real and financial to the concept of flows of economic value (<i>or does the 1993 SNA resolve the Frisch-Aukrust vs. Stone conflict?</i>)	152
Box 26. A difficult and intensively debated imputation: the production and distribution among users of Financial Intermediation Services Indirectly Measured (FISIM)	156
Box 27. Re-routing	159
Box 28. A pending imputation-re-routing case: the consumption of advertising-supported television, radio broadcasts, etc. services	161
Box 29. An overview of the Dutch proposals in the second half of the 1980s	165
Part III. Statistical Synthesis	
Chapter 5. National Accounts as a Statistical Synthesis	191
1. From scattered statistical data towards a system of economic statistics	192
1.1. Secondary use of available information as a starting point	192
1.2. Acting in advance of the information production process	193
1.3. Emergence of the concept of "system of economic statistics"	193
1.4. A more ambitious, but isolated effort: the French experience in the linkage with microeconomic accounts	194
1.5. Developing tools and frameworks for statistical integration	196
1.6. Statistical coordination at the international level	198
2. The quest for consistency	203
2.1. Wide geographical extension, though with unequal coverage of the system	203

2.2. Synthesizing and balancing	204
2.3. Goods and services and GDP	206
2.4. Institutional sector accounts and synthesis of the Tableau économique d'ensemble [Overall Economic Account]	212
2.5. The financial/non-financial adjustment: a problematic issue	214
3. Reliability challenged	215
3.1. Isolated British attempt to estimate margins of error	215
3.2. Revision of estimates at benchmark operations	216
3.3. Comparing successive versions of the accounts	217
3.4. Accurately measuring changes, or absolute levels, or both at the same time?	218
3.5. Towards an economy more difficult to describe and measure	224
3.6. Trend of economic information systems to misadjust	226
Outlook	227
Annotated bibliography	230
Appendix. The GNP Committee and the GNP Inventories	233
Box 30. System of economic statistics	197
Box 31. Richard Stone's attempt to design a system of demographic and social statistics	199
Box 32. Statistical system and environment	201
Box 33. Satellite accounts and extension of statistical syntheses	202
Box 34. Methods of national income estimates according to Studenski's book <i>The Income of Nations</i> (1958)	205
Box 35. Presentation of a statistical discrepancy in the United Kingdom	207
Box 36. Gaps in the measurement of total household consumption between household surveys and national accounts	209
Box 37. Diagram of a synthesis with an annual input-output table	210
Box 38. The United Kingdom gives up quantitative estimates of the accounts reliability	218
Box 39. Questioning the growth rates of the USSR and other economies with similar systems	222
Box 40. An opinion from the Federal Reserve Board (1991) on the issue of financial statistics	226

Part IV. Concepts and Economic Theory

Chapter 6. Production, Value and Welfare A. Controversies surrounding government activities	241
1. The accounting design	244
2. To include or not to include?	246
3. Is there any double-counting?	251
4. Measuring at factor cost?	255
5. Interest on the public debt and national income compilation	265
5.1. Nature of interest in the SNA	267
Outlook	268
Annotated bibliography	271
Box 41. The 1993 SNA concept of production	242
Box 42. The balances of market GDP and non-market GDP in the French 1976 SECN	245
Box 43. The issue of "consumption subsidies"	249

Box 44. To adjust National Income/GDP for intermediate consumption of non-market services by market producers?	256
Box 45. Market Prices and Factor Cost (incomes): a synthetic presentation of the main alternatives	262
Chapter 7. Production, Value and Welfare B. National accounting and welfare	273
1. National income and changes in welfare: the search for a rigorous demonstration	273
1.1. Pigou's initial attempt in a framework of cardinal utility	274
1.2. Hicks and the <i>Economica</i> debate	276
1.3. Taking income distribution into account	278
2. National accounting and changes in economic welfare: the search for a composite indicator	279
2.1. Kuznets and the ultimate objectives of economic activity	279
2.2. To adjust national income or GDP in the direction of economic welfare?	281
2.3. Environmental concerns and proposals for adjustments to the aggregates	294
Outlook	296
Annotated bibliography	299
Box 46. Hicks' conceptual framework	277
Box 47. Illegal production in the 1993 SNA	281
Box 48. The relationship between GDP and welfare measurement according to the 1993 SNA	282
Box 49. Nordhaus and Tobin's Measure of Economic Welfare for the USA	284
Box 50. Household activities	287
Box 51. Leisure	288
Box 52. Externalities	291
Chapter 8. Production, Income and Wealth	303
1. Flow accounts and wealth accounts: unsynchronized developments	303
1.1. Many estimates of wealth before the national accounts era	303
1.2. Slow take-off of integrated balance sheets	304
1.3. Estimates of human capital	306
1.4. Obstacles to the integration of human capital	306
1.5. The issue of intangible investment	307
1.6. Military durables	310
1.7. An incomplete concept of GFCF	311
1.8. Development of the accounting framework	311
2. Complex relationships between income and change in net worth	317
2.1. Greater difficulties in estimating wealth	317
2.2. Critical measurement of consumption of fixed capital	319
2.3. Capital gains and losses: the treatment of interest	328
2.4. Capital gains and losses: should they be included in income?	329
2.5. Importance of the other accumulation accounts	334
3. The debate on the environment	334
3.1. Treatment of the extraction of market natural resources	335
3.2. Taking into account non-market non-monetary natural assets	344

3.3. Return to the interpretation of net domestic product in terms of welfare and sustainability	350
Outlook	351
Annotated bibliography	357
Appendix. Hicks' concept of income and national accounts: interpretation issues	364
Box 53. Arguments behind the European opposition to the inclusion of Research and Development Expenditures in capital formation	309
Box 54. Production, Income, Wealth: From the traditional truncated sequence of accounts to the complete framework of the 1993 SNA/1995 ESA	313
Box 55. Assets and liabilities accounts of the 1993 SNA	315
Box 56. Measurement of consumption of fixed capital and stocks of fixed assets	320
Box 57. Consumption of fixed capital and revision of expectations	325
Box 58. Vocabulary: Consumption of fixed capital and depreciation	327
Box 59. Interest and inflation: illustration of various methods of recording	330
Box 60. Debt forgiveness and writing-offs of bad debts	335
Box 61. Estimating the resource rent and the value of nonrenewable resource deposits	336
Box 62. How to record the extraction of non-renewable resources?	339
Box 63. The World Bank concept of "Genuine saving"	342
Box 64. An outline of the United Nations handbook <i>Integrated Environmental and Economic Accounting</i> (SEEA 1993)	345
Box 65. Vocabulary: Capital – Wealth – Patrimony	352
Chapter 9. Value, Volume and Prices	371
1. Goods and services accounts at constant prices	372
1.1. Towards an integrated system	372
1.2. From fixed-base indices to chain indices	373
2. Changes in the terms of trade and calculation of a "real" national income	376
3. Complete national accounts systems at constant prices	380
4. Volume of value added and double deflation	384
4.1. Double deflation methodology spreading	384
4.2. Discussions in the economic literature	385
5. Measuring the volume of production factors, growth accounting and productivity	387
5.1. The French experience of "surplus accounts"	388
5.2. Interpretation issues	394
6. Volume-price factoring for equipment goods	395
6.1. Two opposing views	395
6.2. A crucial controversy	400
7. International comparisons of volume and price	402
7.1. Before the ICP project	402
7.2. The International Comparison Project (ICP)	403
Outlook	408
Annotated bibliography	413
Appendix. Reviewing indices	418
Box 66. From GDP in volume to real national income	377
Box 67. Complete national economic accounts at constant prices: Courbis summarized by Courbis	382

Box 68. Surplus accounts	390
Box 69. Volume-price factoring of the value of investment: Contrasting alternative approaches	397
Box 70. National income per capita, according to exchange rates and purchasing power parities (World Development Indicators 2000)	405
Box 71. Vocabulary : "Real"	409
Part V. Politics	
Chapter 10. Uses and Status of National Accounting	425
1. "The Golden Age of National Accounting"	425
1.1. Postwar Reconstruction and Government's economic role	426
1.2. Originality of the French experience	429
1.3. Uses in very different contexts	445
2. Crisis of macroeconomic regulation and relative setback of national accounting	446
2.1. Emphasis on short-term analysis and expansion of quarterly accounts	447
2.2. New but unwitting customers	448
2.3. Increasing use of micro databases	450
2.4. Considerable extension of the institutional and political role of national accounting	451
2.5. National Accounting stumbles over certain issues	453
3. Sensitive relationships with economic theories	455
3.1. Interaction between theories and national accounts measures	455
3.2. Evolution of the intellectual status of national accounting among theoreticians	456
3.3. Multiple intellectual sources of national accounting	459
3.4. Diverging views concerning the relationships between economic theory and national accounting	461
Outlook	462
Annotated bibliography	468
Appendix. The use of the European system of accounts (ESA) in the procedures concerning accession to the European Economic and Monetary Union	472
Box 72. The IARIW	427
Box 73. The SEEF staff	432
Box 74. Economists, statisticians, accountants, national accountants: different cultures?	438
Box 75. Schools of national accounting?	463
General Outlook – The fortune of a vast enterprise	479
Postface (in the first person singular)	487
Subject Index	495
Index of Names	513
Acronyms	521