

The WTO Agreement on Agriculture

A Commentary

JOSEPH A McMAHON

OXFORD
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Contents

<i>Table of WTO Disputes</i>	xiii
<i>GATT Panel Reports</i>	xv
<i>WTO Documents</i>	xvi
<i>WTO Agreements and other Legal Instruments</i>	xix
<i>List of Abbreviations</i>	xxiii

CHAPTER 1: THE PREAMBLE	1
1.1 Overview of the History of the GATT and Agriculture	1
1.1.1 The US Waiver	1
1.1.2 The CAP and the Harberler Report	3
1.1.3 The Kennedy Round	6
1.1.4 The Tokyo Round	8
1.2 Overview of the Uruguay Round Negotiations	10
1.2.1 The Declaration	10
1.2.2 The Mid-Term Review to Brussels 1990	12
1.2.3 Completing the Negotiations	13
1.3 Objectives of the Agreement	14
1.3.1 The Preamble	14
1.3.2 Relationship to Other Agreements	16
1.4 Continuing the Reform Process	19
CHAPTER 2: MARKET ACCESS	24
2.1 Market Access and the GATT	24
2.2 The Uruguay Round Negotiations	26
2.3 The Agreement on Agriculture	30
2.3.1 Tariff Reductions	30
2.3.2 Tariffication	33
2.3.2.1 Chile—Price Band System	35
(a) <i>The Panel Decision</i>	35
(b) <i>The Appellate Body decision</i>	38

2.3.2.2	Price Gap Methodology	43
	(a) <i>The first arbitration report</i>	44
	(b) <i>The second arbitration report</i>	47
2.3.2.3	Minimum and Current Access Commitments	50
2.3.2.4	Annex 5—Special Treatment	53
2.3.3	Special Safeguard Measures	54
2.3.3.1	EC—Poultry	56
	(a) <i>The Panel Decision</i>	57
	(b) <i>The Appellate Body decision</i>	58
2.4	A Comment	60
CHAPTER 3:	DOMESTIC SUPPORT	63
3.1	The Uruguay Round Negotiations	63
3.2	The Agreement on Agriculture	67
3.2.1	The Aggregate Measurement of Support	67
3.2.2	Exemptions from the Reduction Commitment	69
3.2.3	Korea—Beef	72
	3.2.3.1 The Panel Decision	73
	3.2.3.2 The Appellate Body Decision	75
3.2.4	US—Upland Cotton	79
	3.2.4.1 The Panel Decision	80
	3.2.4.2 The Appellate Body Decision	83
3.3	A Comment	85
CHAPTER 4:	EXPORT COMPETITION	89
4.1	Export Subsidies and the GATT	89
4.2	The Uruguay Round Negotiations	92
4.3	The Agreement on Agriculture	95
4.3.1	The Commitments	95
4.3.2	The Subsidies Agreement	97
4.3.3	Canada—Dairy	99
	4.3.3.1 The Panel Decision	100
	4.3.3.2 The Appellate Body Decision	103
	4.3.3.3 First Recourse to Article 21.5 of the DSU	105
	4.3.3.4 Second Recourse to Article 21.5 of the DSU	110

4.3.4 US—Foreign Sales Corporation	114
4.3.4.1 The Panel Decision	115
4.3.4.2 The Appellate Body Decision	117
4.3.4.3 Recourse to Article 21.5 of the DSU	119
4.3.5 US—Upland Cotton	120
4.3.5.1 The Panel Decision	121
4.3.5.2 The Appellate Body Decision	127
4.3.6 EC—Sugar	131
4.3.6.1 The Panel Decision	133
4.3.6.2 The Appellate Body Decision	138
4.4 A Comment	143
 CHAPTER 5: THE PEACE CLAUSE	 146
5.1 The Uruguay Round Negotiations	146
5.2 The Agreement on Agriculture	147
5.2.1 Brazil—Desiccated Coconut	148
5.2.2 US—Upland Cotton	149
5.2.2.1 The Panel Decision	149
5.2.2.2 The Appellate Body Decision	155
5.3 A Comment	156
 CHAPTER 6: SPECIAL AND DIFFERENTIAL TREATMENT	 164
6.1 Developing Countries and the GATT	164
6.2 The Uruguay Round Negotiations	169
6.3 The Agreement on Agriculture	172
6.3.1 Special and Differential Treatment	172
6.3.2 Decision on Least-Developed and Net Food-Importing Countries	176
6.4 A Comment	184
 CHAPTER 7: CONTINUING THE REFORM PROCESS	 192
7.1 Introduction	192
7.2 Market Access	193
7.3 Domestic Support	199

7.4 Export Competition	206
7.5 Special and Differential Treatment	208
7.5.1 Market Access	208
7.5.2 Domestic Support	210
7.5.3 Export Competition	213
7.6 Non-Trade Concerns	214
7.7 Phase 2 Negotiations	219
7.8 A Comment	221
 CHAPTER 8: THE DOHA DEVELOPMENT	
AGENDA	224
8.1 The Doha Declaration	224
8.1.1 The Ministerial Declaration	225
8.1.2 The Start of Negotiations	226
8.1.3 The Harbinson Modalities	228
8.2 The Cancun Ministerial Conference	230
8.2.1 The Joint Text and Other Proposals	231
8.2.2 The del Castillo Text	232
8.2.3 The July Framework	234
8.2.4 After the Framework	238
8.3 The Hong Kong Ministerial Conference	241
8.3.1 Getting Ready for Hong Kong	242
8.3.2 The Hong Kong Ministerial Conference	244
8.3.3 After Hong Kong	248
 APPENDICES	253
Appendix 1 The Agreement on Agriculture	255
Appendix 2 The Modalities Agreement: Modalities for the Establishment of Specific Binding Commitments under the Reform Programme MTN.GNG/MA/W/24	281
Appendix 3 The July Framework: Decision Adopted by the General Council on 1 August 2004 (WT/L/579) Annex A Framework for Establishing Modalities in Agriculture	300
 <i>Bibliography</i>	309
<i>Index</i>	317