

# Capital Theory

## Volume I

*Edited by*

**Christopher Bliss**

*Nuffield Professor of International Economics  
University of Oxford, UK*

**Avi J. Cohen**

*Associate Professor of Economics  
York University, Canada*

*and*

**G.C. Harcourt**

*Emeritus Reader in the History of Economic Theory  
University of Cambridge, UK  
Emeritus Fellow  
Jesus College, Cambridge, UK  
and Professor Emeritus  
University of Adelaide, Australia*

**0**

**An Elgar Reference Collection**

Cheltenham, UK • Northampton, MA, USA

# Contents

<i>Acknowledgements</i>	ix
<i>Introduction The Theory of Capital: A Personal Overview</i> Christopher Bliss	xi
<i>Introduction Capital Theory Controversy: Scarcity, Production, Equilibrium and Time</i> Avi J. Cohen and G.C. Harcourt	xxvii

## **PART I CLASSICAL AND MARXIAN CONCEPTIONS OF CAPITAL**

1. K.H. Hennings ([1987] 1990), 'Capital as a Factor of Production', in John Eatwell, Murray Milgate and Peter Newman (eds), *The New Palgrave: Capital Theory*, London: Macmillan Reference Books, 108-22 3
2. David Ricardo (1951), 'IV. The Chapter on Value in Edition I' excerpt from 'Introduction', excerpt from 'On Value' and 'On Machinery', in Piero Sraffa (ed.), *The Works and Correspondence of David Ricardo*, Volume I, Chapter I, Sections III-V, Chapter XXXI, Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, xxx-xxxvii, 22-43, 386-97 18
3. Karl Marx ([1891] 1972), 'Wage Labour and Capital', in Robert C. Tucker (ed.), *The Marx—Engels Reader*, Second Edition, New York: W.W. Norton and Company, Inc., 167-90 60
4. Luigi L. Pasinetti (1983), 'The Accumulation of Capital', *Cambridge Journal of Economics*, 7, 405-11 84

## **PART II FOUNDATIONS OF NEOCLASSICAL CAPITAL THEORY: IMPATIENCE AND PRODUCTIVITY**

5. Nassau William Senior ([1836] 1938), 'Instruments of Production' and 'Capital', in *An Outline of the Science of Political Economy*, Chapter 3, London: George Allen and Unwin, Ltd, 57-60 93
6. Ian Steedman (1972), 'Jevons's Theory of Capital and Interest', *Manchester School of Economic and Social Studies*, XL, 31-52 97
7. Syed Ahmad (1998), 'Rae, Bohm-Bawerk, and Fisher on the Supply and Demand of Capital', in O.F. Hamouda, C. Lee and D. Mair (eds), *The Economics of John Rae*, Chapter 6, London and New York: Routledge, 111-28, references 119
8. Eugen von Bohm-Bawerk (1959), 'The Problem of Interest', 'Final Conclusions' and 'Present and Future in Economic Life', in *Capital and Interest*, Translated by George D. Huncke and Hans F. Sennholz, Volume 1, Chapter I, Chapter XV, Volume 2, Chapter I, South Holland, IL: Libertarian Press, 1-7, 348-54, 259-89, notes 139
9. John B. Clark (1891), 'Distribution as Determined by a Law of Rent', *Quarterly Journal of Economics*, 5 (3), April, 289-318 194

## Capital Theory I

10. John Bates Clark (1899), 'Kinds of Capital and of Capital-Goods', in *The Distribution of Wealth: A Theory of Wages, Interest and Profits*, Chapter X, New York and London: The Macmillan Company, 141-56 224
11. Christopher Bliss (1990), 'Alfred Marshall and the Theory of Capital', in John K. Whitaker (ed.), *Centenary Essays on Alfred Marshall*, Chapter 9, Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 223-1 240
12. Knut Wicksell ([1934] 1961), 'Capitalistic Production', in Lionel Robbins (ed.), *Lectures on Political Economy*, Translated from the Swedish by E. Classen, Volume 1: General Theory, Part II, Chapter 2, London: Routledge and Kegan Paul Ltd, 144-95 259
13. Knut Wicksell ([1934] 1961), 'Real Capital and Interest (continued): A Mathematical Analysis of Dr. Akerman's Problem', in Lionel Robbins (ed.), *Lectures on Political Economy*, Translated from the Swedish by E. Classen, Volume 1: General Theory, Appendix 2(b), London: Routledge and Kegan Paul Ltd, 274-99 311
14. Paul A. Samuelson (1967), Excerpts from 'Irving Fisher and the Theory of Capital', in *Ten Economic Studies in the Tradition of Irving Fisher*, Chapter 2, New York: John Wiley and Sons, Inc., 17-19, 26-35 337
15. Joseph A. Schumpeter ([1934] 1983), 'Interest on Capital', in *The Theory of Economic Development: An Inquiry into Profits, Capital, Credit, Interest, and the Business Cycle*, Translated from the German by Redvers Opie, Chapter V, New Brunswick and London: Transaction Books, 157-211 350

### **PART III SOME AUSTRIAN AND NEO-AUSTRIAN CONTRIBUTIONS TO CAPITAL THEORY**

16. Carl Menger ([1871] 1976), Excerpt from 'The Laws Governing the Value of Goods of Higher Order', in *Principles of Economics*, Translated by James Dingwall and Bert F. Hoselitz, Part III, Chapter 3, Sections A-D, New York and London: New York University Press, 149-65 407
17. Frank A. Fetter (1902), 'The "Roundabout Process" in the Interest Theory', *Quarterly Journal of Economics*, 17 (1), November, 163-80 424

### **PART IV EARLY NEOCLASSICAL CAPITAL CONTROVERSIES**

18. Thorstein Veblen (1908), 'Professor Clark's Economies', *Quarterly Journal of Economics*, **XXII** (2), February, 147-95 445
19. Avi J. Cohen (1998), 'Frank Knight's Position on Capital and Interest: Foundation of the Knight/Hayek/Kaldor Debate', in Malcolm Rutherford (ed.), *The Economic Mind in America: Essays in the History of American Economics: Perspectives on the History of Economic Thought*, Chapter 10, London and New York: Routledge, 145-63 494

*Capital Theory I*

20. Ian Steedman (1994), 'On *The Pure Theory of Capital* by F.A. Hayek', in M. Colonna, H. Hagemann and O.F. Hamouda (eds), *The Economics of F.A. Hayek*, Volume II: Capitalism, Socialism and Knowledge, Chapter 1, Aldershot: Edward Elgar, 3-25 513
  21. Murray Milgate (1979), 'On the Origin of the Notion of "Intertemporal Equilibrium"', *Economica*, 46 (181), New Series, February, 1-10 536
  22. J. Fred Weston (1951), 'Some Perspectives on Capital Theory', *American Economic Review, Papers and Proceedings*, 41 (2), May, 129-44 546
- Name Index* 562

# Capital Theory

## Volume III

*Edited by*

**Christopher Bliss**

*Nuffield Professor of International Economics  
University of Oxford, UK*

**Avi J. Cohen**

*Associate Professor of Economics  
York University, Canada*

*and*

**G.C. Harcourt**

*Emeritus Reader in the History of Economic Theory  
University of Cambridge, UK*

*Emeritus Fellow*

*Jesus College, Cambridge, UK*

*and Professor Emeritus*

*University of Adelaide, Australia*

**C**

**An Elgar Reference Collection**

Cheltenham, UK • Northampton, MA, USA

# Contents

*Acknowledgements*

vii

*Introductions by the editors to all three volumes appear in Volume I*

## **PART I RESWITCHING AND CAPITAL REVERSING**

1. Paul A. Samuelson (1962), 'Parable and Realism in Capital Theory: The Surrogate Production Function', *Review of Economic Studies*, **XXIX** (3), June, 193-206 3
2. Luigi L. Pasinetti (1966), 'Changes in the Rate of Profit and Switches of Techniques', *Quarterly Journal of Economics*, **LXXX** (4), November, 503-17 17
3. P. Garegnani (1970), 'Heterogeneous Capital, the Production Function and the Theory of Distribution', *Review of Economic Studies*, 37 (3), July, 407-36 32
4. Paul A. Samuelson (1966), 'A Summing Up', *Quarterly Journal of Economics*, 80 (4), November, 568-83 62
5. Luigi L. Pasinetti (1969), 'Switches of Technique and the "Rate of Return" in Capital Theory', *Economic Journal*, **LXXIX** (315), September, 508-31 78
6. Robert M. Solow (1970), 'On the Rate of Return: Reply to Pasinetti', *Economic Journal*, **LXXX** (318), June, 423-8 102
7. Luigi L. Pasinetti (1970), 'Again on Capital Theory and Solow's "Rate of Return"', *Economic Journal*, **LXXX** (318), June, 428-31 108
8. Edwin Burmeister (1976), 'Real Wicksell Effects and Regular Economies', in Murray Brown, Kazuo Sato and Paul Zarembka (eds), *Essays in Modern Capital Theory*, Amsterdam, New York and Oxford: North-Holland Publishing Company, 145-64 112

## **PART II ASSESSMENTS OF THE CAMBRIDGE CAPITAL THEORY CONTROVERSIES**

9. G.C. Harcourt ([1969] 1986), 'Some Cambridge Controversies in the Theory of Capital', in O.F. Hamouda (ed.), *Controversies in Political Economy: Selected Essays of G.C. Harcourt*, Chapter 7, Brighton: Wheatsheaf Books Ltd, 145-206 135
10. Mark Blaug (1975), 'A Final Judgement', in *The Cambridge Revolution: Success or Failure? A Critical Analysis of Cambridge Theories of Value and Distribution*, Revised Edition, Chapter VIII, London: The Institute of Economic Affairs, 79-86, references 197

11. Amit Bhaduri (1969), 'On the Significance of Recent Controversies on Capital Theory: A Marxian View', *Economic Journal*, **LXXIX** (315), September, 532-9 206
12. Joan Robinson ([1974] 1979), 'History versus Equilibrium', in *Collected Economic Papers*, Volume 5, Chapter 4, Oxford: Basil Blackwell, 48-58 214
13. Joan Robinson (1975), 'The Unimportance of Reswitching', *Quarterly Journal of Economics*, 89 (1), February, 32-9 225
14. G.C. Harcourt (1976), 'The Cambridge Controversies: Old Ways and New Horizons - Or Dead End?', *Oxford Economic Papers*, 28 (1), March, 25-65 233
15. Frank Hahn (1982), 'The Neo-Ricardians', *Cambridge Journal of Economics*, 6 (4), December, 353-74 274
16. Avi J. Cohen (1989), 'Prices, Capital, and the One-commodity Model in Neoclassical and Classical Theories', *History of Political Economy*, 21 (2), Summer, 231-51 296

### **PART III CAPITAL, INCREASING RETURNS AND ENDOGENOUS GROWTH**

17. Frank H. Knight (1944), 'Diminishing Returns from Investment', *Journal of Political Economy*, 52 (1), March, 26-47 319
18. Kenneth J. Arrow (1962), 'The Economic Implications of Learning by Doing', *Review of Economic Studies*, **XXIX** (3), 155-73 341
19. Paul M. Romer (1986), 'Increasing Returns and Long-Run Growth', *Journal of Political Economy*, 94 (5), October, 1002-37 360
20. Paul M. Romer (1990), 'Endogenous Technological Change', *Journal of Political Economy*, 98 (5, Part 2), October, S71-S102 396
21. Kevin M. Murphy, Andrei Shleifer and Robert W. Vishny (1989), 'Industrialization and the Big Push', *Journal of Political Economy*, 97 (5), October, 1003-26 428
22. Robert J. Barro and Xavier Sala-i-Martin (1992), 'Convergence', *Journal of Political Economy*, 100 (2), April, 223-51 452
23. Philippe Aghion and Peter Howitt (1998), 'Market Structure', in *Endogenous Growth Theory*, Chapter 7, Cambridge, MA and London: MIT Press, 205-32, references 481
24. Robert M. Solow (2000), 'Lessons and Suggestions for Aggregative Growth Theory', in *Growth Theory: An Exposition*, Second Edition, Chapter 12, New York and Oxford: Oxford University Press, 180-86, references 510

# Capital Theory

## Volume II

*Edited by*

**Christopher Bliss**

*Nuffield Professor of International Economics  
University of Oxford, UK*

**Avi J. Cohen**

*Associate Professor of Economics  
York University, Canada*

*and*

**G.C. Harcourt**

*Emeritus Reader in the History of Economic Theory  
University of Cambridge, UK  
Emeritus Fellow  
Jesus College, Cambridge, UK  
and Professor Emeritus  
University of Adelaide, Australia*

**C**

**An Elgar Reference Collection**

Cheltenham, UK • Northampton, MA, USA



# Contents

*Acknowledgements*

ix

*Introductions by the editors to all three volumes appear in Volume I*

## **PART I CAPITAL IN ONE-COMMODITY NEOCLASSICAL GROWTH MODELS**

1. D.G. Champernowne (1945-1946), 'A Note on J. v. Neumann's Article on "A Model of Economic Equilibrium"', *Review of Economic Studies*, 13 (1), 10-18
2. F.P. Ramsey (1928), 'A Mathematical Theory of Saving', *Economic Journal*, **XXXVIII** (152), December, 543-59 12
3. Robert M. Solow (1956), 'A Contribution to the Theory of Economic Growth', *Quarterly Journal of Economics*, 70 (1), February, 65-94 29

## **PART II VARIATIONS ON SIMPLE NEOCLASSICAL GROWTH MODELS: HETEROGENEOUS CAPITAL GOODS, TWO-SECTOR MODELS AND MORE**

4. R. Dorfman, P.A. Samuelson and R.M. Solow (1971), 'Efficient Programmes of Capital Accumulation', in G.C. Harcourt and N.F. Laing (eds), *Capital and Growth*, Chapter 18, Harmondsworth: Penguin Education, 348-68 61
5. Robert M. Solow (1963), 'The Rate of Return on Investment', in *Capital Theory and the Rate of Return*, Excerpt from Chapter 1, Amsterdam: North-Holland Publishing Company, 16-28 **82**
6. W.E.G. Salter (1966), 'A Model of the Delay in the Utilisation of New Techniques of Production', in *Productivity and Technical Change*, Second Edition, Chapter IV, Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 48-65 95
7. F.H. Hahn and R.C.O. Matthews (1964), 'Two-sector Models', excerpt from 'The Theory of Economic Growth: A Survey', *Economic Journal*, 74 (296) December, 812-21, references 113
8. Milton Friedman (1976), 'The Theory of Capital and the Rate of Interest', in *Price Theory*, Chapter 17, New York: Aldine de Gruyter, 283-322 124

## **PART III PRODUCTION FUNCTIONS AND AGGREGATE CAPITAL**

9. Charles W. Cobb and Paul H. Douglas (1928), 'A Theory of Production', *American Economic Review, Papers and Proceedings*, 18 (1), Supplement, March, 139-65 167

10.	Joan Robinson (1953-1954), 'The Production Function and the Theory of Capital', <i>Review of Economic Studies</i> , 21 (2), 81-106	194
11.	D.G. Champernowne (1953-1954), 'The Production Function and the Theory of Capital: A Comment', <i>Review of Economic Studies</i> , 21(2), 112-35	220
12.	Robert M. Solow (1955-56), 'The Production Function and the Theory of Capital', <i>Review of Economic Studies</i> , 23 (2), 101-8	244
13.	Franklin M. Fisher (1971), 'Aggregate Production Functions and the Explanation of Wages: A Simulation Experiment', <i>Review of Economics and Statistics</i> , <b>LIII</b> (4), November, 305-25	252
<b>PART IV KEYNES AND THE CAMBRIDGE SCHOOL</b>		
14.	R.F. Kahn (1959), 'Exercises in the Analysis of Growth', <i>Oxford Economic Papers</i> , 11 (2), June, 143-56	275
15.	Colin Rogers (1989), excerpts from 'Wicksellian Monetary Theory' in <i>Money, Interest and Capital</i> , Chapter 2, Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 21-35, 39 <sup>^</sup> 3, references	289
<b>PART V SRAFFA AND SRAFFIANS</b>		
16.	Piero Sraffa (1936), Letter to Joan Robinson, 27 October, Archives, King's College, Cambridge	313
17.	Piero Sraffa (1960), 'Reduction to Dated Quantities of Labour' and 'Fixed Capital', in <i>Production of Commodities by Means of Commodities: Prelude to a Critique of Economic Theory</i> , Chapters VI and X, Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 34-40, 63-73	316
18.	Duncan K. Foley (2001), 'Value, Distribution and Capital: A Review Essay', <i>Review of Political Economy</i> , 13 (3), 365-81	334
<b>PART VI DISAGGREGATED CAPITAL, ACCUMULATION AND GENERAL EQUILIBRIUM</b>		
19.	Edmond Malinvaud (1953), 'Capital Accumulation and Efficient Allocation of Resources', <i>Econometrica</i> , 21 (2), April, 233-68	353
20.	F.H. Hahn (1966), 'Equilibrium Dynamics with Heterogeneous Capital Goods', <i>Quarterly Journal of Economics</i> , 80 (4), November, 633-46	389
21.	C.J. Bliss (1975), 'The Orthodox Vision', in <i>Capital Theory and the Distribution of Income</i> , Chapter 12, Amsterdam and Oxford: North Holland Publishing Company, 279-97, references	403
22.	Avinash Dixit (1977), 'The Accumulation of Capital Theory', <i>Oxford Economic Papers</i> , 29 (1), March, 1-29	423
<b>PART VII CAPITAL AND OVERLAPPING GENERATIONS</b>		
23.	Paul A. Samuelson (1958), 'An Exact Consumption-Loan Model of Interest With or Without the Social Contrivance of Money', <i>Journal of Political Economy</i> , <b>LXVI</b> (6), December, 467-82	455