

Theory of Decision under Uncertainty

Itzhak Gilboa

Tel Aviv University, Israel, and HEC, Paris

CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Contents

Preface • • *page* xiii

I	Intuitive Definitions	1
1	Motivating Examples	3
2	Free Will and Determinism	5
2.1	Can Free Choice Be Predicted?	5
2.2	Is the World Deterministic?	6
2.3	Is Free Will Observable?	6
2.4	The Problem of Free Will	7
2.5	A Rational Illusion	10
2.6	Free Will and the Decision Matrix	12
3	The Principle of Indifference	14
3.1	Will a Canonical Space Help?	14
3.1.1	The Canonical State Space	14
3.1.2	Difficulties with a Uniform Prior on $[0, 1]$	15
3.1.3	Conclusion	16
3.2	What's Special about the Coin?	17
3.2.1	Symmetry	17
3.2.2	Smooth Beliefs	18
4	Relative Frequencies	20
4.1	The Law of Large Numbers	20
4.2	The Problem of Induction	21
4.2.1	Hume's Critique	21
4.2.2	Goodman's Grue-Bleen Paradox	22
4.2.3	Kolmogorov Complexity and Its Dependence of Language	23
4.2.4	Grue-Bleen Again	26
4.2.5	Evolutionary Explanations	31
4.3	Problems with the Frequentist Approach	34

5	Subjective Probabilities	37
5.1	Linda the Bank Teller	37
5.2	Pascal's Wager	38
5.3	Classical versus Bayesian Statistics	40
5.3.1	Basic Definitions	40
5.3.2	The Gambler Fallacy	41
5.3.3	Exchangeability	42
5.3.4	Confidence Is Not Probability	44
5.3.5	Classical Statistics Can Be Ridiculous	45
5.3.6	Different Methods for Different Goals	46
II	Behavioral Definitions	49
6	A Case Study	51
6.1	A Characterization Theorem for Maximization of Utility	51
6.2	Proof	53
6.3	Interpretations	55
6.3.1	A Few Definitions	56
6.3.2	A Meta-Scientific Interpretation	59
6.3.3	A Normative Interpretation	62
6.3.4	A Descriptive Interpretation	63
6.4	Limitations	64
6.4.1	Semiororders	65
6.4.2	Other Ways to Measure Utility	71
7	The Role of Theories	72
7.1	Theories Are Always Wrong	72
7.2	Theories and Conceptual Frameworks	74
7.3	Logical Positivism as a Metaphor	76
8	Von Neumann-Morgenstern's Theorem	78
8.1	Background	78
8.2	The Theorem	79
8.3	Proofs	83
8.3.1	The Algebraic Approach	83
8.3.2	A Geometric Approach	84
8.3.3	A Separation Argument	85
8.4	The Three Interpretations	86
9	De Finetti's Theorem	89
9.1	Motivation	89
9.2	The Theorem	90
9.3	A Proof	91
9.4	The Three Interpretations	92

10	Savage's Theorem	94
10.1	Background	94
10.2	States, Outcomes, and Acts	96
10.3	Axioms	97
	10.3.1 P1	97
	10.3.2 P2	97
	10.3.3 Notation	99
	10.3.4 Null Events	99
	10.3.5 P3	100
	10.3.6 P4	102
	10.3.7 P5	102
	10.3.8 P6	103
	10.3.9 P7	104
10.4	The Result for a Finite Outcome Set	105
	10.4.1 Finitely Additive Measures	105
	10.4.2 Nonatomic Measures	107
	10.4.3 The Theorem	108
10.5	The Case of a General Outcome Set	108
10.6	Interpretations	109
10.7	The Proof and Qualitative Probabilities	110
11	The Definition of States	113
11.1	Causality	113
	11.1.1 Newcomb's Paradox	113
	11.1.2 States as Functions from Acts to Outcomes	114
	11.1.3 A Problem	115
11.2	Hempel's Paradox of Confirmation	116
	11.2.1 Are All Ravens Black?	116
	11.2.2 A State-Space Formulation	117
	11.2.3 What Is a Confirmation?	117
	11.2.4 A Resolution	118
	11.2.5 Good's Variation	118
	11.2.6 What Do We Learn from This?	119
11.3	Monty Hall Three-Door Game	120
12	A Critique of Savage	123
12.1	Criticizing Critiques	123
	12.1.1 An Example	123
	12.1.2 The General Lesson	124
12.2	Critique of P3 and P4	125
	12.2.1 Example	125
	12.2.2 Defense	126
	12.2.3 State-Dependent Utility	127
	12.2.4 The Definition of Subjective Probability	128
	12.2.5 When Is State Dependence Necessary?	129

12.3	Critique of PI and P2	130
12.3.1	The Basic Problem	130
12.3.2	Reasoned Choice versus Raw Preferences	131
12.3.3	Schmeidler's Critique and Ellsberg's Paradox	132
12.3.4	Observability of States	136
12.3.5	Problems of Complexity	137
13	Objectivity and Rationality	138
13.1	Subjectivity and Objectivity	138
13.2	Objective and Subjective Rationality	139
14	Anscombe-Aumann's Theorem	142
III	Alternative Behavioral Theories	145
15	Choquet Expected Utility	147
15.1	Schmeidler's Intuition	147
15.2	Choquet Integral	149
15.3	Comonotonicity	150
15.4	Axioms and Result	151
16	Prospect Theory	154
16.1	Background	154
16.2	Gain-Loss Asymmetry	154
16.3	Distortion of Probabilities	156
16.4	Rank-Dependent Probabilities and Choquet Integration	158
17	Maxmin Expected Utility	160
17.1	Convex Games	160
17.2	A Cognitive Interpretation of CEU	161
17.3	Axioms and Result	163
17.4	Interpretation of MMEU	163
17.5	Generalizations and Variations	165
17.6	Bewley's Alternative Approach	165
17.7	Combining Objective and Subjective Rationality	166
17.8	Applications	168
IV	Cognitive Origins	171
18	Case-Based Qualitative Beliefs	173
18.1	Axioms and Result	173
18.2	Four Known Techniques	175
18.3	The Combination Axiom in General Analogical Reasoning	177
18.4	Violations of the Combination Axiom	179

19	Frequentism Revisited	180
19.1	Similarity-Weighted Empirical Frequencies	180
19.2	Intuition	181
19.3	Axiomatization	182
19.4	Empirical Similarity and Objective Probabilities	184
20	Future Research	188
	<i>References</i>	191
	<i>Index</i>	199