

Collective Management of Copyrights between Competition, Regulation, and Monopolism

A Comparison of European
and U.S. Approaches to
Collective Management Organizations

by

Dr. Martin Miernicki

Vienna 2017



Nomos

facultas

Table of Contents

Vorwort des Herausgebers	7
Preface and Acknowledgements	9
Table of Contents	11
Abbreviations	17
 I. INTRODUCTION	 23
1. Collective Rights Management – Rationales and Functions	24
2. Purpose and Structure of the Research	28
3. Terminological Remarks	29
3.1. Joint, Collective, and Centralized Management	30
3.2. Collecting Societies and Copyright Collectives	31
3.3. PROs and RROs	32
4. Introduction to EU and U.S. Copyright Law	33
4.1. Constitutional Background	33
4.2. Overview of Copyright-Related Legislation	35
4.3. Communication to the Public and Performance Rights	36
4.4. Performers' Rights	39
5. Emergence of Collective Management Organizations	40
5.1. Emergence of Collective Management in France	40
5.2. Emergence of Collective Management in Germany	41
5.3. Emergence of Collective Management in the United States	43
5.4. Common Developments	44
 II. THE REGULATION OF COLLECTIVE MANAGEMENT ORGANIZATIONS	 45
1. Regulatory Frameworks	46
1.1. EU Regulation	46
1.1.1. Primary Law	46
1.1.2. The Services Directive	47
1.1.3. General Copyright-Related Directives	51
1.1.4. Sector-Specific Regulation:	
Collective Management Directive	52
a) Background and Development	52
b) The Role of the Commission	58

c) The Emergence of New Licensing Models After 2005	60
d) The Union's competence to regulate collective management	64
e) Scope of the Collective Management Directive	66
f) Main features of the Collective Management Directive	69
1.1.5. Implications for the National Regulation of EU Member States	74
1.2. U.S. Regulation	76
1.2.1. Antitrust Law	76
1.2.2. Regulation by Consent Decrees: Background and Development	78
1.2.3. Main Features of the ASCAP and BMI Consent Decrees ..	80
1.2.4. CMOs and Statutory Licenses	81
1.3. Comments on the Regulatory Frameworks and their Development	82
2. Applicability of Antitrust Laws to CMOs	83
2.1. Treaty on the Functioning of the European Union	84
2.1.1. Preliminary Question: The Relationship of EU Competition Law and the Collective Management Directive	84
2.1.2. Undertakings	85
2.1.3. Article 101 TFEU	86
2.1.4. Article 102 TFEU	89
2.1.5. Cross-Border Element	91
2.1.6. Article 106 TFEU	93
2.2. Sherman Act	94
2.2.1. Persons	94
2.2.2. Section 1 Sherman Act	95
2.2.3. Section 2 Sherman Act	97
2.2.4. Interstate Commerce	99
2.3. Comments on the Applicability of Antitrust Laws to CMOs	99
2.3.1. General Remarks	99
2.3.2. What are the Relevant Markets and What is their Nature? ..	100
2.3.3. CMOs as Unlawful Combinations	103
2.3.4. New Licensing Models and Competition Law	109
3. The Regulation of the Different Relations of CMOs: Right Holders, Users, Sister Organizations	110
3.1. CMOs and Right Holders	110
3.1.1. General Remarks	110
3.1.2. Access to Collective Management Services	113

3.1.3.	Acquisition of Membership	115
a)	Nationality Requirement	115
b)	(Global) Assignment Requirement	118
c)	Individual/Direct Management	123
3.1.4.	Modification and Termination of Membership Agreements and Assignment Contracts	127
a)	Withdrawal and Termination	127
b)	Coordination of Membership Agreement and Rights Grant	130
3.1.5.	Governance Structure	132
a)	General Policies	132
b)	Membership Rights	133
c)	Administration and Supervision	136
d)	Transparency and Reporting Obligation	137
e)	Dispute Resolution	139
3.1.6.	Financial Flows between Right Holders and CMOs	140
a)	Collection, Use, and Distribution of the Income	140
b)	Management Fees	146
3.1.7.	Comments on the Relationship between CMOs and Right Holders	148
a)	General Remarks	148
b)	Obligation to Represent	149
c)	Exclusivity of the Rights Grant	150
d)	The (Partial) Withdrawal Issue	151
e)	Of Right Holders, Publishers, and Composers	155
3.2.	CMOs and Users	156
3.2.1.	General Remarks	156
a)	Principles of European Case Law	156
b)	The Collective Management Directive	159
c)	Principles of U.S. Law	162
3.2.2.	Blanket Licenses	168
3.2.3.	Refusal to Issue Cross-Border Licenses	176
3.2.4.	License Fees and Royalties	178
a)	General Remarks	179
b)	Calculation Methods	184
c)	Level of License Fees	195
3.2.5.	Excursus: Statutory Licensing of Musical Rights	204
a)	Overview	206
b)	Rate-Setting Standards	208
3.2.6.	Comments on the Relationship between CMOs and Users	215
a)	General Remarks	215
b)	Obligation to License	216
c)	The 100 percent Licensing Issue	216

d) Defining and Applying Rate-Setting Standards	217
e) Approaches to Blanket Licensing	223
f) Of Users, Discotheques, and Streaming Services	229
3.3. CMOs and Other CMOs	230
3.3.1. The Relationship Between CMOs as a Form of Cooperation	231
3.3.2. The European Approach to Representation Agreements	233
3.3.3. Restrictions Relating to the Representation of Right Holders	235
3.3.4. Tariffs, Rebates, and Deductions	238
a) The Coordination of Tariff Systems	238
b) Rebates and Deductions from License Fees	242
3.3.5. Exclusivity Clauses Relating to the Rights Grant	243
a) General Remarks	243
b) Restrictions as to Users (Customer Allocation)	244
c) Restrictions as to Other CMOs (Territorial Allocation)	246
d) Direct Legal Observations of the CISAC Litigation	250
3.3.6. The Problem of Union-Wide Licensing and the Solution of the Collective Management Directive	253
a) The Need for MTL Options and the Traditional European Licensing Structure	253
b) The MTL Regime of the Collective Management Directive	255
c) The MTL Regime of the Collective Management Directive and New Licensing Models	257
3.3.7. The U.S. Experience	259
a) National Cooperation	259
b) International Cooperation	260
3.3.8. Comments on the relationship between CMOs and other CMOs	261
a) Representation Agreements: Rationales and Legal Status	261
b) The Future of Reciprocal Representation	264
c) Feasibility of MTL under the Collective Management Directive	266

III. CONCLUDING REMARKS AND OBSERVATIONS 267

1. Orientation and Focus of the Regulation of Collective Management of Copyrights in the European Union and the United States 267

1.1. Structural Differences and Common Problems 267

1.2. Balancing the Interests of Users and Right Holders – A Matter of Perspective	268
1.3. The Tale of the Author	270
1.4. The Reduced Principle of Equal Treatment	272
2. The Diverging Image of CMOs: Legitimate Functions and Limited Justifications	272
2.1. Skepticism to the Traditional CMO Model from a Competition Law Perspective	272
2.2. Cultural Functions and the Solidarity Principle	273
3. Regulatory Models: Competition, Monopolies and Minimum Standards Against the Background of Copyright Law	277
3.1. The Competition-Monopolism Dichotomy	277
3.2. Creating Requirements for Competition	281
3.3. Collective Management as a Reflection of Underlying Copyright Systems	283
IV. SUMMARY OF THE MOST IMPORTANT RESULTS	286
REFERENCES	289
1. Books and Journal Articles	289
2. European Commission Official Documents	303
3. European Parliament Official Documents	305
4. United States Copyright Royalty Board Official Documents	306
5. United States Copyright Office Official Documents	306
6. United States Department of Justice Official Documents	306
7. ASCAP Official Documents	306
8. BMI Official Documents	307
9. PRS Official Documents	307
10. Press Releases	308
11. Further Electronic Sources and Webpages	308
12. Table of Cases	310
12.1. European Union	310
12.2. United States	315
12.3. National Courts	318
Zusammenfassung der wesentlichen Aussagen	321
Index	327