

WORLD BANK LATIN AMERICAN  
AND CARIBBEAN STUDIES

# BEYOND THE CITY

---

## The Rural Contribution to Development

*David de Ferranti*

*Guillermo E. Perry*

*William Foster*

*Daniel Lederman*

*Alberto Valdés*



**THE WORLD BANK**  
Washington, D.C.

# Contents

<b>Acknowledgments</b> .....	<b>.xi</b>
<b>Acronyms and Abbreviations</b> .....	<b>.xiii</b>
<b>Chapter 1: The Rural Economy's Contribution to Development: Summary of Findings and Policy Implications</b> .....	<b>.1</b>
1.1 Policy implications .....	.2
1.2 Summary of findings .....	.7
1.3 Conclusions: The need for institutional reforms .....	.26
1.4 Report organization .....	.27
Notes .....	.27
<b>Part I: The Rural Contribution to Development: Analytical Issues</b> .....	<b>.29</b>
<b>Chapter 2: How Do We Define the Rural Sector?</b> .....	<b>.31</b>
2.1 How big is the RNR sector? .....	.32
2.2 RNR sector composition based on national accounts .....	.32
2.3 What do rural people do? Rural poverty, employment, and income sources .....	.42
2.4 How many people really live in rural areas? .....	.46
Notes .....	.55
Annex A .....	.57
Annex B .....	.58
Annex C .....	.60
<b>Chapter 3: From Accounting to Economics: The Rural Natural Resource Sector's Contribution to Development</b> .....	<b>.61</b>
3.1 RNR activities and welfare: Analytical framework .....	.62
3.2 The RNR sector and economic growth .....	.64
3.3 The RNR sector and income of the poorest households .....	.75
3.4 The RNR sector and the environment .....	.80
3.5 The RNR sector and macroeconomic volatility .....	.93
3.6 The RNR sector's contribution to Latin American and Caribbean welfare and beyond .....	.97
Notes .....	.102
<b>Chapter 4: The Promise of the Spatial Approach</b> .....	<b>.103</b>
4.1 The spatial approach: A new fad or old concerns? .....	.103
4.2 The extensive menu of concepts that justify spatial development programs .....	.104
4.3 The spatial approach complements the sectoral approach .....	.106
4.4 The spatial approach is promising: New evidence .....	.112
4.5 Summary of analytical findings .....	.122
Notes .....	.123

<b>Part II: The Rural Contribution to Development: Policy Issues</b> .....	<b>125</b>
<b>Chapter 5: Public Expenditures, RNR Productivity, and Development</b> .....	<b>127</b>
5.1 National welfare and the allocation of public expenditures .....	128
5.2 Are there policy biases in Latin American and Caribbean countries against rural development? .....	130
5.3 Disparities in the per capita spending level in urban and rural areas .....	133
5.4 Does excessive urban concentration harm RNR activities and the rural economy? .....	136
5.5 Sources of RNR productivity growth in Latin American and Caribbean countries .....	140
Notes .....	152
<b>Chapter 6: Policy and the Competitiveness of Agriculture: Trade, Research &amp; Development, and Land Markets</b> .....	<b>155</b>
6.1 The international trade regime, country trade policies, and the RNR sector .....	156
6.2 Latin American and Caribbean public provision of agricultural R&D .....	165
6.3 Identifying socially desirable public policies for rural land markets .....	180
Notes .....	183
<b>Chapter 7: Enhancing the Contribution of Rural Economic Activities to National Development: Rural Finance and Infrastructure Services</b> .....	<b>185</b>
7.1 What role should the government play in rural finance and development? .....	185
7.2 Infrastructure investments for regional development and the poor .....	193
Notes .....	198
<b>Chapter 8: Promoting Economic and Social Development in Poor Regions: Direct Income Supports, Environmental Services, and Tourism</b> .....	<b>199</b>
8.1 Compensation for trade liberalization and targeted anti-poverty support .....	200
8.2 Policies to enhance the contribution of rural environmental services .....	206
8.3 Rural tourism and public support .....	210
Notes .....	213
<b>Chapter 9: Policy Challenges of the Spatial Approach: From Promise to Reality</b> .....	<b>215</b>
9.1 Introduction .....	215
9.2 Government and community roles in enhancing the rural contribution to development .....	215
9.3 Policy evaluation .....	225
9.4 The promising future of Latin American and Caribbean regional development policies .....	230
Notes .....	231
<b>Bibliography</b> .....	<b>233</b>
 <b>Boxes</b>	
<b>Chapter 1</b>	
1.1 Five critical policy questions for Latin American and Caribbean economic authorities .....	2
1.2 Main findings .....	8
<b>Chapter 3</b>	
3.1 Beyond GDP: Accounting for the effect of RNR activities on national welfare .....	63
3.2 The relationship between RNR GDP share and development .....	67
3.3 Rural-urban migration in Bolivia .....	70
3.4 The sectorial approach to illicit crop eradication in Andean countries, 1980–2002 .....	99
<b>Chapter 4</b>	
4.1 The territorial approach to illicit crop eradication .....	122
<b>Chapter 5</b>	
5.1 Empirical translog production functions .....	141
5.2 Empirical farm-level production functions .....	146
<b>Chapter 6</b>	
6.1 Welfare effects of the introduction of genetically modified organisms in Argentina and Mexico .....	171
6.2 Genetically modified organism generation options in tropical Latin American and Caribbean countries .....	174

**Chapter 7**

7.1	What market failures are relevant to rural finance?	186
7.2	Governance criteria for public rural financial services	187
7.3	Risk management approaches of farmers and other rural producers	189
7.4	Weather indices and area yield for crop insurance programs	191

**Chapter 8**

8.1	Direct payments to producers	201
8.2	CCT programs in Latin America	204
8.3	Agricultural tourism in Colombia	212

**Chapter 9**

9.1	Macro models used to evaluate EU cohesion funds	228
-----	---	-----

**Figures****Chapter 1**

1.1	Official and consistent estimates of the Latin America and Caribbean rural population share	9
1.2	Cumulative population distributions by distance to major Latin American and Caribbean cities	10
1.3	Agriculture's GDP share diminishes as countries develop (RNR sectors' GDP share and income per capita, 1960–2002)	12
1.4	RNR growth has positive effects on the overall economy in developing countries (impact of a 1 percent increase in RNR GDP on the rest of the national economy the following year)	12
1.5	Geographic distances to major cities relative to wages after economic reforms in Brazil	16
1.6	Mexican state GDP per capita relative to the federal district, 1940–2000	17
1.7	Regional GDP per capita in Colombia as a share of Bogota's, 1960–96	18

**Chapter 2**

2.1	RNR exports per rural person and agricultural labor productivity, 22 Latin American and Caribbean countries, 2001	39
2.2	Relationships between remoteness, population density, and poverty in Nicaragua	48
2.3	Population density in Latin America and the Caribbean	49
2.4	Cumulative population distribution in Latin America and the Caribbean relative to distance from a major city	49
2.5	Cumulative population distribution in Brazil relative to distance from a major city	50
2.6	Proportion of population that have more than one hour travel time to a city of 100,000 people and that are below the specified population density thresholds	51
2.7	Census rurality measures compared to definition of <150 person per square kilometer and > 1 hour travel time criteria	51

**Chapter 3**

3.1	RNR sector's GDP share and GDP growth, 1960–2002	66
3.2	RNR sector's GDP share and income per capita (annual data from 1960–2002)	67
3.3	Impact of a 1 percent increase in RNR GDP on the rest of the national economy the following year	72
3.4	Impact of a 1 percent increase in non-RNR GDP on the RNR sector	72
3.5	Impact of a 1 percent increase in RNR plus food industries' GDP on the rest of the national economy the following year	74
3.6	CO <sub>2</sub> emissions and RNR activities around the world, 1971–2000	81
3.7	Freshwater withdrawals and RNR activities around the world, 2000	84
3.8	Deforestation and RNR activities around the world, 2000	84
3.9	RNR activities and deforestation sources in Latin American and Caribbean countries between 1990 and 2000	86
3.10	Deforestation and potential agricultural lands in Latin American and Caribbean countries, 2000	86
3.11	The ecological footprints of South American agriculture, 2000	88

**Chapter 4**

4.1	Path dependency in Brazilian frontier settlements: Econometric evidence	121
-----	---	-----

**Chapter 5**

5.1	Urban primacy levels in the Americas, 1960–2000	138
5.2	Illiteracy and fertilizer use per worker	144

**Chapter 7**

7.1 Assessing the performance of rural financial institutions .....	192
---	-----

**Tables****Chapter 1**

1.1 Commodity agricultural production values in Latin American and Caribbean (LAC) countries (percent of national GDP) .....	8
1.2 Nonagricultural income in rural Latin American and Caribbean households .....	9
1.3 Agricultural and nonagricultural GDP growth rates (annual averages for 1970–99, data at constant 1995 dollar exchange rate) .....	11
1.4 Direct and indirect effects of a one-percent agricultural output increase .....	13
1.5 The effect of public goods on agricultural sector productivity .....	20
1.6 Estimated R&D rates of return to the agricultural sector .....	20
1.7 Urban and rural student language attainment by education level (percent of all students with satisfactory attainment) .....	21
1.8 Latin American and Caribbean differentials in access to safe water .....	21
1.9 Composition of rural public expenditures .....	22
1.10 Latin American and Caribbean countries are net agricultural exporters, but many are net food importers .....	23
1.11 Average MFN tariffs are as high in agriculture as in manufacturing .....	24
1.12 MFN tariff peaks (above 15 percent) are as common in agriculture as in manufacturing .....	24
1.13 Public rural expenditures compared with agriculture/GDP ratios .....	25

**Chapter 2**

2.1 Evolution of agriculture GDP in the Latin American and Caribbean region, 1990–2002 .....	33
2.2 Agriculture, forestry, and fisheries as a percent of national GDP .....	34
2.3 Sum of sectoral GDPs of agriculture-related industries according to IICA, 1997 (\$ billions) .....	35
2.4 Summary of expanded agricultural GDP share estimates .....	35
2.5 Main forward linkages for Chile, 1996 .....	36
2.6 Export and import shares and trade balance of rural natural resource sectors (agriculture, forestry, and fisheries) in Latin America and the Caribbean, 1999–2001 averages .....	38
2.7 Average value of RNR and total exports per person, 1999–2001 .....	38
2.8 RNR export and import shares by subsectors, 2000–02 .....	40
2.9 Net trade position in food and agricultural products (excluding forestry and fisheries), 2000–02 averages (\$ millions) .....	41
2.10 Taxonomy of Latin American and Caribbean countries, 1999–2001 .....	42
2.11 Rural poverty and indigence rates (percentage of rural population) .....	43
2.12 Rural nonfarm income (RNFI) as share of rural household income, 1990s .....	44
2.13 Rural household income, distribution, and composition in Mexico, 2003 .....	45
2.14 Income sources of rural households in El Salvador .....	45
2.15 Rural population (absolute value) and rural as percentage of total .....	50
2.16 Urban and rural populations defined, based on data provided .....	52
2.17 Proportion of total population by population density and remoteness .....	53
2.18 Proportion of total population, relative to hours of travel to a city of 100,000 people and low population density ..	53
2.19 Proportion of total population by land category and low population density .....	54
2.20 Proportion of total land area by land category and low population density .....	55
A2.1 Share of RNR products in total exports, 1980–2001 (percent) .....	57
A2.2 Classification of countries according to per capita income and development level, 1999–2001 .....	57
B2.1 Trade balance of forestry products, 1990–92 and 2000–02 averages (\$ millions) .....	58
B2.2 Trade balance of fishery products, 1990–92 and 2000–01 averages (\$ millions) .....	59

**Chapter 3**

3.1 RNR and non-RNR GDP growth rates (annual averages for 1970–99 data at constant 1995 dollar) .....	65
3.2 Regression results: The negative relationship between the RNR sector's GDP share on the development level holds across the globe .....	68
3.3 RNR GDP share falls with development in all Latin American and Caribbean countries (econometric estimates: FE IV regressions with annual data, 1960–2000) .....	69

3.4	Cross-sector Granger causality: Heterogeneity across Latin American and Caribbean (LAC) countries	73
3.5	RNR labor productivity's impact on household incomes across quintiles: Latin America and the Caribbean (LAC) versus other regions (effect of a 1-percent increase on the average household income, percent)	76
3.6	The effect of agricultural or rural prices and incomes on labor demand in Chile and Mexico (effect of a 1 percent increase of each variable on the labor demand, percent)	77
3.7	Sectorial determinants of (log) CO <sub>2</sub> emissions: Fixed-effects estimations with annual data, 1970–2000	83
3.8	Sectorial determinants of (log) freshwater withdrawals (GMM cross-section estimations with year 2000 data)	85
3.9	Sectorial determinants of deforestation between 1990 and 2000 (GMM cross-sectional estimates)	87
3.10	Impact of agricultural land on eco-regional integrity in Latin America and the Caribbean	91
3.11	Differences in agro-chemical demands between export-oriented and traditional crops in Chile (price and output demand elasticities for imported fertilizers, pesticides, and domestic nitrate fertilizers)	92
3.12	Co-movement of prices and quantities across economic activities	94
3.13	Volatility of economic growth across sectors and regions by decades	95
3.14	Sectorial determinants of GDP growth volatility, 1960–99	96
3.15	GMM estimates of determinants of the diversity index of agricultural exports	97
3.16	Contributions of agriculture and non-agriculture to national welfare as of 2000	101
<b>Chapter 4</b>		
4.1	The impact of national indicators of agricultural and rural sophistication on rural wages (effects of a 1 percent increase in each indicator on wages of rural prime-age males, percent)	107
4.2	The impact of national indicators of agricultural and rural sophistication on urban wages (effects of a 1 percent increase in each indicator on wages of urban prime-age males, percent)	107
4.3	Agricultural output differences due to factor use across Ecuadorian provinces (deviations from the national average, percent)	109
4.4	Agricultural productivity differences due to factor use across Ecuadorian provinces (deviations from the national average, percent)	110
4.5	Determinants of industrial employment agglomeration in Argentina, 1974–94	114
4.6	Employment concentration in Brazil, 1986–99	115
4.7	Employment concentration in Mexico, 1985–98	116
4.8	Determinants of employment agglomeration in Brazil, 1986–99	117
4.9	Determinants of employment agglomeration in Mexico, 1985–98	118
4.10	Determinants of industry-regional wage premia in Brazil, 1985–99 Major coca regions in Andean territories	119 122
<b>Chapter 5</b>		
5.1	Government spending in rural areas in Latin America, subsidies and total expenditures (millions of U.S. dollars), 1985–2000	132
5.2	Central government expenditures on education both in rural areas and nationally (U.S. dollars per person)	134
5.3	Percentage of students reaching three levels of mathematics proficiency, and primary school dropout rates, rural and urban areas	134
5.4	Index of government expenditures in rural areas: Share of rural outlays in total spending relative to the share of agricultural GDP, 1985–2000	135
5.5	Regional urbanization levels (percent), 1925–2025	136
5.6	Urban population percentages living in cities of differing scales, 1950 and 1990	136
5.7	Degree of urbanization and urban primacy in Latin America	137
5.8	Total factor productivity growth in RNR activities in Latin America and the Caribbean (LAC) and around the globe	142
5.9	The effect of public goods on RNR-sector productivity growth in Latin America and the Caribbean (LAC) and the rest of the world	143
5.10	The effect of public goods on RNR-sector productivity growth in Latin America and Caribbean (LAC) countries during the 1990s (effect of a 1 percent increase in each variable on the average annual growth of RNR TFP for each country)	145
5.11	Production elasticities in Ecuadorian farms	147
5.12	Effect of state variables on Ecuadorian farm production (effect of a 1 percent increase in each variable on farm output, percent)	149
5.13	Determinants of household agricultural output in Nicaragua, 1998	151
5.14	Determinants of household agricultural inefficiency in Mexico, 2003	152

**Chapter 6**

6.1	Summary of world price results for multilateral trade policy liberalization simulations (percent)	158
6.2	Trade balance of agricultural products for different OECD protection levels, 2000–02 average (current dollars millions)	161
6.3	Percent of trade in all agricultural products for different OECD protection levels, 2000–02 average	162
6.4	Average MFN tariff rates by product category, 2000	164
6.5	Proportion of tariffs by product category, with tariff values exceeding 15 percent	164
6.6	Public agricultural research expenditures: Annual growth rates (percent per year)	165
6.7	Funding sources for Latin American and Caribbean public agricultural research in the 1990s	166
6.8	Institutional composition of public agricultural R&D spending, 1996	166
6.9	Estimated rates of return	167
6.10	Estimated average annual yield growth due to modern varieties for selected crops and regions in marginal areas with poor market access	178

**Chapter 8**

8.1	Design features of CCT in Latin American and Caribbean countries, 2002	203
8.2	World Bank support for PES programs	207
8.3	Tourism sector size in eight Latin American and Caribbean countries	211

**Chapter 9**

9.1	Provincial regional policies in Argentina	219
	Impact of the structural funds on GDP growth: Comparison of simulation results obtained from macroeconomic models (growth effects in percent differential from the baseline)	228