

End of the Line

The Failure of Amtrak Reform
and the Future of
America's Passenger Trains

Joseph Vranich

The AEI Press

Publisher for the American Enterprise Institute

WASHINGTON, D.C.

Contents

LIST OF ILLUSTRATIONS	xi
FOREWORD, <i>Wendell Cox</i>	xiii
ACKNOWLEDGMENTS	xvii
INTRODUCTION	1
1. A BRIEF HISTORY OF AMTRAK	9
2. THE FAILURE OF AMTRAK REFORM EFFORTS	12
A Blue-Ribbon Call for Major Change	13
The Amtrak Reform and Accountability Act of 1997	14
The Clinton Administration's Unqualified Reform Board	16
Projecting a "Glidepath" to Profitability	18
Squandering Amtrak's Unearned IRS "Tax Refund"	21
The Amtrak Reform Council Pulls the "Sunset Trigger"	24
A Plan to Liquidate Amtrak	26
Amtrak Blocks Liquidation Plans	28
A Heritage of Suppressing Information	31
3. AMTRAK'S PRESENT CONDITION	36
Amtrak's Role in Passenger Transport	37
Amtrak's Finances since the Failure of Reform	44
Amtrak's Fossilized Route Structure	45
Shutdown Threats	46
Disproportionate Subsidies	51
Hidden Amtrak Subsidies	53
<i>Income Tax Return</i>	53
<i>Loan Default</i>	54
<i>Federal Transit Administration</i>	54
<i>Federal Railroad Administration</i>	54

	<i>Housing and Urban Development</i>	55
	<i>Congestion Mitigation and Air Quality (CMAQ) Improvement</i>	55
	<i>Transportation Infrastructure Finance and Innovation Act of 1998</i>	55
	<i>Federally Imposed Local Tax Exemptions</i>	56
	<i>State Funds</i>	56
	<i>Local Funds</i>	56
	<i>International Assistance</i>	57
	Attempts to Tap Highway and Air Travelers' User Fees	59
	Additional Costs to the Economy	60
4.	MYTHS ABOUT THE VALUE OF AMTRAK	65
	Myth No. 1: Amtrak's Political Invulnerability	65
	Myth No. 2: September 11 Demonstrated the Need for Amtrak	67
	Myth No. 3: The Acela Express Will Save Amtrak	71
	Myth No. 4: America Needs a National High-Speed Rail Network	76
	Myth No. 5: America Needs European Trains	79
	Myth No. 6: America Needs Long-Distance Trains	79
	Myth No. 7: Bigger Would Be Better	85
5.	FALLACIES ABOUT THE COST OF AMTRAK	89
	Fallacy No. 1: Amtrak's Revenues Will Increase Substantially—Someday	89
	<i>Advertising</i>	92
	<i>Reservations and Passenger Information Systems</i>	92
	<i>Stations and Parking</i>	92
	<i>More Convenient Connections</i>	93
	<i>New Equipment</i>	93
	<i>Service Guarantees</i>	93
	<i>Improving On-Time Performance</i>	94
	<i>Carrying Freight and High-Value Express</i>	95
	Fallacy No. 2: Amtrak Will Control Its Costs—Someday	96
	<i>Labor Costs for Amtrak and Airlines: A Stark Contrast</i>	99
	<i>Amtrak Has Difficulty Raising Fares to Raise Revenue</i>	100
	Fallacy No. 3: Cutting Amtrak Fares Will Increase Ridership	102

Fallacy No. 4: Amtrak Contributes to Economic Growth	106
Fallacy No. 5: America Cannot "Throw Away" Amtrak	107
6. DEFENDING AGAINST TERRORISM: CAN AMTRAK DO THE JOB?	109
New York's Railroad Tunnels	110
Amtrak's Skewed Priorities	112
Local Capital Subsidies and Ownership	113
Protecting Trains, Stations, and Infrastructure	114
All Train Operators Are Vulnerable to Attack	117
Sabotage to Amtrak: Real and Threatened	119
Amtrak's Counterproductive Political Actions	121
Inequities in Paying for Transportation Security	122
7. ESCAPE FROM AMTRAK: STATE AND LOCAL GOVERNMENTS	124
Shutdown Threats Harm Commuters	124
Boston and the Changing Commuter Contract Market	126
Other Cities and Regions	130
<i>Chicago</i>	130
<i>Los Angeles</i>	131
<i>New Jersey</i>	131
<i>New York</i>	131
<i>Northern Virginia</i>	132
State Government Relationships Deteriorate	135
8. PASSENGER RAILROADS: THEY CAN WORK	137
Privatization Options	137
Fifty-five Nations Would Do Away with Amtrak	139
Great Britain's Franchising Sparks Record Traffic Boom	143
Japan's Stunning Rail Efficiency Gains	153
Rocky Mountaineer Trains Boost Canadian Tourism	155
America's Success with Conrail and the Alaska Railroad	157
9. CREATIVE APPROACHES TO RAIL TRANSPORTATION	159
Amtrak Undermines Emerging Competitors	160
U.S. Capabilities Exist to Replace Amtrak	162
Diversity of Alternative Operators	163
Service to the Nostalgia Market	165
Air and Bus Developments	166
Effective Legislative Remedies	168

x END OF THE LINE

CONCLUSION	169
APPENDIX A: CHRONOLOGY OF WARNINGS ABOUT AMTRAK'S FINANCIAL CONDITION	175
APPENDIX B: CHRONOLOGY OF ACELA EXPRESS DEVELOPMENT	182
APPENDIX C: THE BREADTH AND DEPTH OF WORLDWIDE RAIL PRIVATIZATION	195
APPENDIX D: LEGISLATION REFLECTING REFORM ATTEMPTS	203
NOTES	205
RECOMMENDED REFERENCES	251
INDEX	257
ABOUT THE AUTHOR	265