

WBI Learning Resources Series

Aligning Financial Supervisory Structures with Country Needs

Edited by

Jeffrey Carmichael

Alexander Fleming

David T. Llewellyn

WORLD ^CBANK INSTITUTE

Promoting knowledge and learning for a better world

Contents

Foreword.....	xlii
----------------------	-------------

Contributors.....	xvli
--------------------------	-------------

Chapter 1: Summary of the Discussion.....	1
--	----------

Jeffrey Carmichael

Choosing an Appropriate Regulatory Structure.....	2
Managing the Transition.....	6
Making Structures Work.....	9
Other Issues.....	12
Conclusions.....	13

Chapter 2: Institutional Structure of Financial Regulation and Supervision: The Basic Issues.....	17
--	-----------

David T. Llewellyn

Institutional Structure.....	19
Some Initial Perspectives.....	22

Regulation, the Financial System, and the Economy.....	22
Universal Functions.....	24
Origin of the Debate.....	30
Some Key Issues.....	32
The Importance of Institutional Structure.....	34
A Regulatory Matrix.....	36
Alternative Frameworks.....	40
Integrated Versus Multiple Agencies:.....	43
The Case for Integration.....	43
The Potential Hazards of Integrated Agencies.....	47
The Mega Regulator-Supervisor.....	52
Twin Peaks Model.....	56
The Role of the Central Bank.....	58
International Experience.....	68
Corporate Governance Issues.....	81
Conclusions.....	84
Appendix. Financial Conglomerates.....	85
 Chapter 3: Making the Structural Decision.....	93
Australia's Approach to Regulatory Reform.....	93
<i>Jeffrey Carmichael</i>	
Setting Up the Inquiry.....	94
The Evidence Produced by the Inquiry.....	96
Inefficiencies in the Financial System.....	96
The Changing Financial Landscape.....	97
Regulatory Implications.....	100
From Implications to Objectives.....	103
Philosophical Framework.....	104
Anticompetitive Behavior.....	105
Market Misconduct.....	105
Asymmetric Information.....	106

Systemic Instability.....	107
Implications for Regulatory Structure.....	107
Structural Options Considered.....	108
Industry-Based Regulators.....	109
The Market Failure-based Model.....	109
The Super Regulator Model.....	110
The Committee Recommendations.....	111
Conclusions.....	112

The South African Case.....115

Andre Bezuidenhout

South Africa's Financial Environment.....	116
The Process to Review the Regulatory Environment.....	117
A Mild Bank Liquidity Crisis.....	119
Country-Specific Features Informing the Structural Decision....	120
Openness of the Economy and the Discretion of the Central Bank.....	120
Concentration in Banking.....	121
Settlement System and Time to React.....	122
The Financial Safety Net and Deposit Insurance.....	122
Lack of True Integration in Financial Groups.....	123
The Role of State-Owned and Foreign-Owned Banks.....	124
Rationale for an Objective-Based Approach.....	124
A Model for Good Times and Bad?.....	126
Conclusions.....	126

The New Structure of Financial Regulation in Ireland.....129

Liam O'Reilly

International Trends and Issues in Financial Regulation.....	130
Rationale for Reviewing the Structure of Financial Regulation in Ireland.....	131
Process Involved in Implementing the Government Decision	132

Why This Model Is Suitable for Ireland.....	134
The New Structure in Operation.....	136
Financial Stability.....	138
Regulation of All Sectors.....	139
Strategic Plan, 2004-06.....	142
Central Bank and Financial Services Authority of Ireland Bill, 2003.....	143
Confidentiality Rules.....	144
Funding Arrangements.....	145
Conclusions.....	146

Chapter 4: The Speed of Change: Balancing the Risks.....149

Issues In the Unification of Supervision: Lessons from the Swedish Experience.....	149
---	-----

Stefan Ingves

Key Considerations.....	150
Managerial Challenges.....	152
The Swedish Experience.....	153
Conclusions.....	158

The Integration of Financial Supervisory Bodies: The Korean Experience.....	161
--	-----

Seok-Keun Lee

The Need for Change and the Decision to Integrate.....	162
The Process of Integration.....	164
The Planning Process.....	165
Organizational Structure of the Financial Supervisory Service.....	166
The Benefits and Challenges of Integration.....	167
Key Factors for Successful Integration.....	169
The Big Bang Approach in Korea and Elsewhere.....	169

Chapter 5: Transitional Issues in Emerging Markets.....171

The Organizational Structure of Financial Supervision: The Salvadoran Case.....	171
--	-----

Ana Margoth Ar6valo

Time Frame and Rationale for Separation.....	172
From the Central Bank to an Independent Agency.....	173
Supervision of the Securities Market and Pension Funds.....	174
Assessment of the Process.....	175
The Agencies.....	176
Role of the Central Bank.....	179
Coordinating Mechanisms.....	179
The Changing Financial Sector Landscape: Implications for the Regulatory Structure.....	181

The Single Financial Supervisor: The Hungarian Case.....	187
---	-----

LZszld Balogh

Features of the Hungarian Financial Landscape.....	188
The Objectives of Integration.....	191
The Process of Integration.....	193
International Road Map for Further Development.....	196
Issues Considered in the Integration of Supervision.....	198
Supervisory Independence.....	199
Institutional Autonomy.....	200
Budgetary Autonomy.....	200
Administrative Autonomy.....	201
Regulatory Autonomy.....	201
Accountability and Transparency.....	202
Practical Challenges of Integration.....	203
Conclusions.....	206

Chapter 6: Making Regulatory Structures Effective.....209

Establishing Legal Consistency for Integrated Regulation.....	209
---	-----

Peter R. Kyle

Constitutional Limitations: Independence of the Central Bank and Role of the Judiciary.....	210
Legislative Environment.....	213
Specific Legal Issues.....	217
Conclusions.....	219

Creating an Effective Regulatory Culture in Estonia 223

Andres Trink

The Process of Integration.....	224
Preparation Phase: Selecting Staff and Preparing People.....	224
Formal Launch.....	225
Transition Phase.....	226
Challenges Encountered.....	228
Lack of Common Benchmarks of Performance.....	228
Differences in Compensation.....	228
Fear of New Leadership and Hierarchy.....	229
Differences in Supervisory Approach, Scope, and Methods ..	229
Inherent Conflicts in Regulatory Cultures.....	230
Enforcement Policy in a Transitional Supervisor.....	230
Practical Solutions Applied.....	231
Conclusions.....	232

Communicating with Stakeholders: Issues to Consider233

Howard Davies

Who Are the Relevant Stakeholders?.....	233
How to Communicate?.....	234

What to Communicate?.....	235
How to Measure Success in Stakeholder Communications?.....	236

Chapter 7: Keynote Addresses from the Conference.....237

Integrated Regulation In the United Kingdom and the Lessons for Others.....	237
---	-----

Howard Davies

Creation of the Financial Services Authority.....	237
How Successful Has FSA Been?.....	239
The Case for Integrated Regulation.....	242
The Case Against Integration and Why It Is Wrong.....	244
Overly Bureaucratic?.....	245
Overly Powerful?.....	245
Loss of Specialist Expertise?.....	246
Conflict between Prudential and Conduct-of-Business Regulation?.....	247
The Central Bank Problem?.....	249
The Preconditions for Success.....	254

Implementing an Integrated Supervisor In Estonia: Lessons Learned.....	257
---	-----

Andres Trink

Tables

Table 2.1: Regulatory Matrix.....	38
Table 2.2: Main Reasons for Adopting Integrated Supervision.....	47
Table 2.3: Problems in Establishing Integrated Supervisory Agencies.....	51
Table 2.4: Structure of Supervision in 77 Countries, 2002.....	72
Table 2.5: Bank Regulators in 69 Countries.....	73
Table 2.6: Supervision Authorities in 69 Countries, 2002.....	74

Table 2.7: Scope of Unified Supervisory Agencies.....	78
Table 2.8: Powers of the Integrated Supervisory Agencies over Banks.....	80

Figures

Figure 2.1: FAC Index and CBFA Index in 69 Countries, 2002.....	76
Figure 3.1: Board Membership.....	136
Figure 3.2: Relationship between Central Bank and Financial Services Regulator.....	137
Figure 3.3: Organizational Chart of the Irish Financial Services Regulatory Authority.....	141
Figure 5.1: Structure of Financial Supervision in El Salvador.....	177
Figure 5.2: Functional Setup of HFSA, 2003.....	195

Boxes

Box 5.1: Timetable for Setting Up the Single Financial Supervisor in Hungary.....	193
Box 5.2: International Road Map of Assessments.....	197