

THE OSCE CODE OF CONDUCT
ON POLITICO-MILITARY
ASPECTS OF SECURITY
Anatomy and Implementation

by

Victor-Yves Ghebali and Alexander Lambert

MARTINUS NIJHOFF PUBLISHERS

LEIDEN / BOSTON

TABLE OF CONTENTS

List of Abbreviations	xv
Foreword to Part I by Ambassador <i>Jan Kubis</i> , Secretary General of the OSCE	xvii
Foreword to Part II by Ambassador <i>Lamberto Zannier</i> , Director, OSCE	
Conflict Prevention Centre	xix
General Introduction	1
PART I – Paragraph-by-Paragraph Commentary on the Code of Conduct	17
<i>Vincent Ghebali</i>	
Title: "Code of Conduct on Politico-Military Aspects of Security"	19
Preamble	20
- 1 st paragraph: Parties to the Code of Conduct	22
- 2 nd paragraph: The Code of Conduct's rationale	22
- 3 rd paragraph: Undiminished status of existing international law principles	24
- 4 th paragraph: Undiminished status of existing OSCE commitments	24
- 5 th paragraph: Adoption of the Code of Conduct	25
Section I. Reaffirmation of comprehensive security and cooperative security, and enunciation of the solidarity principle	26
- Paragraph 1: Wholesale confirmation of OSCE commitments	27
- Paragraph 2: Reaffirmation of the comprehensive security concept	28
- Paragraph 3: Reaffirmation of the indivisibility of security in the OSCE area and beyond	28
- Paragraph 4: Reaffirmation of the cooperative security approach	30
- Paragraph 5: Enunciation of the solidarity principle	33

Section II. Reaffirmation of the commitment to cooperate against terrorism	36
- Paragraph 6: Reaffirmation of the commitment to take appropriate measures to prevent and combat terrorism in all its forms	37
Section III. Reaffirmation of the equal value of the Helsinki Final Act's principles and of the commitment of non-assistance to aggressor states	39
- Paragraph 7: Reaffirmation of the equal value of the Helsinki Final Act's Principles	40
- Paragraph 8: Reaffirmation of the commitment of non-assistance or support to an aggressor state	40
Section IV. Security Rights and obligations of OSCE participating states	41
- Paragraph 9: Reaffirmation of the right to self-defence	42
- Paragraph 10: Reaffirmation of the right to freely choose security arrangements	42
- Paragraph 11: Reaffirmation of the right to belong to alliances and the right to neutrality	43
- Paragraph 12: Obligation to maintain only such military capabilities commensurate with individual or collective security needs	45
- Paragraph 13: Obligation to determine military capabilities through national democratic procedures. Renunciation of military domination in the OSCE area	47
- Paragraph 14: Authorisation to station armed forces on the territory of another participating state in accordance with freely negotiated agreements as well as international law	48
Section V. Importance of the process of arms control, disarmament and CSBM	51
- Paragraph 15: Importance of implementation in good faith of arms control, disarmament and CSBM commitments	52
- Paragraph 16: Reaffirmation of the commitment to pursue arms control, disarmament and CSBM measures in the OSCE area	53
Section VI. Reaffirmation of commitments to cooperate for conflict prevention and crisis management	54
- Paragraph 17: Cooperation to counter economic/environmental and human dimension tensions conducive to conflicts	55
- Paragraph 18: Reaffirmation of the equal importance of cooperation at the various phases of the conflict management cycle	56
- Paragraph 19: Cooperation for peaceful resolution and humanitarian assistance support in armed conflicts	57
Section VII. Democratic control of armed forces	58
- Paragraph 20: Rationale for the democratic control of armed forces	60
- Paragraph 21: Primacy of the constitutionally established authorities vested with democratic legitimacy over military power	65
- Paragraph 22: Legislative approval of, as well as restraint in, transparency of and public access to military defence expenditures	67

- Paragraph 23: Political neutrality of armed forces and civil rights of their individual members	69
- Paragraph 24: Safeguards against military incidents due to accident or error	70
- Paragraph 25: Inadmissibility of forces that are not accountable to or controlled by their constitutionally established authorities	71
- Paragraph 26: Prohibition of acquisition by paramilitary forces of combat mission capabilities in excess of those for which they were established	72
- Paragraph 27: Consistency with human rights of recruitment or call-up of armed (military, paramilitary and security) forces	73
- Paragraph 28: Rights and duties of armed forces personnel, including possibility of exemption from or alternatives to military service	74
- Paragraph 29: Promotion of the knowledge of international humanitarian law and reflection of its commitments in military training programmes and regulations	77
- Paragraph 30: Instruction of armed forces personnel in international humanitarian law, including awareness of individual accountability at domestic and international level	79
- Paragraph 31: Individual accountability of commanders and rank and file servicemen of armed forces under national and international law	80
- Paragraph 32: Exercise of their human rights by the personnel of military, paramilitary and security forces	82
- Paragraph 33: Legal and administrative national procedures for the protection of the rights of all forces personnel	83
Section VIII. Democratic use of armed forces	83
- Paragraph 34: Consistency of the commandment, manning, training and equipment of armed forces with international humanitarian law	84
- Paragraph 35: Consistency of defence policy and doctrine with international humanitarian law and the Code of Conduct	85
- Paragraph 36: Subjection of the domestic use of force to the rule of law and commensurability of such use with the needs for enforcement	87
- Paragraph 37: Prohibition of a domestic use of force aimed at restricting the peaceful and lawful exercise of human and civil rights or at depriving people of their individual or collective identity	92
Section IX. Implementation arrangements	94
- Paragraph 38: Accountability for implementation	94
Section X. Final clauses	103
- Paragraph 39: Politically binding nature of the Code and date of its coming into force	103
- Paragraph 40: Undiminished value of existing OSCE commitments	105
- Paragraph 41: Reflection of the Code's commitments in relevant national internal documents, procedures or legal instruments	106
- Paragraph 42: Publication and widespread dissemination of the Code at national level	106
Bibliography	109

Annexes to Part I	117
- Annex 1: Proposal submitted by Hungary and the United States, at the Moscow Conference on the human dimension, concerning "Civilian control over military and security forces" (CSCE/CHDM/.43 of 26 September 1991)	117
- Annex 2: Proposal submitted by France, Germany and other participating states, at the 1992 Helsinki Follow-up Meeting, concerning a "CSCE Code of Conduct on security relationships among participating states" (CSCE/HM/WG2/1 of 19 May 1992)	118
- Annex 3: Proposal submitted by Poland on a "CSCE Code of Conduct in the field of security" (CSCE/FSC/SC.5/Rev.1 of 18 November 1992)	119
- Annex 4: Proposal submitted by the member states of the European Community, Iceland and Norway on a "CSCE Code of Conduct governing mutual relations between participating states in the field of security" CSCE/FSC/SC.21 of 30 June 1993)	129
- Annex 5: Proposal submitted by Austria and Hungary on a "CSCE Code of Conduct governing the behaviour of the participating states towards each other and of governments towards their citizens" (CSCE/FSC/SC.22 of 15 September 1993)	140
- Annex 6: Proposal submitted by Turkey on a "Code of Conduct governing the mutual relations of the CSCE participating states in the field of security" (CSCE/FSC/SC.8 of 16 December 1992)	154
- Annex 7: Proposal on implementation provisions for a Code of Conduct" (CSCE/FSC/SC.17 of 5 May 1993)	160
- Annex 8: Proposal submitted by Hungary on the "democratic control of the armed forces and their use" (CSCE/FSC/SC.25 of 23 February 1994)	162
- Annex 9: Working document submitted by France regarding the structure of a Code of Conduct (CSCE/FSC/SC/B.2 of 3 June 1993)	166
- Annex 10: United Nations "Code of Conduct for Law Enforcement Officials", adopted by the United Nations General Assembly (Resolution 34/169 of 17 December 1979)	168
- Annex 11: Declaration on the Police adopted by the Parliamentary Assembly of the Council of Europe (Resolution 690 of 8 May 1979)	173
- Annex 12: Recommendation on "Control of internal security services in Council of Europe member states" adopted by the Parliamentary Assembly of the Council of Europe (Recommendation 1402 of 26 April 1999)	177

PART II – Assessment of Implementation Trends of the Code of Conduct

<i>Alexander Lambert</i>	181
Introductory Remarks	185
1. Assessment Framework	187
<i>1.1 The Concept of 'Armed Forces'</i>	188
1.1.1 The Code and the Security Sector	188
1.1.2 Military, Paramilitary and Security Forces	189
1.1.3 Terminology Used in Sections VII-VIII	192
<i>1.2 The Code and the Euro-Atlantic Enlargement Process</i>	194
1.2.1 EU Criteria for Democracy	194
1.2.2 NATO and the Partnership for Peace Programme	196
1.2.3 Sub-Regional Dimensions of the Information Exchange	203
<i>1.3 The Connection between the Code of Conduct and the 1998 Questionnaire</i>	204
1.3.1 The Elements of the Code Reflected in the Questionnaire	204
1.3.2 The Ratio between Inter- and Intra-state Elements	208
<i>1.4 The Questionnaire Viewed from a Thematic Perspective</i>	210
1.4.1 Overlaps Between Individual Items of the Questionnaire	210
1.4.2 Outline for the Evaluation of the Information Exchange	214
2. Thematic Analysis of the Information Exchange	219
<i>2.1 Primacy of Democratic Constitutional Civilian Power over Military Power</i>	220
2.1.1 National Planning and Decision-Making Process for the Determination of the Military Posture	222
2.1.1.1 General Information on the Relation between the Executive and Legislative Branches of government	223
2.1.1.2 Roles of Parliament and the Broader Public	225
2.1.1.3 The Ministry of Defence and Civilian Leadership	227
2.1.1.4 NATO Enlargement and National Defence Decision- Making	228
2.1.1.5 Systems of Presidential-Executive Decision-Making in Central and Eastern Europe	234
2.1.2 Public Access to Information Related to the Armed Forces	235
2.1.2.1 Transparency and Publicity of the Defence Budget	236
2.1.2.2 Special Legislation Related to Public and Restricted Access to Information	237
2.1.2.3 Ministerial Information Policies	238

2.1.3	Constitutionally Established Authorities and Procedures to Ensure the Democratic Political Control of the Security Sector	242
2.1.3.1	General Information on the 'Armed Forces'	243
2.1.3.2	Specific Information on Paramilitary and Internal Security Forces	250
2.1.3.3	Intelligence Services	254
2.1.3.4	Police and Police Reform	262
2.1.4	Roles and Missions of Military, Paramilitary and Security Forces	267
2.1.4.1	Regular Military Forces	268
2.1.4.2	Paramilitary and Security Forces	275
2.2	<i>Subjection of the Armed Forces to the Norms and Prescriptions of International Humanitarian Law (IHL)</i>	281
2.2.1	Respect of IHL in Peacetime and Wartime	283
2.2.2	Promotion of Knowledge on IHL	285
2.3	<i>Respect of the Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms of the Armed Forces Personnel</i>	287
2.3.1	Recruitment and Call-up for Service in Military, Paramilitary and Security Forces	289
2.3.1.1	General Trend Toward Professionalism	290
2.3.1.2	Recruitment, Call-up and Human Rights	291
2.3.1.3	Special Information on Paramilitary and Security Forces	292
2.3.2	Exemptions from and Alternatives to Compulsory Military Service	293
2.3.2.1	Conscientious Objection	293
2.3.2.2	Exemptions from Compulsory Military Service	295
2.3.2.3	Alternative Civilian Service	297
2.3.3	Protection of the Rights of Forces Personnel	300
2.3.3.1	Civilian and Military Court Systems	301
2.3.3.2	Restrictions in the Field of Civic Rights and Political Freedoms	303
2.3.3.3	Procedures and Institutions Ensuring the Exercise of the Personnel's Individual Rights	305
2.4	<i>Interstate Aspects of the Information Exchange</i>	311
2.4.1	Combat and Prevention of Terrorism	311
2.4.1.1	Global Arrangements	312
2.4.1.2	Regional Arrangements	314
2.4.1.3	Bilateral Arrangements	316

2.4.1.4	Implementation of International Commitments on the Domestic Level	317
2.4.2	Stationing of Armed Forces on Foreign Territory	322
2.4.2.1	International Peacekeeping	324
2.4.2.2	Regional Arrangements	325
2.4.2.3	Domestic Decision-Making Process	326
3	The Code's Regime Evaluation	329
3.1	<i>The Substance of the Information Exchange</i>	330
3.1.1	Supremacy of Democratic Constitutional Civilian Power over Military Power	330
3.1.2	Subjection of the Armed Forces to the Norms and Prescriptions of IHL	342
3.1.3	Respect of the Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms of the Armed Forces Personnel	344
3.1.4	Inter-state Elements of the Information Exchange	351
3.2	<i>The Reporting Technique</i>	358
3.2.1	The Updated 2003 Questionnaire	359
3.2.2	Enhancing Effectiveness, Transparency and Efficiency of the Reporting	365
3.2.3	Contributing to Best Practices of democratic control of armed forces	368
3.3	<i>The Way Ahead</i>	370
3.4	<i>The 2003 and 2004 Information Exchange</i>	374
	Bibliography	379
	Annexes to Part II	381
	<i>Annex 1: Redistribution of tasks and responsibilities of the national authorities in defence planning decision-making and the determination of the military posture in an EU and NATO candidate country</i>	381
	<i>Annex 2: Roles and responsibilities of national authorities in defence decision-making and the determination of the military posture in some of the CIS countries</i>	383
	<i>Annex 3: Competencies and Responsibilities of National Authorities in a newly-admitted NATO member country</i>	387

<i>Annex 4: Competencies and responsibilities of national authorities in the field of democratic control of the armed force in some of the established democracies, as well as some of the NATO/EU candidate countries of East-Central Europe</i>	390
<i>Annex 5: Civilian control exercised through presidential, parliamentary and judicial control in two Caucasus countries</i>	392
<i>Annex 6: Officer and Conscript Training and Education in IHL in one established democracy and EU member state</i>	394
<i>Annex 7: The Updated Questionnaire 2003</i>	396
Index to Part I	399
Index to Part II	415