Counting the Many

The Origins and Limits of Supermajority Rule

MELISSA SCHWARTZBERG

New York University



Contents

ΑC	Acknowledgments	
i	Introduction	i
	Voting and Judgment	5
	Majority and Supermajority Rule	7
PA	RT I A REMEDY FOR THE PROBLEMS OF UNANIMITY	
2.	Prelude: Acclamation and Aggregation in the	
	Ancient World	19
	Acclamation in Homeric Assemblies	21
	The Origins of Counting Votes in Archaic Greece	25
	Counting versus Estimating in Athens	2.8
	Secrecy and the Vote	3 4
	From Athens to Rome: Acclamation to the	
	Written Ballot?	39
	The Origin of Supermajority Rules	44
	Conclusion	47
3	Unanimitas to a Two-Thirds Vote: Medieval	
	Origins of Supermajority Rule	49
	Unanimity, Moral Fallibility, and the Sanior et	
	Maior Pars	52
	The Emergence of the Two-Thirds Rule	59
	Supermajority Rules in the Italian City-Republics	61
	The Principles of Supermajority Rule	67

x Contents

4	Unanimity and Supermajority Rule in	
	Eighteenth-Century France	71
	Unanimity and Certainty	74
	Unanimity and Fallibility	79
	Temptation and Coercion under Unanimity	84
	Simple and Qualified Majority Rules	88
	The Contemporary Logic of Supermajority Rules	
	against Unanimity	9 :
PA	RT II A REMEDY FOR THE PROBLEMS OF	
MA	AJORITY RULE	
5	Equality, Majority Rule, and Supermajorities	105
	Equality and Independence of Judgments	in
	Formal Equality, Epistemic Equality, and Risk	121
	Institutional Stability	125
	Securing a Consensus	133
	Vulnerable Minorities	141
	Conclusion	144
6	Constitutionalism without Supermajorities	146
	Distinctive Liabilities of Supermajority Rule within	
	Constitutionalism	149
	Does Constitutional Stability Require Supermajorities?	16.
	Consensus Support for Constitutional Amendments	168
	Constitution Making and Vulnerable Minorities	~LJ2
	Conclusion	180
7	Constitutionalism under Complex Majoritarianism	182
	Complex Majoritarianism: One Proposal	184
	A Note on Targeted Vetoes	2.00
	Conclusion	202
8	Conclusion	205
Re	ferences	217
Index		231