

# The Samaritan's Dilemma: The Political Economy of Development Aid

CLARK C. GIBSON, KRISTER ANDERSSON,  
ELINOR OSTROM, AND SUJAI SHIVAKUMAR

<sup>C</sup>  
OXFORD  
UNIVERSITY PRESS

# Contents

<i>List of Boxes</i>	xvi
<i>List of Figures</i>	xvii
<i>List of Tables</i>	xviii
<i>List of Acronyms and Abbreviations</i>	xix
<i>List of Contributors</i>	xxi

## Part I. Introduction

<b>1. What's Wrong with Development Aid?</b>	<b>3</b>
<b>1.1. Rethinking development aid</b>	<b>3</b>
1.2. Incentives, development aid, and the plan of this book	5
1.2.1. Perverse incentives in day-to-day interactions	
1.2.2. Perverse incentives in the policy process	
1.2.3. Perverse incentives in the development aid system	
1.2.4. Perverse incentives in donor agencies	
1.2.5. Cases in recipient countries	
1.3. Five key concepts for the institutional analysis of development aid	7
1.3.1. Institutions (and their close cousins)	
1.3.2. Incentives	
1.3.3. Development, development aid, and development cooperation	
1.3.4. Sustainability	
1.3.5. Ownership	
1.4. Promoting development	13
1.4.1. Missing money?	
1.4.2. Missing institutions?	
1.4.3. Collective-action situations and development	
1.4.4. Ownership and collective action	
1.5. Conclusion	18

## Part II. Theoretical Foundations

<b>2. Laying the Theoretical Foundations for the Study of Development Aid</b>	<b>23</b>
2.1. Introduction	23
2.2. An overview of the institutional analysis and development framework	24

2.3. Doing institutional analysis	25
2.3.1. Actors and action situations	
2.3.2. Explaining outcomes within an action arena	
2.3.3. The concept of rules	
2.3.4. Biophysical/material conditions	
2.3.5. Attributes of a community	
2.4. Motivational problems at the operational level	35
2.4.1. Public goods and free-riding	
2.4.2. Common-pool resource problems	
2.4.3. The Samaritan's Dilemma	
2.4.4. Asymmetric power relationships	
2.5. Information problems at an operational level	41
2.5.1. Missing information and local knowledge	
Moral hazard	
Principal—agent situations	
2.5.2. Asymmetric information about characteristics	
Adverse selection	
Signaling problems	
2.6. Solving operational-level problems	46
<b>3. Better Development Through Better Policy? Development Aid's Challenges at the Collective-Choice Level</b>	<b>49</b>
3.1. Introduction	49
3.2. Changing unproductive situations at the collective-choice level	50
3.3. Missing, weak, or bad institutions	53
3.4. Motivational problems at the collective-choice level	54
3.4.1. Rules as public goods	
3.4.2. Rent seeking	
3.4.3. Corruption	
3.5. Informational problems at the collective-choice level	56
3.5.1. Missing and asymmetric information	
Fiscal illusion	
3.5.2. Translating preferences into outcomes—the impossibility theorem	
3.6. Enter the donor	57
<b>4. Sorting Out the Tangle: Incentives Across Action Situations in Development Aid</b>	<b>61</b>
4.1. Introduction	61
4.2. The chain of aid delivery	62
4.3. The international development cooperation octangle	63
4.3.1. The full octangle	
4.3.2. The donor—recipient negotiation arena	
Strong donor—strong recipient	

Strong donor—weak recipient	
Enlightened donor—weak recipient	
4.3.3. Principal-agent arenas within donor and recipient countries	
Principal-agent relations—politicians and bureaucrats	
Principal—agent relations—owners, donor agencies, and contractors	
4.3.4. Beneficiaries	
Links between beneficiaries and government	
Linking governments to citizens and interest groups	
4.3.5. Competition among donors	
4.4. Applying the IAD framework to analyze the donor-recipient dyad	75
4.5. Conclusion	84
5. A Formal Analysis of Incentives in Strategic Interactions Involving an International Development Cooperation Agency, Roy Gardner and Christopher J. Waller	87
5.1. Introduction	87
5.2. Strategic implication of altruism for results	88
5.2.1. Aid in a one-shot game: The Samaritan	
5.2.2. Aid in a repeated game: The Samaritan's Dilemma	
5.2.3. Principal-agent problems in one-shot games	
5.2.4. Principal-agent problems in repeated games	
5.3. Foreign aid as a substitute for borrowing in capital markets	95
5.3.1. Aid conditionality	
5.3.2. Aid tournaments	
5.4. Externalities and market failures	99
5.4.1. Public good problems	
5.4.2. Common-pool resource (CPR) problems	
5.4.3. Corruption	
5.5. Coordinated aid	108
5.6. Equity considerations	109
5.7. Warm-glow effects	110
5.8. Conclusion	111
6. All Aid is Not the Same: The Incentives of Different Types of Aid	112
6.1. Introduction	112
6.2. Aid as "carrots and sticks"	112
6.3. The configuration of aid capital	114
6.4. The characteristics of aid	115
6.4.1. Grants, credits, and guarantees	
Grants	
Credits	
Guarantees	
6.4.2. Tied-aid—Issues and incentives	
6.4.3. Aid conditionality— <i>Ex ante</i> versus <i>ex post</i>	

6.5. The modalities of aid	
6.5.1. Project aid	
6.5.2. Program aid	
6.5.3. Sector-wide approaches	
6.5.4. Humanitarian assistance	
6.5.5. Technical cooperation	
6.6. Conclusion	127

### Part III. Case Studies

<b>7. Applying the IAD Framework: The Incentives Inside a Development Agency</b>	<b>131</b>
7.1. Introduction	131
7.2. Methods	132
7.3. Using the IAD framework to study the organization of a development agency: Sida	133
7.3.1. Sida as an agent of the Swedish government and its people	
7.3.2. Looking inside Sida	
7.4. Contextual variables and their influences on action arenas	137
7.4.1. Institutional factors influencing action arenas	
7.4.2. Cultural factors influencing the action arenas	
7.4.3. Biophysical characteristics influencing the action arenas	
7.5. Patterns of interactions: Incentives for learning about sustainable outcomes	141
7.5.1. A highly motivated staff	
Individual learning about sustainability	
Empirical evidence on the conditions for individual learning about sustainability	
Short-term assignments	
Communication after an assignment	
Temporary contracts	
Retention and recruitment of younger staff	
Career advancement criteria related to performance of past projects	
7.6. Organizational learning through formal evaluations	150
7.7. Empirical evidence on organizational learning through evaluations	151
7.8. A formal evaluation process without much learning	153
7.9. Budgetary processes oriented toward sustainability	154
7.10. Conclusions	156
<b>8. Incentives for Contractors in Aid-Supported Activities, Krister Andersson and Matthew R. Auer</b>	<b>160</b>
8.1. Introduction	160
8.2. The place of contractors in aid programs	161

8.3. Incentives for contractor performance	162
8.3.1. Pre-design phase	
8.3.2. Design phase	
8.3.3. Implementation phase	
8.4. Incentive incompatibilities: Control versus ownership	165
8.5. Contractors' incentives and the prospects for sustainability	166
8.5.1. Is a consultant-directed project likely to be sustainable?	
8.5.2. What is the role of the consultant in ownership?	
8.6. The Sida contractors' perceptions	167
8.6.1. "For whom do we work?"	
8.6.2. Contractors' perceptions of relationship to Sida	
8.6.3. What makes a consultant tick?	
<b>Sida Aid in Electricity and Natural Resource Projects in India</b>	<b>171</b>
9.1. Using institutional analysis	171
9.2. Sweden's development cooperation with India	172
9.2.1. Changing strategic interests in bilateral development assistance	
9.2.2. Aid and institutional reform in the states	
9.3. Capacity building for participatory management of degraded forests in Orissa	174
9.3.1. History of the project	
9.3.2. An institutional analysis of the Orissa Capacity Building Project	
The action arena	
Rules-in-use—A return to community-based forest management	
9.3.3. The role of key actors	
The Orissa Forest Department	
The government of Orissa	
Sida	
Scandiaconsult Natura	
NGOs	
9.3.4. Interactions within the octangle	
The Sida—Orissa Forest Department—forest communities triad	
The Sida—Scandiaconsult Natura—Orissa Forest Department triad	
9.3.5. Implications for ownership and sustainability	
9.4. The Chandrapur-Padghe HVDC Converter Terminal Project	184
9.4.1. History of the project	
9.4.2. An institutional analysis of the Chandrapur-Padghe Project	
The action arena	
Rules-in-use: Governance in the power sector	
A free-rider problem	

9.4.3.	Interactions within the octangle	
	The recipient government—MSEB—interest group triad	
	The donor government—Sida—special interests triad	
	The donor—other donors—recipient triad	
	The contractor at the center	
	Recipient beneficiaries	
9.4.4.	Implications for ownership and sustainability	
9.5.	Conclusions	194
10.	Sida <b>Aid</b> in Electricity <b>and</b> Natural Resource Projects <b>in</b> Zambia	<b>198</b>
10.1.	Introduction	198
10.2.	Zambia's experience with development cooperation	198
10.2.1.	Sweden's role in Zambia's development	
10.3.	The Zambian ERB	200
10.3.1.	History of the ERB project	
10.3.2.	An institutional analysis of the ERB	
	Actors and the action situation	
	Influences on the action arena	
10.3.3.	Patterns of interaction: Incentives and the ERB	
	Incentives of government	
	Incentives of ZESCO	
	Incentives of the ERB	
	Incentives for the public and interest groups	
	Incentives for Sida	
10.3.4.	Outcomes: Implications for ownership and sustainability	
10.4.	The Kafue Gorge Hydropower Station Rehabilitation Project	207
10.4.1.	Project history	
10.4.2.	An institutional analysis of the KGRP	
	The action arena	
	Influences on the action arena	
10.4.3.	Patterns of interaction	
	Incentives of government	
	Incentives of ZESCO	
	Incentives for Sida	
	Incentives for Swedpower	
10.4.4.	Outcomes: Implications for ownership and sustainability	
10.5.	TheCFU	211
10.5.1.	History of the project	
10.5.2.	An institutional analysis of the CFU	
	Action arena	
	Influences on the action arena	
	Community attributes	
	Institutional context and rules-in-use	
10.5.3.	Patterns of interaction: Incentives and the CFU project	

£SZ

³V'I

l£1

JSJU sauBpuauaq Supjnj Q/JJ

\£Z

sjirejinsuoo jo ajoj aqx SII

(yii

spA3j JBUOIBZIUBSJO puB |BnpiAipui aqj JB SUIUJB3J Sui\$.moDug Y\

911

A"iinQBuiBjsns puB diqsjauAvo £\

SZZ

pooS aqj jo ajnjBu aqx Ti1

|7^^

S3AIJU90UI JO 3J0.I 9qj JO SS3U3JBAVV "J'H

eZZ

iPTV moqv J U J ^ T ayw 3A^H J^HM II

## uoisnpuo^ 'AJ JBJ

6lZ

suoisnpuo3 90I

A"jijqBuiBjsns puB diqsjauM.0 aoj suoqBDijduij >'S'OI

UOIJEAJ3SUO3 JOI S3AIJU3DUJ

Bpig JOJ S9AIJU3DUI

dd v W J°J S3AIJU33UJ

n JO J°