

Britain Alone!

**The Implications and Consequences of United Kingdom
Exit from the EU**

Edited by

Patrick J. Birkinshaw
Andrea Biondi

Wolters Kluwer

Table of Contents

Editors	v
Contributors	vii
Foreword	xxi
Introduction	
<i>Patrick J. Birkinshaw & Andrea Biondi</i>	<i>1</i>
PART I	
Constitutional Issues	11
CHAPTER 1	
Britain Alone Constitutionally: Brexit and <i>Restitutio in Integrum</i> <i>Patrick J. Birkinshaw & Mike Varney</i>	<i>13</i>
§1.01 Introduction	13
§1.02 Three Positions	14
§1.03 The Constitutional Changes	14
§1.04 Did the UK Lose Sovereignty?	16
§1.05 Common Law Constitutionalism	19
§1.06 The Rule of Law	20
§1.07 Judicial Attacks on Europe	21
§1.08 Common Law of Human Rights	27
§1.09 EU Charter of Fundamental Rights	30
§1.10 The General Principles	31
§1.11 The Separation of Powers	33
§1.12 Remaining Questions	34

Table of Contents

CHAPTER 2

A Tale of Two Referendums: Scotland, the UK and Europe

<i>Stephen Tierney & Katie Boyle</i>	39
§2.01 Introduction	39
§2.02 The Impact of EU Issues upon the Scottish Independence Debate	40
[A] Background: The Status of EU Law in Scots Law	40
[B] How Would an Independent Scotland Have Negotiated Membership?	41
[C] Parties to Negotiation	41
[D] The United Kingdom's Position	42
[E] Attitude of the European Union	43
[F] Treaties and Admission	44
[G] Period of Negotiation and Process of Membership	46
[H] Scotland outside of the European Union?	48
§2.03 Scotland after the Referendum: The Debate over UK Membership of the EU	- 50
[A] A Referendum on UK Membership: The 'No Vote' Scenario	50
[B] What If the UK Votes to Leave the EU?	53
§2.04 Conclusion	54

CHAPTER 3

'Britain Alone': A View from Northern Ireland

<i>Gordon Anthony</i>	57
§3.01 Introduction	57
§3.02 EU Membership and Northern Ireland: Better In, or Better Out?	60
§3.03 The 'Problem' of Consociationalism	62
§3.04 North/South Intergovernmental Relations	64
§3.05 Equality and Human Rights Law	66
§3.06 Conclusion	70

CHAPTER 4

'Brexit' and Welsh Devolution: The Likely Impact

<i>Mike Varney</i>	- 73
§4.01 Introduction	73
§4.02 The Impact on Devolved Powers to Make Legislation	76
§4.03 The Impact on the Powers of the Welsh Ministers	80
§4.04 The Welsh Power to Resist Withdrawal from the EU or Changes to Human Rights Protection	82
§4.05 Welsh Influence on European and International Policymaking †	84
§4.06 Conclusion	87

CHAPTER 5

Responsibility, Voice and Exit: Britain Alone?

<i>Paul Craig</i>	89
§5.01 Introduction	89
§5.02 Constitutional Responsibility: The Status Quo	91
[A] Political Responsibility, Member States and Inter-institutional Division of Power	91
[B] Political Accountability, Member States and Substantive Treaty Provisions	94
[C] Political Accountability, Member States and EU Legislation	95
§5.03 Constitutional Voice and Responsibility: The Subject Matter for Renegotiation	97
§5.04 Constitutional Voice and Responsibility: The Catch 22 of Renegotiation	104
§5.05 Constitutional Consequences: Future Relations	105
[A] The 'Relatively' Predictable	106
[B] The 'Relatively' Unpredictable	106
§5.06 Conclusion	107

PART II

Managing Alone?	109
-----------------	-----

CHAPTER 6

Which Options Would Be Available for the United Kingdom in the Case of a Withdrawal from the EU?

<i>Jean-Claude Piris</i>	111
§6.01 Introduction	111
§6.02 The Legal Framework	112
§6.03 Avoiding Brexit by Getting a Special EU Member Status?	115
§6.04 The Seven Possible Options after 'BREXIT'	117
[A] BREXIT Would Negatively Affect British External Trade	126
[1] Regarding British External Trade with the EU	126
[2] Regarding British External Trade with the Rest of the World	126
[B] BREXIT Would Have Also Negative Effects for the UK in Other Areas than External Trade	127
[1] First, on the UK's Legislation and Regulation	127
[2] Second, on Individuals	128
§6.05 What Would Be the Best Way to Avoid Brexit?	129
[A] The Importance of the Legal Shape of the Possible Answers	129
[B] How Could the EU Meet Those Wishes?	133
[1] Economic Governance	133
[2] Competitiveness	133
[3] Sovereignty	134
[4] Immigration	135

Table of Contents

§6.06	Conclusion	136
§6.07	Post-Scriptum (19 December 2015)	137
CHAPTER 7		
The UK and the World: Environmental Law		
	<i>Ioanna Hadjiyianni</i>	139
§7.01	Introduction	139
§7.02	The UK and the EU	141
	[A] EU Environmental Law and the UK	141
	[B] Relationship with the EU after Exit: The UK as a Third Country	147
§7.03	The EU, the UK and the World	151
	[A] Relationship with the World: The UK as a Member State	151
	[B] The Relationship with the World after exit: The UK as an Ex-Member State	156
§7.04	Conclusion	158
CHAPTER 8		
The EU's External Relations: A Question of Competence		
	<i>Daniel Denman</i>	159
CHAPTER 9		
Judicial Protection and the UK's Opt-Outs: Is Britain Alone in the CJEU?		
	<i>Maria Kendrick</i>	165
§9.01	Introduction	165
§9.02	Flexibility and Its Mechanisms	166
§9.03	Judicial Protection	167
	[A] Choice of Legal Basis	168
	[B] Decisions Authorising Enhanced Cooperation	171
	[C] Exclusion of a Non-participating Member State	176
§9.04	Staying In, Even When Not Opting In	180
§9.05	Conclusion	182
CHAPTER 10		
Criminal Law		
	<i>John R. Spencer</i>	183
§10.01	Introduction	183
§10.02	What EU Criminal Law Consists Of?	183
§10.03	The UK's Attitude towards EU Criminal Law: Past and Present	187
§10.04	The Effect of Withdrawal	192

CHAPTER 11

From EU Citizens to Third-Country Nationals: The Legacy of <i>Polydor</i> <i>Marja-Liisa Oberg</i>	199
§11.01 Introduction	199
§11.02 Defining 'European Individuals'	201
§11.03 Exporting Internal Market <i>Acquis</i> : 'So Close, Yet So Far Away'	202
[A] The <i>Polydor</i> Doctrine	203
[B] The Application of the <i>Polydor</i> Doctrine	204
§11.04 Turkish, Swiss and EEA Nationals: 'European Individuals'?	205
[A] The EEC-Turkey Agreement	205
[B] EU-Switzerland Bilateral Agreements	206
[C] The EEA Agreement	208
[D] Three Rounds of <i>United Kingdom v. Council</i> The EEA, Switzerland and Turkey Agreements Compared	210
§11.05 Conclusion	213

CHAPTER 12

Britain Alone! The Implications and Consequences of United Kingdom Exit from the European Union: Social Policies <i>Aileen McColgan</i>	215
§12.01 Introduction	215
§12.02 An Historical Account of Domestic Discrimination/Equality Law	216
§12.03 The Impact of EU Law on Domestic Discrimination Law	220
§12.04 Domestic Law and the "Coalition Government"	221
[A] Introduction	221
[B] Discrimination Questionnaires	223
§12.05 Tribunal Powers of Recommendation	224
§12.06 Tribunal Fees	228
[A] The Threat to Equality Law	228
[B] Conclusion: Europe as the Guarantor of Rights?	230

CHAPTER 13

The Death of Social Europe <i>Keith D. Ewing</i>	233
§13.01 Introduction	233
§13.02 The Birth of Social Europe	234
§13.03 The Death of Social Europe	243
§13.04 Conclusion	252

Table of Contents

CHAPTER 14

The United Kingdom without the Charter of Fundamental Rights of the European Union: Putting Down the Dog That Did Not Bark?

<i>Kieron Beale QC</i>	257
§14.01 Introduction	257
§14.02 The Scope of EU Fundamental Rights Protection in the UK Prior to the Adoption of the Charter	261
[A] The Protection of Fundamental Rights through General Principles of EU Law	261
[B] The Scope of Application of EU General Principles of Law: The ECJ Jurisprudence	267
[C] The Scope of Application of EU General Principles of Law: The Response of the UK Courts	268
[D] The Common Law Protection of Fundamental Rights	271
§14.03 The Adoption of the Charter	273
§14.04 The Scope of Application of the Charter	275
§14.05 The Diversion of the So-Called Opt Out for the United Kingdom	277
§14.06 Has the Charter in the UK Been the Guard Dog Which Did Not Bark?	279
[A] Tax Cases	279
[B] Immigration Cases	280
[C] Privacy Cases	282
[D] Miscellaneous Cases	284
§14.07 Will We Miss the Charter If It Goes?	286

CHAPTER 15

State Aid Control, Government Spending and the Virtue of Loyalty

<i>Andrea Biondi</i>	291
§15.01 Introduction	291
§15.02 The Numbers: Government Spending and Business 'Support'	292
§15.03 Constitutional Reflections: The Relationships between the EU and Its Member States and between the Member States Themselves	295
§15.04 Loyalty and Direct Execution	296
§15.05 State Aid Control as a Direct Execution Model	296
[A] The (Legal) Sanctity of the European Commission's Role	298
[B] All Member States Must Cooperate: The Stick	300
§15.06 Direct Administration and Flexibility: The Carrot	304
§15.07 Conclusions: Stick and Carrot	308

CHAPTER 16

Differentiated Integration and the Single Supervisory Mechanism: Which Way Forward for the European Banking Authority?

<i>Pierre Schammo</i>	311
§16.01 Introduction	311
§16.02 The Single Supervisory Mechanism and the European System of Financial Supervision: Introducing the ECB and EBA	313
[A] The SSM and the ECB	313
[B] The ESFS and EBA	315
[C] Interactions between EBA and the ECB Following the Establishment of the SSM	316
§16.03 The Establishment of the SSM: The Approach to NoPS	317
[A] The SSM Conundrum: The Concerns of NoPS	317
[B] The EU Legislature's Approach to NoPS	319
[1] Safeguards	320
[2] The Legislature's Approach: An Ill-considered Approach	321
§16.04 Alternative Approaches	326
[A] Varying EBA's Functions: Fitting Functions to Governance	326
[1] Setting 'Rules of Conduct'?	326
[2] Allowing for Dissenting Views?	327
[3] Abolishing Some of EBA's Functions?	328
[B] Varying EBA's Governance: Fitting Governance to Functions	329
[1] Independent Appointees as Trustees	329
[2] Tasks of Trustees	331
§16.05 Conclusion	334
Index	337