

Theoretical Logic in ^Sociology

Volume Two

**THE ANTINOMIES
OF CLASSICAL
THOUGHT:
MARX AND DURKHEIM**

Jeffrey C. Alexander

*University of California Press
Berkeley • Los Angeles*

CONTENTS—OVERVIEW

Preface and Acknowledgments

Introduction

Volume One

POSITIVISM, PRESUPPOSITIONS, AND CURRENT CONTROVERSIES

- One* Theoretical Logic in Scientific Thought
- Two* Theoretical Logic in Sociological Thought (1): The Failure of
Contemporary Debate to Achieve Generality
- Three* Theoretical Logic in Sociological Thought (2): Toward the
Restoration of Generality
- Four* Theoretical Logic as Objective Argument
- Notes*
- Indexes*

Volume Two

THE ANTINOMIES OF CLASSICAL THOUGHT: MARX AND DURKHEIM

Preface

- One* Prolegomena: General Theoretical Argument as Interpretation:
The Critical Role of "Readings"
- Part One. Collective Order and the Ambiguity about Action*
- Two* Marx's First Phase (1): From Moral Criticism to External
Necessity

- Three** Marx's First Phase (2): The Attack on Moral Criticism and the Origins of a Historical Materialism
- Four** Durkheim's First Phase (1): The Ambiguous Transition from Voluntary Morality to Morality as External Constraint
- Five** Durkheim's First Phase (2): *The Division of Labor in Society* as the Attempt to Reconcile Instrumental Order with Freedom
- Part Two. Two Different Paths to Collective Order*
- Six** Marx's Later Writings: The Elegant Apotheosis of Instrumental Control
- Seven** Durkheim's Later Writings (1): The Transition to Morality as a Spiritual Force
- Eight** Durkheim's Later Writings (2): The Religious Model and the Idealist Theory of Society
- Part Three. One-Dimensional Theory and Its Discontents*
- Nine** Equivocation and Revision in the Classical Theory of Sociological Idealism: Durkheim and "Durkheimianism"
- Ten** Equivocation and Revision in the Classical Theory of Sociological Materialism: Marx and "Marxism"
- Notes*
- Works of Marx and Durkheim*
- Indexes*

Volume Three

THE CLASSICAL ATTEMPT AT THEORETICAL SYNTHESIS: MAX WEBER

Preface

- One** Weber's Early Writings: Tentative Explorations beyond Idealism and Materialism
- Two** The Later Writings and Weber's Multidimensional Theory of Society
- Three** The Retreat from Multidimensionality (1): Presuppositional Dichotomization in the "Religious" Writings
- Four** The Retreat from Multidimensionality (2): Instrumental Reduction in the "Political" Writings
- Five** Legal-Rational Domination and the Utilitarian Structure of Modern Life

Six Weber Interpretation and Weberian Sociology: "Paradigm Revision" and Presuppositional Strain

Notes

Works of Weber

Indexes

Volume Four

THE MODERN RECONSTRUCTION OF
CLASSICAL THOUGHT: TALCOTT PARSONS

Preface: Theoretical Thought and Its Vicissitudes: The Achievements and Limitations of Classical Sociology

One Theoretical Controversy and the Problematics of Parsonian Interpretation

Two The Early Period: Interpretation and the Presuppositional Movement toward Multidimensionality

Three The Middle Period: Specifying the Multidimensional Argument

Four The Later Period (1): The Interchange Model and Parsons' Final Approach to Multidimensional Theory

Five The Later Period (2): Socialization, Social Change, and the Systemic and Historical Bases of Individual Freedom

Six The Methodological Error (1): Neopositivism and the Formalization of Parsons' Theory

Seven The Methodological Error (2): Neopositivist Strategy and the Conflation of Presuppositional Logic with Specific Commitments

Eight The Presuppositional Error (1): Sociological Idealism and the Attack on Instrumental Order in the Early and Middle Work

Nine The Presuppositional Error (2): Idealist Reduction in the Later Writings

Ten Conclusion: "Paradigm Revision" and Parsonianism

Appendix: Conflation and Reduction in the Interpretation of Parsonian Theory

Notes

Works of Parsons

Indexes

Contents
VOLUME TWO
THE ANTINOMIES
OF CLASSICAL
THOUGHT:
MARX AND DURKHEIM

Preface to Volume Two vii

Chapter One: Prolegomena. General Theoretical Argument as Interpretation: The Critical Role of "Readings" 1

Part One

Collective Order and the Ambiguity about Action

Chapter Two: Marx's First Phase (1): From Moral Criticism to External Necessity 11

1. Reduction and Conflation in Marxist Interpretation 12
2. "Early Writings": From Normative Tension to Utilitarian Calculation 15
 - 2.1. Moral Criticism and the Appeal to Universal Norms: The Starting Point 15
 - 2.2. Natural Necessity and the Appeal to Self Interest: The Initial Transition 19
 - 2.3. Alienation and the Submission to Material Order: The Ambivalent Acceptance of Political Economy in the 1844 Manuscripts 26
 - 2.3.1. The Challenge of the "Theses on Feuerbach": Philosophical Multidimensionality Reaffirmed as Species-Being 27
 - 2.3.2. The Tentative Solution: "Natural Man" and the Instrumental Logic of Political Economy 28

2.3.3. The Hanging Thread: The Subjective Foundations of Alienation and the Problem of the Transition to Communism	35
--	----

Chapter Three: Marx's First Phase (2): The Attack on Moral Criticism and the Origins of a Historical Materialism 41

1. The Years of Transition 41
 - 1.1. The Attack on Cultural "Generality" and the End of Philosophy 42
 - 1.2. Transforming the Status of "Alienation": The Attack on Subjectivity in the Transition to Communism 48
 - 1.3. The Residual Category of Later Marxism: Inexplicable Normative Action 53
2. Maturity: Rational Action and Coercive Order in *The Communist Manifesto* 56
3. Conclusion: Interpretive Errors and Marx's True Contribution 64

Chapter Four: Durkheim's First Phase (1): The Ambiguous Transition from Voluntary Morality to Morality as External Constraint 75

1. Reduction and Conflation in Durkheimian Interpretation 76
2. Durkheim's Early Writings: The Unsuccessful Search for Voluntary Morality 81
 - 2.1. Social Crisis and the Search for a Responsive Collectivism 82
 - 2.2. The Critique of Classical Economy: Morality as the Collectivist Alternative 86
 - 2.3. Durkheim's Contradictory Approaches to Moral Order: Theoretical Ambivalence and the Movement toward an Antivoluntaristic Determinism 92
 - 2.3.1. The Problem of Action: Durkheim's Ambiguous Critique of Egoistic Rationality 92
 - 2.3.2. The Problem of Order: The Tortuous Path toward Collective Control 95
 - 2.4. Involuntary Morality and Durkheim's First Sociology 109
 - 2.5. Conclusion: Mechanical Order and Durkheim's Relation to the Instrumentalist Tradition 112

Chapter Five: Durkheim's First Phase (2): The Division of Labor in Society as the Attempt to Reconcile Instrumental Order with Freedom 119

1. "Material Individualism" as the Antidote to Mechanical Order: The Division of Labor in the Early Sociological Essays 121
2. Empirical Discovery and Theoretical Ambivalence in *The Division of Labor in Society* 124
 - 2.1. Book 1: The Confrontation between Instrumental and Normative Theory as a Debate over Modernity 128
 - 2.1.1. Mechanical and Organic Solidarity as Presuppositional Problems: The Shift toward Instrumental Individualism 128
 - 2.1.2. Modernity as the Differentiated Moral Community: The Last Attempt at Voluntary Order 134
 - 2.1.3. The Surrender to Modern Instrumentalism: Noncontractual Solidarity as Coercive Force 140
 - 2.2. Book 2: The Instrumental-Collective Causes of Labor Division 146
 - 2.3. Book 3: The Residual Categories of Durkheim's Critical Materialism 152
3. Conclusion: *The Division of Labor* as a Return to Spencer and Marx 157

Part Two

Two Different Paths to Collective Order

Chapter Six: Marx's Later Writings: The Elegant Apotheosis of Instrumental Control 163

1. Historical Development and the Slowness of Revolution 164
2. Action and order in *Capital* 167
 - 2.1. Instrumental Action and the Commodity Form 168
 - 2.2. Coercive Order and the "Laws" of Capitalism 171
 - 2.3. False Consciousness and the Reflected Superstructure 178
 - 2.4. The True Sources of Obedience: The Material Reproduction of Labor as the "Invisible Thread" 187
 - 2.5. True Consciousness: The Instrumental Rationality of Class Struggle and Revolution 192

3. The Empirical Status of the Later Writings 199
4. The Ethical Status of the Later Writings 203
5. "Social" Determinism: The Conflation of Action and Order and Marx's Problem with the Individual 205

Chapter Seven: *Durkheim's Later Writings (1): The Transition to Morality as a Spiritual Force* 211

1. Refuting *The Division of Labor in Society*: The Middle Years and Durkheim's Initial Reconceptualization of Moral Order 214
 - 1.1. *The Rules of Sociological Method* as Theoretical Critique 217
 - 1.2. *Socialism* and *Suicide*: Exchange and Association as Morality and Affect 221
 - 1.3. The Theoretical Status and Causes of Durkheim's Innovation 230
2. Spiritualizing Morality: Religion as the Model of Voluntary Order 233
 - 2.1. The "Revelation": Durkheim's Encounter with the Sacred 235
 - 2.2. The Impact of Durkheim's Religious Sociology on His Middle-Period Work 242
 - 2.3. Consolidating the New Theory: Durkheim's Refutation of Marxism and the Establishment of the *L'Année sociologique* 250
3. Conclusion: Durkheim's Confession "*Malgre Lui*" 255

Chapter Eight: *Durkheim's Later Writings (2): The Religious Model and the Idealist Theory of Society* 259

1. Normative Society: The Hierarchy of Institutions 261
2. Culture and the Sacred Individual 263
3. Families and Occupations: Two Spheres of Particularistic Spirit 267
4. The State and the Law as Transcendent Representations 271
5. Education: The Religious Nature and History of a Contemporary Institution 279
6. Moral Economics and the Disadvantages of Idealism 287
7. Conclusion. The Deceptiveness of "Social" Facts: Sociological Idealism as the Conflation of Action and Order 292

Part Three

One-Dimensional Theory and Its Discontents

Chapter Nine: Equivocation and Revision in the Classical Theory of Sociological Idealism: Durkheim and "Durkheimianism" 299

1. Durkheim's "Second Thoughts": Theoretical Conflation and Residual Utilitarianism 301
2. "Durkheimianism" as Paradigm Revision: Making Idealism Instrumental 306

Chapter Ten: Equivocation and Revision in the Classical Theory of Sociological Materialism: Marx and "Marxism" 328

1. Marx's "Second Thoughts": Revolution as the Product of Moral Solidarity and Voluntary Action 330
2. "Marxism" as Paradigm Revision: Making "Materialism" Normative 343
3. Conclusion: The Instability of One-Dimensional Theory and the Need for Its Transcendence 370

Notes 371

Works of Marx and Durkheim 537

Author-Citation Index 543

Subject Index 555