



Addressing the Challenges of Globalization

An Independent Evaluation of the World Bank's Approach to Global Programs



Contents

vii	Acknowledgments
xi	Foreword, Prólogo, Avant-propos
xv	Preface, Prefacio, Préface
xxi	Executive Summary
xxxi	Résumen ejecutivo
xliii	Résumé analytique
iv	List of Case Study Programs
lvii	Abbreviations and Acronyms
1	1 Introduction and Context: Global Challenges and the Need for Collective Action
3	Issues and Trends in Global Programs
9	2 Overview of the Case Study Programs
11	Program Objectives
15	Governance and Management
18	The Bank's Roles
21	3 Program Relevance to Global Challenges, Bank Priorities, and Country Priorities
22	Evidence of International Consensus
27	Consistency with the Bank's Sector Strategies
28	Consistency with the Subsidiarity Principle and the Bank's Strategic Foci for Global Programs
30	Conclusions
33	4 Striving for Results: Assessing the Outcomes and Impacts of Global Programs
34	Quality of Monitoring and Evaluation Activities
41	Links Between Global Programs and Country Operations
45	Conclusions
53	5 Governance, Management, Partnerships, and Participation
53	Governance Functions, Principles, and Models
58	Clarity of Roles and Responsibilities

	60	Partnering with Developing Countries, Civil Society, and the Private Sector
	65	Overall Assessment and Lessons
67	6	Global Programs Need Global Strategy
	68	Funding Models of Global Programs That Combine the DGF, Trust Funds, and Bank Budget Need Greater Clarity
	69	Inconsistent Application of DGF Funding Rules Causes Confusion and Poses Reputational Risks
	72	Bank-Administered Trust Funds for Global Programs Could Be Deployed More Strategically
73	7	World Bank Performance in Global Programs
	74	Comparative Advantage
	74	Global-Country Links
	77	Oversight
	80	Exit Strategy
83	8	Findings and Recommendations
	83	OED Findings
	88	OED Recommendations
91		Annexes
	93	A: Previous OED Recommendations in Relation to Global Programs
	97	B: Progress in Implementing the Phase 1 Recommendations Relating to Strategic and Programmatic Management
	101	C: Evaluation Framework for Phase 2 Report and 26 Case Studies
	109	D: Suggested Appraisal Template for Global Programs
	113	E: OED's Summary of the Known Outcomes and Impacts of Case Study Global Programs
	127	F: Source Material
	129	G: People Consulted
	151	H: Case Study Summary Information
	241	I: Management Response
	247	J: Chairman's Summary: Committee on Development Effectiveness (CODE)
251		Endnotes
263		References
		Boxes
	2	1.1 Definition and Management of Global Programs by the World Bank
	3	1.2 What Is the World Bank's Comparative Advantage with Respect to Global Programs?
	5	1.3 Global Public Goods, Merit Goods, and the Logic of Global Collective Action
	12	2.1 Subsidiarity: Who Does What
	14	2.2 Both "Approaches" and "Standards" Raise Practical Issues: The Devil Is in the Details
	25	3.1 AIDS Programs Face Continuing Implementation Challenges
	35	4.1 UNAIDS-Funded and Bank-Administered Monitoring and Evaluation of HIV/AIDS Programs Face the Challenge of Donor Coordination
	36	4.2 To Deliver Global Public Goods of Benefit to the Poor, Global Programs Need Analytical Foundations with a Results-Based Orientation

37	4.3 Key Terms in Results-Based Management and Evaluation
38	4.4 Partners in Poverty-Focused CGAP Disagree on Need to Verify Program Impact on the Poor
39	4.5 Impacts of Global Agricultural and Health Research
55	5.1 The Two Largest Programs Show the Roots of Diversity and Complexity
56	5.2 What Are Partnerships? Who Are Members and Partners?
56	5.3 Shareholder and Stakeholder Models
70	6.1 The DGF Has Had Difficulty Applying Its Selectivity Criteria to the Bank's Global Programs
75	7.1 The Effectiveness of Bank Cosponsorship as a Governance Tool Is Underexplored

Tables

7	1.1 Management Actions Following OED's Phase 1 Report
10	2.1 Environment and Agriculture Are the Largest Case Study Programs
13	2.2 Most Programs Primarily Address National Public Goods or Capacity
16	2.3 Governance and Management Arrangements Are Diverse
17	2.4 Unlike Programs Housed outside the Bank, Those Housed inside the Bank Tend to Be Chaired by the Bank
19	2.5 World Bank Plays Multiple Roles in Global Programs
20	2.6 Many Programs Contribute Financial Resources That Supplement the Bank's Administrative Budget
23	3.1 Genesis Is One Indicator of International Consensus for a Program
34	4.1 Most Recent Program-Level Evaluations
42	4.2 The Bank Has Difficulty Linking Global Programs with Country Operations Where Bank Staff Are Not Implementing Global Program Activities
48	4.3 Programs Financing Investments Have More Known Benefits to Developing Countries
57	5.1 Most Programs Now Involve Stakeholders beyond Donors on Their Governing and Executive Bodies
68	6.1 Disconnects Between Program Objectives and Their Funding Arrangements Create Problems
71	6.2 Eight of 18 DGF-Supported Programs Violate DGF's 15 Percent Guideline in FY04, and Windows 1 and 2 Need to Be Revisited
78	7.1 Bank Oversight of Case Study Programs, by Governance Model

Figures

6	1.1 Official Development Assistance Has Fluctuated, but Not Grown, since 1990
10	2.1 Age of Case Study Programs
11	2.2 The Programs Are Engaged in a Wide Range of Activities
26	3.1 Donor Participation Varies in the Case Study Programs
41	4.1 Overall OED Assessment of Monitoring and Evaluation
45	4.2 New Commitments to HIV/AIDS and Other Communicable Diseases Have Grown Rapidly
66	5.1 Overall OED Assessment of Governance and Management
88	8.1 Overall OED Assessment of Current Consistency of Case Study Programs with the Development Committee Criteria