

# The Economics of Budget Deficits Volume I

*Edited by*

**Charles K. Rowley**

*Duncan Black Professor of Economics, George Mason University  
and General Director, The Locke Institute, Fairfax, VA, USA*

**William F. Shughart II**

*Frederick A.P. Barnard Distinguished Professor of Economics  
and Robert M. Hearin Chair, University of Mississippi, USA*

*and*

**Robert D. Tollison**

*Robert M. Hearin Professor of Economics, University of Mississippi, USA*

THE INTERNATIONAL LIBRARY OF CRITICAL WRITINGS IN ECONOMICS

An Elgar Reference Collection (,  
Cheltenham, UK • Northampton, MA, USA

# Contents

<i>Acknowledgements</i>	xi
<i>Introduction</i> Charles K. Rowley, William F. Shugart II and Robert D. Tollison	xiii

**PART I THE HISTORY AND MEASUREMENT OF BUDGET DEFICITS**

Part I Overview Charles K. Rowley, William F. Shugart II and Robert D. Tollison	3
1. Gary M. Anderson (1986), 'The US Federal Deficit and National Debt: A Political and Economic History', in James M. Buchanan, Charles K. Rowley and Robert D. Tollison (eds), <i>Deficits</i> , Chapter 2, Oxford: Basil Blackwell Ltd, 9-46	7
2. Alberto Alesina (2000), 'The Political Economy of the Budget Surplus in the United States', <i>Journal of Economic Perspectives</i> , 14 (3), Summer, 3-19	45
3. Mario I. Blejer and Adrienne Cheasty (1991), 'The Measurement of Fiscal Deficits: Analytical and Methodological Issues', <i>Journal of Economic Literature</i> , <b>XXIX</b> (4), December, 1644-78	62
4. Laurence J. Kotlikoff and Bernd Raffelhuschen (1999), 'Generational Accounting Around the Globe', <i>American Economic Review, Papers and Proceedings</i> , 89 (2), May, 161-6	97
5. Jody W. Lipford (2001), 'How Transparent is the U.S. Budget?', <i>Independent Review: A Journal of Political Economy</i> , V (4), Spring, 575-91	103

**PART II CLASSICAL PUBLIC DEBT THEORY**

Part II Overview Charles K. Rowley, William F. Shugart II and Robert D. Tollison	123
6. Adam Smith (1776/1976), 'Of Publick Debts', in R.H. Campbell, A.S. Skinner and W.B. Todd (eds), <i>An Inquiry into the Nature and Causes of the Wealth of Nations</i> , Volume II, Book V, Chapter III, Oxford: Clarendon Press, 907-47	127
7. T.R. Malthus (1803/1992), 'Of Poor-Laws, continued', in Donald Winch (ed.), <i>An Essay on the Principle of Population; or A View of its Past and Present Effects on Human Happiness; With an Inquiry into our Prospects Respecting the future Removal or Mitigation of the Evils which it occasions</i> , Book III, Chapter VII, Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 110-23	168

## The Economics of Budget Deficits I

8. David Ricardo (1821/1951), 'Taxes on Other Commodities than Raw Produce', in Piero Sraffa (ed.) with M.H. Dobb, *The Works and Correspondence of David Ricardo, Volume I: On the Principles of Political Economy and Taxation*, Chapter XVII, Third Edition, Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 243-56 182
9. John Stuart Mill (1848/1965), 'Of a National Debt', in J.M. Robson (ed.), *Principles of Political Economy with Some of Their Applications to Social Philosophy*, Book V, Chapter VII, Toronto: University of Toronto Press and London: Routledge and Kegan Paul, 873-9 196

### **PART III KEYNESIAN PUBLIC DEBT THEORY**

- Part III Overview *Charles K. Rowley, William F. Shughart II and Robert D. Tollison* 205  
i'
10. John Maynard Keynes (1936/1973), 'The Marginal Propensity to Consume and the Multiplier', in *The Collected Writings of John Maynard Keynes: Volume VII, The General Theory of Employment Interest and Money*, Chapter 10, London and Basingstoke: Macmillan and New York: St Martin's Press for Royal Economic Society, 113-31 209
  11. Abba P. Lerner (1943), 'Functional Finance and the Federal Debt', *Social Research*, 10 (1), February, 38-51 228
  12. Abba P. Lerner (1948), 'The Burden of the National Debt', in *Income, Employment, and Public Policy: Essays in Honor of Alvin H. Hansen*, Chapter II, New York: W.W. Norton & Company, Inc., 255-75 242
  13. Paul A. Samuelson (1948), 'Fiscal Policy and Full Employment without Inflation', in *Economics: An Introductory Analysis*, First Edition, Chapter 18, New York: McGraw-Hill Book Company, Inc., 409-43 263
  14. Paul A. Samuelson (1970), 'Fiscal Policy and Full Employment without Inflation', in *Economics*, Eighth Edition, Chapter 19, New York: McGraw-Hill Book Company, Inc., 330-53 298

### **PART IV THE BURDEN OF DEBT RE-EXAMINED**

- Part IV Overview *Charles K. Rowley, William F. Shughart II and Robert D. Tollison* 325
15. J.E. Meade (1958), 'Is the National Debt a Burden?', *Oxford Economic Papers*, 10 (2), New Series, 163-83, June 327
  16. J.E. Meade (1959), 'Is the National Debt a Burden? A Correction!', *Oxford Economic Papers*, 11, New Series, 109-10 348

17. James M. Buchanan (1958), 'Concerning Future Generations', Chapter Four, and 'A Suggested Conceptual Revaluation of the National Debt', Appendix, in *Public Principles of Public Debt; A Defense and Restatement*, Homewood, IL: Richard D. Irwin, Inc., 31-47 and 196-215 350
18. Richard A. Musgrave (1959), 'Classical Theory of Public Debt', in *The Theory of Public Finance: A Study in Public Economy*, Chapter 23, New York: McGraw-Hill Book Company, Inc., 556-80 387
19. Abba P. Lerner (1961), 'The Burden of Debt', *Review of Economics and Statistics*, XLIII, 139-41 412
20. Franco Modigliani (1961), 'Long-Run Implications of Alternative Fiscal Policies and the Burden of the National Debt', *Economic Journal*, LXXI, December, 730-55 415
21. James M. Buchanan (1964), 'Public Debt, Cost Theory, and the Fiscal Illusion', in James M. Ferguson (ed.), *Public Debt and Future Generations*, Chapter Six, Chapel Hill, NC: University of North Carolina Press, 150-63 441
22. James Tobin (1965), 'The Burden of the Public Debt: A Review Article', *Journal of Finance*, XX, 679-82 455
23. James M. Buchanan (1966), 'The Icons of Public Debt', *Journal of Finance*, XXI, 544-6 459
24. James Tobin (1966), 'Reply', *Journal of Finance*, XXI, 547 462

# The Economics of Budget Deficits Volume II

*Edited by*

Charles K. Rowley

*Duncan Black Professor of Economics, George Mason University,  
and General Director, The Locke Institute, Fairfax, VA, USA*

William F. Shughart II

*Frederick A.P. Barnard Distinguished Professor of Economics  
and Robert M. Hearin Chair, University of Mississippi, USA*

*and*

Robert D. Tollison

*Robert M. Hearin Professor of Economics, University of Mississippi, USA*

THE INTERNATIONAL LIBRARY OF CRITICAL WRITINGS IN ECONOMICS

An Elgar Reference Collection     C

Cheltenham, UK • Northampton, MA, USA

# Contents

Acknowledgements	ix
------------------	----

An introduction by the editors to both volumes appears in Volume I

**PART I     RICARDIAN EQUIVALENCE IN THE DOCK**

Part I Overview	Charles K. Rowley, William F. Shughart II and Robert D. Tollison	3
1.	Robert J. Barro (1974), 'Are Government Bonds Net Wealth?', <i>Journal of Political Economy</i> , 82 (6), 1095-117	7
2.	Martin Feldstein (1976), 'Perceived Wealth in Bonds and Social Security: A Comment', <i>Journal of Political Economy</i> , 84 (2), 331-6	30
3.	James M. Buchanan (1976), 'Barro on the Ricardian Equivalence Theorem', <i>Journal of Political Economy</i> , 84(2), 337-42	36
4.	Robert J. Barro (1976), 'Reply to Feldstein and Buchanan', <i>Journal of Political Economy</i> , 84 (2), 343-9	42
5.	Gerald P. O'Driscoll, Jr. (1977), 'The Ricardian Nonequivalence Theorem', <i>Journal of Political Economy</i> , 85 (1), 207-10	49
6.	Robert J. Barro (1979), 'On the Determination of the Public Debt', <i>Journal of Political Economy</i> , 87 (5, Part 1), 940-71	53
7.	Geoffrey Brennan and James M. Buchanan (1980), 'The Logic of the Ricardian Equivalence Theorem', <i>Finanzarchiv</i> , 38 (1), New Series, 4-16	85
8.	Paul Evans (1993), 'Consumers are Not Ricardian: Evidence from Nineteen Countries', <i>Economic Inquiry</i> , <b>XXXI</b> (4), October, 534-48	98
9.	T.D. Stanley (1998), 'New Wine in Old Bottles: A Meta-Analysis of Ricardian Equivalence', <i>Southern Economic Journal</i> , 64 (3), January, 713-27	113

**PART II     PUBLIC CHOICE AND PUBLIC DEBT: THEORY AND EVIDENCE**

Part II Overview	Charles K. Rowley, William F. Shughart II and Robert D. Tollison	131
10.	Edgar K. Browning (1975), 'Why the Social Insurance Budget is too Large in a Democracy', <i>Economic Inquiry</i> , <b>XIII</b> , September, 373-88	135

11. Torsten Persson and Lars E.O. Svensson (1989), 'Why a Stubborn Conservative Would Run a Deficit: Policy with Time-Inconsistent Preferences', *Quarterly Journal of Economics*, CIV, May, 325-45 151
12. Amihai Glazer (1989), 'Politics and the Choice of Durability', *American Economic Review*, 79 (5), December, 1207-13 172
13. Alberto Alesina and Guido Tabellini (1990), 'A Positive Theory of Fiscal Deficits and Government Debt', *Review of Economic Studies*, 57 (3), July, 403-14 179
14. Guido Tabellini and Alberto Alesina (1990), 'Voting on the Budget Deficit', *American Economic Review*, **80**(1), March, 37-49 191
15. Timothy Besley and Anne Case (1995), 'Does Electoral Accountability Affect Economic Policy Choices? Evidence from Gubernatorial Term Limits', *Quarterly Journal of Economics*, CX, August, 769-98 204
16. W. Mark Crain and Robert D. Tollison (1993), 'Time Inconsistency and Fiscal Policy: Empirical Analysis of U.S. States, 1969-89', *Journal of Public Economics*, 51 (1), May, 153-9 234
17. W. Mark Crain and Lisa K. Oakley (1995), 'The Politics of Infrastructure', *Journal of Law and Economics*, **XXXVIII** (1), April, 1-17 241

## **PART in DEFICIT FINANCE IN CONSTITUTIONAL PERSPECTIVE**

- Part III Overview *Charles K. Rowley, William F. Shughart II and Robert D. Tollison* 261
18. James M. Buchanan (1985), 'The Moral Dimension of Debt Financing', *Economic Inquiry*, **XXIII** (1), January, 1-6 265
  19. Robert D. Tollison and Richard E. Wagner (1986), 'Balanced Budgets and Beyond', in James M. Buchanan, Charles K. Rowley and Robert D. Tollison (eds), *Deficits*, Chapter 20, Oxford: Basil Blackwell Ltd, 374-90 271
  20. Milton Friedman (1978), 'The Limitations of Tax Limitation', *Policy Review*, 5, Summer, 7-14 288
  21. Alvin Rabushka (1982/1987), 'A Compelling Case for a Constitutional Amendment to Balance the Budget and Limit Taxes', in Richard H. Fink and Jack C. High (eds), *A Nation in Debt: Economists Debate the Federal Budget Deficit*, Frederick, MD: University Publications of America, 212-30 296
  22. Henry Hazlitt (1983/1987), 'A Proposal for Two Constitutional Amendments', in Richard H. Fink and Jack C. High (eds), *A Nation in Debt: Economists Debate the Federal Budget Deficit*, Frederick, MD: University Publications of America, 231 -4 315
  23. Aaron Wildavsky (1985), 'Equality, Spending Limits, and the Growth of Government', in C. Lowell Harriss (ed.), *Control of*

- Federal Spending*, Proceedings of the Academy of Political Science, 35 (4), New York: Academy of Political Science, 59-71 319
24. W. Mark Crain and James C. Miller III (1990), 'Budget Process and Spending Growth', *William and Mary Law Review*, 31 (4), Summer, 1021-46 332
25. Jvirgen von Hagen (1991), 'A Note on the Empirical Effectiveness of Formal Fiscal Restraints', *Journal of Public Economics*, 44, 199-210 358
26. James M. Poterba (1994), 'State Responses to Fiscal Crises: The Effects of Budgetary Institutions and Politics', *Journal of Political Economy*, **102** (4), August, 799-821 370
27. W. Mark Crain and Timothy J. Muris (1995), 'Legislative Organization of Fiscal Policy', *Journal of Law and Economics*, XXXVIII (2), October, 311 -33 393
28. Edward M. Gramlich (1995), 'The Politics and Economics of Budget Deficit Control: Policy Questions and Research Questions', in Jeffrey S. Banks and Eric A. Hanushek (eds), *Modern Political Economy: Old Topics, New Directions*, Chapter 6, Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 171 -90 416
29. James M. Buchanan (1997), 'The Balanced Budget Amendment: Clarifying the Arguments', *Public Choice*, 90, 117-38 436
30. James M. Poterba (1997), 'Do Budget Rules Work?', in Alan J. Auerbach (ed.), *Fiscal Policy: Lessons from Economic Research*, Chapter 3, Cambridge, MA and London, England: MIT Press, 53-86 458
31. Robert D. Reischauer (1997), 'Comment', in Alan J. Auerbach (ed.), *Fiscal Policy: Lessons from Economic Research*, Cambridge, MA and London, England: MIT Press, 87-95 492
32. David Romer (1997), 'Comment', in Alan J. Auerbach (ed.), *Fiscal Policy: Lessons from Economic Research*, Cambridge, MA and London, England: MIT Press, 97-100 501
33. W. Mark Crain and Nicole Verrier Crain (1998), 'Fiscal Consequences of Budget Baselines', *Journal of Public Economics*, 67 (3), March, 421-36 505
34. Charles K. Rowley (2000), 'Budget Deficits and the Size of Government in the UK and US: A Public Choice Perspective on the Thatcher and Reagan Years', in K. Alec Chrystal and Rupert Pennant-Rea (eds), *Public Choice Analysis of Economic Policy*, Chapter 2, London: Macmillan Press Ltd and New York: St Martin's Press, Inc., 20-58 521