The Tyranny of the Ideal

JUSTICE IN A DIVERSE SOCIETY

Gerald Gaus

PRINCETON UNIVERSITY PRESS

Princeton and Oxford

Summary of Contents

Preface xv

CHAPTER I

The Allure of the Ideal: Orienting the Quest for Justice 1

CHAPTER II

The Elusive Ideal: Searching under a Single Perspective 42

CHAPTER III

The Fractured Ideal: Searching with Diverse Perspectives 105

CHAPTER IV

The Nonideal: The Open Society 150

CHAPTER V

Advancing from the Citadel 241

Appendixes 251

Works Cited 265

Index 279

Contents

Preface xv

CHAPTER I

The Allure of the Ideal: Orienting the Quest for Justice 1
1 Orienting to Utopia 1
1.1 Beyond the Contemporary Debate and Its Categories 1
1.2 Of Paradise 3
1.3 Climbing 5
1.4 Dreaming 11
1.5 Recommending—Rescuing Justice from Uselessness 16
2 Social Realizations and the Ideal 18
2.1 Perfect Principle Conformity and Ideal Societies 18
2.2 Justice and Its Social Realization 21
2.3 How Well Justified Are Our Principles of Justice? 26
3 Modeling the Ideal (and Nonideal) 29
3.1 Setting the Constraints Regulating Coherent Social Worlds (One Sense of Feasibility) 29
3.2 The Aim of Ideal Theory 34
3.3 Abstraction and Idealization 36
4 Two Conditions for Ideal Theory 39

CHAPTER II

The Elusive Ideal: Searching under a Single Perspective 42
1 Perspectives on Justice 42
1.1 Evaluative Perspectives and the Social Realizations Condition 42
1.2 Meaningful Structures and the Orientation Condition 51
1.3 Why Not Feasibility? 56
2 Rugged Landscape Models of Ideal Justice 61
2.1 Smooth v. Rugged Optimization 61
2.2 How Rugged? High-Dimensional Landscapes and the Social Realizations Condition 67
2.3 How Rugged? Low-Dimensional Landscapes the Orientation Condition 72

2.4 Ideal Theory: Rugged, but Not Too Rugged, Landscapes 73
3 The Neighborhood Constraint and the Ideal 74
3.1 Rawls's Idea of a Neighborhood 74
3.2 The Social Worlds We Know Best 76
3.3 The Neighborhood Constraint and the Ideal 80
3.4 Progressive v. Wandering Utopianism 84
4 Increasing Knowledge of the Landscape and Expanding the Neighborhood 89
4.1 Experiments in Just Social Worlds 89
4.2 Improving Predictions: Diversity within, and the Seeds of It between, Perspectives 93
4.3 Introducing Explicit Perspectival Diversity 98
5 The Limits of Like-Mindedness 101

CHAPTER III
The Fractured Ideal: Searching with Diverse Perspectives 105
1 Attaining the Ideal through Perspectival Diversity 105
1.1 From Full to Partial Normalization 105
1.2 Diversity of Meaningful Structures and Finding the Ideal 107
1.3 The Hong-Page Theorem 111
2 Dilemmas of Diversity 114
2.1 The Neighborhood Constraint (Again) 115
2.2 The Theorem and Actual Politics 116
2.3 The Utopia Is at Hand Theorem 120
2.4 The Interdependence of the Elements of a Perspective on the Ideal 122
2.5 The Fundamental Diversity Dilemma 130
3 The Benefits of Diversity 133
3.1 The Fundamental Diversity Insight 133
3.2 The Deep Insight of Hong and Page's Analysis 134
3.3 Modular Problems 135
3.4 Recombination 137
3.5 Improving Predictions 138
4 Escaping the Tyranny of the Ideal 139
4.1 The Tyranny of The Choice 139

4.2 From Normalization to Deep Diversity 144
4.3 A Liberal Order of Republican Communities? 145

CHAPTER IV
The Nonideal: The Open Society 150
1 Justice without Normalization? 150
1.1 Normalization and Determinate Justice 150
1.2 Sen's Partial Normalization Theory 154
1.3 Muldoon's Nonnormalized Contract 165
1.4 Not All Liberal Justice Is Fit for the Open Society 173
2 An Artificial, Open, Public Social World 177
2.1 On Creating a Public Social World 177
2.2 Polycentrism 184
2.3 Liberty, Prohibitions, and Searching 187
2.4 Reducing Complexity through Jurisdictions 198
2.5 Markets 202
2.6 The Moral and Political Constitutions 206
3 Rules We Can Live With 208
3.1 On Choosing without Agreeing on the Best 208
3.2 The Socially Eligible Set 211
3.3 Abandoning the Optimizing Stance 215
3.4 The Social Space of the Open Society 220
4 Imperfect Coordination on the Moral Constitution 223
4.1 Coordination as Diversity Reducing 223
4.2 The Changing Moral Constitution 226
4.3 How Diversity Maintains the Open Society 230
4.4 The Perspectives of Reform and Order 237

CHAPTER V
Advancing from the Citadel 241
1 Recounting the Journey 241
2 Adieu to the Well-Ordered Society 245
3 The Citadel of the Ideal 248

Appendix A. On Measuring Similarity 251

Appendix B. On Predictive Diversity 261

Works Cited 265

Index 279