

The Legal Protection of Databases

MarkJ. Davison

Monash University

CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Contents

<i>Foreword by William R. Cornish</i>	<i>page xv</i>
<i>Acknowledgments</i>	xvi
<i>Table of cases</i>	xvii
<i>Table of legislation</i>	xxiii
<i>Table of European Union legislation</i>	xxxiv
<i>Table of treaties, conventions, other international and regional instruments</i>	xxxviii
1 Introduction	1
Why have databases become an important issue	2
The structure of this book	3
2 Some basic principles	10
Basic copyright principles concerning databases	11
Compilations and collections	11
Originality	13
The 'sweat of the brow' approach	14
An intellectual creation	15
European standards of originality	16
The spectrum of originality	17
Originality as it applies to compilations and databases	17
Authorship	21
Some technical aspects of database creation	22
Infringement	24
A substantial part of a work: qualitative rather than quantitative tests	25
Rights that are infringed	28
Right of reproduction	29
Right of rental	31
Right of distribution	31
Right of communication to the public	31
Protection against circumvention of technological protection devices	32
Exceptions to copyright	32
Compulsory licensing	34
Summary of copyright	36

Principles of unfair competition	37
Contract law and databases	40
Competition law	43
The paradigm does not fit	43
The legal model for protection may generate the possibility of legitimate market power being created	46
The logistics of government regulation	47
Government policy towards competition law	48
Aspects of distributive justice	48
3 Protection of databases in the EU	50
History of the Directive	51
The Green Paper	52
The First Draft	53
Justification for a Directive	54
Definition of a database	54
Copyright in a database	54
Relationship to copyright in computer programs	55
Exceptions to copyright	55
Relationship between copyright and contract law	56
The <i>sui generis</i> right	57
Compulsory licensing	57
Exceptions to the <i>sui generis</i> right	58
Term of protection	59
Protection for databases outside the EU	59
Retrospectivity	59
Preservation of other legal provisions	59
Summary of the First Draft	60
Opinion of the Economic and Social Committee of the Council	60
Definition of a database	62
Protection for databases outside the EU	63
Duration of protection	63
Authorship of databases and circumvention of technological protection of databases	64
Summary of the Committee's Opinion	64
Amendments to the Directive by the European Parliament	65
Definition of a database	66
The <i>sui generis</i> right	66
Compulsory licensing	66
Exceptions to the <i>sui generis</i> right	67
The duration of protection	67
Summary of the 1993 Amendments	67
The common position of 10 July 1995	68
The final version of the Directive	68
The recitals	69
The need for uniform laws	69
Explanation of the substantive provisions of the Directive	70
Scope of the Directive and the definition of a database	70
Computer programs	74
Copyright in databases	75

Contents

Authors of databases	76
Restricted acts	76
Exceptions to copyright in databases	77
The <i>sui generis</i> right	81
The maker of a database	82
A qualitatively or quantitatively substantial investment in obtaining, verifying or presenting	83
Right to prevent extraction and/or re-utilisation	87
Infringement of the right of extraction and re-utilisation	89
Exceptions to the <i>sui generis</i> right	91
Duration of the <i>sui generis</i> right	92
Retrospectivity	93
Territorial qualification for protection	97
Compulsory licensing and competition law	97
Saving of existing legal regimes	98
Final provisions	98
Summary of the Directive	99
Circumvention of protection measures	100
4 Transposition of the Directive	103
Belgium	109
Copyright before and after transposition	109
Unfair competition laws	111
<i>Sui generis</i> protection	111
Right to extract or re-utilise an insubstantial part	112
Exceptions	113
Term of protection	113
France	113
Copyright before and after transposition	113
Unfair competition law	115
<i>Sui generis</i> protection	116
Right to extract or re-utilise an insubstantial part	117
Exceptions	117
Term of protection	118
Germany	118
Copyright before and after transposition	118
Unfair competition laws	123
<i>Sui generis</i> protection	124
Right to extract or re-utilise an insubstantial part	125
Exceptions	126
Term of protection	126
Ireland	126
Copyright protection before and after transposition	126
Unfair competition laws	127
<i>Sui generis</i> protection	128
The right to extract or re-utilise an insubstantial part	128
Exceptions	128
Term of protection	128
Licensing schemes	128
Technological protection measures	129

Contents

Italy	129
Copyright before and after transposition	129
Unfair competition laws	131
<i>Sui generis</i> protection	132
The right to extract or re-utilise an insubstantial part	133
Exceptions	133
The Netherlands	133
Copyright before and after transposition of databases prior to the Directive	133
Unfair competition laws	134
<i>Sui generis</i> protection	135
The right to extract or re-utilise an insubstantial part	136
Exceptions	137
Term of protection	137
Spain	138
Copyright before and after transposition	138
Unfair competition laws	139
<i>Sui generis</i> protection	140
The right to extract or re-utilise an insubstantial part	140
Exceptions	140
Term of protection	140
Sweden	141
Copyright before and after transposition	141
Unfair competition laws	142
<i>Sui generis</i> protection	142
United Kingdom	143
Copyright before and after transposition	143
Unfair competition laws	146
<i>Sui generis</i> protection	147
Right to extract or re-utilise an insubstantial part	151
Exceptions	151
Term of protection	151
Licensing schemes	152
Summary of the transposition of the Directive	152
Harmonisation of copyright	152
The investment necessary to qualify for <i>sui generis</i> protection	153
Nature of the right and the test of infringement	155
Definition of a lawful user	156
Lack of harmonisation of the exceptions	156
The period of protection	156
Relationship to unfair competition laws	157
Single source databases	157
Conclusion	158
rotection of databases in the United States of America	160
Copyright	162
Some decisions since <i>Feist</i>	162
Circumvention of technological measures	164
The fair use defence	167
Summary of the copyright position	170

Nature and history of the American tort of misappropriation	171
<i>International News Service v. Associated Press</i>	172
Subject matter of protection	173
Protection against whom	174
Nature of the protection	174
The dissenting judgment in <i>International News Service v. Associated Press</i>	175
Summary of the position in <i>International News Service v. Associated Press</i>	176
The chequered history of the decision in <i>International News Service v. Associated Press</i>	178
Limitations on the scope of the tort of misappropriation	179
Pre-emption by the Federal Constitution and intellectual property legislation	180
Direct competition between the parties	183
Time-sensitivity	185
Reducing the plaintiffs incentive	187
Summary of American unfair competition law	189
Legislative proposals for <i>sui generis</i> protection	190
The Database Investment and Intellectual Property Antipiracy Bill of 1996	190
Definition of a database	191
The <i>sui generis</i> right	191
Comparisons with misappropriation	192
Comparisons with the Directive	192
The Collections of Information Antipiracy Bill 1997	193
Definition of a Database	194
Prerequisite for <i>sui generis</i> protection	194
Nature of the <i>sui generis</i> right	195
Potential market	195
Circumvention of database protection systems and protection of database management information	197
Permitted acts	197
Exclusions	198
Preservation of contract law and other legal regimes	199
Pre-emption of state law	199
Comparisons with the Directive	199
Comparisons with misappropriation	200
The Collections of Information Antipiracy Bill of 1999	200
Definition of a collection of information	201
Material harm	201
The market protected	202
A substantial part	203
Fair use	204
Reasonable uses for educational, scientific or research purposes	205
Other reasonable uses	206
Special provisions for securities and commodities market information and digital on-line communications	207
Special provisions regarding genealogical information	207
Investigative, protective or intelligence activities	207

Contents

Computer programs and digital on-line communications	208
Government collections of information	208
Duration of protection	209
Retrospectivity	211
Remedies	211
Study and report	211
Comparisons with the Directive	211
Comparisons with misappropriation	212
The Consumer and Investor Access to Information Bill of 1999	213
Summary of the American position	213
International aspects of protection of databases	217
International agreements concerning copyright protection of databases	218
National treatment, most favoured nation status and the Directive	221
Public international obligations and the American legislation	226
Steps towards a WIPO Treaty on the Protection of Databases	226
The Draft Treaty	227
Further moves towards a database treaty by WIPO	228
WIPO information meeting on intellectual property in databases, Geneva, 17-19 September 1997	229
Observations by WMO and UNESCO	229
Outcome of the information meeting	230
Summary of moves to adopt a database treaty	231
EU and bilateral arrangements	234
Conclusion	235
The appropriate model for the legal protection of databases	237
The argument in favour of <i>sui generis</i> protection	239
Economic theory	241
Price discrimination	242
The costs of intellectual property rights	244
Rent seeking	245
Loss of public good benefits	247
Transaction costs	254
Enforcement costs	257
Limiting the costs of property rights	257
Summary of economic theory	258
Anecdotal and empirical evidence	259
Evidence of the Directive's impact	263
Non-economic roles of information	264
Limits of the tragedy of the commons	266
Examples of scientific cooperation	269
The Health WIZ project	269
World Meteorological Organization (WMO)	271
Some suggestions for protection of databases	272
Defining the subject matter of protection narrowly so as to avoid unnecessary and unintended consequences	273

Separation of the subject matter of <i>sui generis</i> protection for sweat of the brow from copyright protection	274
Differentiation of <i>sui generis</i> rights from copyright	275
Exceptions to copyright to permit use of underlying information	276
Exceptions to prohibitions on circumvention protection devices	277
An equivalent to the fair use defence	277
Relationship with contract law and compulsory licences	278
Modification of competition law principles	280
Duration of the period of protection	280
Remedies	281
Excise some areas of scientific cooperation from any treaty or legislation	282
Government information	282
Conclusion	283
Addendum	285
Canadian approach to originality	285
Reports to WIPO on the impact of database protection on developing countries	286
<i>Glossary</i>	288
<i>Bibliography</i>	290
<i>Index</i>	296