

Does "Trickle Down" Work?

Economic Development Strategies and Job Chains in Local Labor Markets

Joseph Persky
Daniel Felsenstein
Virginia Carlson

2004

^C
W.E. Upjohn Institute for Employment Research
Kalamazoo, Michigan

Contents

| | |
|--|-----------|
| Acknowledgments | ix |
| 1 Introduction | 1 |
| Surface Ripples and Vertical Chains | 1 |
| Multipliers in Practice: A Hypothetical Case Study | 3 |
| Building Tools for Job-Chains Analysis | 6 |
| 2 Labor Markets and Trickle Down | 11 |
| Underemployment and Labor Markets | 13 |
| Trickle Down and Economic Development | 17 |
| Conclusions | 20 |
| Notes | 21 |
| 3 The Problem with Impact Analysis: Counting Everything, Valuing Nothing | 23 |
| Issues in Impact Analysis | 26 |
| All-or-Nothing Evaluations | 27 |
| Studies and Applications | 31 |
| Synthesizing the Applications | 33 |
| The Limits to Existing Approaches | 42 |
| Conclusions | 46 |
| Notes | 47 |
| 4 Delving beneath the Surface: Job Chains in the Evaluation of Local Economic Development | 49 |
| Defining Job Chains | 52 |
| Applications of the Job-Chains Metaphor | 57 |
| A General Model of Job Chains | 61 |
| The Mechanics of Job Chains: A Leontief Approach | 64 |
| Job Chains and Trickle Down: Three Propositions | 70 |
| Conclusions | 72 |
| Notes | 73 |
| 5 Operationalizing a Job-Chains Approach | 75 |
| The Need for Empirical Research | 75 |
| An Empirical Strategy | 77 |
| The Panel Study of Income Dynamics | 79 |
| Estimating the Augmented Q Matrix | 80 |

| | |
|--|------------|
| Chain Lengths | 83 |
| Individual Welfare Gains | 86 |
| Welfare Gains along Average Chains | 92 |
| Sensitivity Analysis | 94 |
| Expanding on Impact Analysis | 95 |
| Conclusions | 101 |
| Notes | 102 |
| 6 Extensions | 105 |
| Boom and Bust | 105 |
| Goods and Services | 112 |
| Internal and External Hiring | 115 |
| Conclusions | 117 |
| Notes | 119 |
| 7 Job Chains—Implications for State and Local Economic Development Policy | 121 |
| Economic Development Policy Themes | 122 |
| Trickle Down—Does It Really Work? | 127 |
| Thinking "Chain-Wise"—Why It Helps | 128 |
| Notes | 130 |
| Appendix A: Unemployment and Underemployment | 131 |
| Appendix B: Formal Treatment of Trickle Down | 141 |
| Appendix C: Data | 147 |
| References | 157 |
| The Authors | 167 |
| Index | 169 |
| About the Institute | 179 |