

The Rise of the Value-Added Tax

KATHRYN JAMES

Monash University, Faculty of Law

lgj| Cambridge
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Contents

<i>List of figures</i>	<i>page</i> xii
<i>List of tables</i>	xiii
<i>Preface</i>	xv
<i>List of commonly used abbreviations and key terms</i>	xvii
1 The rise of the value-added tax	1
1 What lies behind the remarkable rise of the VAT?	5
2 Overview of the book	8
2.1 Part I – The rise of the value-added tax – Exploring the gap between expectation and deliver)'	8
2.2 Part II – Explaining the rise of the VAT	9
2.3 Part III – Case studies on the real-world challenges of VAT reform	12
PART I THE RISE OF THE VALUE-ADDED TAX – EXPLORING THE GAP BETWEEN EXPECTATION AND DELIVERY	
2 An introduction to the good VAT	17
1 Defining the good VAT	17
2 Measuring the merits of the good VAT	20
2.1 Consumption is the preferred tax base	21
2.2 The good VAT measured against public finance criteria	25
3 Prescribing the good VAT – A comparison with other VAT alternatives	35
4 Norm 1 – A broad consumption base at a single rate with minimal exclusions	41
4.1 Extend the good VAT through all stages of the production and distribution chain	45

4.2	Maintain a broad VAT base with minimal exclusions	46
4.3	Levy the VAT at a single rate	68
5	Norm 2 – Calculation of VAT liability using the invoice-credit mechanism	70
5.1	Operation of the invoice-credit mechanism	70
5.2	The advantages of the invoice-credit method over other methods	72
6	Norm 3 – Levying VAT on a destination basis	77
7	Conclusion	80
3	An introduction to the many real VATs in existence	81
1	Defining real VATs	81
2	Measuring the merits of real VATs	83
2.1	Preference for consumption	84
2.2	Revenue generation	86
2.3	Neutrality	89
2.4	Efficiency	90
2.5	Growth	92
2.6	Simplicity	94
2.7	Equity	94
3	Assessing real VATs against the three design norms of the good VAT	97
4	Norm 1 – A broad consumption base at a single rate with minimal exclusions	98
4.1	Most real VATs do not reach a broad consumption base	99
4.2	Most real VATs have multiple exclusions to their base	105
4.3	Many real VATs are levied at multiple rates	116
4.4	The impact of departures from norm 1 on the incidence of real VATs	118
5	Norm 2 – Calculation of VAT liability using the invoice-credit mechanism	119
5.1	Denials and delays in the payment of refunds	120
5.2	VAT Fraud and Avoidance	124
5.3	Administrative and compliance costs	131
6	Norm 3 – Levying real VATs on a destination basis	136
7	Conclusion	143
 PART II EXPLAINING THE RISE OF THE VAT		
4	The conventional approach to explaining the rise of the VAT	147
1	Celebration over explanation – Explaining the VAT's rise by reference to its merits	148
2	The strong articulation – Merits as the reason for the VAT's rise	152
2.1	Deficiencies in the strong articulation of the merits explanation	155

3	The weak articulations – Merits as underpinning evolutionary or fashionable growth and yardstick competition	159
3.1	Deficiencies in the account of evolutionary or fashionable growth and yardstick competition	161
4	The weak articulations – Merits as the basis for the promotion of VAT by transnational actors	161
4.1	Intergovernmental organisations	162
4.2	A limited account of direct influence	165
4.3	Failing to account for indirect influence	169
5	Actors frequently overlooked by the conventional approach	171
5.1	Advisers and consultants	171
5.2	Business organisations	173
5.3	Aid and development agencies	175
6	The neglect of domestic context	176
7	Conclusions on the conventional approach to explaining the rise of the VAT	182
5	Toward an alternative approach to explaining the rise of the VAT	185
1) The application of public policy analysis to taxation	185
2	Public choice	188
2.1	Choice under constraints	191
2.2	A focus on how the choices under constraints of political actors might impact the good VAT	193
2.3	The challenge of public choice to the conventional approach	200
2.4	Limitations of public choice	203
3	Historical institutionalism	204
3.1	The important legacy of history	206
3.2	Institutions and the dynamics of agency, ideas, power and change	217
3.3	Further comparisons with public choice	222
3.4	Fiscal sociology	224
4	A new approach to explaining the rise of the VAT	226
4.1	Selecting the case studies of reform	233
	PART III CASE STUDIES ON THE REAL-WORLD CHALLENGES OF VAT REFORM	
6	Australia	241
1	We of the 'never ever' – The history of the introduction of a goods and services tax in Australia	242
1.1	The 1970s and the Asprey Committee	242
1.2	The 1980s Draft White Paper and National Taxation Summit	243

1.3 Fightback! and the 1993 federal election	245
1.4 'A new tax system'	247
2 Pathways to reform	249
2.1 Path-dependent framing of the merits of the GST	249
2.2 Drafting the GST	253
2.3 Constitutional constraints and the exclusion of food	254
2.4 Legislation by regulation	258
2.5 Lobbying and the divergent fates of the 'unholy alliance'	259
2.6 Administering the GST	267
3 Assessing the Australian GST against the three design norms for a good VAT	271
3.1 Norm 2 – Calculation of VAT liability using the invoice-credit mechanism	272
3.2 Norm 3 – Levying VAT on a destination basis	282
4 Norm 1 – A broad consumption base at a single rate with minimal exclusions	284
4.1 Unintended consequences of a single rate	284
4.2 Failure to reach a broad consumption base	293
4.3 Legislating for a consumption base	296
5 Conclusion	336
 7 The United States	 338
1 A history of the VAT reform debate in the United States	339
1.1 Early paths	340
1.2 1960s and 1970s – Task force, blueprints and syndromes	343
1.3 The 1980s – Reform and Reaganomics	355
1.4 Post-TRA86 – The euphoria is short lived; crisis ensues	363
1.5 The current state of play – Post-2005 reform trends	372
2 Future pathways to reform	375
2.1 Structural features of US tax policy-making	377
2.2 Interest groups, business and lobbyists	385
2.3 The VAT as one of many competing proposals and the path-dependent framing of merits	387
2.4 Disputes about the merits of the VAT and the path-dependent assessment of merits	390
3 How a potential US VAT might measure up against the three design norms for the good VAT	395
3.1 Key sources of departures from a broad consumption base norm	396
3.2 Exploring the likely treatment of financial supplies	398
4 Conclusion	404

8	Conclusions on the rise of the value-added tax	407
1	Part I – The rise of the value-added tax – The gap between expectation and delivery	407
2	Part II – Explaining the rise of the value-added tax	408
3	Part III – Case studies on the real-world challenges of VAT reform	410
4	Clearing the path to reveal real trends	415
	<i>Bibliography</i>	421
	<i>Index</i>	469