

# HARD CHOICES

Decision making under unresolved conflict

ISAAC LEVI

*Columbia University*



*The right of the  
University of Cambridge  
to print and sell  
oil mQu'er of b'syoks  
was granted by  
Henry VIII in 1534.  
The University has printed  
and published continuously  
since 1584.*

**CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS**

*Cambridge*

*London New York New Roche lie*

*Melbourne Sydney*

# Contents

<i>Preface</i>	<i>xi</i>
1 MORAL STRUGGLE	<i>i</i>
1.1 Two kinds of struggle	<i>i</i>
1.2 Withholding judgement	5
1.3 For the best, all things considered	73
1.4 The plan of this book	77
2 DILEMMAS	20
2.1 Conflict and deontic logic	20
2.2 Guilt	24
2.3 Choosing without resolving conflict	28
2.4 Unresolved conflict generalized	35
3 VALUES IN SCIENTIFIC INQUIRY	36
3.1 Cognitive values	36
3.2 Cognitive and practical values	42
3.3 Pluralism and conflict	46
4 CHOICE AND FOREKNOWLEDGE	47
4.1 Ability and possibility	47
4.2 Choice	53
4.3 Foreknowledge and freedom	58
4.4 The argument thus far	6y
5 VALUE STRUCTURES	69
5.1 Value commitments, value structures and ways of evaluation	69
5.2 Ways of evaluation	77
5.3 The mixture property	74
5.4 Potential resolutions	<i>JJ</i>
5.5 Cardinal and ordinal conflict	79
5.6 V-admissibility	80
5.7 Lexicographically ordered value structures	80

6	VALUES REVEALED BY CHOICES	83
6.1	Choice and preference	83
6.2	Value preference	84
6.3	Robust preference	85
6.4	Optimality	86
6.5	Categorical preference	97
6.6	Revealing preference	95
6.7	Normality	97
6.8	Revealed preference according to V-admissibility	99
6.9	Lexicographical V-admissibility	104
6.10	Conclusion	706
7	UNCERTAINTY AS A SOURCE OF CONFLICT	108
7.1	Uncertainty	108
7.2	Extended value structures	709
7.3	Lexicography	770
7.4	Expected value	777
7.5	Credal indeterminacy	774
7.6	Upper and lower betting quotients	722
7.7	Ellsberg's problem	128
7.8	The Allais problem	140
7.9	Consistency of choice	745
7.10	Conclusion	148
8	CONFLICT AND SOCIAL AGENCY	749
8.1	What is an agent?	749
8.2	Benevolence and conflict	154
9	DISTRIBUTING BENEFITS	<i>i</i> <sub>58</sub>
9.1	Benevolence for each and benevolence for all	158
9.2	Benefit comparison structures	164
9.3	The average benefit principle	770
9.4	Benefit level dictatorship	773
9.5	Admissibility	774
9.6	Fair distribution	777
10	UTILITARIANISM AND CONFLICT	185
10.1	The sources of conflict	185
10.2	Concern and conflict	185
10.3	Average versus total utility	186

10.4	Classical utilitarianism	790
10.5	Preference utilitarianism	792
10.6	Conclusion	795
11	SOCIAL CHOICE THEORY	207
11.1	Social benefit functional	207
11.2	Lexicography	204
	Independence	206
11.4	Paretian conditions	208
11	Invariance	270
11.6	Anonymity	277
11.7	Benevolence for all	272
11.8	Potential resolutions	273
11.9	Utilitarian aggregation	273
11.10	Leximinb-admissibility and ableximin- admissibility	214
11.11	Arrow's impossibility	276
12	CONFLICT AND INQUIRY	279
	Notes	223
	Bibliography	243
	Name index	247
	Subject index	249