

# Pension Reform and Economic Theory

A Non-Orthodox Analysis

---

**Sergio Cesaratto**

*Professor of Economics, Department of Political Economy,  
University of Siena, Italy*

**Edward Elgar**

Cheltenham, UK • Northampton, MA, USA

# Contents

---

<i>List of Tables</i>	viii
<i>List of Figures</i>	x
<i>List of Abbreviations</i>	xi
<i>Acknowledgements</i>	xii
Introduction	1
1. Alternative Views of <i>PAYG</i> as a Social Institution	16
1.1 Introduction	16
1.2 Origin of Retirement as a Social Institution	18
1.3 Private and Social Insurances	25
1.4 The Insurance Fiction in Practice: The Political Legitimacy of <i>PAYG</i>	27
1.5 The Insurance Fiction in Theory: Samuelson's Model	31
1.6 The Samuelson–Lerner Controversy	36
1.7 The Post-Samuelson–Lerner Debate	38
1.8 Moral Social Habits and Social Transfers	42
1.9 Final Remarks	43
2. Re-engineering <i>PAYG</i> : The Controversy over the Notional Defined Contribution Reforms	52
2.1 Introduction	52
2.2 Archetypal Accounting Structures of <i>PAYG</i>	54
2.3 Notional Defined Contribution Reforms	60
2.4 Criticism of the <i>NDC</i> scheme	74
2.5 The Italian <i>NDC</i> Reform	80
2.6 Final Remarks	84
3. The Conventional Interpretation of a Fully-Funded Scheme and Capital Theory	90
3.1 Introduction	90
3.2 Description of a Fully-Fledged <i>FF</i> Scheme	93
3.3 <i>FF</i> Schemes and Capital Theory	95
3.4 The Rates of Return of <i>FF</i> and <i>PAYG</i> Schemes	99
3.5 Equivalent Schemes Vis-à-Vis a Demographic Shock	101

3.6	Alternative Pension Schemes and Savings in an Imperfect Design Context	117
3.7	Final Remarks	123
	Appendix 3.1: Simple Formal Exposition and Simulations of the Demographic Shocks in a Neoclassical <i>FF</i> Scheme	131
	Appendix 3.2: Economies Indifferent between <i>PAYG</i> and <i>FF</i> Schemes	139
4.	The Transition from <i>PAYG</i> to <i>FF</i> Schemes	142
4.1	Introduction	142
4.2	The Transition to Capitalization and the Savings Rate	145
4.3	Two Kinds of Transition Plans	149
4.4	Alleged Advantages of Disguised <i>PAYG</i>	154
4.5	Divergent Interpretations of the Chilean Reform	161
4.6	Modigliani's and Feldstein's Transition Plans	163
4.7	Pension Funds and the Savings Paradox	165
4.8	Final Remarks	169
	Appendix 4.1: A World Bank Example of a False Transition to an <i>FF</i> System	175
	Appendix 4.2: On Feldstein's Transition Plans	178
5.	The Controversy over the Social Security Surplus	185
5.1	Introduction	185
5.2	The Social Security Surplus in National Accounts	185
5.3	Interpretations of the Social Security Trust Fund	186
5.4	An Appraisal of the Controversy	188
5.5	Final Remarks	192
	Appendix 5.1: Severance Pay and the Creation of an <i>FF</i> Scheme in Italy	196
6.	The Classical-Keynesian Macroeconomics of Pension Reform in Closed and Open Economies	198
6.1	Introduction	198
6.2	The Theory of Effective Demand in the Short and in the Long Period	200
6.3	Pension Transfers and Demand-Led Growth	202
6.4	The Impact of the Demographic Shocks in the Light of the Theory of Effective Demand	204
6.5	A 'Classical' Proposal of an <i>FF</i> Reform	207
6.6	A World of Investment Opportunities: 'Emerging Markets' and Endogenous Growth	212
6.7	A Keynesian View of International Capital Flows	218
6.8	Final Remarks	220

7. Classical and Neoclassical Perspectives on the Welfare State and Pensions	227
7.1 Introduction	227
7.2 The Classical Theory of Distribution	229
7.3 Lineages of a Classical Approach to the Welfare State	231
7.4 Public and Private Provision of Social Wage Goods	235
7.5 The Classical View of the Incidence of Payroll Taxation	238
7.6 The Net Distributive Role of the State	239
7.7 Classical and Neoclassical Approaches	239
7.8 Dissatisfaction with Welfare Economics	241
7.9 Classical and Neoclassical Views of Pensions	242
7.10 The Classical Approach and the Political and Moral Economy Views of Pensions	245
7.11 Final Remarks	246
8. The Viability of an Ageing Society: A Classical Exploration	252
8.1 Introduction	252
8.2 Stylized Demographic Trends	255
8.3 Ageing and the Labour Market	268
8.4 Ageing and the Cost of <i>PAYG</i>	282
8.5 Final Remarks	293
Appendix 8.1: Keynes on Population Decline	301
9. Summary of the Main Arguments	303
9.1 Introduction	303
9.2 Alternative Views of <i>PAYG</i>	304
9.3 'Actuarial Anaesthesia'? The <i>NDC</i> Reforms	308
9.4 Fully-Funded Reforms	312
9.5 The Economic Impact of Ageing on the Labour Market and on the Sustainability of <i>PAYG</i>	318
9.6 The Interpretation and the Future of <i>PAYG</i> in the Classical-Keynesian View	325
<i>References</i>	333
<i>Index</i>	350