

Marie Kuntz

# Conceptualising Transnational Corporate Groups for International Criminal Law



**Nomos**

# Table of Contents

|  |    |
|--|----|
| Preface                                      | 5  |
| Table of Contents                            | 7  |
| List of Abbreviations                        | 13 |
| Introduction                                 | 15 |
| A. Research Question and State of Research   | 19 |
| 1. Status Quo in International Criminal Law  | 21 |
| 2. Discussion on Corporations                | 25 |
| a. Origins: The Rome Conference              | 25 |
| b. Focus on National Criminal Law Theory     | 29 |
| c. No Definition of the Object of Regulation | 32 |
| 3. Regulation Gap in National Law            | 34 |
| 4. General Premises for Definition           | 36 |
| a. Independence from National Law            | 37 |
| b. Principle of Complementarity              | 37 |
| c. Criminal Law Premises                     | 41 |
| d. Summary                                   | 41 |
| B. Structure                                 | 42 |
| 1. Links to Existing Legal Concepts          | 42 |
| a. International Law                         | 42 |
| b. EU Competition Law                        | 44 |
| c. UK Law                                    | 45 |
| d. US Alien Tort Statute                     | 46 |
| e. Comprehensive Analysis of Criteria        | 47 |
| 2. Economic Analysis                         | 47 |
| 3. Case Study                                | 48 |
| C. Possible Use of the Concept               | 48 |

|   |     |
|---|-----|
| Chapter I: Transnational Corporate Groups in International Law                | 51  |
| A. Transnational Corporate Groups as Subjects of International Law            | 52  |
| 1. Arguments Concerning a <i>de lege lata</i> International Legal Personality | 53  |
| 2. No Definition of the Object of Regulation                                  | 59  |
| B. Transnational Corporate Groups in International Treaty Law                 | 62  |
| 1. Human Rights Treaties  | 64  |
| 2. International Labour Law   | 67  |
| 3. International Environmental Law  | 68  |
| 4. Summary  | 71  |
| C. Transnational Corporate Groups in International Investment Law             | 72  |
| 1. Investments of Transnational Corporate Groups                              | 73  |
| 2. Determining the Investor's Nationality                                     | 75  |
| a. Bilateral Investment Treaties  | 75  |
| b. Diplomatic Protection  | 77  |
| 3. Article 25 (2) b ICSID Convention  | 79  |
| a. Consent to Apply Article 25 (2) b ICSID Convention                         | 80  |
| b. General Criteria for Control   | 81  |
| c. Pyramidal Transnational Corporate Groups                                   | 82  |
| d. Limits to Corporate Group Structure Arguments                              | 86  |
| 4. Special Requirements in Bilateral Investment Treaties                      | 88  |
| 5. Abuse in International Investment Law                                      | 90  |
| 6. Summary  | 92  |
| D. Transnational Corporate Groups in Soft Law                                 | 93  |
| 1. UN Norms and the Special Representative                                    | 95  |
| 2. OECD Guidelines  | 104 |
| 3. ILO Tripartite Declaration   | 108 |
| 4. Summary  | 109 |
| E. Summary  | 110 |
| Chapter II: Transnational Corporate Groups in EU Competition Law              | 111 |
| A. Corporate Groups as one Undertaking  | 113 |
| B. Control as a Decisive Criterion  | 115 |
| 1. Control via Shareholdings  | 117 |
| a. Presumption for Wholly Owned Subsidiaries                                  | 117 |
| b. Other Shareholdings  | 122 |
| 2. Indicia for Decisive Influence   | 123 |
| a. Involvement in Day-to-Day Business   | 124 |

|   |         |
|---|---------|
| b. Strategic Control  | 124     |
| c. Integrated Business  | 127     |
| d. Personnel Links  | 129     |
| e. Unified Appearance   | 131     |
| f. Reporting Obligations  | 132     |
| 3. Rebuttal   | 133     |
| a. General Criteria   | 136     |
| b. Successful Rebuttals   | 138     |
| 4. Summary  | 141     |
| C. Consequences   | 142     |
| 1. A Corporate Group as a Perpetrator                                 | 143     |
| 2. Jurisdiction   | 148     |
| 3. Succession   | 149     |
| 4. Fines  | 152     |
| 5. Procedure  | 156     |
| D. Summary  | 160     |
| <br>Chapter III: UK Law as a Counterapproach to<br>EU Competition Law | <br>163 |
| A. Attribution of Acts and Knowledge to Corporations                  | 164     |
| B. The Rule: Separate Legal Personalities                             | 167     |
| 1. The Salomon Principle  | 167     |
| 2. Transfer to Corporate Groups                                       | 168     |
| C. The Exceptions   | 171     |
| 1. Single Entity  | 173     |
| 2. Piercing the Corporate Veil  | 178     |
| 3. Agency within Corporate Groups                                     | 184     |
| 4. Beneficial Ownership   | 187     |
| 5. Direct Duty of Parent  | 190     |
| 6. Interpretation of Contracts and Statutes                           | 193     |
| D. Summary  | 197     |
| <br>Chapter IV: US Approaches to Transnational Corporate Groups       | <br>203 |
| A. Alien Torts Statute: Transnational Corporate Group Litigation      | 204     |
| 1. Subject Matter   | 206     |
| 2. Corporations as Potential Perpetrators                             | 210     |
| a. Private Actors   | 210     |
| b. Corporations   | 212     |
| 3. Corporate Groups as Potential Perpetrators                         | 216     |

## Table of Contents

|  |   |     |
|--|---|-----|
| a.   | General Standards                                   | 217 |
| b.   | Agency  | 222 |
| i.   | General Agency Test                                 | 222 |
| ii.  | Parental Control                                    | 223 |
| c.   | Alter Ego   | 226 |
| d.   | Enterprise Theory                                   | 229 |
| 4.   | Transnational Reach of Corporate Groups             | 232 |
| a.   | Territorial Jurisdiction                            | 232 |
| i.   | Presumption Against Extraterritoriality             | 233 |
| ii.  | Rebuttal  | 235 |
| b.   | Forum Non Conveniens                                | 239 |
| 5.   | Summary   | 242 |
| B.   | The Notion of Undertaking in US Antitrust Law       | 243 |
| 1.   | Group Privilege                                     | 244 |
| 2.   | Extension of <i>Copperweld</i> Jurisprudence        | 246 |
| 3.   | No Single Economic Entity Doctrine                  | 248 |
| Chapter V: Comprehensive Analysis of Criteria                                |   | 253 |
| Chapter VI: Transnational Corporate Groups in Economic and Management Theory |   | 259 |
| A.   | Methodology and Terminology                         | 259 |
| B.   | Control as a Decisive Criterion                     | 261 |
| 1.   | Transaction Cost Economics                          | 262 |
| 2.   | Other Theories                                      | 267 |
| 3.   | Summary   | 270 |
| C.   | Criteria of Control                                 | 271 |
| 1.   | Control via Shareholdings                           | 271 |
| 2.   | Organisational Structure                            | 274 |
| a.   | Decentralisation                                    | 275 |
| b.   | Relationships within Transnational Corporate Groups | 279 |
| 3.   | Integrated Business                                 | 282 |
| a.   | Vertical Integration                                | 283 |
| b.   | Horizontal Integration                              | 287 |
| 4.   | Personnel Links                                     | 290 |
| 5.   | Unified Appearance                                  | 293 |
| 6.   | Reporting Obligations                               | 295 |
| 7.   | Summary and Limitations                             | 298 |
| D.   | Corporate Groups and Limited Liability              | 301 |
| 1.   | Limited Liability: A Short Introduction             | 301 |

|  |         |
|--|---------|
| 2. Corporate Groups                                      | 304     |
| a. Fostering Innovation                                  | 305     |
| b. Specific Risks  | 306     |
| 3. Summary   | 309     |
| E. Summary   | 310     |
| <br>Chapter VII: Concept in Practice: A Brief Case Study | <br>313 |
| A. Material Allegations                                  | 313     |
| B. Corporate Group Structure                             | 314     |
| C. Application of Set of Criteria                        | 316     |
| 1. Power to Control                                      | 316     |
| 2. Exercise of Parental Control                          | 316     |
| a. Involvement in Day-to-Day Management                  | 316     |
| b. Strategic Control                                     | 317     |
| c. Integrated Business                                   | 320     |
| d. Personnel Links                                       | 322     |
| e. Unified Appearance                                    | 324     |
| f. Reporting Obligations                                 | 324     |
| 3. Result  | 325     |
| <br>Summary  | <br>327 |
| <br>Outlook: Consequences for International Criminal Law | <br>337 |
| <br>Table of Cases                                       | <br>343 |
| <br>Bibliography   | <br>385 |