Ana M. Lopez Rodriguez

Lex Mercatona and Harmonization of Contract Law in the EU

DJ0F Publishing
2003
# Table of contents

PREFACE ............................................................................................................. i  
TABLE OF CONTENTS ......................................................................................... n  
LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS ................................................................................... XII

Chapter 1 .............................................................................................................. 1  
INTRODUCTION, ................................................................................................... 1  
1.1 The de-nationalization of contract law ..................................................... 1  
1.2 Problem description ................................................................................... 3  
1.2.1 Lex mercatoria ...................................................................................... 3  
1.2.2 Contract law harmonization in the EU .................................................. 5  
1.2.3 Thesis..................................................................................................... 7  
1.3 Delimitation of the research ...................................................................... 7  
1.3.1 Substantive scope .................................................................................. 9  
1.3.1.1 Notion of cross-border agreement ................................................... 9  
1.3.1.2 Notion of commercial agreement ................................................... 10  
1.3.2 Terminology remarks ........................................................................... 10  
1.3.2.1 Concepts similar or alternative to lex mercatoria ......................... 10  
1.3.2.2 European contract law ..................................................................... 11  
1.4 Method ....................................................................................................... 11  
1.4.1 Relevant legal sources in cross-border commercial contracting ........... 11  
1.4.2 The use of comparative law .................................................................. 14  
1.4.3 The method of Law and Economics ..................................................... 14  
1.5 Aims of the research .................................................................................. 15  
1.6 Plan ............................................................................................................. 16

PART II
INTERNATIONAL SELF-REGULATION AND LEX MERCATORIA
............................................................................................................................ 17

Chapter 2 .............................................................................................................. 19
THE LAW APPLICABLE TO CROSS-BORDER AGREEMENTS ................................... 19  
2.1 The applicable law .................................................................................... 19  
2.2 Party autonomy in international contracts ................................................. 20
Table of contents

2.2.1 Advantages of party autonomy ............................................. 22
2.2.2 Conflictual and material autonomy (kollisionsrechtliche and materiellrechtliche Verweisung) ............................................. 23

2.3 Applicable law in the absence of choice .................................. 24
  2.3.1 Flexible rules ............................................................. 25
  2.3.2 The American approaches ............................................ 28
    2.3.2.1 The governmental interest analysis ............................... 29
    2.3.2.2 Leflar's better rule of law ....................................... 30

2.4 Why the conflictual method is not the most adequate for cross-border contract adjudication ............................................. 31
  2.4.1 Classical mechanisms of the conflictual method ................. 31
  2.4.2 The supremacy of national law ...................................... 32
    2.4.2.1 Geographical localization ......................................... 32
    2.4.2.2 The application of foreign law ................................... 34
      i) Application of foreign law by national courts .................... 35
    2.4.2.3 The contents of national law .................................... 39

2.5 Conclusions ................................................................. 41

Chapter 3 .................................................................................. 42

THE SELF-REGULATION OF INTERNATIONAL TRADE .................. 42
  3.1 Harmonization of commercial law in the context of intergovernmental cooperation ............................................. 42
    3.1.1 Unification and harmonization of law ............................. 43
    3.1.2 Legal instruments ...................................................... 43
      3.1.2.1 International conventions ....................................... 44
        i) Advantages .......................................................... 44
        ii) Disadvantages .................................................... 45
      3.1.2.2 Model laws ...................................................... 47
        i) Advantages .......................................................... 48
        ii) Disadvantages .................................................... 49
    3.1.3 Conclusions ............................................................. 49

3.2 International self-regulation ................................................. 49
  3.2.1 Definition, types and instruments of self-regulation .......... 50
  3.2.2 Self-regulation as a spontaneous process ......................... 51
    3.2.2.1 Trade usages and custom ....................................... 51
      i) Binding force of trade usages in domestic law .................. 53
      ii) Binding force of trade usages in uniform commercial law .... 54
      iii) Binding force of trade usages in international commercial arbitration ............................................. 55
  3.2.3 Self-regulation as a deliberate enterprise ......................... 56
    3.2.3.1 Standard contracts .............................................. 56
Binding force of standard contracts..........................59
3.2.3.2 Legal guides.............................................61
3.2.3.3 Self-regulatory contracts................................62
   i) Self-regulatory contracts before national courts.........63
   ii) Self-regulatory contracts in international commercial
   arbitration.....................................................64
   iii) Practical significance of self-regulatory contracts......64
3.2.3.4 Rules of trade organizations..........................65
3.2.3.5 Combined techniques. Standard clauses and choice of law
...............................................................66
3.2.3.6 Procedural techniques................................67
   i) Extrajudicial dispute settlement............................67
   ii) International commercial arbitration.....................67
3.2.4 Self-regulation as a mixed process. International commercial
arbitration..........................................................68
   3.2.4.1 Delocalized arbitration................................69
   3.2.4.2 Creation of rules in international commercial arbitration
   i) Procedural rules..............................................72
   ii) Private international law techniques......................75
   iii) Creation of substantive rules on international contract law..79
3.2.4.3 Legal value of arbitral precedents......................81
3.2.4.4 The contribution of arbitral practice to international self-
regulation..........................................................83
3.3 Conclusions.....................................................84

Chapter 4............................................................85
LEX MERCATORIA.....................................................85
4.1 Historical background..........................................86
   4.1.1 The medieval lex mercatoria............................86
   4.1.2 The new lex mercatoria................................88
   4.1.3 The "old" and the "new" lex mercatoria compared........89
4.2 Concept and sources of lex mercatoria.....................90
   4.2.1 The concept of lex mercatoria..........................90
       4.2.1.1 Concepts of lex mercatoria based on its relation with
               national law...........................................91
       4.2.1.2 Concepts of lex mercatoria based on its substantive quality
               .......................................................92
   4.2.2 Concepts similar or alternative to lex mercatoria......94
       i) Autonomous law of international trade..................95
       ii) Anational law............................................95
       iii) Commercial law of nations................................95
       iv) International trade usages. International customary law....96
       v) General principles of law................................96

iv
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>vi) Contrat sans loi</td>
<td>9 7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>vii) Sachnormen im Kollisionsrecht</td>
<td>9 7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>viii) Amiable composition</td>
<td>97</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ix) Transnational law</td>
<td>9 8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>x) Lex mercatoria stricto sensu</td>
<td>99</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2.3 Sources of lex mercatoria</td>
<td>1 00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.3 The theory of lex mercatoria</td>
<td>1 01</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.3.1 The legal quality of lex mercatoria</td>
<td>1 02</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.3.2 Lex mercatoria as a legal system</td>
<td>1 04</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>i) Completeness</td>
<td>1 05</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ii) Structured character</td>
<td>1 06</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>iii) Predictability</td>
<td>107</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>iv) Evolving character</td>
<td>1 08</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.3.3 Lex mercatoria as a substantive method of adjudication</td>
<td>1 09</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.4 Application of lex mercatoria in international arbitration and by national courts</td>
<td>III</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.4.1 Lex mercatoria in international commercial arbitration</td>
<td>1 12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.4.1.1 Lex mercatoria as applicable law</td>
<td>1 12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>i) Choice of lex mercatoria by the parties</td>
<td>1 12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ii) Application of lex mercatoria in the absence of choice</td>
<td>1 16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.4.1.2 Application of lex mercatoria on other grounds</td>
<td>1 21</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>i) Substantive transnational rules relating to the existence and the validity of the arbitration agreement</td>
<td>1 21</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ii) Transnational private international law rules</td>
<td>1 22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>iii) Substantive transnational rules relating to the merits of the dispute</td>
<td>1 23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>iv) Transnational public policy</td>
<td>1 26</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>v) Application of lex mercatoria in arbitration ex aequo et bono</td>
<td>128</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.4.2 Lex mercatoria and national courts</td>
<td>1 29</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.4.2.1 The application of lex mercatoria by national courts</td>
<td>1 29</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.4.2.2 Recognition and enforcement of awards based on lex mercatoria</td>
<td>1 35</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.5 Conclusions</td>
<td>1 43</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Chapter 5 | 145 |

THE NEW PARADIGM OF INTERNATIONAL CONTRACT LAW. THE UNIDROIT PRINCIPLES OF INTERNATIONAL COMMERCIAL CONTRACTS AND THE PRINCIPLES OF EUROPEAN CONTRACT LAW | 145 |

5.7 The Unidroit Principles of International Commercial Contracts | 1 47 |

5.1.1 Scope of application | 1 49 |

5.1.2 Structure and content | 1 50 |

5.1.2.1 Structure | 150 |
5.1.2.2 Contents of the UP
i) Freedom of contract
ii) Openness to usages
iii) Favor contractus
iv) Good faith and fair dealing
v) Policing against unfairness

5.1.2.3 Interpretation and supplementation of the Principles

5.1.3 The role of the UP in practice
i) A model for national and international legislators
ii) A means of interpreting and supplementing existing international instruments
iii) UP as means of interpreting and supplementing domestic law
iv) The UP as a guide for drafting and negotiating international commercial contracts

5.1.4 The UP as the law governing the contract
i) Choice of the UP by the parties
ii) "Indirect" application of the UP
i) The UP applied as lex mercatoria, general principles of law or the like
ii) Application of the UP in the absence of choice
iii) The UP as a substitute for the applicable law

5.2 The Principles of European Contract Law
i) Scope of application
ii) Structure and contents. Differences with the UP
i) General provisions
ii) Formation
iii) Authority of agents
iv) Validity
v) Contract interpretation
vi) Contents and effects. Performance
vii) Non-performance and remedies in general
viii) Particular remedies for non-performance

5.2.3 The role of the PECL in practice
i) Choice of the PECL by the parties
ii) "Indirect" application of the PECL
i) Application of the PECL as lex mercatoria
ii) Application of the PECL in the absence of choice
## Table of contents

iii) Application of the PECL as substitute for the applicable law .................................................................2 01

5.2.3.3 Other functions of the PECL .................................................................2 02
i) PECL as a guide for drafting contracts .................................................................2 02
ii) Interpretation of national law in conformity with EU legislation ..............................2 02
iii) PECL as applicable to contracts between private parties and public authorities and as a tool for the ECJ .................................................................2 02
iv) PECL as model for the legislator .................................................................2 02

5.3 'Legal quality of the UP and the PECL' .................................................................2 03

5.3.1 The UP and the PECL, new sources of lex mercatoria? .................................................................2 03
5.3.2 The UP and PECL as standard terms .................................................................2 06
5.3.3 Privatized lawmaking .................................................................................................2 09

5.3.3.1 The UP and PECL as international restatements of contract law .................................................................2 10
5.3.3.2 The concept of creeping codification of lex mercatoria .................................................................2 11
5.3.3.3 Transnational Law Databases .................................................................................................2 11

5.4 Conclusions ..................................................................................................................2 12

PART II

HARMONIZATION OF CONTRACT LAW IN THE EU .................................................................2 14

Chapter 6 .................................................................................................................................217

THE LEGAL INTERVENTION OF THE EC ON CONTRACT LAW .................................................................2 17

6.1 Legal intervention of the Community on private law .................................................................................................2 18

6.1.1 Significance of private law for European integration .................................................................................................2 18
6.1.2 Legal basis for EC intervention in the field of private law .................................................................................................2 19

6.2 The impact of EC legislation on the law of contract .................................................................................................2 20

6.2.1 Lack of a uniform system of contract law in EC legislation .................................................................................................2 23
6.2.2 The erosion of domestic contract law .................................................................................................2 25

6.2.2.1 Conceptual divergences .................................................................................................2 25
6.2.2.2 Minimum harmonization .................................................................................................2 27
6.2.2.3 Transposition of concepts .................................................................................................2 28
i) Existing legal concepts affected by EC law .................................................................................................2 29
ii) New concepts ...............................................................................................................................................2 29

6.2.2.4 Interpretation of domestic contract law in conformity with EC law .................................................................2 30
6.2.2.5 Legal constellations and normative conflicts .................................................................................................2 31

6.3 The need for a common framework for EC contract law .................................................................................................2 33

6.3.1 Review and re-formulation of existing EC legislation on contract law .................................................................................................2 34
6.3.2 General principles of European contract law ........................................ 2 35

Chapter 7 ............................................................................................................. 2 37

CONTRACT LAW AND THE INTERNAL MARKET ..................................................... 2 37

7.1 Obstacles to the completion of the Internal market created by disparate mandatory rules .............................................................. 2 38

7.1.1 Consumer contracts .................................................................................. 2 39

7.1.1.1 Different levels of protection ................................................................. 2 39

7.1.1.2 The need for a common framework for consumer contracts .......... 2 41

7.1.2 Business to business transactions ............................................................ 2 44

7.2 Obstacles caused by the existence of different contract laws ................. 2 47

7.2.1 Increased transaction costs ...................................................................... 2 48

7.2.2 The psychological factor ......................................................................... 2 51

7.3 The need for a common law of contract to promote intra-community trade ................................................................. 2 52

Chapter 8 ............................................................................................................. 2 54

A EUROPEAN CONTRACT CODE? ................................................................... 2 54

8.1 Legal basis for the enactment of a Contract Code ..................................... 2 55

8.1.1 Articles 94 and 95 ECT .......................................................................... 2 55

8.1.2 Articles 65 and 67 ECT .......................................................................... 2 57

8.1.3 Article 308 ECT ..................................................................................... 2 58

8.1.4 Art. 293 ECT ......................................................................................... 2 59

8.1.5 The principle of subsidiarity ................................................................... 2 60

8.2 Potential legal instruments for the enactment of a European Contract Code and its scope ................................................................. 2 61

8.2.1 Potential legal instruments ...................................................................... 2 61

8.2.1.1 EC Directive ..................................................................................... 2 61

8.2.1.2 Regulation ........................................................................................ 2 62

8.2.1.3 International Convention ................................................................. 2 62

8.2.1.4 Recommendation ............................................................................ 2 63

8.2.2 Scope ....................................................................................................... 2 64

8.2.2.1 Material scope .................................................................................. 2 64

8.2.2.2 Geographical scope .......................................................................... 2 65

8.3 Feasibility of a common law of contract .................................................... 2 66

8.3.1 Some problematic issues ......................................................................... 2 66

8.3.1.1 Pre-contractual dealings .................................................................. 2 66

i) Culpa in contrahendo ................................................................................ 2 66

ii) Duty of disclosure ....................................................................................... 2 67

8.3.1.2 Binding character of contracts ............................................................ 2 68

8.3.1.3 Contractual effects upon third parties ............................................. 2 69

8.3.1.4 Specific performance ........................................................................ 2 69
### Table of Contents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>8.3.1.5 The principle of good faith</td>
<td>270</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.3.2 Is the unification of contract law feasible?</td>
<td>271</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.4 Contract law and codification</td>
<td>273</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.4.1 Codification and national sovereignty</td>
<td>273</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.4.2 The flaws of codification</td>
<td>275</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.4.2.1 Substantive quality</td>
<td>275</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.4.2.2 Keeping the law up-to-date</td>
<td>276</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.4.2.3 The features of the Code</td>
<td>277</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.5 The sociological and cultural factors</td>
<td>78</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.5.1 Conflict situations across legal cultures</td>
<td>79</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.5.2 The sociological aspects of private law</td>
<td>80</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.5.3 Do culture and sociology really matter?</td>
<td>81</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.6 Conclusions</td>
<td>83</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chapter 9</td>
<td>85</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HARMONIZATION OF EUROPEAN CONTRACT LAW BY NON-LEGISLATIVE MEANS</td>
<td>85</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.1 The costs of legislative harmonization</td>
<td>287</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.1.1 The principle of proportionality</td>
<td>287</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.1.2 Notion of optional harmonization</td>
<td>288</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.2 Harmonization of contract law in the EU by market forces</td>
<td>288</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.2.1 Competition between legal orders</td>
<td>289</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.2.2 Transaction costs and governance structures</td>
<td>293</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.2.3 Conclusions</td>
<td>297</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.3 Legal scholarly and harmonization of contract law in the EU</td>
<td>297</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.3.1 &quot;Privatized&quot; harmonization of contract law</td>
<td>297</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.3.1.1 The Pavia Group on a European Contract Code</td>
<td>298</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.3.1.2 The Trento Common Core Approach to European Private Law</td>
<td>299</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.3.1.3 The Study Group on a European Civil Code</td>
<td>301</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.3.1.4 The Commission on European Contract Law</td>
<td>303</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.3.1.5 Re-birth of a European ius commune</td>
<td>303</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.3.1.6 Assessment: cultivators versus codifiers</td>
<td>305</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.3.2 Development of a common European legal culture</td>
<td>306</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.3.2.1 Relationship between a common legal culture and legal uniformity</td>
<td>306</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.3.2.2 Towards a common European legal culture</td>
<td>307</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>i) Legal research</td>
<td>308</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ii) Legal education</td>
<td>308</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>iii) A common European legal method</td>
<td>309</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.3.2.3 A common legal culture as indispensable foundation for a European contract law</td>
<td>310</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.3.3 A European Restatement of Contract Law</td>
<td>311</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Section</td>
<td>Page</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.1.2 Application of lex mercatoria on other grounds</td>
<td>341</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.1.3 Recognition and enforcement of awards based on lex mercatoria</td>
<td>342</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.1.4 Lex mercatoria as arbitrator-made law</td>
<td>342</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.2 The UP and PECL: new sources of lex mercatoria?</td>
<td>342</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.2.1 The UP and PECL as applicable law</td>
<td>343</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.2.1.1 Mandatory rules</td>
<td>344</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.2.1.2 Gap filling</td>
<td>344</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.2.2 The Principles and the new paradigm of international contract law</td>
<td>345</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.3 Why harmonize contract law in the EU?</td>
<td>345</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.3.1 The improvement of existing EC legislation on contracts</td>
<td>346</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.3.2 Removal of the obstacles hindering the internal market</td>
<td>347</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.3.2.1 Consumer contracts</td>
<td>348</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.3.2.2 Business-to-business transactions</td>
<td>349</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>i) Disparate mandatory rules</td>
<td>349</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ii) The co-existence of different contract laws</td>
<td>350</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.4 To which extent should the Community intervene?</td>
<td>351</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.4.1 Contract law and business expectations</td>
<td>352</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.4.2 The search for less interfering means of promoting intra-community trade</td>
<td>353</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.4.2.1 Towards a revision of the 1980 Rome Convention</td>
<td>354</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.4.2.2 Creation of information channels</td>
<td>355</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.5 Final remarks</td>
<td>356</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

DANSK RESUME: 357
- Lex mercatoria 357
- Harmonisering af aftaleretten i EU 358

BIBLIOGRAPHY 361
TABLE OF ARBITRAL AWARDS 392
TABLE OF COURT DECISIONS 396
GLOSSARY 400