

# GAMES OF STRATEGY

*Avinash Dixit*

*Susan Skeath*

W • W • Norton & Company

New York • London

# Contents

Preface    xix

## PART ONE

### Introduction and General Principles

#### **i**

Basic Ideas and Examples    1

1 WHAT IS A GAME OF STRATEGY?    2

2 SOME EXAMPLES AND STORIES OF STRATEGIC GAMES    4

A. Which Passing Shot? 4

B. The GPA Trap 5

C. "We Can't Take the Exam Because We Had a Flat Tire" 6

D. Why Are Professors So Mean? 8

E. Roommates and Families on the Brink 9

F. The Dating Game 11

3 OUR STRATEGY FOR STUDYING GAMES OF STRATEGY    12

SUMMARY    14

## How to Think About Strategic Games 15

- 1 DECISIONS VERSUS GAMES 16
- 2 CLASSIFYING GAMES 18
  - A. Are the Moves in the Game Sequential or Simultaneous? 18
  - B. Are the Players' Interests in Total Conflict, or Is There Some Commonality? 19
  - C. Is the Game Played Once or Repeatedly, and with the Same or Changing Opponents? 20
  - D. Do the Players Have Full or Equal Information? 21
  - E. Are the Rules of the Game Fixed or Manipulate? 22
  - F. Are Agreements to Cooperate Enforceable? 23
- 3 SOME TERMINOLOGY AND BACKGROUND ASSUMPTIONS 24
  - A. Strategies 25
  - B. Payoffs 26
  - C. Rationality 27
  - D. Common Knowledge of Rules 29
  - E. Equilibrium 30
  - F. Dynamics and Evolutionary Games 32
  - G. Observation and Experiment 33
- 4 THE USES OF GAME THEORY 34
- 5 THE STRUCTURE OF THE CHAPTERS TO FOLLOW 35
- SUMMARY 38
- KEY TERMS 39
- EXERCISES 39

## Concepts and Techniques

### Games with Sequential Moves 43

- 1 A SENATE RACE AS A SEQUENTIAL-MOVE GAME 44
- 2 ILLUSTRATING SEQUENTIAL-MOVE GAMES 46
- 3 DESCRIBING STRATEGIES 47
- 4 ROLLBACK EQUILIBRIUM 49
- 5 A SEQUENTIAL-MOVE GAME WITH ONLY "ONE" PLAYER 53

6 ORDER ADVANTAGES	56
7 ADDING MORE PLAYERS	58
8 ADDING MORE MOVES	63
A. Tic-Tac-Toe	63
B. Chess	65
9 EXPERIMENTS IN STRATEGY	70
SUMMARY	73
KEY TERMS	74
EXERCISES	74

## Games with Simultaneous Moves 79

1 ILLUSTRATING SIMULTANEOUS-MOVE GAMES	80
A. Zero-Sum Versus Non-Zero-Sum Games	80
B. Constructing an Actual Game Table	81
2 NASH EQUILIBRIUM	82
3 DOMINANT STRATEGIES	83
4 WHEN BOTH PLAYERS HAVE DOMINANT STRATEGIES	85
5 WHEN ONLY ONE PLAYER HAS A DOMINANT STRATEGY	87
6 SUCCESSIVE ELIMINATION OF DOMINATED STRATEGIES	89
A. Symmetric Games	92
B. Weak Versus Strict Dominance	93
7 MINIMAX STRATEGIES IN ZERO-SUM GAMES	93
8 CELL-BY-CELL INSPECTION	97
9 PURE STRATEGIES THAT ARE CONTINUOUS VARIABLES	99
<b>10 THREE PLAYERS</b>	<b>104</b>
<b>11 MULTIPLE EQUILIBRIA IN PURE STRATEGIES</b>	<b>107</b>
A. Assurance	107
B. Chicken	110
C. The Battle of the Two Cultures	112
D. Weak Dominance	114
12 NO EQUILIBRIUM IN PURE STRATEGIES	116
SUMMARY	118
KEY TERMS	118
EXERCISES	119

Simultaneous-Move Games with Mixed Strategies	124
1 WHAT IS A MIXED STRATEGY?	125
2 WHAT DOES A MIXED STRATEGY ACCOMPLISH?	125
A. The Row Player's Perspective	127
B. The Column Player's Perspective	131
3 EQUILIBRIUM IN MIXED STRATEGIES	132
4 MIXING IN NON-ZERO-SUM GAMES	136
A. Chicken	136
B. The Battle of the Two Cultures	140
5 FURTHER DISCUSSION OF MIXED STRATEGIES	143
A. The Odds Method	143
B. Counterintuitive Outcomes with Mixed Strategies	147
C. Using Mixed Strategies in Practice	149
6 MIXING WHEN ONE PLAYER HAS THREE OR MORE PURE STRATEGIES	151
A. A General Case	152
B. A Coincidental Case	156
SUMMARY	159
KEY TERMS	160
EXERCISES	160
 Appendix: Probability and Expected Utility	 163
1 THE BASIC ALGEBRA OF PROBABILITIES	163
A. The Addition Rule	165
B. The Modified Addition Rule	166
C. The Multiplication Rule	166
D. The Modified Multiplication Rule	167
E. The Combination Rule	168
F. Expected Values	169
2 INFERRING EVENT PROBABILITIES FROM OBSERVING CONSEQUENCES	170
3 ATTITUDES TOWARD RISK AND EXPECTED UTILITY	173
SUMMARY	176
KEY TERMS	177

## 6 Combining Simultaneous and Sequential Moves 178

- 1 ILLUSTRATING GAMES IN BOTH EXTENSIVE AND STRATEGIC FORM 179
- 2 GAMES WITH BOTH SIMULTANEOUS AND SEQUENTIAL MOVES 182
- 3 COMBINED SEQUENTIAL-PLAY AND MIXED-STRATEGY EQUILIBRIA 185
- 4 RULES CHANGE K CONVERTING FROM SEQUENTIAL TO  
SIMULTANEOUS PLAY 189
- 5 SOLVING THE SEQUENTIAL-MOVE GAME FROM ITS STRATEGIC  
FORM 192i
- 6 SUBGAME-PERFECT EQUILIBRIA 195
- 7 RULES CHANGE IK CONVERTING FROM SIMULTANEOUS TO  
SEQUENTIAL PLAY 199
- SUMMARY 205
- KEY TERMS 206
- EXERCISES 206

## 7 Consolidation, Extension, and Discussion 209

- 1 VALIDITY OF THE NASH EQUILIBRIUM CONCEPT 210
  - A. Is the Nash Equilibrium Concept Too Imprecise? 211
  - B. Do Players in Actual Games Play Nash Equilibrium Strategies? 213
  - C. Does Rationality by Itself Imply Nash Equilibrium? 216
  - D. Does the Nash Equilibrium Account for Risks Properly? 218
  - E. Is the Expected-Payoff Maximization Assumption Reasonable? 219
- 2 GAMES OF DYNAMIC COMPETITION 223
  - A. Calculating the Probabilities of Winning at Tennis 225
  - B. Strategy in Tennis 229
  - C. Applying Tennis Analysis to Business 231
- 3 NASH EQUILIBRIUM WITH CONTINUOUS STRATEGIES 232
- 4 MIXING AMONG MANY STRATEGIES: EXAMPLES 234
  - A. A Zero-Sum, Three-by-Three Game 234
  - B. A Three-by-Three Example with Unused Strategies 238
- 5 MIXING AMONG MANY STRATEGIES: GENERAL THEORY 240
- SUMMARY 247
- KEY TERMS 248
- EXERCISES 248

# Some Broad Classes of Games and Strategies

## © The Prisoners' Dilemma Game 255

- 1 THE BASIC GAME (REVIEW) 256
- 2 SOLUTIONS i: REPETITION 257
  - A. Finite Repetition 258
  - B. Infinite Repetition 259
- 9 C. Games of Unknown Length 262
  - D. General Theory 263 ,
- 3 SOLUTIONS II: PENALTIES AND REWARDS 266
- 4 SOLUTIONS III: LEADERSHIP 269
- 5 EXPERIMENTAL EVIDENCE 271
- 6 REAL-WORLD DILEMMAS 274
  - A. Policy Setting 274
  - B. Labor Arbitration 276
  - C. Evolutionary Biology 277
  - D. Price Matching 278
- SUMMARY 280
- KEY TERMS 281
- EXERCISES 281

## Appendix: Infinite Sums 285

(ol

## ^J Games with Strategic Moves 288

- 1 A CLASSIFICATION OF STRATEGIC MOVES 289
  - A. Unconditional Strategic Moves 290
  - B. Conditional Strategic Moves 291
- 2 CREDIBILITY OF STRATEGIC MOVES 292
- 3 COMMITMENTS 294
- 4 THREATS AND PROMISES 298
  - A. Example of a Threat: U.S.-Japanese Trade Relations 298
  - B. Example of a Promise: The Pizza Pricing Game 303

C. Example Combining Threat and Promise: Joint U.S.-European Military Operations	304
5 SOME ADDITIONAL ISSUES	306
A. When. Do Strategic Moves Help?	306
B. Deterrence Versus Compellence	307
6 ACQUIRING CREDIBILITY	308
A. Reducing Your Freedom of Action	308
B. Changing Your Payoffs	310
7 COUNTERING YOUR OPPONENT'S STRATEGIC MOVES	313
A. Irrationality	314
B. Cutting Off Communication	314
C. Leaving Escape Routes Open	314
D. Undermining Your Opponent's Motive to Uphold His Reputation	314
E. Salami Tactics	315
SUMMARY	315
KEY TERMS	316
EXERCISES	316

## 10 Evolutionary Games 320

1 THE FRAMEWORK	321
2 THE PRISONERS' DILEMMA	324
A. The Twice-Played Prisoners' Dilemma	326
B. Multiple Repetitions	329
C. Comparing the Evolutionary and Rational-Player Models	330
3 CHICKEN	331
4 THE ASSURANCE GAME	334
5 INTERACTIONS ACROSS SPECIES	337
6 THE HAWK-DOVE GAME	341
A. Rational Strategic Choice and Equilibrium	341
B. Evolutionary Stability for $V > C$	342
C. Evolutionary Stability for $V < C$	342
D. $V < C$ : Stable Polymorphic Population	343
E. $V < C$ : Each Individual Mixes Strategies	344
7 SOME GENERAL THEORY	345
8 DYNAMICS WITH THREE TYPES IN THE POPULATION	347



9 EVOLUTION OF COOPERATION AND ALTRUISM 350

SUMMARY 352

KEY TERMS 353

EXERCISES 354

## Collective-Action Games 356

1 COLLECTIVE-ACTION GAMES WITH TWO PLAYERS 357

A. Numerical Examples 358

B. Generalization of the Two-Person Case 361

2 COLLECTIVE-ACTION PROBLEMS IN LARGE GROUPS 362

i

3 A BRIEF HISTORY OF IDEAS 368

4 SOLVING COLLECTIVE-ACTION PROBLEMS 369

A. Analysis 371

B. Applications 375

5 SPILLOVERS, OR EXTERNALITIES 377

A. The Calculus of the General Case 380

B. Negative Spillovers 381

C. Positive Spillovers 385 •

6 "HELP!"—A GAME OF CHICKEN WITH MIXED STRATEGIES 388

SUMMARY 392

KEY TERMS 393

EXERCISES 394

## Uncertainty and Information 397

1 CONTROLLING AND MANIPULATING RISK 398

A. Strategies to Reduce Risk 398

B. Using Risk 401

C. Manipulating Risk in Contests 402

2 SOME STRATEGIES TO MANIPULATE INFORMATION 403

A. Literal and Strategic Liars 405

B. King Solomon's Unwisdom 406

3 INCENTIVES TO INDUCE EFFORT 409

4 SCREENING AND SIGNALING 412

5 SEPARATION AND POOLING 416

A. Separating Equilibrium	419
B. Pooling Equilibrium	420
C. Semiseparating Equilibrium	421
6 SOME EVIDENCE FOR SIGNALING AND SCREENING	424
7 ADDITIONAL READING ON INFORMATION MANIPULATION	426
SUMMARY	427
KEY TERMS	428
EXERCISES	429

## PART FOUR

# Applications to Specific Strategic Situations

## 13 Brinkmanship: The Cuban Missile Crisis 435

1 A BRIEF NARRATION OF EVENTS	436
2 A SIMPLE GAME-THEORETIC EXPLANATION	443
3 ACCOUNTING FOR ADDITIONAL COMPLEXITIES	445
4 A PROBABILISTIC THREAT	451
5 PRACTICING BRINKMANSHIP	454
SUMMARY	459
KEY TERMS	459
EXERCISES	460

## 14 Strategy and Voting 462

1 VOTING RULES AND PROCEDURES	463
A. Binary Methods	463
B. Plurative Methods	464
C. Mixed Methods	465
2 VOTING PARADOXES	467
A. The Condorcet Paradox	467
B. The Reversal Paradox	469
C. The Agenda Paradox	470
D. Change the Voting Method, Change the Outcome	471

3	EVALUATING VOTE AGGREGATION METHODS	473
4	STRATEGIC VOTING	474
	A. Plurality Rule	475
	B. Pairwise Voting	477
	C. The Borda Count	481
5	THE MEDIAN VOTER THEOREM	481
	A. Discrete Political Spectrum	482
	B. Continuous Political Spectrum	486
	SUMMARY	488
	KEY TERMS	489
	EXERCISES	490

## Bidding Strategy and Auction Design 494

1	TYPES OF AUCTIONS	495
2	THE WINNER'S CURSE	497
3	BIDDING STRATEGIES	500
4	VICKREY'S TRUTH SERUM	501
5	ALL-PAY AUCTIONS	503
6	HOW TO SELL AT AUCTION	505
	A. Risk-Neutral Bidders and Independent Estimates	506
	B. Correlated Estimates	507
	C. Risk-Averse Bidders	508
7	SOME ADDED TWISTS TO CONSIDER	509
	A. Multiple Objects	509
	B. Defeating the System	511
	C. Information Disclosure	511
8	THE AIRWAVE SPECTRUM AUCTIONS	512
	A. Designing the Rules	513
	B. How the Auctions Have Fared	515
	C. Two Specific Bidding Issues	516
	SUMMARY	518
	KEY TERMS	518
	EXERCISES	519

# I 16

## Bargaining 521

- 1 NASH'S COOPERATIVE SOLUTION 523 ,
  - A. Numerical Example 523
  - B. General Theory 524
- 2 VARIABLE-THREAT BARGAINING 529
- 3 ALTERNATING-OFFERS MODEL K TOTAL VALUE DECAYS 531
- 4 EXPERIMENTAL EVIDENCE 534
- 5 ALTERNATING-OFFERS MODEL IK IMPATIENCE 537
- 6 MANIPULATING INFORMATION IN BARGAINING 542
- 7 BARGAINING WITH MANY PARTIES AND ISSUES 544
  - A. Multi-Issue Bargaining 545
  - B. Multiparty Bargaining 546
- SUMMARY 547
- KEY TERMS 547
- EXERCISES 548

# 17

## Markets and Competition 550

- 1 A SIMPLE TRADING GAME 552
- 2 THE CORE 560
  - A. Numerical Example 562
  - B. Some Properties of the Core 563
  - C. Discussion 565
    - »
- 3 THE MARKET MECHANISM 567
  - A. Properties of the Market Mechanism 569
  - B. Experimental Evidence 571
- 4 THE SHAPLEY VALUE 572
  - A. Power in Legislatures and Committees 574
  - B. Allocation of Joint Costs 575
- 5 FAIR DIVISION MECHANISMS 577
- SUMMARY 579
- KEY TERMS 580
- EXERCISES 580

## Index 583