

Budget Support as More Effective Aid?

Recent Experiences and Emerging Lessons

Edited by
Stefan Koeberle
Zoran Stavreski
Jan Walliser



THE WORLD BANK
Washington, D.C.

Contents

FOREWORD	xv
EDITORS' PREFACE	xvii
CONTRIBUTORS AND DISCUSSANTS	xix
ABBREVIATIONS AND ACRONYMS	xxiii
PART I: INTRODUCTION	1
1. BUDGET SUPPORT: CONCEPT AND ISSUES	3
<i>Stefan Koeberle and Zoran Staureski</i>	
A. Context for the Emergence of Budget Support	3
B. Definitions, Key Characteristics, and Rationale for Budget Support	5
C. When Is Budget Support Appropriate?	10
D. Key Issues in Design and Implementation	16
E. Summary and Conclusions	23
2. MANAGING FIDUCIARY ISSUES IN BUDGET SUPPORT OPERATIONS	27
<i>David Shand</i>	
A. Fiduciary and Developmental Objectives: Two Sides of the Same Coin	28
B. Issues in Fiduciary Risk	32
C. Using Public Financial Management Diagnostic Information	34
D. Measuring and Calibrating Fiduciary Risk	35
E. Strategies to Manage and Mitigate Fiduciary Risk	37
F. Is Budget Support Improving PFM?	40
PART II: RECENT EVALUATIONS OF BUDGET SUPPORT	45
3. POVERTY REDUCTION SUPPORT CREDITS (PRSC): A STOCKTAKING	47
<i>John M. Factora</i>	
A. Operationalizing the PRSP	49
B. PRSP Alignment: Content and Coverage	56
C. Harmonization and Predictability	65
D. Conclusions	78

4.	EUROPEAN COMMISSION BUDGET SUPPORT: AN INNOVATIVE APPROACH TO CONDITIONALITY	81
	<i>Directorate General for Development</i>	
	A. The European Commission's Approach: How Does it Work?	81
	B. EC Approach: What is the Rationale?	83
	C. EC Approach: What Does the Review of Experience to Date Show?	85
5.	A FRAMEWORK FOR EVALUATING GENERAL BUDGET SUPPORT	91
	<i>Mike A. Hammond</i>	
	A. Evolving Goals of Budget Support	91
	B. Purpose, Subject, and Scope of the Evaluation	93
	C. The Evaluation Framework	95
	D. Implementing the Evaluation	98
6.	GENERAL BUDGET SUPPORT: KEY FINDINGS OF FIVE USAID STUDIES	105
	<i>Development Information Services</i>	
	A. Issues Analyzed	106
	B. Conclusions	116
7.	DOES GENERAL BUDGET SUPPORT WORK? EVIDENCE FROM TANZANIA	
	<i>Andrew Lawson, David Booth, Meleki Msuya, Samuel Wangwe, and Tim Williamson</i>	
	A. How Can We Judge Success?	121
	B. The Tanzanian Context	122
	C. Findings	122
	D. Overall Conclusions	135
	E. Learning from Tanzania	136
8.	GENERAL BUDGET SUPPORT AND PUBLIC FINANCIAL MANAGEMENT REFORM: EMERGING LESSONS FROM TANZANIA AND UGANDA	139
	<i>Tim Williamson</i>	
	A. The Hypothesis	139
	B. Direct Effects of General Budget Support Funding in Tanzania and Uganda on Public Financial Management Outcomes	141
	C. Major Factors behind Improvements in Public Financial Management Systems	146
	D. The Role of Nonfinancial General Budget Support Inputs in Improving Public Financial Management Systems	147
	E. Conclusions and Their Implications	149
	PART III: ALIGNING BUDGET SUPPORT WITH COUNTRY PROGRAMS	153
9.	PRSPS AND BUDGETS: A SYNTHESIS OF FIVE CASE STUDIES	155
	<i>Rosa Alonso, Lindsay Judge, and Jeni Klugman</i>	

A.	Data Production, Availability, and Use	157
B.	Budget Formulation and the PRSP—Has the PRSP Process Increased the Openness and Transparency of the Budget Process?	163
C.	Accountability for Expenditures and Results	173
D.	Costing and Consistency with Overall Macroeconomic Framework	177
E.	Donor Coordination and Alignment with PRS Priorities and Predictability and Variability of External Financing	186
F.	Conclusions	189
10.	RECONCILING ALIGNMENT AND PERFORMANCE IN BUDGET SUPPORT PROGRAMS: WHAT NEXT?	193
	<i>David Booth, Karin Christiansen, and Paolo de Renzio</i>	
A.	The Broad Problem: PRSPs as a Two-sided Deal	194
B.	The Particular Problem: PRSP Annual Progress Reports and Performance Assessment Frameworks for Budget Support	196
C.	Why PRSP Monitoring Is Not Working	199
D.	Reforming Performance Assessment Frameworks: Toward Results-based Conditionality?	203
E.	The Alternative	205
F.	Conclusion	208
	PART IV: PREDICTABILITY OF BUDGET SUPPORT	213
11.	PREDICTABILITY OF BUDGET AID: RECENT EXPERIENCES	215
	<i>Oya Celasun and Jan Walliser</i>	
A.	Data on Budget Aid	217
B.	Budget Aid Flows: How Unpredictable Are They?	220
C.	Intrayear Predictability of Budget Aid	225
D.	Conclusions	226
12.	IMPROVING THE DYNAMICS OF AID: TOWARD MORE PREDICTABLE BUDGET SUPPORT	229
	<i>Benn Eifert and Alan Gelb</i>	
A.	Aid Instability: Some Stylized Facts	232
B.	Cushioning Expenditures through Reserve Management and Fiscal Rules	236
C.	How Risky Are Multiyear Aid Commitments?	241
D.	Calibrating Budget Support: Performance Levels versus Changes?	252
E.	Developing Performance-based Norms to Guide Aid Allocations	255
F.	Conclusion	265
	PART V: BUDGET SUPPORT COORDINATION AND CONDITIONALITY	265
13.	WORLD BANK CONDITIONALITY: TRENDS, LESSONS, AND GOOD PRACTICE PRINCIPLES	267
	<i>Stefan Koerberle and Jan Walliser</i>	
A.	Conditionality: Definitions, Modalities, and Approaches	268
B.	Trends in World Bank Conditionality	272
C.	Applying Conditionality	276

D. Key Messages of the Conditionality Review	284
E. Good Practice Principles	286
14. BUDGET SUPPORT, CONDITIONALITY, AND IMPACT EVALUATION	295
<i>Jan Willem Gunning</i>	
A. The Case for Results-based Aid	295
B. Aid as a Contract	297
C. Implementing Results-based Aid: Design and Experience	301
D. Shocks, Results, and Predictability	303
E. Impact Evaluation	306
F. Conclusion	308
15. TRUST, CONDITIONALITY, AND AID EFFECTIVENESS	311
<i>Paul Mosley and Suleiman Abrar</i>	
A. Intuitive Foundations	312
B. The Model	316
C. Econometric Tests	321
D. Evidence from Case Studies	324
E. Policy Conclusions and Recommendations	330
16. FUNGIBILITY, PRIOR ACTIONS, AND ELIGIBILITY FOR BUDGET SUPPORT	333
<i>Oliver Morrissey</i>	
A. Approaches to Improving Aid Effectiveness	333
B. A Model of Selectivity through Prior Actions	335
C. Government Spending: Fungibility, Allocation, and Effectiveness	339
D. Conclusions and Policy Implications	341
Good Practice Note on Harmonization	344
Good Practice Note on Memorandum of Understanding	347
PART VI: COUNTRY EXPERIENCES	351
17. BUDGET SUPPORT, AID DEPENDENCY, AND DUTCH DISEASE: THE CASE OF UGANDA	353
<i>Michael Atingi-Ego</i>	
A. Patterns and Composition of Budget Support to Uganda, 1993–2003	354
B. Implications of the Increase in Budget Support	356
C. Prices of Tradables versus Nontradables	365
D. Exchange Rate and Export Sector Competitiveness	366
E. Policy Recommendations and Conclusions	367
18. BUDGET SUPPORT IN MOZAMBIQUE	371
<i>Gregor Binkert and Jose Sulemane</i>	
A. MOU, Dialogue, Trust Building, and Harmonization	371
B. Planning and Budgeting	372
C. Monitoring and Evaluation of Budget Support	373
D. Accountability	373
E. Institutional and Human Capacity Building	374

19. AFGHANISTAN: BUDGET SUPPORT IN A POSTCONFLICT ENVIRONMENT	375
<i>Wabidullah Shahrani</i>	
20. BUDGET SUPPORT AND POVERTY REDUCTION IN SOUTH ASIA	377
<i>Shantayanan Devarajan and Shekhar Shah</i>	
A. Addressing South Asia's Development Challenges with Budget Support	379
B. Challenges Facing Budget Support in South Asia	387
PART VII: DONOR PERSPECTIVES ON BUDGET SUPPORT	391
21. INTERNATIONAL MONETARY FUND PERSPECTIVE ON CONDITIONALITY	393
<i>Atish Ghosh</i>	
A. Purposes of IMF Conditionality	393
B. 2002 Conditionality Guidelines	394
C. Lessons for Donors Providing Budget Support	395
22. ENDING POLICY CONDITIONALITY: THE RECENT SHIFT IN THE UNITED KINGDOM'S AID POLICY	397
<i>Nick Amin</i>	
A. Rationale for a New Conditionality Framework	399
B. How Will the New Policy Be Implemented?	400
C. Implications for Budget Support and Cooperation with Development Partners	403
D. Conclusion	405
23. GERMANY'S PERSPECTIVE ON BUDGET SUPPORT	407
<i>Ingrid-Gabriela Hoven</i>	
24. DIRECT BUDGET SUPPORT, DISBURSEMENT MECHANISMS, AND PREDICTABILITY	411
<i>Norwegian Agency for Development Cooperation (NORAD)</i>	
A. The Use of Direct Budget Support	412
B. Causes and Consequences of Lack of Predictability	414
C. Graduated Response Mechanisms	416
D. The Way Forward	424
25. BUDGET SUPPORT AND AID EFFECTIVENESS: EXPERIENCE IN EAST ASIA	431
<i>Hiroto Arakawa</i>	
A. Definitions	432
B. Roles of Budget Support	433
C. Aid Coordination and Harmonization in Vietnam and the Philippines	436
D. Conclusion and Implications for Future Assistance to Africa	440

26. THE NETHERLANDS: COUNTRY SELECTIVITY AND AID MODALITY CHOICES	447	
<i>Maarten Brouwer</i>		
PART VIII: PRACTITIONERS' FORUM ON BUDGET SUPPORT: DISCUSSION AND CONCLUDING REMARKS	451	
27. SUMMARY OF DISCUSSION	453	
A. Budget Support: Concept, Instrument Choice, and Fiduciary Aspects	453	
B. Programmatic Alignment, Ownership, and Accountability	455	
C. Predictability and Macroeconomic Impact of Aid	457	
D. Donor Coordination and Conditionality	459	
28. FORUM PARTICIPANTS' CONCLUDING REMARKS	463	
Louis Kasekende	463	
Terrius Zongo	465	
Nick Amin	466	
Alan Gelb	469	
Mark Plant	470	
Jerome Morris Wolgin	474	
James Adams	475	
REFERENCES	479	
BOXES		
1.1	Definitions	6
1.2	Sector Budget Support	8
1.3	Recent and Ongoing Evaluations of Budget Support	10
4.1	What Does "Results" Mean?	82
4.2	Frequently Asked Questions about the Commission's Approach to Budget Support	88
7.1	Summary of Findings—General Budget Support in Tanzania	137
9.1	Fostering Intra- and Inter-ministerial Cooperation in Burkina Faso	167
9.2	Tanzania: the Participatory Public Expenditure Review and the PRSP Process	170
9.3	Bolivia: Incentivizing Pro-poor Spending at the Local Level	175
9.4	Uganda: Poverty Criteria as a Guide to Budget Allocations	184
10.1	Why the APR Is Not Adequate for Budget Support Financing Decisions: Examples from Africa	200
13.1	Good Practice in Different Country Circumstances	288
18.1	Budget Support and the Aid Relationship in Mozambique	372
22.1	Essential Elements of the UK Policy	398
25.1	Aid Enhancement Efforts in Vietnam	437
25.2	Aid Enhancement Efforts in the Philippines	438