

Comparing Federal Systems

SECOND EDITION

Ronald L. Watts

Published for the School of Policy Studies, Queen's University
by McGill-Queen's University Press
Montreal & Kingston • London • Ithac;

Contents

<i>List of Tables</i>	vii
<i>Foreword to the First Edition</i>	ix
<i>Preface to the First Edition and Summary</i>	xi
<i>Preface to the Second Edition</i>	xv
<i>Acknowledgements</i>	xvii
1. INTRODUCTION.....	1
1.1 The Relevance of Comparisons.....	1
1.2 A Brief History of Federalism.....	2
1.3 The Relevance of Federalism in the 1990s.....	4
1.4 Definition of Terms and Principles of Federalism.....	6
1.5 Federal Societies, Constitutions and Governments.....	14
1.6 Issues in the Design and Operation of Federations.....	17
1.7 Criteria for the Selection of Federations Considered in this Study.....	18
2. OVERVIEW OF THE FEDERATIONS COMPARED IN THIS STUDY.....	21
2.1 Established Federations in Developed Countries.....	21
United States of America (1789).....	21
Switzerland (1848).....	22
Canada (1867).....	23
Australia (1901).....	24
Austria (1920).....	25
Germany (1949).....	26

2.2	Selected Multilingual Federations in Developing Countries.....	27
	India (1950).....	27
	Malaysia (1963).....	28
2.3	Recently Emerged and Emerging Federations.....	29
	Belgium (1993).....	29
	Spain (1978).....	30
2.4	Bicommunal Federations That Have Separated.....	31
	Czechoslovakia (1920-1992).....	31
	Pakistan (1947-1971).....	32
3.	THE DISTRIBUTION OF POWERS IN FEDERATIONS.....	35
3.1	The Issue of Balancing Unity and Diversity.....	35
3.2	Relationship between Distributions of Legislative and Executive Powers.....	36
3.3	Variations in the Form of the Distribution of Legislative Authority.....	37
	Exclusive Legislative Powers.....	37
	Concurrent Legislative Powers.....	38
	Residual Powers.....	39
3.4	The Scope of Legislative Powers Allocated.....	40
3.5	Distribution of Administrative Responsibilities.....	41
4.	THE DISTRIBUTION OF FINANCES.....	43
4.1	Importance of the Allocation of Financial Resources.....	43
4.2	The Distribution of Revenue Powers.....	43
4.3	The Allocation of Expenditure Powers.....	44
4.4	The Issue of Vertical and Horizontal Imbalances.....	45
4.5	The Role of Financial Transfers.....	47
4.6	Conditional or Unconditional Transfers.....	48
4.7	Equalization Transfers.....	50
4.8	Processes and Institutions for Adjusting Financial Arrangements ...	53
5.	PROCESSES FOR FLEXIBILITY AND ADJUSTMENT IN FEDERATIONS.....	57
5.1	Importance of Processes for Intergovernmental Collaboration.....	57
5.2	Forms and Extent of Intergovernmental Relations.....	57
5.3	Other Devices for Flexibility and Adjustment in the Distribution of Powers.....	59
5.4	Cooperative versus Competitive Federalism.....	60
5.5	Implications for the Democratic Character of Federations.....	61

6.	SYMMETRY AND ASYMMETRY IN FEDERATIONS.....	63
6.1	Political and Constitutional Asymmetry Distinguished.....	63
6.2	Examples of Political Asymmetry.....	63
6.3	Examples of Constitutional Asymmetry.....	66
7.	MULTILEVEL FEDERAL SYSTEMS.....	69
7.1	The Impact of Membership in Supra-federation Federal Organizations.....	69
7.2	The Place of Local Governments.....	70
8.	DEGREES OF DECENTRALIZATION AND NON-CENTRALIZATION IN FEDERATIONS.....	71
8.1	Conceptual Issues in Measuring Decentralization and Relative Autonomy.....	71
	Legislative Decentralization.....	72
	Administrative Decentralization.....	73
	Financial Decentralization.....	73
	Decentralization to Non-governmental Agencies.....	74
	Constitutional Limitations.....	75
	The Character of Federal Decision Making.....	75
8.2	A Comparative Assessment in Relation to Canada.....	75
8.3	Minimum Federal Powers.....	80
9.	THE REPRESENTATIVE INSTITUTIONS OF FEDERAL GOVERNMENTS.....	83
9.1	The Importance of Shared Federal Institutions as a Focus for Unity.....	83
9.2	Institutions Based on the Separation of Powers or Parliamentary Principles.....	84
9.3	The Significance of These Forms for the Representativeness and Effectiveness of Federal Governments.....	85
9.4	The Impact of Electoral Systems and Political Parties.....	90
9.5	The Role of Federal Second Chambers.....	92
	Bicameralism within Federations.....	92
	Selection of Members.....	92
	Basis of Regional Representation.....	95
	Powers of Second Chambers Relative to the First Chamber.....	96
10.	CONSTITUTIONAL SUPREMACY IN FEDERATIONS.....	99
10.1	The Constitution as Supreme Law.....	99
10.2	Processes for Constitutional Adjudication and Judicial Review	99

10.3	Supreme Courts and Constitutional Courts.....	100
10.4	Constitutional Amendment Procedures.....	101
10.5	The Role of Constitutional Bills of Rights.....	104
10.6	Provisions for Formal Secession.....	107
11.	THE PATHOLOGY OF FEDERATIONS.....	109
11.1	Significance of the Pathology of Federations.....	109
11.2	Sources of Stress.....	110
	The Distribution and Character of Internal Social Divisions ...	110
	The Role of the Institutions and Structures of Federations.....	110
	Strategies Adopted to Combat Disintegration.....	112
	Polarizing Political Processes.....	112
11.3	The Special Problem of Bicommunal Federations.....	113
11.4	Processes and Consequences of Disintegration.....	114
12.	CONCLUSIONS.....	117
12.1	Canada in Comparative Perspective.....	117
12.2	Implications for the Future Development of the Canadian Federation.....	120
	APPENDIX A	
	The Distribution of Powers and Functions in Federations: A Comparative Overview.....	125
	NOTES.....	131
	SELECTED READINGS	135