

The High Cost of Free Parking

By
Donald C. Shoup



PLANNERS PRESS
American Planning Association
Chicago, Illinois
Washington, D.C.

Contents

Acknowledgements	xvii
<hr/>	
1. The Twenty-First Century Parking Problem	1
The Car Explosion	4
The "Commons" Problem	7
Skewed Travel Choices	9
Cures That Kill	9
The Twenty-First Century Parking Solution	13
<hr/>	
<i>Part I: Planning for Free Parking</i>	19
2. Unnatural Selection	21
The Genesis of Parking Requirements	21
Huddled Masses Yearning to Park Free	22
Planning without Prices	23
Planning without Theory	25
First Strategy: Copy Other Cities	27
Second Strategy: Consult ITE Data	31
Five Easy Reforms	64
Conclusion: The Immaculate Conception of Parking Demand	65
3. The Pseudoscience of Planning for Parking	75
Three-Step Process	75
Circular Logic	84
Estimating Demand without Prices	87
Professional Confidence Trick	88
Planners in Denial	89
Parochial Policies	92
Mobility versus Proximity	93
Systemwide Effects of Parking Requirements	94
Parking Spaces Required for a Change of Land Use	97
Quantity versus Quality	101
Conclusion: An Elaborate Structure with No Foundation	111
4. An Analogy: Ancient Astronomy	119
A Parallel Universe	120
The Muddle Is the Message	121
5. A Great Planning Disaster	127
Bundled Parking and the Decision to Drive	128
Distorted Urban Form	129
Degraded Urban Design	136

Higher Housing Costs	141
Paralysis by Parking Requirements	153
Limits on Homeownership	157
Damage to the Urban Economy	157
Harm to the Central Business District	158
Harm to Low-Income Families	165
Price Discrimination	167
Prices and Preferences	169
Precedent Coagulates into Tradition	171
An Analogy: Bloodletting	173
Conclusion: First, Do No Harm	175
6. The Cost of Required Parking Spaces	185
How Much Does a Parking Space Cost?	185
Monthly Cost of a Parking Space	191
External Costs of a Parking Space	194
Conclusion: The High Cost of Required Parking Spaces	200
7. Putting the Cost of Free Parking in Perspective	205
Total Subsidy for Parking	205
Capital Cost of the Parking Supply	208
New Parking Spaces Compared with New Cars	210
Free Parking Compared with the Cost of Driving to Work	211
Parking Subsidies Compared with Congestion Tolls	215
Simple Arithmetic	217
Conclusion: A Great Planning Disaster	218
8. An Allegory: Minimum Telephone Requirements	225
9. Public Parking in Lieu of Private Parking	229
Benefits of In-Lieu Fees	231
Concerns about In-Lieu Fees	232
How Do Cities Set the In-Lieu Fees?	233
Why Pay the Fee rather than Provide the Parking?	236
The Impact Fees Implicit in Parking Requirements	237
Conclusion: The High Cost of Parking Requirements	246
10. Reduce Demand Rather than Increase Supply	251
Transit Passes in Lieu of Parking Spaces	251
Parking Cash Out in Lieu of Parking Spaces	262
Car Sharing	266
Policies Appropriate to Their Locations	267
Conclusion: Offer the Option to Reduce Parking Demand	267

<i>Part II: Cruising for Parking</i>	273
11. Cruising	275
Cruising through the Twentieth Century	276
Detroit	279
Washington, D.C	280
New Haven and Waterbury	281
London	281
Paris	283
Freiburg	283
Jerusalem and Haifa	283
Cambridge	284
Cape Town	284
New York	285
San Francisco	288
Sydney	289
Cruising without Parking	289
Conclusion: A Century of Cruising	290
12. The Right Price for Curb Parking	295
Is Curb Parking a Public Good?	296
Time Limits	296
The Right Price	297
External Costs of Curb Parking	303
Demand-Responsive Prices	304
Can Prices Manage Curb Parking Demand?	307
Two Later Observations	314
Conclusion: Charge the Right Price for Curb Parking	315
13. Choosing to Cruise	321
To Cruise or to Pay	321
Equilibrium Search Time: An Example	323
The Wages of Cruising	324
Rent Seeking	329
Two Pricing Strategies	330
Elasticities	331
A Numerical Example	333
Complications	335
Is Cruising Rational?	339
The Role of Information	340
Conclusion: An Invitation to Cruise	342
14. California Cruising	347
Park-and-Visit Tests in Westwood Village	348
Cheaper Curb Parking Creates More Cruising	350
Cruising for a Year	351

Side Effects of Cruising	361
Solo Drivers More Likely to Cruise	362
Market Prices Can Attract More People	363
Wages of Cruising in Westwood Village	367
Perception versus Reality	367
Turning Wasted Time into Public Revenue	369
Conclusion: The High Cost of Cruising	369
<hr/>	
Part III. Cashing in on Curb Parking	377
15. Buying Time at the Curb	379
First Parking Meter	380
The Technology of Charging for Curb Parking	382
Not Technology but Politics	390
Conclusion: Honk if You Support Paid Parking	392
16. Turning Small Change into Big Changes	397
Parking Benefit Districts	397
A Logical Recipient: Business Improvement Districts	401
Pasadena: Your Meter Money Makes a Difference	403
San Diego: Turning Small Change into Big Changes	418
Conclusion: Cash Registers at the Curb	427
17. Taxing Foreigners Living Abroad	433
A Market in Curb Parking	434
Residential Parking Benefit Districts	435
Benefits of Parking Benefit Districts	453
Conclusion: Changing the Politics of Curb Parking	464
18. Let Prices Do the Planning	471
Space, Time, Money, and Parking	471
The Optimal Parking Space	473
Greed versus Sloth	474
Parking Duration and Vehicle Occupancy	475
The Invisible Hand	479
Classic Monocentric Models	480
Efficiency	483
Practicality	484
Enforcement	486
Banning Curb Parking	489
Where Would Jesus Park?	494
Removing Off-Street Parking Requirements	495
Conclusion: Prices Can Do the Planning	499
19. The Ideal Source of Local Public Revenue	505
Henry George's Proposal	505
Curb Parking Revenue Is Public Land Rent	508

Parking Requirements Act Like a Tax on Buildings	509
What Would Adam Smith Say about Charging for Parking?	512
Revenue Potential of Curb Parking	513
Division of Curb Parking Revenue	519
Similarity to Special Assessments	522
Property Values	523
An Analogy: Congestion Pricing	523
Appropriate Public Claimants	527
Parking Increment Finance	528
Equity	530
Opportunity Cost of Curb Parking	539
Economic Development	540
Monopoly, Free Parking, and Henry George	543
Conclusion: The Revenue Is under Our Cars	547
20. Unbundled Parking	559
Parking Costs Unbundled from Housing Costs	560
Parking Caps or Parking Prices	568
Effects of Unbundling on VMT and Vehicle Emissions	569
Objections to Unbundling	572
Conclusion: The High Cost of Bundled Parking	575
21. Time for a Paradigm Shift	579
Parking Requirements as a Paradigm	580
Retrofitting America	582
An Illustration: Advising the Mayor	583
A New Style of Planning	584
<hr/>	
<i>Part IV: Conclusion</i>	587
22. Changing the Future	589
Curb Parking as a Commons Problem	590
Enormous Parking Subsidies	591
Unintended Consequences	592
Enclosing the Commons	594
Public Property, Not Private Property	595
Commons, Anticommons, and the Liberal Commons	596
Public Property, but without Open Access	599
Other Commons Problems	600
Two Futures	601
Three Reforms	602
<hr/>	
Appendix A: The Practice of Parking Requirements	607
Three Steps in Setting a Parking Requirement	608

662 Land Uses	609
216 Bases	610
Convergence to the Golden Rule	612
Parking Requirements and Regional Culture	614
Parking Requirements and Parking Technology	614
What Went Wrong?	617
Appendix B: Nationwide Transportation Surveys	621
Drivers Park Free for 99 Percent of All Automobile Trips	621
Cars Are Parked 95 Percent of the Time	624
Appendix C: The Language of Parking	627
Appendix D: The Calculus of Driving, Parking, and Walking	631
Elasticities	633
Complications	633
The Price of Time	635
Appendix E: The Price of Land and the Cost of Parking	643
Break-Even Land Values	643
Land Banks	645
Cost of Complying with Parking Requirements	646
Appendix F: People, Parking, and Cities	649
Share of Land in Streets and Parking	650
People and Land: Los Angeles, New York, and San Francisco	653
Appendix G: Converting Traffic Congestion into Cash	659
Use of the Toll Revenue	664
Estimates of the Toll Revenue	666
Income Distribution and Political Support	668
Appendix H: The Vehicles of Nations	673
<hr/>	
References	683
<hr/>	
Index	713
<hr/>	

Tables

2-1. Peak Parking Occupancy and Minimum Parking Requirements	36
2-2. Parking Turnover Rates	55
3-1. Selected Land Uses that Have Parking Requirements	76
3-2. Selected Bases for Parking Requirements	77
3-3. Parking Requirements for the Afterlife	79
3-4. Pataphysical Parking Requirements	80
3-5. Parking Spaces Required When a Building's Use Changes	99
5-1. An Example of How Parking Requirements Reduce Floor Area Ratios	134