

Keeping the Promise of Social Security in Latin America

Indermit S. Gill, Truman Packard,
and Juan Yermo

With the assistance of Todd Pugatch

A COPUBLICATION OF STANFORD ECONOMICS AND FINANCE,
AN IMPRINT OF STANFORD UNIVERSITY PRESS, AND THE WORLD BANK

Contents

Foreword	xvii
Acknowledgments	xix
1 RETHINKING SOCIAL SECURITY PRIORITIES IN LATIN AMERICA	1
PART I. RETROSPECTIVE: FISCAL, FINANCIAL, AND SOCIAL BENEFITS FROM PENSION REFORM	17
2 STRUCTURAL REFORMS TO SOCIAL SECURITY IN LATIN AMERICA	19
3 THE FISCAL SUSTAINABILITY OF PUBLIC PENSION PROMISES IN LATIN AMERICA	39
4 THE FINANCIAL BENEFITS OF PENSION REFORM	57
5 SOCIAL GAINS FROM PENSION REFORMS IN LATIN AMERICA	89
PART II. ANALYTICAL: HOW GOVERNMENTS CAN HELP INDIVIDUALS DEAL WITH RETIREMENT	107
6 How INDIVIDUALS VIEW SOCIAL SECURITY	109
7 How WELL HAS THE "SAVINGS" COMPONENT PERFORMED FROM THE INDIVIDUAL'S PERSPECTIVE?	125
8 THE PREFERENCES THAT INDIVIDUALS REVEAL	165

PART III. PROSPECTIVE: THE FUTURE OF SOCIAL SECURITY IN LATIN AMERICA	197
9 PREVENTING POVERTY IN OLD AGE: IMPROVING THE POOLING COMPONENT	199
10 FACILITATING CONSUMPTION SMOOTHING: IMPROVING THE SAVINGS COMPONENT	227
11 THE WAY FORWARD	267
Technical Annex. Assumptions of PROST Simulations	283
Appendix. Background Papers for <i>Keeping the Promise</i>	291
Bibliography	293
Index	321
BOXES	
1.1 Three Central Dilemmas of Pension Privatization	3
3.1 Bolivia's Pension Reform: A Transition Considerably More Costly Than Expected	45
3.2 Virtuous and Vicious Fiscal Circles: The Cases of Chile and Argentina	47
4.1 The Importance of Concomitant Reforms in the Financial System	64
4.2 Inflation-Indexed Securities in Latin America	74
5.1 Defining the Coverage Problem: What Is It and Why Do We Care?	95
5.2 Was Increasing Coverage an Objective of Pension Reform?	97
6.1 The Welfare State as a Piggy Bank to Reduce Old-Age Income Insecurity	110
6.2 A Theory of "Comprehensive Insurance"	113
7.1 The Four Fundamental Risks in Retirement Income Security Systems	127
7.2 Comparing Notional Defined Contribution Systems and Pension Funds Invested in Inflation- and Wage-Indexed Government Bonds	128
7.3 Argentina's System in Crisis: Do Private Accounts Protect Workers from Policy Risk?	133
7.4 Points to Keep in Mind When Comparing Risks in Pension Fund Portfolios in Latin America	137

8.1	PRIESO: Social Risk Management Surveys in Chile and Peru	176
8.2	Peru's Reformed Pension System: Multipillar in Name Only	179
9.1	The <i>Cuota Social</i> : Preventing Poverty among Elderly Men and Women in Mexico	208
9.2	BONOSOL: Bolivia's Universal Pension Program	210
10.1	The Big-Bang Approach to Voluntary Pension Savings Reform in Chile	248
10.2	The Role of the Financial System in Brazil's Voluntary Pension Savings Plans	250
11.1	The Role of the Second Pillar	278

FIGURES

1.1	Pension Systems Cover between 10 and 60 Percent of the Economically Active Population in Latin American Countries	6
1.2	Between One-Tenth and Two-Thirds of the Aged Populations Receive Pensions in Latin American Countries	7
2.1	Rising Life Expectancy Increases the Share of Elderly People in the Population and Upsets the Balance of Pure PAYG Pension Systems	20
2.2	Destination of Mandatory Pension Contributions	29
3.1	Simulated Implicit Pension Debts (IPDs) with and without Structural Reforms	40
3.2	Total Pension Debt (Explicit) Accumulated after 2001, with and without Structural Reforms	43
3B.1	Cash Flow Gap in Bolivia	45
3B.2a	Chile Was Fiscally Strong prior to Reform; Argentina Was Not	47
3B.2b	Pension System Deficits Contributed Significantly to Deteriorating Fiscal Balance in Argentina	48
3.3	There Is No Indication That Pension Reform Increased Mexico's Country Risk	52
4.1	Pension Funds Are Major Investors in Government Debt	63
4.2	Interest Rate Spreads Have Declined in Peru and Bolivia Since the Reforms (1993-2002)	79
4.3	Stock Market Turnover Ratios in Selected Latin American Countries (1990-2001)	81
5.1	Structural Reforms Are Likely to Improve Equity by Lowering Regressive Transfers and Returns	91

5.2	Structural Reforms Make the New Systems More Gender Neutral, but Women's Average Benefits Can Be Significantly Lowered by the Use of Gender-Specific Mortality Tables	92
5.3	Pension Income Increases Inequity Relative to Earned Income from Labor	94
5.4	Has Participation Increased? There Is No Clear Pattern in Data on Contribution to National Pension Systems	100
7.1	Pension Funds Invest Mainly in Government Bonds and Instruments Issued by Financial Institutions	132
7.2	The Standard Trade-Off between Risk and Return Has Not Materialized in Latin America (Returns from Inception to December 2000)	136
7.3	In Chile Intercohort Differences in Returns Have Been Large	139
7.4	Returns on Deposits in Chile Have Been Lower but More Stable Than Pension Fund Returns	140
7.5	Brady Bonds Would Have Been a Better Investment Than Domestic Equities for Peruvian Pension Funds	141
7.6	Variable Commission Rates Have Risen as a Result of Declines in Contribution Rates in Argentina and Peru	147
7.7	Half of the Pension Contributions of the Average Chilean Worker Who Retired in 2000 Went to Fees	148
7.8	Participation in the Second Pillar Is Costlier for Poorer Workers in Chile	149
7.9	Annuities Have Yielded Varying Levels of Retirement Benefits in Chile	154
7.10	Chile's Pension Funds Did Not Do a Good Job of Educating Participants: <i>Fondo 2</i> Had Few Takers Despite Earning Higher Returns	156
7.11	Chilean Workers' Choices in the New Multifund System Largely Correspond with the Default Options	158
7.12	Choices Are Similar for Different Income Groups in Chile If Controlling for Age	159
8.1	Chile: Reported Contribution Density	180
8.2	There Is No Difference in Risk Preferences between Employees and Self-Employed Workers Who Responded to the PRIESO Survey in Chile	182
8.3	Self-Employed Workers Who Contribute to the AFP System in Chile Have a Greater Tolerance for Risk	183

8.4	Peru: Reported Contribution Density	184
8.5	There Is No Difference in Risk Preferences between Employees and Self-Employed Workers in Peru	187
8.6	Self-Employed People in the AFP System in Peru Are More Risk Averse	188
9.1	Rising Life Expectancy Increases the Share of Elderly People in the Population and Upsets the Balance of Pure Pooling Pension Systems	200
9.2	Accumulated Wealth Increases with Age and Is Greatest among Old People	204
9.3	Relative Generosity and Cost of Alternative Public Poverty Pension Arrangements in Selected Countries	212
9.4	Average Noncontributory Pensions Are between 30 Percent and 60 Percent of Average Contributory Pensions	217
10.1	In Peru, Fees Remain Persistently High, Despite Increasing Returns and Declining Administrative Costs	234
10.2	Savings Products Offered by Insurers Are More Popular Than the AFPs' Liquid <i>Cuenta 2</i>	249
10.3	Mutual Funds Have Grown Significantly Only in Brazil, Where Pension Funds Are Voluntary	252
10.4	Fees for Equity Mutual Funds in Chile Have Remained Stubbornly High	255
10.5	Economies of Scale in Fund Management Kick in at Low Asset Levels	256
10.6	Insurance Company Bankruptcy Is a Threat to Policyholders	258
11.1	Coverage Can Vary at Similar Stages of Economic Development	274
TABLES		
1.1	Instruments of Old-Age Income Security	10
2.1	Principal Features of Structural Reforms to Social Security Systems (Old-Age Disability and Death) in Latin America during the 1980s and 1990s	23
2.2	Principal Features of Structural Reforms to Social Security Systems (Old-Age Disability and Death) in Latin America during the 1990s and 2000s	26
2.3	Contribution Rates and Earnings Ceilings in the Mandatory Funded Systems	32
2.4	Voluntary Funded Pillars in Latin America	35

3.1	Current Pension Deficits (Benefit Expenditures Less Contribution Revenue) Financed by Government Transfers	42
4.1	Portfolio Ceilings by Main Asset Classes (December 2002)	61
4.2	Portfolio Floors by Country	62
4.3	Assets Held by Pension Funds Have Doubled as a Percentage of GDP (December 1998-December 2002)	62
4.4	Pension Funds Invest Mainly in Debt of Governments and Financial Institutions (December 2002)	67
4.5	For the Average Latin American Country, the Two Largest Institutions Control Two-Thirds of the Pension Funds (December 2002)	68
5.1	There Is Evidence That Pension Reforms Positively Affect Incentives	102
5.2	Participation Rates and Incidence of Benefits Show a Regressive Pattern of Coverage by Formal Pension Systems	104
6.1	Justifying a Government-Imposed Mandate to Save for Old Age—Microeconomic Reasons	117
6.2	Justifying a Government-Imposed Mandate to Save for Old-Age—Macroeconomic Reasons	120
7.1	Gross, Real Returns to Pension Funds Have Been High	130
7.2	Asset Allocation and Portfolio Limits	142
7.3	Workers Still Pay High Commissions in Some Countries (December 2002)	145
7.4	The Form of Benefits Is Usually Inconsistent with an Assumption of Retiree Irrationality with Respect to Saving	151
7.5	The Five New Funds in Chile Vary by Proportion of Equity Investment	157
8.1	Probability That Workers Contribute to Social Security Is Determined by Individual, Household, and Labor Market Factors	171
8.2	Reformed Pension Systems in Chile and Peru Are Similar, but There Are Important Differences	178
9.1	Poverty among Elderly People Is as Frequent as among Other Age Groups When Measured by Current Income	202
9.2	Expenditure on Noncontributory Pension Programs	215
9.3	Noncontributory, Poverty Prevention Pensions Cover a Significant Portion of Pension Recipients	216

9.4	As a Share of Average Wages, Minimum Wages Are Relatively High in Chile, Colombia, and Some Other Latin American Countries	218
9.5	Cost of Providing and Guaranteeing a Public Pension Equal to the Minimum Wage	220
10.1	Reform Options to Reduce the Operational Expenses of the New Private Second Pillar	235
10.2	Reform Options to Ensure That Savings Are Passed on to Affiliates as Lower Commissions	240
10.3	Reform Options to Improve Investment and Longevity Risk Management	243
TA.1	Assumptions Common to All Country Cases	283
TA.2	Country-Specific Details, Assumptions, and Sources of Data	284
TA.3	Assumed Profiles of Representative Affiliated Men and Women	289