

# Old-Age Income Support in the 21st Century

*An International Perspective  
on Pension Systems and Reform*

*Robert Holzmann and Richard Hinz*

*together with*

*Hermann von Gersdorff, Indermit Gill, Gregorio Impavido,  
Alberto R. Musalem, Robert Palacios, David Robolino,  
Michał Rutkowski, Anita Schwarz, Yvonne Sin,  
Kalanidhi Subbarao*

THE WORLD BANK  
WASHINGTON, D.C.

---

---

# Contents

<b>Preface</b> .....	<b>vii</b>
<b>Acronyms and Abbreviations</b> .....	<b>ix</b>
Introduction and Executive Summary .....	1
A Framework for Pension Reform .....	2
Design and Implementation Issues .....	9
Structure of the Report .....	20
 <b>PART 1. CONCEPTUAL UNDERPINNINGS</b>	
1 The Need for Reform .....	23
Fiscal Pressure: Short-Term Urgencies and Long-Term Needs .....	23
Delivering on Promises .....	27
Aligning Systems with Socioeconomic Changes .....	30
Challenges and Opportunities of Globalization .....	32
The Contours of Promising Reform Directions .....	34
2 Conceptual Foundations of the World Bank's Perspective .....	37
The Social Risk Management Framework .....	37
Rationale for Public Intervention .....	39
The Multipillar Approach: Diversification and Efficiency .....	42
The (Net) Benefits of Funding .....	44
A Benchmark, Not a Blueprint .....	53

3	Goals and Criteria That Define the World Bank's Perspective .....	55
	Primary Goals: Adequate, Affordable, Sustainable, and Robust Pensions .....	55
	Secondary Goal: Contribution to Economic Development .....	57
	Reform Criteria .....	58
4	World Bank Lending to Support Pension Reform .....	63
	Scope of the World Bank's Pension Lending .....	64
	Diversity of Pension Reforms .....	65

## PART 2. DESIGN AND IMPLEMENTATION ISSUES

5	General and Country-Specific Options for the Reform of Pension Systems .....	73
	General Options for Reform .....	73
	Country-Specific Options for Reform: Policy Progression and Path Dependency .....	84
	Conclusions .....	91
6	Key Reform Issues: Firm Positions and Open Questions .....	93
	Pillar Design, Poverty Relief, and Redistribution .....	93
	Financial Sustainability Issues .....	104
	Management of Public Pension Funds .....	106
	Administrative and Implementation Issues .....	114
	Readiness and Regulatory and Supervisory Financial Market Issues .....	127
	Political Economy and Organization of Pension Reforms .....	134
	Examples of Reform Dilemmas and Questions .....	138
7	Regional Experiences: Developments and First Evaluation of Reform .....	141
	Latin America and the Caribbean .....	141
	Central and Eastern Europe and Central Asia .....	150
	South Asia .....	159
	Sub-Saharan Africa .....	162
	Middle East and North Africa .....	165
	East Asia .....	168
8	Final Remarks .....	171

<b>Appendix: Tables on Old-Age Income Poverty</b> .....	<b>173</b>
<b>Endnotes</b> .....	<b>179</b>
<b>Glossary</b> .....	<b>189</b>
<b>References</b> .....	<b>195</b>
<b>Contributors</b> .....	<b>215</b>

## FIGURES

4.1 Timing of World Bank Loans to Multipillar Schemes, by Number of Loans .....	69
4.2 Timing of World Bank Loans to Multipillar Schemes, by Amount of Loans .....	70
6.1 Parallel and Integrated Civil Service Pensions, by Region .....	103
6.2 Distribution and Importance of Public Pension Funds, by Region .....	107
6.3 Combined Collection and Clearinghouse .....	117
6.4 Decentralized Funded Pillar in Chile and Hungary .....	118

## TABLES

1 Multipillar Pension Taxonomy .....	10
4.1 World Bank Lending with Pension Components, Fiscal 1984–2004 .....	65
4.2 Regional Distribution of World Bank Lending Activities, 1984–2004 .....	66
4.3 World Bank Pension-Related Lending Classified by Pillar Support, 1984–2004 .....	67
4.4 Proportion of Pension-Related Lending for Second-Pillar Implementation, 1984–2004 .....	68
4.5 World Bank Lending for Reforms with a Dominant Second Pillar, 1984–2004 .....	69
5.1 Multipillar Pension Taxonomy .....	82
5.2 Stylized Reform Choices for Countries: Matching Reform Needs with Constraints and Opportunities .....	85

7.1	Principal Features of Structural Reforms to Social Security Systems (Old-Age Disability and Death) in Latin America, 1980s and 1990s .....	142
7.2	Principal Features of Structural Reforms to Social Security Systems (Old-Age Disability and Death) in Latin America, 1990s and 2000s .....	144
7.3	Characteristics of Pension Reforms Moving to a Multipillar System in Transition Economies in Europe and Central Asia, as of April 2004 .....	154
A.1	Poverty Gap in Select African Countries, by Type of Household, Various Years .....	173
A.2	Inventory of Noncontributory Pension Programs in Developing Countries .....	174
A.3	Money as a Percentage of GDP Required to Eliminate the Poverty Gap in Select African Countries, by Type of Household, Various Years .....	176
A.4	Cost of Social Pensions (0.70 Percent of the Poverty Threshold) as a Percentage of GDP in Select African Countries, Various Years .....	177