Multinational Enterprises and the Law

Second Edition

PETER T MUCHLINSKI

LLB (Lond), LLM (Cantab), Barrister, Professor in International Commercial Law, The School of Oriental and African Studies, University of London

OXfORD
UNIVERSITY PRESS
I. THE CONCEPTUAL FRAMEWORK

1. Getting to Know Multinational Enterprises
   1. Problems of Definition 5
   2. The Principal Phases of MNE Growth 8
      (a) The First Period: 1850-1914 10
      (b) The Second Period: 1918-1939 12
      (c) The Third Period: 1945-1990 15
         (i) The Period of American Dominance: 1945—1960 15
         (ii) The Period of Renewed International Competition: 1960-1990 18
      (d) The Fourth Period: 1990 onwards 21
   3. Explanations for the Growth of MNEs 25
   4. The Role of Legal Factors in the Growth of MNEs 33
      Concluding Remarks 44

2. Business and Legal Forms of Multinational Enterprise: Towards a Theory of Control 45
   1. MNEs as Transnational Business Organizations 45
   2. Legal Forms of Multinational Enterprise 51
      (a) Contractual Forms 52
         (i) Distribution Agreements 53
         (ii) Production Agreements 54
         (iii) Public Private Partnerships 55
      (b) Equity Based Corporate Groups 56
         (i) The Anglo-American 'Pyramid' Group 56
         (ii) European Transnational Mergers 58
         (iii) The Japanese 'Keiretsu' 63
         (iv) Changes in Business Organization and Effect on Equity Based Structures 65
(c) Joint Ventures  
(d) Informal Alliances between MNEs  
(e) Publicly Owned MNEs  
(0 Supranational Forms of International Business  
   (i) Forms Adopted by the European Community  
   (ii) The Andean Multinational Enterprise  
   (iii) Public International Corporations  
3. Business and Legal Forms and the Control of MNE Activities  
Concluding Remarks  

3. Regulating Multinationals  
1. The Principal Actors  
2. Developing a Regulatory Agenda  
3. The Role of Ideology  
   (a) The Ideological 'Building Blocks': 1960—1990  
      (i) The 'Neo-Classical Market' Perspective  
      (ii) The 'Regulated Market Perspective'  
      (iii) The 'Marxist' Perspective  
      (iv) The Influence of Nationalism  
   (b) The Influence of the Debate on 'Globalization'  
      (i) Globalization and MNE Regulation  
      (ii) 'Global Consumerism'  
      (iii) 'International Corporate Social Responsibility'  
4. Bargaining Power, Sources and Sites of MNE Regulation  
   (a) Bargaining Between States and MNEs  
   (b) Sources of Regulatory Standards  
   (c) 'Sites' of Regulation  
      (i) Self-Regulation  
      (ii) Regulation by NGOs  
      (iii) National Regulation  
      (iv) Bilateral Regulation  
      (v) Regional Regulation  
      (vi) Multilateral Regulation  
Concluding Remarks  

II. ECONOMIC REGULATION BY HOME AND HOST COUNTRIES  

4. The Jurisdictional Limits of Regulation Through National or Regional Law  
1. The Legal Bases for the Extraterritorial Regulation of MNEs  
   (a) Nationality  
   (b) Protective Jurisdiction  
   (c) Objective Territorial Jurisdiction
2. Jurisdiction to Prescribe 129
   (a) Nationality Links 131
   (b) The 'Effects' Doctrine 133
   (c) Links of Ownership and Control 139
3. Personal Jurisdiction 140
   (a) Establishing a Sufficient Connection Between the Forum and the Non-Resident Unit of the MNE 140
      (i) Corporate Links Between Resident and Non-Resident Units of the MNE 141
      (ii) Links Based on Other Business Contacts With the Forum Jurisdiction 148
           Presence of Corporate Officers 149
           Presence of Products Manufactured by a Non-Resident Corporation 149
           Supply of Goods and Services Through the Internet 151
   (b) The Doctrine of Forum Non Conveniens as Applied to Non-Resident Units of MNEs 153
4. Jurisdiction to Enforce 160
   (a) The Disclosure of Evidence in Proceedings Involving a MNE 161
      (i) Disclosure of Evidence in US Antitrust Proceedings 162
      (ii) US Disclosure Orders and Foreign Secrecy Laws 166
   (b) The Reduction of Conflicts over Demands for Disclosure of Evidence Located in a Foreign Jurisdiction 169
      (i) Bilateral Cooperation 169
Concluding Remarks 174
5. The Control of Inward Investment by Host States 177
   1. The Scope of Host State Discretion 177
   2. Techniques for Restricting Entry and Establishment 179
      (a) Total Exclusion and Sectoral Exclusion of Foreign Investors 179
          (i) Total Exclusion 179
          (ii) Sectoral Exclusion 180
      (b) Laws Restricting Foreign Shareholdings in National Companies 184
          (i) Indigenization Laws 185
          (ii) Restrictions on Foreign Ownership in Privatized Companies 188
      (c) Laws Regulating Equity Joint Ventures Between Foreign and Local Enterprises 191
      (d) 'Screening' Laws 201
Concluding Remarks 213
6. Measures for the Encouragement of Inward Direct Investment 215
   1. The Encouragement of Inward Direct Investment by Host States 215
      (a) Host States Without Specialized Controls on Inward Direct Investment 216
(b) Investment Incentives 219
(c) Export Processing Zones (EPZs) and Related 'Policy Enclaves' Within the Host State 226
   (i) The Evolution of EPZs 226
   (ii) The Principal Legal and Administrative Features of EPZs in Developing Host States 229
   (iii) The Performance of EPZs 232
   (iv) The Chinese 'Special Economic Zone' Policy 234
2. Bilateral and Regional Measures for the Encouragement of Direct Investment 238
   (a) The North American Free Trade Agreement (NAFTA) 239
   (b) The European Internal Market 242
3. Multilateral Arrangements Dismantling Barriers to Inward Investment 248
   (a) The OECD Codes of Liberalization 248
   (b) Direct Investment and the WTO Agreements 251
      (i) Services 252
      (ii) Trade-Related Intellectual Property Measures (TRIPs) 256
      (iii) Trade-Related Investment Measures (TRIMs) 258
Concluding Remarks 261

7. Taxation Problems Associated With MNEs 263
1. International Double Taxation and MNEs 263
2. Location of Investments and Tax Considerations 267
3. Tax Avoidance and MNEs 269
   (a) The 'Transfer Pricing' Problem 269
      (i) Establishing Transfer Prices in MNE Networks 271
      (ii) Incentives, Disincentives and Empirical Evidence for Transfer Price Manipulations 273
      (iii) The Regulation of Transfer Price Manipulations: Arm's Length and Comparable Profit Methods (CPM) 277
      (iv) Problems Relating to the Administration of Transfer Pricing Controls Using the Arm's Length Standard 288
      (v) Formula Apportionment 294
   (b) The Use of 'Tax Havens' by MNEs 299
Concluding Remarks 306

8. Group Liability and Directors' Duties 307
1. The Regulation of MNE Group Liability Under Existing Legal Principles 308
   (a) Equity Based MNE Groups 308
      (i) Direct Liability of the Parent Company 309
      (ii) Lifting the Corporate Veil 313
   (b) Liability of Transnational Network Enterprises 316
2. New Approaches to MNE Group Liability 317
   (a) The 'Enterprise Entity' Theory and its Limitations 317
   (b) Towards a New Law of MNE Group Liability? 321
3. The Protection of Minority Shareholders in the Subsidiary of a MNE 326
4. Protection of Creditors Upon the Insolvency of the Subsidiary of a MNE 331
Concluding Remarks 335

9. Corporate Governance and Disclosure 337
   1. Principal Motives and Interests Behind Enhanced MNE Accountability and Disclosure 337
   2. Reforming the Internal Governance Structures of MNEs 340
      (a) The Use of Outside or Non-Executive Directors 342
      (b) Enhanced External Regulation of the Auditing Function 349
      (c) European Initiatives for Employee Consultation and Information 354
   3. Disclosure by MNEs in Annual Accounts and Other Statements 359
      (a) Consolidated Financial Statements 361
      (b) Segmental Disclosure 370
      (c) Social Disclosure 375
         (i) Employee Disclosure 377
         (ii) Value-Added Statements 377
         (iii) Environmental Disclosure 378
      (d) Foreign Currency Translation 382
   Concluding Remarks 383

10. Regulation Through Competition Law 385
    1. The Nature and Aims of Competition Regulation 385
    2. The Incidence of Anti-Competitive Conduct on the Part of MNEs and Regulatory Responses 388
       (a) Anti-Competitive Agreements and Concerted Practices 390
          (i) International Cartels 390
          (ii) Vertical International Distribution Systems 392
          (iii) Joint Ventures 394
       (b) 'Abuse of a Dominant Position' or 'Monopolization' 398
       (c) Mergers and Acquisitions 402
    3. International Developments in the Regulation of Restrictive Business Practices 417
   Concluding Remarks 427

11. Technology Transfer 429
    1. 'Technology' and 'Technology Transfer' 429
    2. The Generation and Use of Technology: International Technology Markets 432
III. THE SOCIAL DIMENSION

12. Labour Relations 473

1. The Evolution of the ILO and OECD Codes 474
2. General Policies of the Codes and Their Relationship to National Laws 476
3. Employment Issues 479
   (a) Employment Promotion 479
   (b) Equality of Opportunity and Treatment 481
   (c) Security of Employment 482
4. Training of Workers 486
5. Conditions of Work and Life 487
   (a) Wages, Benefits, and Conditions of Work 487
   (b) Minimum Age 489
   (c) Safety and Health 490
6. Industrial Relations 492
   (a) Freedom of Association and the Right to Organize 492
   (b) Collective Bargaining and Consultation 501
   (c) Examination of Grievances and Settlement of Industrial Disputes 505
Concluding Remarks 506

13. Human Rights and Multinational Enterprises 507

1. Human Rights and the Protection of MNEs 509
2. The Basis of Human Rights Obligations for MNEs 514
3. The Major Substantive Human Rights Obligations of MNEs 518
4. Monitoring and Enforcement 525
   (a) The National Level 526
   (b) The Inter-governmental Level 531
Concluding Remarks 536
14. Environmental Issues 537

1. Core Concepts 537
   (a) Sustainable Development 537
   (b) Environmental Protection 539
      (i) The 'Precautionary' Principle 540
      (ii) The 'Preventive' Principle 540
      (iii) The 'Polluter Pays' Principle 541

2. Environmental Regulation of MNEs 541
   (a) Main Themes and Issues 542
   (b) Informal Regulation 546
      (i) Corporate Self-Regulation 546
      (ii) 'Civil' Regulation 550
   (c) Formal Regulation 556
      (i) National and Regional Regulation 556
      (ii) International Regulation 566

Concluding Remarks 574

IV. INTERNATIONAL REGULATION

15. Control of Investment Risks I: Contractual Stability, Renegotiation, Taking of Property, and Investment Guarantees 577

1. The Restriction of State Sovereignty in the Field of Contractual Relations with Foreign Investors 578
   (a) The 'Internationalization' of International Investment Agreements 579
   (b) Sanctity of Contract and Stabilization Clauses 582

2. Renegotiation of International Investment Agreements 583

3. The Taking of Foreign Corporate Assets 587
   (a) What Constitutes a Taking 587
   (b) The Legality of Takings Under the Law of the Host State 596
   (c) The Legality of Takings at International Law 597
   (d) The Issue of Compensation 601
      (i) The Valuation of Expropriated Property 602
      (ii) The Measure of Compensation 610
      (iii) Settlement of Claims Through Lump Sum Agreements 613

4. Investment Guarantee Schemes 614

Concluding Remarks 620

16. Control of Investment Risks II: Non-Discrimination, Fair and Equitable Treatment, and Full Protection and Security 621

1. National Treatment 621

2. Most Favoured Nation Treatment 628

3. Fair and Equitable Treatment 635
4. Full Protection and Security 648
5. Compensation in Cases Other Than Expropriation 650
Concluding Remarks 651

17. The Codification of International Standards For the Treatment of Foreign Investors 653

1. The Development of International Standards 654
   (a) The Andean Common Market (ANCOM) 656
   (b) The OECD Guidelines on Multinational Enterprises 658
   (c) The Draft UN Code of Conduct on Transnational Corporations 660
   (e) The Failure of Recent Initiatives to Adopt Multilateral Investment Rules 666

2. The Content of International Investment Agreements 674
   (a) Preamble 675
   (b) Provisions Defining the Scope of Application of the Treaty 675
      (i) Subject-Matter Covered 676
      Definition of 'Investments' to Which the IIA Applies 676
      The Admission of Investments 676
      Applicability to Investments Made Prior to the Conclusion of the Treaty 678
      (ii) Covered Persons and Entities 678
      (iii) Territorial Application 681
      (iv) Temporal Application 681
   (c) Standards of Treatment 682
      (i) General Standards of Treatment 682
      Fair and Equitable Treatment 682
      National Treatment 683
      Most Favoured Nation (MFN) Standard 685
      The Observance of Obligations 685
      (ii) Specific Standards of Treatment 689
      Free Transfer of Payments 690
      Compensation for Losses Due to Armed Conflict or Internal Disorder 691
      Compensation for Expropriation 691
      Other Specific Standards 693
   (d) Dispute Settlement Clauses 694
      (i) Disputes Between the Contracting Parties 694
      (ii) Disputes Between the Host State and the Foreign Investor 695

3. The Effect of IIAs in the National Legal Systems of the Parties 698
Concluding Remarks 701
## Contents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>18. The Settlement of International Investment Disputes</strong></td>
<td>703</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. The Limitations of Traditional International Dispute Settlement</td>
<td>704</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mechanisms in MNE/Host State Relations</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Alternatives to Diplomatic Protection: International Dispute</td>
<td>707</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Settlement Mechanisms Involving the MNE and Host State</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(a) Ad Hoc Arbitration and Conciliation</td>
<td>709</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(b) Institutional Systems for International Dispute Settlement</td>
<td>710</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(i) The ICC Court of Arbitration</td>
<td>711</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(ii) NAFTA</td>
<td>712</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(iii) Energy Charter Treaty</td>
<td>713</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(iv) MERCOSUR</td>
<td>714</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(v) ASEAN</td>
<td>715</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. The International Centre for Settlement of Investment Disputes</td>
<td>716</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(a) The AimsofICSID</td>
<td>716</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(b) The ICSID Convention and Its Effect on State Regulation of</td>
<td>719</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Investment Disputes</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(i) The Contracting State's Ability to Control Jurisdiction</td>
<td>719</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(ii) Subject-Matter Jurisdiction</td>
<td>731</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(iii) The Delocalized Character of ICSID Arbitration</td>
<td>734</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(iv) Annulment of Tribunal Awards</td>
<td>740</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(v) Enforcement of ICSID Awards</td>
<td>743</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(vi) Procedure and Costs</td>
<td>743</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Concluding Remarks</strong></td>
<td>745</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Index**                                                                 |
**747**