THE INTERNATIONAL LAW OF BELLIGERENT OCCUPATION

YORAM DINSTEIN



| Pre | face | e Page | xi |
|-----------------------|---|--|--|
| Tal | ble.o | of cases | xiv |
| Tal | ble o | f treaties | xxii |
| Tal | ble d | of UN Resolutions | xxix |
| List | t of | abbreviations | XXX |
| The general framework | | 1 | |
| I. | Bel | lligerent occupation as a natural phenomenon in war | 1 |
| II. | | | 2 |
| III. | The | e strata of the international law of belligerent occupation | 4 |
| | A. | Customary international law | 4 |
| | B. | The Hague Regulations | 4 |
| | C. | Geneva Convention (IV) | 6 |
| | D. | Additional Protocol I | 7 |
| IV. | Αł | orief historical outline | 8 |
| | A. | The past | 8 |
| | B. | The last decades | 10 |
| V | The | e case of Israel | 12 |
| | А. | The Sinai Peninsula and the Gaza Strip | 13 |
| | B. | The West Bank .' ' | 15 |
| | C. | The'Oslo Process'Accords | 16 |
| | D. | East Jerusalem | 18 |
| | E. | The Golan Heights | 19 |
| | F. | The general applicability of Geneva Convention (IV) | 20 |
| | G. | Judicial review by the Supreme Court sitting as a High | |
| | | Court of Justice | 25 |
| | H. | The domestic applicability of Geneva Convention (IV) | 28 |
| | Tal Tal Tal List The I. II. III. | Table.o. Table of Table of List of The ge I. Bel II. Bel III. Tho A. B. C. D. IV. A B. A. B. V Tho A. B. V Tho A. B. C. D. IV. A B. C. D. E. F. G. | Table.ofcasesTable of treatiesTable of UN ResolutionsList of abbreviationsList of abbreviationsThe general frameworkI. Belligerent occupation as a natural phenomenon in warII. Belligerent occupation and the legality ol warIII. The strata of the international law of belligerent occupationA. Customary international lawB. The Hague RegulationsC. Geneva Convention (IV)D. Additional Protocol IIV. A brief historical outlineA. The pastB. The last decadesV The case of IsraelA. The Sinai Peninsula and the Gaza StripB. The West BankC. The'Oslo Process'AccordsD. East JerusalemE. The Golan HeightsF. The general applicability of Geneva Convention (IV)G. Judicial review by the Supreme Court sitting as a High Court of Justice |

| 2. ' | The | legal nature and basic principles of belligerent | |
|------|------|--|----------|
| | | cupation | 31 |
| | I. | * | |
| | | regime | 31 |
| | | A. Belligerent occupation and inter-State armed conflicts | 31 |
| | | (a) The linkage of belligerent occupation to war | 31 |
| | | (b) Occupation following unconditional surrender | 32 |
| | | (c) Non-international armed conflicts | 33 |
| | | B. The non-consensual nature of belligerent occupation | 35 |
| | | (a) Coercion as the key to belligerent occupation | 35 |
| | | (b) Occupation based on agreement following war | 36 |
| | | (c) Consensual occupation of Allied territory during war | 37 |
| | | (d) Occupation by UN forces | 37 |
| | | C. The distinction between belligerent occupation and | |
| | | invasion " | 38 |
| | | D. The indispensability of effective control | 42 |
| | | E. Some ancillary comments | 46 |
| | | (a) lurisdictional rights | 46 |
| | | (b) Outlying land areas | 46 |
| | | (c) Maritime areas and air space | 47 |
| | | (d) Proclamation | 48 |
| | | (e) Several Occupying Powers | 48 |
| | II. | Sovereignly and belligerent occupation | 49 |
| | | A. Sovereignty and non-annexation | 49 |
| | | B. Transfer of title over an occupied territory | 51 |
| | | C. Nationality and allegiance | 52 |
| | III. | | 55 |
| | | A. The administration of an occupied territory | 55 |
| | | B. The overall responsibility of the Occupying Power | 57 |
| | | C. Self-government | 57 59 |
| | w | D. The employment of local officialsProtected persons in occupied territories | 59 60 |
| | 1. | A. The scope of protection | 60 |
| | | B. The treatment of saboteurs | 63 |
| | v | . Protecting Powers | 64 |
| | | A. The theory | 64 |
| | | B. The practice | 66 |
| 2 | TT | - | 67 |
| 3. | | uman rights and belligerent occupation | 67 |
| | I. | | 67 |
| | II. | The application of human rights law in occupied territories | 69 |

| III. | Derogations from obligations to respect human rights | 71 |
|----------|--|-----|
| | A. Derogations and war | 71 |
| | B. Procedural and substantive requirements | 73 |
| | Non-derogable human rights | 74 |
| V. | Built-in limitations of human rights | 77 |
| | A. Explicit limitations | 77 |
| | B. Implicit limitations | 78 |
| | Balance between competing human rights | 80 |
| VII. | The interaction between the law of belligerent occupation and | |
| | the law of human rights | 81 |
| | A. Convergence and divergence | 81 |
| | B. The advantages of the law of belligerent occupation | 82 |
| | C. The advantages of human rights law | 84 |
| | D. The <i>lex specialis</i> rule | 85 |
| 4. The 1 | naintenance of law and order in occupied | |
| | itories | 89 |
| I. | Hague Regulation 43 | 89 |
| | The structure and scope of Regulation 43 | 90 |
| | Restoring and ensuring public order and life under | 20 |
| | Regulation 43 | 91 |
| IV | Individual resistance to occupation | 94 |
| 11. | A. Saboteurs and prisoners of war | 94 |
| | B. Levee en Masse | 96 |
| v | Riot control | 98 |
| | Hostilities in occupied territories | 99 |
| V 1. | A. The duality of hostilities and occupation | 99 |
| | B. Direct participation in hostilities | 101 |
| | C. 'Human shields' | 101 |
| 5. Les | gislation by the Occupying Power | 108 |
| | The meaning of the phrase'les lois en vigueur' | 108 |
| | The meaning of the phrase 'empechement absolu' | 108 |
| | Article 64 of Geneva Convention (IV) | 109 |
| | The specific categories of necessity . | 110 |
| 1V. | A. Security legislation | |
| | B. 'Repeal of legislation inconsistent with Geneva | 112 |
| | Convention (IV) | 113 |
| | C. Legislation geared to the needs of the civilian population | 115 |
| | D. Other legislation | 115 |
| V | Prolonged occupation | 110 |
| v | . i roiongeu occupation | 110 |

| | VI. The litmus test | 120 |
|----|---|-------|
| | VII. Institutional changes | 123 |
| | VIII. Taxation | . 125 |
| | IX. Limitations of the legislative power | 128 |
| | X. Settlers | / 130 |
| 6. | The judicial system in occupied territories | 132 |
| | I. The double-tiered system of courts | 132 |
| | A. Local courts | 132 |
| | B. Military courts | 136 |
| | C. Concurrent jurisdiction | 139 |
| | II. The right to a fair trial | 141 |
| | III. Capital punishment | 143 |
| 7. | Protection of the civilian population under belligerent | |
| | occupation | 146 |
| | I. Freedom from genocide and the right to life | 146 |
| | A. The prohibition ofigenocide | 146 |
| | B. The individual right to life | 148 |
| | II. Ensuring the survival of the civilian population | 148 |
| | III. Respect for the rights of protected persons | 151 |
| | IV. The prohibition of hostage-taking | 151 |
| | V. Collective penalties and reprisals | 154 |
| | A. Collective penalties | 154 |
| | B. Demolition or sealing off of houses | 156 |
| | C. Reprisals | 159 |
| | VI. Deportations and transfer | 160 |
| | A. Voluntary departure, deportation and relocation | 160 |
| | B. The Israeli practice | 162 |
| | C. Individual versus mass deportations | 164 |
| | D. 'Exclusion'versus deportation | 166 |
| | E. The State of nationality versus other countries | 168 |
| | F. Occupying versus occupied territory | 169 |
| | VII. Evacuation | 171 |
| | VIII. Internment (administrative detention) | 172 |
| | IX. Assigned residence | 176 |
| | X. Compulsory work | 178 |
| 8. | Special protection in occupied territories | 180 |
| | I. Refugees | 180 |
| | II. Women and children | 183 |
| | A. Women | 183 |
| | B. Children | 183 |

| CONTENTS |
|----------|
| CONTENTS |

| | III. | Medical services | 187 |
|-----|---|---|-----|
| | IV. | Civil defence | 190 |
| | V. | Humanitarian relief | 191 |
| | | A. Relief consignments | 191 |
| | | B. Relief personnel | 193 |
| 9. | Destruction and pillage of property in occupied | | |
| | terr | itories | 195 |
| | I. | Destruction of property | 195 |
| | | A. The general prohibition | 195 |
| | | B. Special protection | 199 |
| | | C. Demolition of a house as a sanction | 202 |
| | II. | Pillage | 207 |
| 10. | Sei | zure and use of property in occupied territories | 210 |
| | 1. | General observations | 210 |
| | | A. The prohibition of spoliation | 210 |
| | | B. The distinction between public and private | |
| | | property | 211 |
| | | C. The temporal problem | 212 |
| | II. | Public property | 213 |
| | | A. Immovable property | 213 |
| | | B. Movable property | 218 |
| | | C. Extraordinary property | 220 |
| | | (a) Property of municipalities | 220 |
| | | (b) Cultural property | 220 |
| | | (c) Medical properly | 221 |
| | | (d) Civil defence <i>materiel</i> | 223 |
| | | (e) Submarine cables | 224 |
| | III. | Private property . ' | 224 |
| | | A. Immovable property | 226 |
| | | -B. Movable property • | 227 |
| | | (a) Ordinary property | 227 |
| | | (b) <i>Munitions de guerre</i> and related items | 232 |
| | IV. | The right of angary | 236 |
| 11. | Ot | her major issues relating to belligerent occupation | 238 |
| | I. | Settlements | 238 |
| | | A. Geneva Convention (IV) | 238 |
| | | B. The Israeli settlements | 240 |
| | | C. The Judgments of the Supreme Court of Israel | 242 |

IX

| II. | The security barrier | 247 |
|-----------|---|-------|
| | A. The setting | 247 |
| | B. The <i>Beit Sourik</i> case | . 248 |
| | C. The Advisory Opinion of the International Court of Justice | 250 |
| | D. The Alfei Menashe case | 255 |
| III. | Reunion of families | 259 |
| IV. | Political activities and elections | 264 |
| V. | Freedom of the press | 265 |
| VI. | Freedom of religion | 267 |
| VII. | Human dignity | 268 |
| 12. The t | termination of belligerent occupation | 270 |
| I. | The complete end of belligerent occupation | 270 |
| | A. Treaty of peace | 270 |
| | B. Prescription | 271 |
| | C. Withdrawal from an occupied territory | 272 |
| | D. Binding decision by the UN Security Council | 273 |
| II. | Partial end of belligerent occupation | 274 |
| | A. Agreement between the parties | 274 |
| | B. The tide of hostilities | 276 |
| | C. Unilateral decision of the Occupying Power | 276 |
| III. | Post-hostilities belligerent occupation | 280 |
| IV. | The consequences of the termination of occupation | 283 |
| Cor | nclusion | 286 |
| Inde | ex of persons | 288 |
| | ex of subjects • | 293 |