

WORLD BANK LATIN AMERICAN
AND CARIBBEAN STUDIES

INEQUALITY IN LATIN AMERICA

Breaking with History?

David de Ferranti

Guillermo E. Perry

Francisco H. G. Ferreira

Michael Walton



THE WORLD BANK
Washington, D.C.

Contents

Acknowledgments	xi
Summary	1
Chapter 1: Introduction: Motivation and Conceptual Framework	17
1.1 A conceptual framework	18
1.2 The consequences of high inequality	24
Part I: The Nature of Inequality in Latin America	33
Chapter 2: Different Lives: Inequality in Latin America	35
2.1 Some conceptual issues	35
2.2 Income inequality and beyond	37
2.3 Measurement-related issues and data limitations	48
2.4 Inequality in Latin America in perspective	53
2.5 Looking inside household income	57
2.6 Inequality beyond income	66
2.7 Conclusions	71
Chapter 3: Group-Based Inequalities: The Roles of Race, Ethnicity, and Gender	77
3.1 Who are the people of Latin America?	78
3.2 Inequality among individuals during the lifecycle	84
3.3 Would income inequality decline if returns to human capital were more equal?	96
3.4 Conclusions	104
Part II: The Determinants of Inequality in Latin America	107
Chapter 4: Historical Roots of Inequality in Latin America	109
4.1 Factor endowments, inequality, and institutions	109
4.2 The persistence of inequality: The colonial period	112
4.3 The persistence of inequality: Post-independence	112
4.4 The 20 th century	120
4.5 The 21 st century and beyond	122
Chapter 5: State-Society Interactions as Sources of Persistence and Change in Inequality	123
5.1 Political and social structures as forces for the reproduction of inequality	125
5.2 The potential for equalizing political and social change	134
5.3 Conclusions	145
Chapter 6: Economic Mechanisms for the Persistence of High Inequality in Latin America	149
6.1 Asset distributions: Education and land	151
6.2 Job match quality	157
6.3 Remuneration in the labor markets	161
6.4 Household formation	165
6.5 Conclusions	173

Part III: Policies for Lower Inequality.	175
Chapter 7: Policies on Assets and Services.	177
7.1 Education	177
7.2 Property rights, land, and housing.	189
7.3 Infrastructure services and the distributional impact of privatization.	204
7.4 Conclusions.	215
Chapter 8: Policies on Markets and Institutions.	217
8.1 Markets and inequality.	217
8.2 Labor market policies and inequality.	224
8.3 Inequality and macroeconomic crises.	227
8.4 Conclusions.	243
Chapter 9: Taxation, Public Expenditures, and Transfers.	247
9.1 Taxes and distribution	248
9.2 Public social spending and distribution.	257
9.3 Cash transfers and distribution.	268
9.4 Conclusions.	280
Statistical Appendix.	285
Bibliography.	351

Boxes

Chapter 1	
1.1 Measuring inequality of opportunities in Brazil.	20
Chapter 2	
2.1 Social class.	46
2.2 Mobility in Latin America: What little is known?.	51
• 2.3 Some simple decompositions.	63
2.4 Social capital and trust.	66
2.5 Disability and distribution.	70
Chapter 3	
3.1 Distribution of the population of the Americas: An historical evolution.	79
3.2 <i>Todos Contamos</i> : National census and social inclusion.	80
3.3 The challenge of racial, ethnic, and gender identification and measurement.	82
3.4 What if we do hold "all else constant?".	85
3.5 Women's other job: Housework.	90
3.6 Oaxaca-Blinder decomposition methodology.	94
3.7 Econometric methodology.	98
Chapter 5	
5.1 Racial inequality and social spending: Evidence from the United States and Europe.	128
5.2 Clientelism and the underprovision of public services in the Dominican Republic.	131
5.3 Are there political and social reasons for the contrast between Latin America and East Asia?.	133
5.4 Political agency and the potential for redistributive strategy in rich countries: Lessons from the OECD.	135
5.5 Increased equity through taxation and social spending in a democratic Chile.	136
5.6 Failed redistributive efforts in a fragmented democracy: Social security reforms in Brazil.	138
5.7 Neopopulism and policies on social funds in Peru.	139
5.8 Transition at the sectoral level? Mexico's targeted antipoverty programs.	141
5.9 Popular budgeting in Porto Alegre: Explaining a transition to a new political equilibrium.	142
5.10 Local contexts and the transition from clientelism: Ibaguè versus Pasto.	144
Chapter 6	
6.1 Schematic representation of household income determination.	150

Chapter 7

- 7.1 Business elites and the fear of education: Is there a low-road trap? Evidence from northeastern Brazil and the southern United States. 186
- 7.2 Bilingual education: Preserving cultural heritage without being left behind. 188
- 7.3 The poverty reduction potential of land in rural Mexico. 193

Chapter 8

- 8.1 Alternative views on the potential impact of market-oriented reforms and inequality. 219
- 8.2 The evolution of small-scale firms in the "Third Italy". 225
- 8.3 Unions, firms, and the expansion of high-value export crops in Petrolina-Juazeiro in northeastern Brazil. 228
- 8.4 Institutions, macroeconomic policy, and volatility. 230

Chapter 9

- 9-1 Do tax incidence numbers mean much?. 253
- 9-2 Issues in the valuation of public services. 260
- 9-3 Summarizing benefit incidence using Gini income elasticities (GIE). 265

Figures**Summary**

1. Difference in average years of education between top and bottom quintiles for people 31⁺ and 51-60, in 2000 . . . 3
2. Trends in income inequality in Latin America between the early 1990s and early 2000s. 4
3. The elasticity of poverty reduction with respect to growth for different levels of inequality. 4
4. Wages of various groups in relation to the wages of white males. 5
5. Marital sorting and income inequality. 6
6. Distribution of mathematics and reading test scores for 15-year-olds in Brazil, Mexico, and OECD countries. 8
7. Tax revenue in relation to GDP per capita. 12
8. Average and marginal incidence of access to various health services. 13
9. Targeting to the poor and reach among the poor for different types of programs in Brazil. 14

Chapter 1

- (Box 1.1) Inequality of opportunities as a share of total inequality, 1996. 20
- 1.1 A simple conceptual framework. 22
 - 1.2 Perceptions of fairness regarding the income distribution in Latin America. 25
 - 1.3 Inequality and poverty with a constant mean. 26
 - 1.4 Growth elasticities become less negative with inequality. 26

Chapter 2

- 2.1 Income shares by deciles (household per capita income). 39
- 2.2 Household per capita income distribution, excluding the richest 1 percent, Mexico, 2000. 40
- 2.3 Equivalized household income. 41
- 2.4 Indices of aggregate welfare for Argentina under alternative assumptions of a society's aversion to inequality 47
- 2.5 Brazil's consumption inequality in international perspective. 49
- 2.6 Distribution of household per capita income, per region, 1990s. 54
- 2.7 Difference in average years of education between top and bottom quintiles, per country. 58
- 2.8 Hourly wage gap between skilled and unskilled workers, men aged 25 to 55. 60
- 2.9 Hourly wage gap between semi-skilled and unskilled workers, men aged 25 to 55. 61
- 2.10 Increase in hourly wages for college-educated workers, men aged 25 to 55. 61
- 2.11 Labor market outcomes by gender. 62
- 2.12 Ratio of number of children under age 12 years of age per household between bottom and top quintiles. 65
- 2.13 School enrollment rates by age and country 68
- 2.14 Gaps in access to services, by country. 72

Chapter 3

- (Box 3.1) The changing ethnic composition of the Americas. 79
- 3.1 Completed primary education or less, by race, ethnicity, and gender. 86
 - 3-2 Proportion of workers in service or managerial, occupations, by group and country. 89
 - 3.3 Wage gaps by race/ethnicity and gender. 92

3.4 Urban gender wage gap—ratio of women's hourly wages to men's hourly wages.	93
(Box 3.7) a. Nonindigenous male vs. American Indian male (simulating earnings regression coefficients).	99
(Box 3.7) b. Nonindigenous male vs. American Indian male (simulating only education).	100
(Box 3.7) c. Nonindigenous male vs. American Indian male (simulating both a and b).	100
3.5 Actual and simulated earnings distributions for white and indigenous men in Bolivia	102
3.6 Actual and simulated earnings distributions for Indo-Guyanese men and women.	103

Chapter 5

5.1 The syndrome of weak and unequal states: correlations between the rule of law and development outcomes	124
5.2 Political financing and its impact, by type.	128
5.3 Impact of bribes in shaping policy, according to a survey of firms by a recipient group, Peru, 2001.	129
5.4 The rise and fall of the labor share in Argentina	132

Chapter 6

6.1 Income and education inequalities across countries.	152
6.2 Lorenz curves of years of schooling, selected countries.	153
6.3 Difference in mean incomes per hundredth of the mean-normalized distribution: U.S.—Brazil and U.S.—Brazil (with U.S. conditional distribution of education).	156
6.4 Income and land inequalities across countries.	157
6.5 Labor force participation and inequality across countries.	158
6.6 Unemployment and inequality across countries.	159
6.7 Informality and inequality across countries.	160
6.8 Returns on schooling and inequality across countries.	162
6.9 Distribution of and returns on education explain some of the differences between income distributions.	163
6.10 Marital sorting and inequality across countries.	165
6.11 Youth dependency and inequality across countries.	166
6.12 Old-age dependency and inequality across countries.	167
6.13 The role of reproductive behavior in accounting for differences in income distribution between Brazil and the United States.	168
6.14 Total public spending and income inequality.	168
6.15 Public expenditure on primary education and income inequality.	169
6.16 Public income transfers to households and income inequality.	169
6.17 U.S.-Brazil differences, actual and simulated including nonlabor incomes and reweighting	170
6.18 Retirement income as a share of total household income, Brazil and the United States.	171
6.19 Nonlabor incomes account, for some of the differences between Italian and Chilean income distributions.	172

Chapter 7

7.1 The long chain of interactions from unequal schooling to more equal outcomes.	178
7.2 Education dynamics in selected countries; years of schooling of men and women by age group.	179
7.3 Years of schooling by cohort for blacks and whites in Brazil and South Africa	181
7.4 Spending by education level in Chile, Mexico, and Brazil	185
7.5 Polarization and property rights across countries.	190
(Box 7.3) The marginal welfare impact of increased land.	193
(Box 7.3) a. The welfare impact of land assets and interactions with education.	194
(Box 7.3) b. The welfare impact of land assets and interactions with indigeneity.	194
(Box 7.3) c. The welfare impact of land assets and interactions with road access.	194
7.6 Land inequality and growth, 1970—99.	195
7.7 Property taxation as a share of GDP in Latin America and other countries.	203
7.8 Public and private investment in selected infrastructure sectors in Latin America, 1980—98.	208
7.9 Increases in access to infrastructure, by income decile in Argentina and Nicaragua	209
7.10 Views on privatization in Latin America at different points in time.	210

Chapter 8

8.1 The extent of policy reforms in Latin America, with country and policy variations.	218
8.2 Correlation between changes in reform and changes in income inequality.	220
8.3 Crony bias versus democratic voice and accountability.	223
8.4 Tax compliance versus crony bias.	224
8.5 Labor market rigidity and informality.	227

8.6	The association between macroeconomic volatility and measures of institutional conditions	229
8.7	The evolution of the labor share in Chile, Mexico, and Peru	235
8.8	Cumulative percentage change in time deposits (by residence and size) in Argentina	238
8.9	The evolution of foreign asset holdings in Argentina	238
Chapter 9		
9.1	Highest personal and enterprise income tax rates in Latin America	250
9.2	Value-added tax rate (in Latin America)	251
9.3	Unweighted average of tax revenue and taxes per category in Latin America	252
9.4	A simple cross-country regression of total tax revenues against log GDP per capita	253
9.5	The relationship between personal income taxes and income	257
9.6	Public social spending in Latin America: expenditures per capita, as share of public spending and GDP, 1990s	258
9.7	Average and marginal access incidence for various health services	262
9.8	Average and marginal benefit incidence for access to water in Latin America	262
9.9	Concentration coefficients for public social spending, Mexico 2000	264
9.10	Targeting, coverage of the poor, and spending on various programs, Brazil 1997	266
9.11	Ratio of income of the 1st to 5th income quintiles, with and without public transfers, Chile, 1990—1998	267
9.12	Total social security expenditure	270
Tables		
Summary		
1.	Indicators of inequality for selected Latin American countries, the United States, and Italy	2
Chapter 1		
1.1	Theoretical elasticities of poverty with respect to aggregate income growth	27
Chapter 2		
2.1	Gini coefficients of the distribution of household per capita income: Common sample countries, decadal averages by region	55
2.2	Distribution of household per capita income, 1992 (income shares by deciles and vintiles)	56
2.3	Distribution of household per capita income, 1990s (quintiles)	57
Chapter 3		
3.1	Distribution of Afro-descended, indigenous, and female populations in the Americas and the Caribbean, various years (percent)	78
3.2	Interviewer perception versus self-perception of race—Brazil, 1997 (percent)	83
33	Interviewer versus self-perception of ethnicity—Peru, 2000 (percent)	83
(Box 3-4)	Labor market outcomes for different groups	85
3.4	Ratio of female to male educational attainment and literacy	86
3.5	Difference in the probability of being in each sector, by race and by gender (percent)	87
3.6	Share of sector that is female (percent)	88
37	Occupational distribution, by gender	88
(Box 3.5)	Average weekly hours spent on housework, by household member	90
3-8	Asset ownership, by race, ethnicity, and gender (percent)	91
3-9	Access to services by race, ethnicity, and gender (percent)	91
310	Decompositions of group mean log wage differentials	94
3.11	Within-group inequality share (for distributions of labor income)	95
3.12	Theil index decompositions (for hourly wages)	96
313	Individual earnings and inequality measures, based on actual and simulated earnings within racial and gender groups	97
Chapter 4		
4.1	The distribution and composition of the population in New World economies (percent)	111
4.2	Laws governing the franchise and the extent of voting in selected countries, 1840-1940	114
4.3	Literacy rates in the Americas, 1850-1950	116
4.4	Land ownership rates in rural regions of Mexico, the United States, Canada, and Argentina in the early 1900s (percent)	119

Chapter 6

- 6.1 Variation in student performance in PISA 2000 examinations 155
 6.2 Wage, work, and self-employment in selected countries, 1995. 161

Chapter 7

- 7.1 Years of education by income quintile for Brazil and Jamaica, men and women aged 21–30__180
 7.2 Mathematics test results for Brazilian students who identify themselves as black or of mixed blood, compared with white. 182
 7.3 Schools account for only a small part of variance in student learning outcomes__183
 7.4 Gini coefficients for the distribution of operational holdings of agricultural land across regions__191
 7.5 Gini coefficients for the distribution of operational holdings of agricultural land in Latin American countries. 191
 7.6 Selected land reforms in Latin America in the 20th century. 195
 7.7 Distribution of housing wealth Brazil, Chile, and Peru. 201
 7.8 Access to selected services for top and bottom quintiles, selected countries (percent). 204
 7.9 Enterprise profitability land access to infrastructure in Guatemala (net income of owner in quetzales per-worker hour). 205
 7.10 Price changes after privatization. 211

Chapter 8

- 8.1 Effects of policy reforms on inequality: Estimates from three studies. 221
 8.2 Changes in real per capita income across the income distribution in Mexico, 1992-2000. 232
 8.3 Financial income during the 1994–96 crisis in Mexico. 233
 8.4 Total fiscal costs of selected banking crises. 236

Chapter 9

- 9-1 Income inequality before and after taxes and transfers in selected industrialized countries. 248
 9-2 Typology of Latin American countries by fiscal position and social spending, 1998__248
 9-3 Tax structure in the 1990s, Latin America and developed countries (in percent of GDP, consolidated central government). 252
 9.4 Tax incidence studies for Latin American countries, 1975–98. 255
 9.5 Increase in social spending with and without social security, ECLAC and IMF databases. 259
 9-6 Synthesis of case studies using estimates of the Gini income elasticity (GIE). 264
 9-7 Social security expenditures around the world, as percentage of GDP. 269
 9.8 Social security expenditures in Latin America and the Caribbean, as percentage of GDP__271
 9.9 Distribution of government expenditures on pensions and unemployment insurance in Brazil by quintile (percent). 271
 9.10 Conditional cash transfers: comparison of program sizes. 273
 9-11 Benefit structure of Progresa, July–December 1999 (pesos/month). 275
 9-12 Cumulative distribution of beneficiaries across national consumption deciles, in percent 277