From Centrally Planned To Market Economies: The Asian Approach

Vblume 1 An Overview

Edited by Pradumna B. Rana and Naved Hamid

Published for the Asian Development Bank by Oxford University Press

> C HONG KONG OXFORD UNIVERSITY PRESS OXFORD NEW YORK 1995

CONTENTS

List of Tables	IX
List of Figures	xi
Foreword	xiii
Acronyms and Abbreviations	XV
Chapter 1	
Introduction: The Asian Approach to Reforming	
Transitional Economies	
By Pradumna B. Rana	
Background i '	1
Comparative Economic Performance: TEAs	
vs. Eastern Europe	2
Initial Conditions and External	
Circumstances	8
Rural-Based vs. Heavy Industry-Based	8
Political and Economic Reforms	9
Size of State Sector	10
External Relations	10
Differences Among the TEAs	11
Sequencing of Policy Reforms	13
The "Standard" Approach	14
The Chinese Experience	15
Approach of the Other TEAs	16
Design of Policy Reforms	18
Enterprise Reform	18
Trade Reform	24
Conclusions	24
Lessons from the TEAs	24
Agenda for Reform	26
Chapter 2	
Taxation, Money, and Credit in the Transition	
from Central Planning	
By Ronald I. McKinnon	
Background	35
TEAs and Eastern Europe: Basic Differences	36
Financial Control Under Classical Socialism	40

40

Fiscal System	' 40
Monetary System	43
Breakdown of Financial Control in	
the Transition	44
Creation of an Effective Tax System	50
Establishment of an Internal Revenue Service	50
Procurement Prices and the Taxation	
of Agricultural Land	53
Personal Income Taxation and the VAT	55
Financial Impact of Enterprise Reforms	58
Coordination of Reforms	60
Different Regimes for Different Enterprises	60
Hardening of the Money and Credit System	63
Stages of Transition	66
Self-Finance: Pros and Cons	68
Effective Commercial Banking	69

Chapter 3

Financial Growth and Macroeconomic Stability in the People's Republic of China, 1978-1992: Implications for Russia and Eastern Europe

By Ronald I. McKinnon	
Introduction	73
Gradual Versus Rapid Liberalization	75
Different Circumstances, Different Approaches	79
The Chinese Puzzle: Price Stability and	
Fiscal Decline	80
Self-Finance and Hard Budget	
Constraints for Chinese Farmers	85
The Importance of Positive Real	
Interest Rates	86
The Role of Price Controls in the	
State Sector	90
Tax Reform and Financial Liberalization	94
The Russian Approach	96
Arguments for the "Big Bang"	96
Unconstrained Bidding by State Enterprises	100
Price Controls on State Enterprises	103
Choice of the Best Disinflation Model	105

Cha	pter	4

Gradual Versus Rapid Liberalization in Socialist Foreign Trade

By Ronald I. McKinnon	
Introduction	107
The Chilean Model of Rapid Trade Liberalization	108
The Chinese Model of Gradual Liberalization	110
Central-Planning and Commodity	
Inconvertibility	110
The Challenge of Reform	112
Chinese Trade Liberalization at the Margin	113
Learning from the Chinese and Chilean Experiences	116

Chapter 5

Agricultural Reform

By Naved Hamid	
Introduction .	119
Importance of Agrarian Reforms	120
Phases of Reform	122
Agrarian Reform in the TEAs	124
Reforms in the People's Republic of China	124
Reforms in Viet Nam	131
Reforms in Lao PDR	135
Reforms in Mongolia	136
Reforms in Myanmar	137
Lessons and Future Directions	139
Chapter 6	
Industrial Enterprise Reform in the	
Transitional Economies of Asia	
By Pradumna B. Rana	
Introduction	143
The Role of State Enterprises in the TEAs	145
State Enterprise Reform in the TEAs	148
Advent of Reform in the TEAs	148
Reforms in the People's Republic of China	149
Reforms in Viet Nam	151
Reforms in Mongolia	152
Reforms in Lao PDR	153

Reforms in Myanmar	/156
Promotion of Nonstate Enterprises	157
Nonstate Enterprises in the PRC	158
Nonstate Enterprises in Viet Nam	159
Nonstate Enterprises in Lao PDR	161
Nonstate Enterprises in Mongolia	165
Nonstate Enterprises in Myanmar	166
Privatization of State Enterprises	167
Privatization in Mongolia	167
Privatization in Lao PDR	169
Lessons and Conclusions	171
Design and Sequencing of Reforms	171
Lessons for the Future	172
Chapter 7	
Financial Reforms in the Transitional	
Economies of Asia	
By Brian van Arkadie	
Introduction	177
Enterprise Viability and Macroeconomic	
Stability	178
Reform of the Fiscal System	179
Tax Reform •	179
Reform of Tax Administration	185
Control of Government Expenditure	186
Reform of the Financial System	189
Changing Role of the Banking System	189
Development of Commercial Banks	191
First Steps in Monetary Reform	197
Foreign Trade Reforms	201
Reform of the Trading System	203
Exchange Rate Adjustment	210
Appendix •	217
References '	223
Author Index	231
Subject Index	233

From Centrally Planned To Market Economies: The Asian Approach

Volume 2 People's Republic of China and Mongolia

> Edited by Pradumna B. Rana and Naved Hamid

Published for the Asian Development Bank by Oxford University Press

0

HONG KONG OXFORD UNIVERSITY PRESS OXFORD NEW YORK

CONTENTS

List of Tables	xiv
List of Figures	xxi
Foreword	xxiii
Acronyms and Abbreviations	XXV

Part One PEOPLE'S REPUBLIC OF CHINA by Christine P.W. Wong

Chapter 1 , ,' •	
Introduction and Overview	
Background	3
Land and People	3
National Income	5
Reform with Growth	7
The Reform Program: An Overview	10
Phases of Reform	11
Local Government Role	13
This Study	14
Chapter 2	
The Pre-Reform Economy	
Ownership Sectors .	15
State Sector	15
Collective Sector	17
Private Sector	19
The Central Planning System	20
Material Allocation System	20
State Budget	21
Banking	23
Price System	24
Foreign Trade	25
Agriculture	25

Chapter 3 Assessing the Maoist Economy

Major Achievements	27
Economic Indicators	27
Social Indicators	29
Economic Organization	31
Major Deficiencies	31
Agriculture Sector	33
Industry Sector	34
Loss of Economic Control	36
Prelude to Reform (1977-1978)	37
Hua's Ten-Year Plan	38

Chapter 4

Rural Sector Reform

Pre-Reform Organization of Agricultural Production	41
Collective Farms	41
State Farms	44
Early Reforms (1978-1984)	45
Quota and Price Reform	45
Marketing Reform	50
Household Responsibility System	50
Second Phase (1985-1988)	51
Declining Terms of Trade	51
Diversion of Resources	53
Summary: Mixed Results	55

Chapter 5

The External Sector	
The Pre-Reform Trade System	57
The Reform Process	60
First Phase (1979-1984)	60
Second Phase (1984-1987)	61
Third Phase (1988-present)	61
The Foreign Trade Plan	62
Anti-Export Bias	62
Licensing	63
Duties, Tariffs, and Subsidies	64
Import Duties and Export Tariffs	64

Export Subsidies	>	65
Import Subsidies		67
Composition of Trade		67
Foreign Exchange Management		70
Exchange Rate System		71
Foreign Exchange Retention for Exporters		72
Swap Markets		74
Balance of Payments		76

Chapter 6 Price Refo

rice Kelorm	
The Pre-Reform Price System	81
The Reform Process	83
First Phase (1979-1984)	84
Second Phase (1985-1988)	87
Third Phase (1989-1990)	89
The Situation in the Early 1990s	90
Return to Reform	91
Official Versus Market Prices	92
Price Structure	93
Role of Local Governments	• 94
Price Subsidies	95
Housing Subsidies	101
Composition of Subsidies	104

Chapter 7

The Fiscal System	
Background	111
Contribution of Industry	111
Growing Revenues	113
Underlying Problems	114
Budgetary Data	114
Fiscal System in the Reform Period	115
Enterprise Taxation	118
Income Tax on State Enterprises	120
Income Tax on Collective Enterprises	123
Income Tax on Private Enterprises	124
Income Tax on Joint Ventures	125
Income Tax on Foreign Enterprises	126

Other Taxes Personal Income Tax	,126 126
Agricultural Tax	120
Industrial-Commercial Tax	120
Consolidated Industrial and Commercial	12)
Tax (CICT)	132
Minor Taxes	133
Overall Budgetary Trends	134
Expenditure Cuts	135
Rising Deficits	135
Extrabudgetary Revenues and	
Expenditures , •	138
Steps to Achieve Balance	142
Central-Local Fiscal Relations	143
Fiscal Contracting	143
Central-Local Budget Trends	144
Local Distortions	146
Chapter 8	
The Financial System	
Institutional Structure	149
People's Bank of China	150
Specialized Banks	150
Credit Cooperatives	155
Nonstate Banks and Nonbank Financial	
Institutions	156
Financial System Operations	157
Monetary Circuits	157
Controlling Bank Credit Flows	158
"Bad" or Nonrepayable Loans	159
Other Losses of State Banks	161
Capital Markets	163
Government Bonds	163
Public Enterprise Bonds	166
Enterprise Securities	166
Other Bonds	168
Interbank Money Markets	168
Rural Finance	169
Agricultural Bank of China	169

Rural Credit Cooperatives	,172
Informal Finance	174
Banking and Monetary Reforms	175
Overall Impact	176
Structural Reforms	177
Interest Rates	177
Allocative Control	178
Capacity for Improvement	180
Chapter 9	
Public Enterprise Reform	
The Role of Public Enterprises	181
Growing Numbers	181
Major Functions ' • ,	183
Forms of State Ownership	186
Administrative Levels	186
Ownership Versus Control	190
The Reform Process	191
Expansion of Enterprise Rights	192
Enterprise Management Contracts	193
Increased Market Orientation	194
Impact on Enterprise Performance .	195
Impact on Labor	197
Assessment of the Reforms	198
Productivity Gains	200
Declining Profit Rates	202
Rising Personnel Costs .	203
Long-Term Prospects for SOEs	207
Declining Profitability	208
Increased Investment .	208
Expropriation of SOE Funds	211
Hardening of the Budget Constraint	211
Ownership Conversion •	213
Management of the Transition	214
Chapter 10	
Nonstate Enterprise Reform	
Introduction	215
Size Distribution of Chinese Industry	215

Contents

Taxono	my of Nonstate Enterprises	/ 221
	Jrban Collectives	221
R	Rural Collectives	224
Iı	ndividual-Owned Enterprises	225
C	Other Enterprises	225
Rural E	Enterprises	226
Private	Enterprises	233
S	ize Distribution	235
S	ectoral Distribution	235
Н	Iidden Enterprises	236
	rivate Management of Collective and State-	
C	Owned Enterprises ¹	237
Conclu	sions	238
L	Leading Role of Private Enterprises	239
Γ	Degrees of Autonomy	240
Т	Coward a Model of Community Enterprises?	243
Chapter 11		
The 1990s: E	End of the Road for Gradualist Reform?	
Introdu	iction	245
Recent	Reforms	247
P	Pricing Policies	248
	Housing Reform	249
Social 1	Effects of Recent Reforms	250
E	Benefits of Reform	251
F	Risks of Reform	252
Problem	ms of Macroeconomic Management	' 253
Ι	Local-Level Growth	254
F	Prospects for Improvement	255
The Ne	eed for a New Strategy	259
Appendices		
	Transition to a Socialist Economy (1949-1957)	263
B: 0	Chronicle of New Policies Related to	
F	Foreign Trade, PRC, 1991-February 1993	270
References		275

Part Two MONGOLIA By Young C. Kim

Chapter 12	
Background and History	
Introduction	295
Early History	295
Independence from China	296
Soviet Relationship	296
Land and People	297
Infrastructure , •	297
Population	297
Language and Religion	298
Regional Differences	299
Major Economic Activities	300
Economic History	300
Socialist Nation-Building, 1921-1932	301
"New Turn" Policy and Prewar Years	302
Postwar Plans	303
Historical Trends	
Patterns of State Investment	304
Agricultural Organization	305
Industrial Organization	307
Control of Trade	307
State Services	308
Extent of Socialization	308
The Reform Era •	309
Glasnost and Perestroika	310
Opening to the World	310
Political Changes	311
Economic Dependence	311
Current Economic Status	312
Chapter 13	
The Pre-Reform Economy	
Economic and Social Indicators	313
Per Capita Income	313

Per Capita Income	31
-------------------	----

Social Indicators Growth of Output	'316 317
±	317
Composition of National Product Sectoral Structure	320
Agriculture	320
Industry	320
Investment and Capital Stock	325
Factor Intensity and Efficiency	329
Population and Work Force	329
Growth of Population	330
Age Composition and Labor Participation	330
Education i ^r	331
Occupational Distribution	332
Public Finance	333
Budgetary Data	333
State Revenues	334
State Expenditures	337
Banking System	338
Interest Rates	338
Distribution of Credit	340
Monetary Developments	340
Prices	341
Foreign Trade and Payments	342
Trade Regimes	343
Composition of Trade	344
Current Account Balance	345
Exchange Rates	'346
Terms of Trade	346
External Debt and Reserves	347
Chapter 14	
The Current Crisis and Prospects for Reform	
External Shocks	349
Reforms in Agriculture and Industry	353
Agriculture Sector	353
Industry Sector	357
Financial, Fiscal, and Monetary Reforms	362
Price and Wage Reforms	'363

Banking Reforms	, 364
Monetary Policy	365
Fiscal Reforms	366
Problems of Macroeconomic Management	366
Reforms in the External Sector	369
Open Economic Policy	369
Law on Foreign Investment	370
Exchange Rate Movement	370
Other Changes in Trade Policy	371
Privatization Program	371
Sequencing of Privatization	371
Transfer Scheme, .	372
Areas of Concern	374
Prospects for Reform	
Macroeconomic Stabilization	376
Rapid Transformation	377
Labor Relations	377
Limited Markets	378
Historical Burden	378
Political Challenges	379
Looking Outward	379
Appendix Tables	381
References	419
Author Index	427
Subject Index	

From Centrally Planned To Market Economies: The Asian Approach

Voltime 3 Lao PDR, Myanmar and Viet Nam

Edited by Pradumna B. Rana and Naved Hamid

Published for the Asian Development Bank by Oxford University Press

> HONGKONG OXFORD UNIVERSITY PRESS OXFORD NEW YORK

CONTENTS

List of Tables		xiv
List of Figures	•	XX
Foreword		xxi
Acronyms		xxiii

Part One

LAO PDR

By Richard Vokes and Armand Fabella

Chapter 1	i'	
-	d and Recent Economic Developments	2
Intro	duction	3
	Historical Background	4
	Geography and Resource Base	6
Evol	ution of the Economic System	10
	Laying the Foundation for Central	
	Planning, 1975-1979	11
	Central Planning with Reform	
	Socialism, 1979-1985	13
	The New Economic Mechanism	16
	Development Plans	18
The	Economy in the 1980s and Early 1990s	21
	Output, Income, and Expenditures	22
	Employment, Wages, and Prices '	25
	Macroeconomic Adjustment and Stabilization	25
	Development Issues and Constraints	27
Chapter 2		
-	eforms and Economic Decentralization	
Fisca	l Sector Reforms	31
	Overall Trends	31
	Major Revenue Sources	33
	Enterprise Taxation	35
	Agricultural Taxes	36
	Household Taxation	36
	Government Expenditures	37

Taxation by Central and Local Governments	' 38
Price and Wage Reforms	38
Increasing Efficiency	42
Budgetary Implications of Reforms	43
Finance Sector Reforms	43
Creation of a Two-Tiered Banking System	44
Other Components of the Banking System	45
Nonbahk Financial Markets	47
Level and Composition of Credit	48
Interest Rate Policy	50
Dealing with Inflation	52
Other Monetary and Banking Reform Issues	54
External Sector Reforms	59
Balance of Payments and Trade Flows	59
Exchange Rate System	61
Trade System and Commercial Policy	62
Public Enterprise Reforms	63
Role of State Enterprises	63
Phases of Reform	65
Impact of Autonomy on State Enterprises	69
Reining in Autonomous Enterprises	73
Divestment of State Enterprises	74
Assessment of the Divestment Program	76
Support for the Divestment Program	79
Agriculture Sector Reforms	80
Profile of the Agriculture Sector	80
Socialist Transformation of Agriculture,	
1975-1986	82
Agricvilture Sector Reforms after the	
Fourth Congress	88
Reform in Upland Agriculture and Forestry	92
Assessment of Agriculture Reforms	95
Growth Prospects	96
Scope for Private Enterprise	101
Business Environment	101
Legal and Regulatory Framework	103
Impact of Fiscal Policy	106
Impact of Finance Sector Reforms	106

Growth of the Private Sector	107
Constraints on the Private Sector	109
Future Support for Private-Sector	
Development	111
Chapter 3	
Costs of Economic Liberalization	
Resource Gaps	113
Savings/Investment Gap	113
Foreign Exchange Gap	114
External Assistance	115
i. Desterint: Descent Developments	
Postscript: Recent Developments Introduction •	117
Political Developments	117
Economic Developments	117
The Economy in 1992	110
Fiscal Reforms	1120
Finance Sector Reforms	120
Foreign Trade and Payments	121
State Enterprise Reforms	124
Agriculture Sector Reforms	124
Private-Sector Development	124
Appendix Tables	127
References	127
References	145
Part Two	
MYANMAR	
By U Tun Wai	
Chapter 4	
Background and Recent Economic Developments	151
Historical Overview	151
Natural Resources and Infrastructure	152
Natural Resources	153
Infrastructure	155
Evolution of the Economic System	157

The AFPFL Period, 1948-1962	,157	
The "Burmese Way to Socialism," 1962-1975	157	
Reforms in the System, 1975-1988	160	
Sectoral Reforms	160	
Agriculture Sector Policies	161	
State Enterprise Reform	165	
Financial Reform	168	
Development Planning	170	
The Economy Since 1970	172	
Output, Incomes, and Expenditures	173	
Employment, Wages, and Prices	176	
Fiscal Developments	179	
Sectoral Trends in Investment	183	
Monetary Developments	184	
External Developments	187	
Major Problem Areas	195	
Monetary Overhang and Inflationary		
Pressure	196	
"Soft" Budget Constraint on State		
Enterprises	197	
Investment and Growth	198	
Macroeconomic Management Issues	198	
Chapter 5		
Aspects of the Current Economy		
Banking Laws and Institutional Structure	201	
Central Bank of Myanmar	201	
Other Banking Institutions	204	
Insurance	206	
Informal Credit and Private Capital Markets	206	
Informal Credit	206	
Capital Market Development	209	
Trading Patterns and Trade Flows	210	
Composition of Exports	210	
Composition of Imports	212	
Commercial Tax Laws, 1990 and 1991	213	•
Commercial Tax Law, 1990	214	$\langle \rangle$
Commercial Tax Law, 1991	215	

249

250

251

251

252

253

253 254

255

257

258

258

263

266

Foreign Aid and External Debt	216
Foreign Aid	217
Foreign Exchange and Debt	218
The 1991/92 Annual Plan	219
Public Investment	221
Production Targets	221
Financial Forecasts	224
Chapter 6	
Sectoral Reforms	
Introduction	227
Fiscal Sector Reforms and Price-Wage Controls	228
Income and Property Taxes	229
Agriculture and Land Taxes	232
Household, Personal Sales, and Property	
Taxes	234
Revenue Collection Reforms	235
Wages and Prices •	235
Revenue Generation Reforms	241
Finance Sector Reforms and Macroeconomic	
Management	242
Inflationary Pressure	243
Institutional Reforms	245
Macroeconomic Reforms	248

Reforms in Foreign Trade and Payments

Import and Export Restrictions

Foreign Trade

Commercial Policy

Tariffs and Taxes

Exchange Controls

Balance of Payments

State Enterprise Reforms

Agriculture Sector Reforms

Exchange Rate Structure

Convertibility Restrictions

Exchange Rate Unification

Role of State Enterprises

Reforms under SLORC

Contents

Marketing Reforms	' 267
Agricultural Credit	267
Agricultural Productivity	268
Scope for Private Enterprise	273
Current Role of the Private Sector	273
Recent Reforms	276
Prospects for Further Reform	278
Chapter 7	
Economic Reform: Problems and Prospects	
Introduction	281
Overall Weaknesses I '	282
Savings-Investment Gap	282
Evaluating the Economic Reform Program	285
Macroeconomic Management	286
Increasing the Role of the Private Sector	288
Reforms in Agriculture and Forestry	288
Price and Wage Reforms	289
Fiscal Issues	290
Trade Issues	291
Structural Adjustment	292
Appendix Tables	295
References	329

Part Three VIET NAM By Adam Fforde and Stefan de Vylder

Chapter 8

Background and Recent Economic Developments	
Introduction	335
Geography and Natural Resources	336
Geography	336
Climate	337
Land Use	337
Environmental Problems	338
Population and Social Services	338

Education and Health Services •	339
Evolution of the Economic System	340
"Classical" Central Planning	341
The 1975-1979 Period	341
Early Reform Process, 1979-1986	345
Economic Crisis, 1986-1988	348
The Economy to the Early 1990s	350
Output, Income, and Expenditures	350
Investment and Savings .	352
Output of Major Commodities	353
Employment and Wages	353
Price System and Price Reform	356
Fiscal Developments	361
Monetary Developments	365
External Developments	374
Major Achievements	382
Doi Moi in a Comparative Perspective	382
Major Problem Areas	384
Budget Deficit and Low Investment	385
Credit Distortions	385
State Role	385
Credibility of Reform Process	386
Physical and Social Infrastructure	386
Financial Constraints	387
Priorities for the 1990s	388
Chapter 9	

Sectoral Reforms

Fiscal Sector Reforms	389
Basic Weaknesses »	390
Subsidies to the State Sector	390
Profit and Turnover Taxes	392
Tax Collection and Fiscal Control	392
Agricultural and Household Taxation	393
Effectiveness of Tax System	394
Price and Wage Reforms	394
Competition for Revenue	395
The 1991 Budget	397

Finance Sector Reforms	-398
Structure of the State Bank	398
Commercial State Banks	400
Share Banks and Cooperatives	400
Nonbank Capital Markets	401
Technical and Other Problems	401
Real Interest Rates	402
Credit for Enterprises, Farmers, and	
Households	403
Excess Inventory Holding	404
Interventions to Restrict Deposits	404
Further Financial Reform	404
External Sector Reforms	405
Foreign Exchange Reforms	406
Formal and Informal Exchange Systems	408
Structure of Exchange Rates	408
Challenges Facing the Exchange System	409
Other Weaknesses	410
State Trading Agencies	410
Recent Changes in the Trade System	411
Tariffs and Trade Taxes	415
State Enterprise Reforms	416
Trends in the Structure of Output	416
Property Rights	416
Response to Competition	419
Early Reforms	420
Reforms in 1990-1991	421
Accountancy Reform	422
Agriculture Sector Reforms	424
Early Reforms	424
Reforms since 1988	426
Agricultural Output and Employment	429
State Farms	430
Farming Households	432
Allocation of Inputs	434
Distribution of Products	435
Changes in Rural Conditions	435
Income and Asset Distribution	438

Assessing the Reforms	439
Scope for Private Enterprise	440
Business Environment	441
Private Sector in Industry	442
Private Sector in Trade	442
Taxation and Regulation	443
Interregional Investment	444
Problems and Prospects	444
Chapter 10	
Adjustment Costs of Liberalization	
Introduction i '	447
Resource Gaps	447
Savings-Investment Gap	448
Budget Deficit	450
Foreign Exchange Gap	451
Relations with CMEA	453
Relations with Non-CMEA Countries	455
Projections	458
The Future	461
References	463
Author Index	467
Subject Index	469