

# **The invention of autonomy**

A history of modern moral philosophy

J. B. SCHNEEWIND

*Johns Hopkins University*

**CAMBRIDGE**  
**UNIVERSITY PRESS**

# Contents

<i>Preface</i>	page	xiii
<i>Acknowledgments</i>		xvii
<i>A note on references and abbreviations</i>		xxi
<b><i>Introduction</i></b>		<b>1</b>
<b>1 <i>Themes in the history of modern moral philosophy</i></b>		<b>3</b>
<i>i Moral philosophy and social change</i>		4
<i>ii Morality and self-governance</i>		5
<i>iii Morality and religion</i>		6
<i>iv Morality, epistemology, and moral psychology</i>		9
<i>v A map of the book</i>		11
<b><i>Part I The rise and fall of modern natural law</i></b>		<b>15</b>
<b>2 <i>Natural law: From intellectualism to voluntarism</i></b>		<b>17</b>
<i>i Origins of natural law theory</i>		17
<i>ii St. Thomas's natural law morality</i>		19
<i>iii Will and the good in voluntarism</i>		21
<i>iv Luther's two kingdoms</i>		26
<i>v Luther's voluntarism</i>		27
<i>vi Calvin's humanistic voluntarism</i>		32
<b>3 <i>Setting religion aside: Republicanism and skepticism</i></b>		<b>37</b>
<i>i Virtù and the manipulative prince</i>		37
<i>ii The self-governing republic</i>		39
<i>iii Pyrrhonism rediscovered</i>		42
<i>iv Montaigne: Skepticism and faith</i>		44
<i>v Montaigne's test</i>		47
<i>vi A Montaignian ethic?</i>		50
<i>vii Charron: Eclectic skepticism</i>		52
<i>viii War and morality</i>		56

<b>4</b>	<b><i>Natural law restated: Suarez and Grotius</i></b>	<b>58</b>
<b>i</b>	<i>Suarez: Will and intellect in law</i>	<b>59</b>
<b>ii</b>	<i>Suarez: The law and its promulgation</i>	<b>62</b>
<b>iii</b>	<i>Suarez: Motives for obedience</i>	<b>64</b>
<b>iv</b>	<i>Grotius and religious belief</i>	<b>66</b>
<b>v</b>	<i>The Grotian problematic</i>	<b>70</b>
<b>vi</b>	<i>"Even if we should concede . . . "</i>	<b>73</b>
<b>vii</b>	<i>The insufficiency of virtue</i>	<b>75</b>
<b>viii</b>	<i>Rights and community</i>	<b>78</b>
<b>5</b>	<b><i>Grotianism at the limit: Hobbes</i></b>	<b>82</b>
<b>i</b>	<i>Desire and conflict</i>	<b>82</b>
<b>ii</b>	<i>From psychology to morality</i>	<b>88</b>
<b>iii</b>	<i>Morality in practice</i>	<b>92</b>
<b>iv</b>	<i>Hobbesian voluntarism</i>	<b>95</b>
<b>6</b>	<b><i>A morality of love: Cumberland</i></b>	<b>101</b>
<b>i</b>	<i>Love as law</i>	<b>102</b>
<b>ii</b>	<i>The status of the law of love</i>	<b>104</b>
<b>iii</b>	<i>From self-love to benevolence</i>	<b>107</b>
<b>iv</b>	<i>God, law, and obligation</i>	<b>109</b>
<b>v</b>	<i>Rationality in morality</i>	<b>113</b>
<b>vi</b>	<i>Ignorance and obedience</i>	<b>116</b>
<b>7</b>	<b><i>The central synthesis: Pufendorf</i></b>	<b>118</b>
<b>i</b>	<i>Moral entities</i>	<b>119</b>
<b>ii</b>	<i>Moral good and natural good</i>	<b>123</b>
<b>iii</b>	<i>Knowledge of natural law</i>	<b>126</b>
<b>iv</b>	<i>Perfect and imperfect duty</i>	<b>131</b>
<b>v</b>	<i>Law and obligation</i>	<b>134</b>
<b>vi</b>	<i>The significance of Pufendorf's voluntarism</i>	<b>138</b>
<b>8</b>	<b><i>The collapse of modern natural law: Locke and Thomasius</i></b>	<b>141</b>
<b>i</b>	<i>Locke and the Grotian problematic</i>	<b>142</b>
<b>ii</b>	<i>Elements of a science of morality</i>	<b>144</b>
<b>iii</b>	<i>Morality as a science</i>	<b>*47</b>
<b>iv</b>	<i>Locke's voluntarism</i>	<b>149</b>
<b>v</b>	<i>Revelation and reason in morals</i>	<b>152</b>
<b>vi</b>	<i>Locke's early work on natural law</i>	<b>153</b>
<b>vii</b>	<i>Justice and love</i>	<b>156</b>
<b>viii</b>	<i>Voluntarism and empiricist morality</i>	<b>157</b>
<b>ix</b>	<i>Thomasius: The rejection of voluntarism</i>	<b>159</b>
<b>x</b>	<i>Obligation and advice</i>	<b>161</b>
<b>xi</b>	<i>Separating law and morality</i>	<b>163</b>

<b>Part II</b>	<b><i>Perfectionism and rationality</i></b>	<b>167</b>
<b>9</b>	<b><i>Origins of modern perfectionism</i></b>	<b>169</b>
	<i>i Stoicism Christianized: du Vair and Lipsius</i>	170
	<i>ii Herbert of Cherbury: Cosmos and Common Notions</i>	176
	<i>iii Herbert: Common Notions, morality, and religion</i>	179
	<i>iv Cartesian voluntarism</i>	184
	<i>v Descartes: Ignorance and virtue</i>	185
	<i>vi Descartes: Happiness, the passions, and love</i>	189
<b>10</b>	<b><i>Paths to God: I. The Cambridge Platonists</i></b>	<b>194</b>
	<i>i Whichcote: Morality as the core of religion</i>	196
	<i>ii John Smith: Perfection, love, and law</i>	199
	<i>iii More: Love's axioms</i>	202
	<i>iv Cudworth: A metaphysics of ethics</i>	205
	<i>v Cambridge Platonism and free will</i>	210
<b>11</b>	<b><i>Paths to God: II. Spinoza and Malebranche</i></b>	<b>215</b>
	<i>i Spinoza: Ethics in a world without ends</i>	216
	<i>ii Wisdom and the good life</i>	220
	<i>iii Spinozistic society</i>	223
	<i>iv Malebranche: Evil and God's general wills</i>	225
	<i>v Order, virtue, and happiness</i>	228
	<i>vi Acquiring merit</i>	231
	<i>vii Malebranchean morality</i>	233
<b>12</b>	<b><i>Leibniz: Counterrevolutionary perfectionism</i></b>	<b>236</b>
	<i>i The best possible world</i>	237
	<i>ii Freedom and determination by reasons</i>	241
	<i>iii Love, justice, and perfection</i>	246
	<i>iv Against Pufendorf: Law and will</i>	250
	<i>v Against Pufendorf: Justification and motive</i>	254
	<b><i>Part III</i></b>	<b>261</b>
	<b><i>Toward a world on its own</i></b>	
<b>13</b>	<b><i>Morality without salvation</i></b>	<b>263</b>
	<i>i Gassendi's rehabilitation of Epicureanism</i>	264
	<i>ii Free will and the incomprehensibility of God</i>	269
	<i>iii Morality and the hidden God</i>	272
	<i>iv Nicole: The ingenuity of self-interest</i>	275
	<i>v Bayle: Religion and the virtuous atheist</i>	279
<b>14</b>	<b><i>The recovery of virtue</i></b>	<b>285</b>
	<i>i Virtue and law</i>	286
	<i>ii Virtue in Utopia</i>	289
	<i>iii Harrington's hollow citizen</i>	293

<b>iv</b>	<i>Shaftesbury's politics</i>	295
<b>v</b>	<i>The diversity of the passions</i>	298
<b>vi</b>	<i>Moral feeling, voluntarism, and skepticism</i>	300
<b>vii</b>	<i>Virtue, happiness, and the complete citizen</i>	306
<b>15</b>	<b><i>The austerity of morals: Clarke and Mandeville</i></b>	<b>310</b>
<b>i</b>	<i>Free will and reasons for action</i>	311
<b>ii</b>	<i>Mathematical morality</i>	314
<b>iii</b>	<i>Morality and rational agency</i>	317
<b>iv</b>	<i>Morality in the best possible world</i>	3x9
<b>v</b>	<i>Morality and the need for Christianity</i>	321
<b>vi</b>	<i>Mandeville: Morality naturalized</i>	323
<b>vii</b>	<i>Morality against nature</i>	327
<b>16</b>	<b><i>The limits of love: Hutcheson and Butler</i></b>	<b>330</b>
<b>i</b>	<i>Carmichael: Pufendorf in Scotland</i>	331
<b>ii</b>	<i>Hutcheson's morality of benevolence</i>	333
<b>iii</b>	<i>Morality and sentiment</i>	336
<b>iv</b>	<i>Reason, motive, and calculation</i>	340
<b>v</b>	<i>Butler: The complexity of human nature</i>	342
<b>vi</b>	<i>Conscience</i>	345
<b>vii</b>	<i>Self-love, benevolence, and morality</i>	349
<b>viii</b>	<i>God and morality</i>	352
<b>17</b>	<b><i>Hume: Virtue naturalized</i></b>	<b>354</b>
<b>i</b>	<i>Moral philosophy as a science of sentiment</i>	355
<b>ii</b>	<i>Desire, belief, and action</i>	358
<b>iii</b>	<i>Laws of approval</i>	362
<b>iv</b>	<i>Artificial and natural virtues</i>	365
<b>v</b>	<i>Obligation</i>	369
<b>vi</b>	<i>Hume and the classical republic</i>	372
<b>vii</b>	<i>Morality and religion</i>	373
<b>18</b>	<b><i>Against a fatherless world</i></b>	<b>378</b>
<b>i</b>	<i>Sentimentalism, skepticism, and the new rationalism</i>	378
<b>ii</b>	<i>Price's intuitionism</i>	380
<b>iii</b>	<i>Intuition and motivation</i>	385
<b>iv</b>	<i>Morality and providential care</i>	387
<b>v</b>	<i>Adam Smith: Sentimentalism restated</i>	388
<b>vi</b>	<i>Moral philosophy dissolved</i>	393
<b>vii</b>	<i>Reid: The active powers</i>	395
<b>viii</b>	<i>Defending the obvious: The intuitive axioms</i>	397
<b>ix</b>	<i>Freedom and morality</i>	399
<b>x</b>	<i>Reid's legacy</i>	402

<b>19</b>	<b><i>The noble effects of self-love</i></b>	<b>404</b>
	<i>i Association and utility</i>	405
	<i>ii God and the greatest happiness</i>	408
	<i>iii Egoism and reform: Helvetius and d'Holbach</i>	413
	<i>iv Bentham: Making morality in a world on its own</i>	419
	<i>v De Sade: Self-love in a corrupt society</i>	424
	<b>Part IV <i>Autonomy and divine order</i></b>	<b>429</b>
<b>20</b>	<b><i>Perfection and will: Wolff and Crusius</i></b>	<b>431</b>
	<i>i Wolff: The need for system</i>	432
	<i>ii Wolffian psychology</i>	435
	<i>iii Wolffian ethics</i>	438
	<i>iv A note on Pietism</i>	442
	<i>v Crusius: The significance of free will</i>	445
	<i>vi Freedom and virtue</i>	449
	<i>vii Morality and God's will</i>	452
<b>21</b>	<b><i>Religion, morality, and reform</i></b>	<b>457</b>
	<i>i Voltaire and voluntarism</i>	458
	<i>ii La Mettrie: Atheism let loose</i>	462
	<i>iii Diderot: Morality without theory</i>	466
	<i>iv Rousseau: The origins of morality</i>	470
	<i>v The transformation of human nature</i>	474
	<i>vi Toward the classical republic</i>	478
	<i>vii Providence without intervention</i>	480
<b>22</b>	<b><i>The invention of autonomy</i></b>	<b>483</b>
	<i>i Toward the moral law</i>	484
	<i>ii On Rousseau's influence</i>	487
	<i>iii Theodicy and morality</i>	492
	<i>iv Theodicy and freedom</i>	497
	<i>v Reason and sentiment</i>	501
	<i>vi Morality and the two worlds</i>	505
<b>23</b>	<b><i>Kant in the history of moral philosophy</i></b>	<b>508</b>
	<i>i Equality with God</i>	509
	<i>ii From self-governance to autonomy</i>	513
	<i>iii Will and desire</i>	515
	<i>iv Natural law, obligation, and moral necessity</i>	518
	<i>v Methods of ethics</i>	522
	<i>vi Virtue, love, and perfection</i>	525

<i>Epilogue</i>	531
24 <i>Pythagoras, Socrates, and Kant: Understanding the history of moral philosophy</i>	533
<i>i The Socrates story</i>	534
<i>ii The Pythagoras story</i>	536
<i>iii Revelation and reason</i>	540
<i>iv Kant and the Pythagoras story</i>	543
<i>v Has moral philosophy a single aim?</i>	548
<i>vi Continuity and change in moral philosophy</i>	550
<i>vii Progress in moral philosophy</i>	553
 <i>Bibliography</i>	555
1 Sources	555
2 Commentary	568
 <i>Index of names</i>	593
<i>Index of subjects</i>	612
<i>Index of biblical citations</i>	624