

Water, Electricity, and the Poor: Who Benefits from Utility Subsidies?

Kristin Komives, Vivien Foster, Jonathan Halpern,
and Quentin Wodon
with support from Roohi Abdullah



THE WORLD BANK
Washington, DC

Contents

Foreword	xiii
Acknowledgments	xv
Abbreviations and Acronyms	xvi
1 Introduction	1
Infrastructure Services Are Important to Economies and Households	2
Many Still Lack Access to Improved Water and Electricity Services	3
Are Subsidies the Answer?	4
Utility Subsidies Are Also Redistributive Mechanisms	5
Objective of This Book: Assessing the Targeting Performance of Subsidies	5
2 A Typology of Consumer Utility Subsidies	8
What Types of Consumer Utility Subsidies Exist?	8
How Are Subsidies Funded?	14
How Prevalent Are Different Types of Subsidies?	19
Why Are Subsidies So Prevalent?	30
Summary	34
3 The Rationale for Subsidizing Services for the Poor	36
Subsidies Are Instruments of Sectoral Policy	36
Utilities Subsidies Are Also Instruments of Broader Social Policy	46
Summary	51
4 The Determinants of Targeting Performance:	
A Conceptual Framework	52
Data and Methodology	52

Conceptual Framework: The Determinants of Subsidy Performance	56
Summary.....	67
5 The Targeting Performance of Quantity-Based Subsidies.....	70
A Snapshot of Performance: Quantity-Targeted Subsidies	
Are Regressive	70
The Access Handicap: Only Connected Households	
Are Potential Beneficiaries	74
Metering: A Necessary Condition for Quantity Targeting	77
Targeting Potential: Do the Poor Consume Less Than the Rich?	79
Beneficiary Targeting in Practice: No One Is Excluded	85
Benefit Targeting in Practice: High-Volume Consumers	
Receive Larger Subsidies.....	86
Summary.....	89
6 Can the Targeting Performance of Consumption Subsidies Be Improved?	92
Improvement of Subsidy Performance by Modifying	
Tariff Design?	92
Beyond Quantity Targeting: Can Subsidy Performance	
Be Improved with Administrative Selection?	98
Beyond Private Connections: How Do Alternative Forms	
of Consumption Subsidies Perform?	114
Summary.....	120
7 The Targeting Performance of Connection Subsidies	122
Universal Connection Subsidies: Subsidy Performance	
If All Who Could Benefit Actually Did	124
Targeted Connection Subsidies: Can Performance	
Be Improved?	125
Assumptions in the Simulations: Will They Hold in Practice?	127
Subsidy Funding and Implementation: How Do They Affect	
Distributional Incidence?	132
Summary.....	134
8 Consumer Utility Subsidies as Instruments of Social Policy.....	136
What Is the Benefit Targeting Performance of Utility Subsidies	
Relative to Other Transfer Mechanisms?	136
What Is the Distribution of Subsidy Benefits Relative	
to Income?.....	140
Do Subsidies Provide Material Benefits	
for Poor Recipients?	143

To What Extent Do Subsidies Contribute to Poverty Reduction?.....	145
Summary.....	147
9 Beyond Subsidies—Other Means of Achieving Sectoral Goals	151
Cost Reduction Measures: Bringing Down the Cost Recovery Threshold?	152
Billing and Payment Systems: Matching the Cash Flow of the Poor?.....	155
Legal and Administrative Barriers: What Removing Nonprice Obstacles Does to Serving the Poor	158
Summary.....	162
10 Conclusions	165
How Prevalent Are Utility Subsidies?	165
How Do Standard Quantity-Targeted Utility Subsidies Perform?	166
Why Do Quantity-Targeted Utility Subsidies Perform So Poorly?	167
Do Quantity-Targeted Subsidies Perform Differently for Water and Electricity?	167
Is It Possible to Improve the Design of Quantity-Targeted Subsidies?	168
Are the Alternatives to Quantity Targeting Any Better?	168
Do Connection Subsidies Perform Better Than Consumption Subsidies?.....	169
Do These Conclusions Vary across Geographical Regions?.....	170
Are Utility Subsidies as Effective as Other Measures of Social Protection?	171
Do Utility Subsidies Have a Material Impact on Disposable Incomes?	171
Are There Viable Alternatives to Utility Subsidies?	171
Appendixes	173
Appendix A: Case Background	173
Appendix B: Electricity: Coverage, Expenditure, and Consumption.....	184
Appendix C: Water: Coverage, Expenditure, and Consumption.....	195
Appendix D: Electricity: Consumption Subsidy Data	208
Appendix E: Water: Consumption Subsidy Data	226

Appendix F: Water: Connection Subsidy Data	244
Appendix G: Burden Limit: Consumption Subsidy Data	250
Appendix H: Increasing Block Tariff Structures	253
Bibliography	264
Index.....	275
Boxes	
2.1 Quantity-Targeted Subsidies in Tariff Structures	13
2.2 Indicative Cost-Recovery Ranges for Water Services	20
2.3 Indicative Cost-Recovery Ranges for Electricity	25
3.1 Methodologies for Measuring Willingness to Pay	38
5.1 The Challenge of Comparing Consumption Levels of the Rich and the Poor.....	80
6.1 Funding Colombia's Geographically Targeted Subsidy Scheme	105
6.2 Chile's <i>ficha CAS</i> , Reducing the Cost of Means Testing	109
6.3 Metering and Water Subsidy Performance in Kathmandu.....	115
7.1 Determinants of Targeting Performance	131
8.1 An Introduction to Gini Coefficients	141
8.2 Poverty Reduction Effect of the Honduran Electricity Subsidy	146
Figures	
2.1 Who Ultimately Captures Government-Funded Subsidies to Utilities?	15
3.1 Willingness to Pay for Water against Full Cost Tariff in Central America.....	39
3.2 Willingness to Pay for Water Supply against Current Tariff in Dehra Dun, India	40
3.3 Monthly Residential Electricity Expenditure Patterns by Region.....	41
3.4 Monthly Residential Water Expenditure Patterns by Region	42
3.5 Affordability of Full Cost Charges for Utility Services in Urban Areas	44
4.1 Decomposing Subsidy Performance	58
5.1 Measures of Beneficiary and Benefit Incidence of Quantity-Targeted Subsidies	71
5.2 Effect of Poverty Assumption on Benefit Targeting Performance Indicator.....	75
5.3 Average Monthly Electricity Consumption per Household, by Quintile	82
5.4 Electricity Consumption among Poor and Nonpoor Households in Guatemala	83

5.5	Average Water Consumption per Household by Quintile	84
5.6	Effect of Minimum Consumption Rules and Fixed Charges on Average Price Paid with an Increasing Block Tariff at Different Consumption Levels.....	87
5.7	Access Factors versus Subsidy Design Factors in Quantity-Targeted Subsidies	90
6.1	Relationship between Strata (Assigned by Housing Quality) and Income Deciles in Bogota, Colombia.....	103
6.2a	Benefit and Beneficiary Incidence of Water Consumption Subsidies.....	111
6.2b	Benefit and Beneficiary Incidence of Electricity Consumption Subsidies	112
6.3a	Water: Access Factors versus Subsidy Design Factors in Modified IBTs and Subsidies Using Administrative Selection.....	113
6.3b	Electricity: Access Factors versus Subsidy Design Factors in Modified IBTs and Subsidies Using Administrative Selection	114
7.1	Performance of Simulated Universal Connection Subsidies.....	125
7.2	Performance of Connection Subsidies If 50 Percent of Poor Households Choose Not to Connect	128
7.3	Distributive Effect of the Cargo SUMA	133
8.1	Inequality in the Distribution of Income versus the Distribution of the Electricity Subsidy in Indian States.....	142
8.2	Average Consumption Subsidy to the Poor as a Percentage of Average Income of the Poor.....	144

Tables

1.1	Percentage of the Population with Access to Improved Water Supply, Sanitation, and Electricity (and Percentage with a Household Water Connection)	4
2.1	Typology of Consumer Utility Subsidies	9
2.2	Summary of Evidence on Price and Income Elasticity.....	18
2.3	Overview of Average Water Tariffs and Probable Degree of Cost Recovery.....	21
2.4	Overview of IBT Tariff Structures for Residential Water Customers.....	24
2.5	Overview of Average Electricity Tariffs and Probable Degree of Cost Recovery.....	26
2.6	Overview of IBT Tariff Structures for Residential Electricity Customers	28
2.7	Summary of Prevalence of Different Types of Subsidies in Water and Electricity.....	29

2.8 Capital Intensity and Asset Lives for Utility Services	33
3.1 Estimated Cost Ranges for Subsistence Service Levels (US\$)	43
3.2 Applicability of Arguments for Transfers in Kind across Different Goods.....	48
3.3 Budget Shares for Different Categories of Goods in Africa (Percentage of Household Budget)	49
3.4 Pseudo Income Elasticities for Different Categories of Goods in Africa	50
4.1 Determinants of Consumption Subsidy Performance	59
4.2 Residential Electricity and Water Tariff Structures in Cape Verde, 2001	62
4.3 Decomposition of Determinants of Subsidy Performance in Cape Verde	63
4.4 Determinants of Connection Subsidy Performance Indicators.....	66
4.5 Decomposition of Determinants of Connection Subsidy Performance in Cape Verde.....	67
5.1 Performance Indicators for Quantity-Based Subsidies	72
5.2 Detailed Decomposition of Factors that Contribute to Ω in the African Subsidy Cases.....	76
5.3 Effect of Connection Rate and Metering Rate on Potential Beneficiaries of Quantity-Targeted Subsidies.....	78
5.4 Relationship between Income and Energy Use in 45 Cities in 12 Developing Countries: Average KgOE per Capita per Month	81
5.5 Summary of Evidence on Income Elasticity of Demand for Water and Electricity	85
5.6 Expected Effect of Quantity Targeting on Determinants of Benefit Incidence, under Different Assumptions about the Correlation between Income and Consumption.....	89
6.1 Effects of Tariff Modifications on the Factors That Determine the Benefit Incidence of Quantity-Targeted Subsidies	93
6.2 Targeting Performance of Simulated Improvements to IBT and VDT Design.....	95
6.3 Targeting Performance of Subsidy Models That Use Administrative Selection.....	99
6.4 Percentage of Households That Qualify for Burden Limit Subsidy as Burden Limit Changes	119
7.1 Connection Charges for Water and Sewerage (US\$)	123
7.2 Performance Indicators for Simulated Targeted Connection Subsidies	126
7.3 Benefit Targeting Performance of Connection Subsidies under Three Scenarios.....	130

8.1 Targeting Performance of Utility Subsidies Relative to Other Social Policy Instruments.....	137
8.2 Median Targeting Performance, Ω , by Targeting Method: Consumer Utility Subsidies versus Other Social Policy Instruments.....	139
8.3 Poverty Effect of X Percent Changes in Water and Electricity Expenditures, If Consumption Levels Do Not Change.....	148
9.1 Effect of Utility Subsidies on Achievement of Sectoral Goals.....	152
9.2 Potential Effects of Different Policy Instruments on Use of Water and Electricity Services	163
A.1 Consumption Subsidy Cases: Electricity.....	174
A.2 Consumption Subsidy Cases: Water	178
A.3 Connection Subsidy Cases: Electricity and Water	182
A.4 Consumption Subsidy Cases: Multisector Burden Limit	183
B.1 Electricity Coverage: Percentage of Households with Electricity or Nonzero Expenditure on Electricity	185
B.2 Estimated Monthly Electricity Consumption in kWh	188
B.3 Monthly Expenditure per Household on Electricity in US\$.....	190
B.4 Monthly Expenditure on Electricity as a Percentage of Household Income.....	192
C.1 Water Coverage: Percentage of Households with a Private Connection	196
C.2 Estimated Monthly Water Consumption per Household in m ³	200
C.3 Monthly Expenditure per Household on Water in US\$.....	202
C.4 Monthly Expenditure on Water as a Percentage of Household Income	205
D.1 Percentage of Households Receiving Subsidy	209
D.2 Percentage of Connected Households Receiving Subsidy	212
D.3 Average Value of Subsidy per Household, as Average Percentage of Household Income.....	215
D.4 Average Value of Subsidy per Household in US\$	217
D.5 Percentage of Subsidy Pool Going to Each Quintile.....	220
D.6 Targeting Indicators: Electricity Subsidies.....	223
E.1 Percentage of Households Receiving Subsidy	227
E.2 Percentage of Connected Households Receiving Subsidy.....	230
E.3 Average Value of Subsidy per Household, as Average Percentage of Household Income	233
E.4 Average Value of Subsidy per Household in US\$.....	235
E.5 Percentage of Subsidy Pool Going to Each Quintile	238
E.6 Targeting Indicators: Water Consumption Subsidies.....	241
F.1 Percentage of Households Receiving Subsidy.....	245
F.2 Percentage of Unconnected Households Receiving Subsidy	246

F.3 Average Value of Subsidy per Household, as Average Percentage of Household Income	246
F.4 Average Value of Subsidy per Household in US\$.....	247
F.5 Percentage of Subsidy Pool Going to Each Quintile.....	248
F.6 Targeting Indicators: Connection Subsidies.....	249
G.1 Percentage of Households Receiving Subsidy	251
G.2 Percentage of Connected Households Receiving Subsidy	251
G.3 Average Value of Subsidy per Household, as Average Percentage of Household Income.....	251
G.4 Average Value of Subsidy per Household in US\$.....	252
G.5 Targeting Indicators: Burden Limit	252
H.1 Electricity: Increasing Block Tariff Structures.....	254
H.2 Water: Increasing Block Tariff Structures	260