

CONVERGENCES
AND DIVERGENCES BETWEEN
INTERNATIONAL HUMAN RIGHTS,
INTERNATIONAL HUMANITARIAN
AND INTERNATIONAL
CRIMINAL LAW

Edited by
Paul DE HERT
Stefaan SMIS
Mathias HOLVOET



intersentia

Cambridge – Antwerp – Portland

CONTENTS

<i>Foreword</i>	v
<i>Preface</i>	vii
<i>About the Contributors</i>	xv

PART I. CONVERGENCES AND DIVERGENCES BETWEEN INTERNATIONAL HUMAN RIGHTS LAW AND INTERNATIONAL CRIMINAL LAW *STRICTO SENSU*

Catalytic, Gap-Filling or Retardant Effects of ICL on HRL: *Quid Juris*

Patrícia PINTO SOARES and Gerhard KREUTZER	3
1. ICL and HRL: As Different as Complementary	3
2. ICL as a Vehicle for Broadening the Scope of Material Enforcement and Protection of Human Rights	5
3. ICL as an Additional Vector of Raising Awareness of Human Rights and Further Empowerment of HRL	9
4. ICL: Narrowing the Scope of Application of Fundamental Human Rights?	10
5. International Criminal Investigations and Prosecutions: A Threat to Well-Established Human Rights?	11
6. The ICC and the Right to a Fair Trial: 'Holier than the Pope'?	14
7. Conclusion	27

Use of Human Rights in International Criminal Law: Influence or Appearances of Legitimacy?

Damien SCALIA	29
1. Introduction	29
2. Preliminary Remarks	30
3. Use of Human Rights Law to Interpret Crimes	33
4. Rights of the Accused	38
5. Misuse of Human Rights Law	41
6. Conclusion	46

The Future of the International Criminal Court: A Non-Human Rights Body?

Marina AKSENOVA	49
1. Introduction	49
2. Place of Human Rights Law within the ICC Architecture.....	54
3. Case Study: <i>Al Senussi</i> Admissibility Proceedings	57
4. Discretion as a Vehicle Behind Human Rights Considerations	65
5. Conclusion	68

PART II. CONVERGENCES AND DIVERGENCES BETWEEN INTERNATIONAL HUMAN RIGHTS LAW AND TRANSNATIONAL CRIMINAL LAW

Strengthening Action to End Forced Labour: The ILO Forced Labour Protocol and States' Positive Human Rights Obligations

Amy WEATHERBURN	73
1. Introduction	73
2. The ILO Forced Labour Framework and its Historical Interaction with International Human Rights Law	75
3. Forced Labour and the Positive Human Rights Obligations on States	79
4. Introducing the ILO Protocol to the Forced Labour Convention	89
5. Strengthening Action to End Forced Labour.....	91
6. Conclusion	99

The International Law of Human Trafficking: At the Forefront of the Convergence between Transnational Criminal Law and International Human Rights Law?

Valentina MILANO	101
1. Introduction	102
2. Integration at the Universal Level	105
3. Integration at the European Level	117
4. Conclusions on the Interaction between International Human Rights Law and Transnational Criminal Law.....	124

International Security and Financial Stability: Resolving Norm Conflicts between Anti-Corruption and Individual Rights

Mirja CIESIOLKA	133
1. Introduction and Overview	134
2. International Anti-Corruption Efforts: Security and Financial Stability.....	135

3.	The Controversial Relationship between Security and Civil Rights: International Anti-Corruption Law and Conflicting Human Rights	139
4.	Managing the Competing Interests and Conflicting Norms in International Law	147
5.	The Interaction between International Anti-Corruption Law and Human Rights Law	150

PART III. CONVERGENCES AND DIVERGENCES BETWEEN INTERNATIONAL HUMAN RIGHTS LAW AND INTERNATIONAL HUMANITARIAN LAW

'It was the Best of Times, It was the Worst of Times': A Tale of Detention in Time of Emergency

	Federica FAVUZZA	163
1.	Introduction	164
2.	First Scenario: Dr Alexandre Manette is Detained by a State Party to the ICCPR	165
3.	Second Scenario: Dr Alexandre Manette is Detained by a State Party to the ECHR	170
4.	Security Detention in Time of Emergency	174
5.	Concluding Remarks	192

The European Court of Human Rights' Approach to Armed Conflict and Humanitarian Law: Ivory Tower or Pas de Deux?

	Cedric DE KOKER	195
1.	Introduction	195
2.	A Changing Legal Landscape: The Strasbourg Court's Increased Engagement with Cases Stemming from Armed Conflict	198
3.	How has the Strasbourg Court Dealt with Situations of Armed Conflict?	201
4.	International Armed Conflicts and Situations of Occupation	203
5.	Non-International Armed Conflicts	211
6.	Conclusion	218

Prohibitions on Arbitrary Displacement in International Humanitarian Law and Human Rights: A Time and a Place for Everything

	Deborah CASALIN	223
1.	Introduction	224
2.	General Principles of Interaction between IHL and IHRL	225
3.	International Prohibitions on Arbitrary Displacement	229

4.	Relationship between the IHL and IHRL Prohibitions on Arbitrary Displacement	240
5.	Findings Regarding Convergences and Divergences	248
6.	Plan for Mass Transfer of Bedouins in Area C of the West Bank, Occupied Palestinian Territory: An Illustration	250
7.	Conclusion	256

Investigations in Armed Conflict: Understanding the Interaction between International Humanitarian Law and Human Rights Law

	Vito TODESCHINI	259
1.	Introduction	259
2.	The Obligation to Investigate in Armed Conflict	261
3.	Interaction between IHL and HRL: A Theoretical Framework	269
4.	The Impact of HRL on War Crimes Investigations	279
5.	Conclusion	284

Conclusion

	Paul DE HERT, Stefaan SMIS and Mathias HOLVOET	287
1.	Introduction	287
2.	Possible Convergences between IHRL, ICL <i>Stricto Sensu</i> , TCL and IHL	288
3.	Frictions, Collisions and Impairments Arising Out of the Interactions between IHRL, ICL <i>Stricto Sensu</i> , TCL and IHL	289
4.	General Concluding Observations	292

	<i>Index</i>	293
	<i>About the Editors</i>	297