

History of Economic Thought as an Intellectual Discipline

D.P. O'Brien

*Emeritus Professor of Economics,
University of Durham, UK*

Edward Elgar

Cheltenham, UK • Northampton, MA, USA

<i>Preface</i>	<i>x</i>
<i>Acknowledgements</i>	<i>xi</i>
I Introduction	
1 Introduction	1
II Methodology	
2 History of Economic Thought as an Intellectual Discipline	9
2.1 Eminent Practitioners	10
2.2 The Decline in the History of Economic Thought	11
2.3 The Case for the History of Economic Thought	14
2.4 Approaches to the History of Economic Thought	20
2.5 The Mainstream Approach	24
2.6 Qualities Needed by Historians of Economic Thought	27
2.6.1 The Paragons	27
2.6.2 Requirements	29
2.6.3 The Wider Intellectual Canvas	31
2.6.4 Philosophy of Science	33
2.6.5 Economic History	34
2.7 Biography	35
2.8 Conclusions	39
3 Five Methodological Detours	43
3.1 Arrow	45
3.2 Industrial Economics and Game Theory	49
3.3 Pigou and the Factual Background	56
3.4 Hayek, Robbins and the Great Depression	60
3.5 Models of Exchange Rates	63
3.6 Conclusions	64

Information and Investment in a Wider Context	67
4.1 Richardson's Criticism of General Equilibrium	69
4.2 The Origins of the Problem of Knowledge	72
4.3 Attempts to Mend the Model: The Marshallian Elements	74
4.3.1 Time	74
4.3.2 The Perfect Competition Shuffle	75
4.3.3 Markets as Information Mechanisms	76
4.3.4 The Entrepreneur	77
4.3.5 The Emphasis on Investment	77
4.3.6 Richardson's Interpretation of Marshallian Competition	78
4.3.7 The Representative Firm and Costs	79
4.4 The Defence of Cartelisation	80
4.5 The Planned Economy	83
4.6 Considerations From the Wider Literature	84
4.7 Conclusions	86

III History of Economic Thought

5 Classical Economics: An Overview	91
5.1 Foundations	92
5.2 Value and Distribution	99
5.2.1 Value	99
5.2.2 Distribution; Wages	104
5.2.3 Distribution: Profit	105
5.2.4 Distribution: Rent	107
5.3 Money	108
5.3.1 Background	108
5.3.2 The Bullion Controversy	109
5.3.3 The Currency and Banking Debate	111
5.4 Trade	113
5.4.1 Smith and the Gains from Trade	113
5.4.2 Comparative Advantage	114
5.4.3 Productivity Differences	115
5.4.4 Welfare Issues	116
5.4.5 The Terms of Trade	116
5.4.6 Trade Policy	117
5.4.7 Unilateral Transfers	118
5.5 Economic Growth	119
5.5.1 Adam Smith	119
5.5.2 Smith's Successors	122
5.5.3 Machinery and Aggregate Demand	124
5.6 Public Finance	125
5.6.1 Taxation	125
5.6.2 Functional Rewards	127

5.6.3	Revenue Raising	128
5.6.4	National Debt	131
5.7	Policy Prescriptions	133
5.7.1	Factories	134
5.7.2	Machinery	134
5.7.3	Poor Relief	135
5.7.4	Education	135
5.7.5	Trade Unions	136
5.7.6	Ireland, Colonies and Emigration	136
5.8	Conclusions	138
6	Marshall's World in His Correspondence	139
6.1	Whitaker's Edition of Marshall's Correspondence	140
6.2	The Official Papers: A Supplement	143
6.3	Marshall the Man	145
6.4	Letters as Evidence	149
6.5	Diaries as Evidence	150
6.6	The Marriage	152
6.7	Marshall and his Contemporaries	153
6.7.1	J.N.Keynes	153
6.7.2	Cunningham	154
6.7.3	Ashley	155
6.7.4	Jevons	156
6.7.5	Foxwell	158
6.7.6	Edgeworth	162
6.7.7	Bohm-Bawerk	163
6.8	Analytics	164
6.8.1	Rent	164
6.8.2	Mathematics and Methodology	165
6.9	The Educationist	167
6.9.1	Degrees for Women	167
6.9.2	The Economics Tripos	169
6.9.3	Bristol	170
6.10	Macmillans	171
6.11	Editorial Matters	172
6.11.1	The Correspondence	172
6.11.2	Official Papers Supplement	175
6.12	Conclusions	177
7	Cannan: Theory and the History of Economic Thought	179
7.1	Biographia	181
7.2	Intellectual Equipment	182
7.3	Production and Distribution	184
7.4	Review of Economic Theory and The Paper Pound	185
7.5	The Paradox of Cannanism	187

7.6	Socialism	191
7.7	Monetary Theory	193
7.8	Malthus and Population	196
7.9	Ricardo and Rent	197
7.10	J.S. Mill	199
7.11	Smith and Turgot	201
7.12	Mandeville and Longfield	202
7.13	Conclusions	203
Friedrich August von Hayek		205
8.1	The Intellectual Canvas	207
8.2	The Scholarly Tradition	208
8.3	Economic Foundations	209
8.4	Subjectivism, Historicism and Scientism	212
8.5	Socialism	215
8.6	Evolution	218
8.7	Legal Institutions	219
8.8	Monetary Economics	220
8.9	Hayek and Keynes	222
8.10	Conclusions	227
Hayek: The Union of Law and Economics		231
9.1	The Nature of Law	235
9.2	Government	240
9.3	Government and Industry	242
9.4	Macroeconomic Policy	244
9.5	The Myth of Social Justice	247
9.6	Distribution	249
9.7	Democracy	250
9.8	Constructivism	251
9.9	Socialism and Planning	254
9.10	Preconceptions and Influence	257
9.11	Conclusions	264
10	Hayek in the History of Economic Thought	267
10.1	Hayek's background	267
10.2	The 1930s: An Outsider	269
10.3	Hayek and Cambridge	271
10.4	Subjectivism	273
10.5	Hayek in the Post-war World	274
10.6	Trade Cycle Theory	278
10.7	The Quantity Theory of Money	282
10.8	Capital Theory	284
10.9	The Inflation-Acceleration Issue	288
10.10	The Falling Price Level	289

10.11	The Role of General Equilibrium	290
10.12	Methodology	291
10.13	Hayek and New Classicism	293
10.14	Overview	296
10.15	Conclusions	301
11	McCulloch and the Literature of Economics	303
11.1	McCulloch as a Collector	304
11.2	The History of Economics	314
11.3	McCulloch's Collections	319
11.3.1	Tracts on Commerce, 1856	319
11.3.2	Tracts on Money, 1856	321
11.3.3	Tracts on Paper Currency and Banking, 1857	323
11.3.4	Tracts on the National Debt, 1857	326
11.3.5	Tracts on Commerce, 1859	328
11.3.6	Miscellaneous Economical Tracts, 1859	330
11.4	Conclusions	334
12	Samuelson: The Theorist as Historian of Economic Thought	335
12.1	Samuelson's Historical Output	336
12.2	Background	338
12.2.1	Education	338
12.2.2	Teachers	339
12.3	Review of the Troops	341
12.4	Samuelson's Approach: Whig History	345
12.5	Samuelson and Classical Economics	347
12.5.1	Adam Smith	348
12.5.2	Ricardo	349
12.5.3	Thunen	350
12.5.4	The Canonical Model	351
12.5.5	Machinery	352
12.5.6	The Classical 'Fallacy'	352
12.6	Marx	353
12.7	Keynes	357
12.8	Short Essays	359
12.9	• <i>Foundations and Economics</i>	360
12.10	Conclusions	361
	<i>Bibliography</i>	365
	<i>Index</i>	417