

THE SEPARATION
OF POWERS IN THE
CONTEMPORARY
CONSTITUTION

JUDICIAL COMPETENCE AND
INDEPENDENCE IN THE
UNITED KINGDOM

ROGER MASTERMAN



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

CONTENTS

Acknowledgements page xi

Table of cases **xii**

Introduction 1

The contemporary separation of powers 1

PA RT I Separation of powers, the Human Rights Act and the European Convention on Human Rights 7

- 1 A doctrine of uncertain scope and application 9
 - The meaning(s) and aim(s) of separation of powers 9
 - Separation of powers in the United Kingdom constitution 16
 - The supremacy of Parliament 20
 - "Theory, as usual, followed upon fact...' 21
 - A relationship of equal branches? 22
 - A descriptive, or normative, device? 24
 - The centrality of judicial independence 26
 - The contemporary separation of powers 31
- 2 The Human Rights Act 1998 and the separation of powers 33
 - Introduction 33
 - Rights as questions of law and/or politics 34
 - The parliamentary bill of rights model 42
 - The Human Rights Act in the United Kingdom constitution 44
 - Intergrating rights concerns into the legislative process 46
 - Interpretations and declarations of incompatibility 48
 - Separation of powers at the macro-level: an inter-institutional dialogue on rights? 50
 - Strong form review by stealth? 52
 - Operating in the shadow of Strasbourg 54
 - The separation of powers implications of the dialogic model 56

3	The Strasbourg influence	60	
	Introduction	60	
	The standard of review and requirement of proportionate interference	63	
	The inadequacy of <i>Wednesbury</i> review	65	
	Proportionate interference	66	
	The Strasbourg jurisprudence on separated governmental functions		70
	Executive involvement in 'judicial' decisions - sentencing		74
	Judicial review of 'administrative' decisions		76
	The Strasbourg jurisprudence on separated institutions		78
	An independent and impartial tribunal		79
	The circumstantial approach to impartiality		80
	The strict separation approach to impartiality		82
	Conclusion	84	
	PART II Judicial engagement with the 'political' branches	87	
4	Justiciability	89	
	The extended range of review	89	
	The justiciability of the Convention rights	90	
	Public resources	93	
	National security	96	
	'High policy' and prerogative powers	99	
	Deployment of the armed forces	100	
	Foreign relations and the power to enter into treaties		101
	The withering of non-justiciability doctrines	103	
	Towards legislative review?	105	
	Conclusion	113	
5	Deference and proportionality	115	
	Introduction	115	
	Deference	116	
	Deference or a margin of appreciation?	117	
	Constraining judicial power under a statutory bill of rights		119
	Deference under the Human Rights Act	121	
	'. . .servility, or perhaps gracious concession'?	123	
	A fig leaf for non-justiciability?	125	
	An autonomous or an integrated concept?	128	
	Proportionality and the intensity of review	129	
	The structure of proportionality review	132	
	The integration of proportionality and deference	135	
	Proportionality, legitimacy and merits review	139	
	Conclusion	141	

PART III The creative powers of courts 143

Statutory interpretation and declarations of incompatibility	145
Introduction	145
The judge as law-maker	146
Interpretative latitude under the Human Rights Act	151
Interpretative law-making on the Human Rights Act model	154
A power of invalidation through interpretation?	156
Implied terms and additional words	160
Deference to the legislature and the limitations of judicial interpretation	163
Democratic dialogue in practice: parliamentary and executive responses to incompatibility	168
Conclusion	176

Developing the common law and the meaning of 'the Convention rights' 181

Introduction	181
The incremental nature of common law development	181
The Human Rights Act and law-making at common law	183
The transformative potential of models of horizontality	183
The modification of breach of confidence	186
Towards directly effective rights to privacy and expression at common law?	189
The meaning and application of 'the Convention rights'	191
'The Convention rights' in domestic law	192
The scope for creative judicial interpretation of 'the Convention rights'	199
Conclusion	202

PART iv The separation of the judicial branch 205

The independence of the judiciary	207
Introduction	207
The institutional independence of the judiciary	208
The distinction between institutional and individual independence	208
The pressure for increased institutional autonomy	212
The office of Lord Chancellor	214
The Lords of Appeal in Ordinary	216
Structural independence secured? The Constitutional Reform Act 2005	219
Independence of the executive	221
Independence of the legislature	225

CONTENTS

Independence, legitimacy and the separation of functions	227
The emergence of a separation of powers jurisprudence?	229
Asserting the division between legislator and judge: procedural fairness at common law	232
Endorsing the Convention's circumstantial approach	232
Towards a 'strict' separation of functions at common law?	236
The reach of separation by fair process	239
Towards a constitutionally separate judicial branch?	242
Towards constitutional separation	245
Descriptive or substantive principles of separation?	245
<i>Select bibliography</i>	254
<i>Index</i>	267