

# **Human Resource Management, Work Systems and Performance: A Theoretical-Empirical Approach**

**Human Resource Management,  
Arbeitsplaatsenstructuur en Prestatie van de Organisatie:  
een Theoretisch-Empirische Benadering**

PROEFSCHRIFT

Ter verkrijging van de graad van doctor  
aan de Erasmus Universiteit te Rotterdam  
op gezag van de Rector Magnificus  
Prof.dr.ir. J.H. van Bommel  
en volgens besluit van het College voor Promoties

De openbare verdediging zal plaatsvinden op  
Donderdag 13 juni 2002 om 13.30 uur

door

Jean-Paul Petrus Elwin Fulco Boselie  
geboren te 's-Hertogenbosch

# Table of Contents

## Voorwoord (Preface in Dutch)

<b>1</b>	<b>Introduction</b>	<b>1</b>
1.1	Introduction	1
1.2	Research Question	2
1.3	Theory	3
1.4	Methodology	3
1.5	Goals	5
1.6	Relevance	5
1.7	Overview of Content	6
<b>2</b>	<b>The Nature of Human Resource Management</b>	<b>9</b>
2.1	Introduction	9
2.2	A Historical Overview	9
2.3	Human Resource Management versus Personnel Management	14
2.4	The Harvard and Michigan Approach of HRM	17
2.5	Theories in the Field of Human Resource Management	20
2.6	Definitions of HRM	26
2.7	Conclusion	28
<b>3</b>	<b>HRM from a Management Control Perspective</b>	<b>31</b>
3.1	Introduction	31
3.2	Management Control Theory	32
3.3	Management Control and a System Approach	34
3.4	Control and Commitment Human Resource Systems	36
3.5	Commitment versus Control	39
3.6	Conclusion	42
<b>4</b>	<b>Human Resource Management and Performance: Lessons from the Netherlands</b>	<b>45</b>
4.1	Introduction	45
4.2	Sustained Competitive Advantage	45
4.3	Categorizing Theories on HRM and Performance	47
4.4	HRM and Performance: existing conceptual models	49
4.5	HRM and Performance: what has been achieved up till now?	51
4.6	Prior Empirical Research from the USA and UK	52
4.7	Empirical Results from the Netherlands	54
4.8	Lessons Learned	56
4.8.1	<i>New Institutionalism</i>	56
4.8.2	<i>Limitations to freedom and leeway</i>	59
4.8.3	<i>Industrial relations and HRM: a network analysis</i>	60
4.9	A Multiple Dimensional Performance Construct	60
4.10	Conclusion	64

<b>5</b>	<b>Conceptual Model and Hypotheses</b>	<b>67</b>
5.1	Introduction	67
5.2	Conceptual Model	67
5.3	Hypotheses	71
5.4	Conclusion	75
<b>6</b>	<b>Research Design</b>	<b>77</b>
6.1	Introduction	77
6.2	Measurement of Control and Commitment HR Practices	77
6.3	Measurement of Performance	80
6.4	Measurement of Institutional Mechanisms	82
6.5	Measurement of Contingencies	83
6.6	Exploring Possible Research Designs	85
6.6.1	<i>Comparison of organizations within one sector</i>	86
6.6.2	<i>Comparison of organizations from different sectors</i>	86
6.6.3	<i>Comparison of units within one organization</i>	86
6.6.4	<i>Comparison of employee groups</i>	87
6.6.5	<i>Comparison of employees within one group</i>	87
6.7	Research Design	87
6.8	Process and Content	90
6.9	Data Collection Method	92
6.9.1	<i>The survey</i>	92
6.9.2	<i>The case studies</i>	94
6.10	Conclusion	96
<b>7</b>	<b>Empirical Results on HRM and Performance in the Netherlands</b>	<b>97</b>
7.1	Introduction	97
7.2	Sectoral Information on Hotels, Local Governments and Hospitals	97
7.2.1	<i>Hotels</i>	97
7.2.2	<i>Local governments</i>	98
7.2.3	<i>Hospitals</i>	98
7.3	Descriptive Statistics of the Participating Branches	99
7.4	Data Reduction	105
7.4.1	<i>Data reduction of control versus commitment HR systems</i>	105
7.4.2	<i>Data reduction of coercive mechanisms</i>	108
7.4.3	<i>Data reduction of normative mechanisms</i>	109
7.5	Correlations	110
7.6	T-tests and Regression Analysis	113
7.7	Conclusion	122

<b>8</b>	<b>Case Study Research</b>	<b>125</b>
8.1	Introduction	125
8.2	Hotel Descriptives	126
8.2.1	<i>Hotel X</i>	127
X.2.2	<i>Hotel Y</i>	128
8.2.3	<i>Hotel Z</i>	129
8.3	Local Governments Descriptives	129
8.3.1	<i>Local government X</i>	129
8.3.2	<i>Local government Y</i>	131
8.4	Hospital Descriptives	133
8.4.1	<i>Hospital X</i>	133
8.4.2	<i>Hospital Y</i>	135
8.5	Implications for HRM and Performance	136
8.5.1	<i>Comparison of hotels</i>	136
8.5.2	<i>Comparison of local governments</i>	137
8.5.3	<i>Comparison of hospitals</i>	137
K.5.4	<i>Comparison of sectors</i>	138
8.6	Conclusion	140
<b>9</b>	<b>Discussion</b>	<b>145</b>
9.1	Introduction	145
9.2	Sustained Competitive Advantage in a Highly Institutionalized Context	145
9.3	The Impact of Institutionalization on International Competitiveness	146
9.4	Best Practices versus Best Fit	147
9.5	HRM Fit	148
9.6	Theoretical Considerations	149
9.7	Lack of Data	149
9.8	Significance and Relevance of Results	150
9.10	Recommendations for Future Research	150
9.11	Recommendations for Practitioners	153
<b>10</b>	<b>Executive Summary</b>	<b>157</b>
10.1	Introduction	157
10.2	Human Resource Management and Work Systems	157
10.3	HRM and Performance in the Netherlands	158
10.4	Conceptual Model	158
10.5	Research Design	159
10.6	The Survey	159
10.7	The Case Studies	160
10.8	Limitations	161
10.9	Conclusion	161
	<b>References</b>	<b>163</b>
	<b>Appendices</b>	<b>180</b>
	<b>Samenvatting (summary in Dutch)</b>	<b>197</b>