

IMPROVING WTO DISPUTE SETTLEMENT  
PROCEDURES

ISSUES AND LESSONS FROM THE PRACTICE  
OF OTHER INTERNATIONAL COURTS  
AND TRIBUNALS

*edited by*

*Friedl Weiss*

CAMERON  
MAY

I N T E R N A T I O N A L L A W & P O L I T I C S

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

### Acknowledgements

#### SECTION I: GATT AND WTO DISPUTE SETTLEMENT: BACKGROUND, CONTEXTUAL CONCEPTS, COMPARATIVE LESSONS, AND ALTERNATIVE DISPUTE RESOLUTION

#### CHAPTER 1: **Improving WTO Procedural Law. Problems and Lessons from the Practice of other International Courts and Tribunals** 27

*By Friedl Weiss*

I.	Preliminary Remarks	17
	A. Seattle <i>et Ap res</i>	1.7
	B. The Amsterdam Conference	17
II.	Of Contextual Concepts	18
	A. Of Treaties	18
	B. Of Economic Disputes	19
	C. Of Problems Concerning the Application of the Law	19
III.	Overcoming the GATT Legacy of Dispute Settlement	20
	A. The GATT System of Dispute Settlement	20
	B. The Velvet WTO Revolution in the Process of Dispute Settlement	22
IV.	The way forward: Lessons and their Absence	23
	A. General Approach	23
	B. The Structure and Main Contents of the Book	24

#### CHAPTER 2: **Alternative Dispute Resolution-Lessons for the WTO ?** 27

*By Ernst-LUrich Petersmann*

I.	Introduction	27
II.	Alternative Dispute Resolution in Private and Public International Law	28
III.	Alternative Dispute Resolution in GATT and the WTO: The Example of the Disputes Over the EC's Import Restrictions on Bananas	3 3
IV.	Alternative Dispute Resolution in International Environmental Law: Why are so many "En vironmen tal Disputes Submitted to GATT and the WTO?	38

**SECTION II: THE PRE-LITIGATION STAGE IN THE WTO DISPUTE  
SETTLEMENT PROCEDURE AND IN THE EC INFRINGEMENT  
PROCEDURE**

**CHAPTER 3: Scope of Jurisdiction in GATT/WTO Dispute Settlement:  
Consultations and Panel Requests** 45

*By Bernhard fansen, Brussels*

**CHAPTER 4: Role and Efficacy of the EC Commission's Reasoned Opin-  
ion in Article 169/170 Proceedings** 55

*By K.P.E. Lasok*

I. Introduction	55
II. The Reasoned Opinion in Proceedings under Article 169	56
III. The Reasoned Opinion in Proceedings under Article 170	58
IV. The Reasoned Opinion in the Context of Dispute Settlement	58
V. Conclusions	63

**CHAPTER 5: The Pre-litigation Stage in the WTO Dispute Settlement Pro-  
cedure and in the EC Infringement Procedure** 67

*By P. ieter-Jcm Kuijper*

**SECTION III: PARTIES, CLAIMS, AND THIRD PARTY INTERVENTION  
IN THE WTO DISPUTE SETTLEMENT PROCEDURE AND IN  
PROCEDURES BEFORE THE EC AND CFI**

**CHAPTER 6: Joinder of Parties and Third Party Intervention in WTO Dis-  
pute Settlement** 77

*By Allan Rosas*

I. Introduction	77
II. Multiple Complaints	78
III. Multiple Defendants	81
IV. The Rights of Third Parties	83
V. Third Parties in Arbitration Procedures	85
VI. Conclusions	86

**CHAPTER 7: Joinder of Actions, Submission of Observations in References for Preliminary Rulings, and Intervention by Member States, Community Institutions, and Any Other Person in ECJ Proceedings' 89**

*By John A. Usher*

I:	Introduction	89
II.:	Joinder of Actions	89
III.	Observations in References for Preliminary Rulings	92
A.	General Issues	92
B.	Parlies	93
C.	MemberStates	94
D.	Community Institutions	94
E.	EFTA Surveillance Authority and EEA States	96
IV.	Intervention	97
A.	The Concept of Intervention	97
B.	Who May Intervene?	97
C.	Supporting the Submissions	100
D.	Relationship to Observations in Preliminary Rulings	202
E.	Timing of the Application	103
F.	Consequences of Intervention	104
G.	Confidentiality	106
V.	Third Party Proceedings	106
VI.	Conclusions	109

**CHAPTER 8: Intervention before the International Court of Justice 111**

*By Christine Chinkin*

**SECTION IV: STANDARDS OF PROCEDURE, SUBMISSIONS ON POINTS OF FACT AND LAW IN WTO, ECJ AND ICJ PROCEEDINGS**

**CHAPTER 9: Written and Oral Submissions in WTO Dispute Settlement 121**

*By Eric L. White*

I.	Introduction	222
II.	Description of the Legal Provisions	122
III.	Description of the Practice	222

IV. Open Issues and Proposals for Reform	225
A. Preliminary Issues	225
B. Amicus Curiae Briefs	226
C. Business Confidential Information	228
V. Conclusion	230
Appendix 3-Working Procedures	131

**CHAPTER 10: Oral Procedures in the Community Courts** 135  
*By Richard Plender*

I. Introduction	235
II. Preparation for the Hearing	235
III. Date of the Hearing	138
IV. The Report for the Hearing	142
V. The Conduct of the Hearing	242
VI. Oral Testimony	247
VII. Written Documents Adduced at or after the Hearing	252
VIII. Exclusion of the Public	257
IX. Reopening of the Oral Procedure	160
X. Records of Hearings	262
XI. Dispensing with Oral Hearings	264

**CHAPTER 11: Submissions on Points of Fact and Law: Written and Oral Pleadings Before the International Court of Justice** 175  
*By Daniel Bethlehem*

I. Introduction	275
II. The Relevance of the ICJ as a Comparator for WTO Dispute Settlement	275
III. Pleadings Before the ICJ and WTO	180
A. Pleadings as an Act of State	180
B. The Form and Content of Pleadings	282
IV. Pleading Facts and Law	186
V. Concluding Remarks	292

SECTION V: EVIDENCE, STANDARD AND BURDEN OF PROOF, AND  
USE OF EXPERTS IN WTO, ECJ AND ICJ  
PROCEEDINGS

**CHAPTER 12: GATT/WTO Panels Between Recording and Finding Facts:  
Issues of Due Process, Evidence, Burden of Proof, and Standard of Review in GATT/WTO Dispute Settlement** **195**

*By James Cameron & Stephen J. Orava*

I.	Introduction	195
II.	The Goals and Effectiveness of Dispute Resolution	196
III.	The Role of the Players in Dispute Settlement	199
	A. Dispute Settlement Panel	200
	B. Individual Panelists	201
	C. The Appellate Body	203
	D. The Chair of a Panel	205
	E. The WTO Secretariat	206
	F. The Parties and Third Parties	207
	G. Outside Counsel	208
IV.	The Establishment of Dispute Settlement Panels	220
	A. The Request for Establishment of a Panel	220
	1. Object and Purpose	220
	2. Prevailing Interpretation	222
	3. Consequences of the Prevailing Interpretation	228
	4. Potential Solutions	220
	5. Recommended Approach	222
	B. The Constitution of Panels	223
V.	Evidence	226
	A. Guidance from the DSU	226
	B. Finding Facts in Practice	228
	C. The Distinction Between Fact and Law	230
	D. Remand Authority	231
VI.	Burden of Proof	232
VII.	Standard of Review	236
	A. General Application	236
	B. Deference in Reviewing the Decisions of Domestic Investigating Authorities	238
	C. Deference Under the Article XX Exceptions	240
VIII.	Conclusion	242

**CHAPTER 13: WTO Panels in the Face of Scientific Uncertainty . 243**  
*By Theofanis Christoforou*

I.	Introduction	243
II.	Note on the History of GATT and WTO Rules Applicable to Scientific Trade Disputes	244
	A. GATT 47	244
	B. WTO	245
III.	Analysis of Relevant WTO Provisions	246
	A. What Evidence is Admissible	246
	B. Selection and Use of Scientific Experts	246
IV.	Some Critical Comments and Suggestions on How to Improve the WTO System of Selecting and Using Scientific Experts	253
	A. Discovering Scientific Truth Versus Identifying Plausible Scientific Alternatives	253
	B. Individual Experts Versus Expert Review Groups	255
	C. Scientific Evidence and Standards of Review	260
V.	Conclusions	263

**CHAPTER 14: Evidence, Standard and Burden of Proof and the Use of Experts in Procedure before the Luxembourg Courts 265**  
*By Jacqueline MacLennan*

I.	Introduction	265
II.	"Burden of Proof" in the Luxembourg Courts	266
III.	Standard of Proof in the Luxembourg Courts	268
IV.	The Approach to Evidence of the Luxembourg Courts	269
V.	Summary of Rules on Evidence of the Luxembourg Courts	272
VI.	Evidence brought forward by the Parties	73
VII.	Evidence Ordered by the Courts	274
	A. Formal Provisions	274
	B. Practice of the Courts	277
	C. Grounds on which Preparatory Measures of Inquiry are Likely to be Ordered	278
	D. Grounds for Non Production of Evidence *	279
VIII.	The Use of Witnesses and Expert Witnesses in the Luxembourg Courts	280
	A. Expert Evidence Brought Forward by the Parties	282
	B. Expert Evidence Requested by the Courts	283
IX.	Conclusions and Some Recommendations	286

**CHAPTER 15: Burden of Proof and Evidence before the ICJ** **289**  
*By Sir Arthur Watts*

I. Introduction	289
II. The Burden of Proof	292
III. Evidence Adduced by the Parties	295
IV. Evidence Available on the Court's Initiative	300

**SECTION VI: APPEALS IN THE WTO DISPUTE SETTLEMENT  
PROCEDURE AND FROM THE CFI TO THE ECJ**

**CHAPTER 16: Appellate Review in WTO Dispute Settlement** **305**  
*By Peter Van den Bossche*

I. -Introduction	305
II. The Standing Appellate Body	305
III. Scope of Appellate Review	308
IV. Main Features of WTO Appellate Review	309
V. Appellate Review Process	321
VI. Appellate Review from 1996 to 2000	316
VII. Conclusion	329

**CHAPTER 17: Fact and Law in Pleadings Before the WTO Appellate  
Body** **321**  
*By Marco Bronckers & Natalie McNeils*

I. Introduction	322
II. When Should the WTO Appellate Body Intervene to Correct an Error of Fact?	321
A. An Objective Assessment of the Facts	322
B. Too High a Standard?	323
C. Questions of Fact in Other Legal Systems	323
D. The Canada -Periodicals Case	324
E. Conclusions on the Eirst Question	326

III.	How Does One Distinguish Between a Question of Law and a Question of Fact?	326
A.	An Example: 'Directly Competitive or Substitutable' Products	326
B.	The Korea - Alcoholic Beverages Case	327
C.	The Application of Law to the Facts	329
D.	Ensuring Uniformity	330
v E.	The Appellate Body's Stance	332
F.	Conclusions on the Second Question	332
IV.	Final. Remarks	332

**CHAPTER 18: Judicial Review by the Court of Justice of the European Communities in Appeals, Ten Years after the Court of First Instance Came into Being** 335

*By Melchior Wathelet*

I.	The Requirement for Admissibility of an Appeal	338
A.	Decisions of the Court of First Instance against which Appeal lies	338
B.	Persons Who May Bring an Appeal	339
C.	Time-Limits and Procedure	339
D.	Applications for Annulment	340
1.	Findings of the Court of First Instance which have been Subject to Review by the Court of Justice	342
i.	Finding of fact	343
ii.	Characterisation of the facts	348
iii.	The Consequences of the rule of law	352
2.	Repetition of the Same Pleas in Law and Arguments Presented at First Instance	352
3.	New Pleas in Law	352
4.	Subsidiary Grounds of the Court of First Instance and Correction of Erroneous Grounds	353
II.	The Case-Law of the Court of Justice in Appeal Cases: Its Contribution to Development of Community Law	356
A.	The Admissibility of Applications for Annulment by Individuals	356
B.	The Scope of the Obligation to give a Statement of Reasons	362
C.	The Requirement that Acts Adopted by the Commission be Authenticated	362
D.	The Principle of Procedural Promptitude	364
III.	Conclusions	365

SECTION VII: REMEDIES IN THE WTO DISPUTE SETTLEMENT  
PROCEDURE AND IN ICJ CASES

**CHAPTER 19: Broadening the Scope of Remedies in WTO Dispute Settlement** 369

*By Robert E. Hudec*

I.	Introduction	369
II.	The Underlying Political Commitment	369
	A. Legal Enforcement under GATT	369
	B. Adoption of the DSU	372
III.	Broadening the Remedies	376
	A. The Order to Comply	377
	B. Remedies for Past Wrongs	382
	C. The Follow-up to Recommendations: The Two Remedies	386
	D. The Retaliation Remedy	386
	E. Deadlines and Other Follow-up Procedures	393
	F. WTO Remedies in Review	399

**CHAPTER 20: Types of Remedies in ICJ cases: Lessons for the WTO? 401**

*By Christine Gray*

I.	Introduction	402
II.	Frameworks	402
III.	The Practice of the ICJ on Remedies: Types of Remedies	402
IV.	Declaratory Judgments	406
V.	Compensation or Performance in the WTO	412
VI.	Conciliation	422

THE GLOSSARY: KEY ABBREVIATIONS	427
---------------------------------	-----

INDEX	429
-------	-----

LIST OF CONTRIBUTORS	429
----------------------	-----