

The Sarbanes-Oxley Debacle What We've Learned; How to Fix It

Henry N. Butler and Larry E. Ribstein

The AEI Press

Publisher for the American Enterprise Institute
WASHINGTON, D. C.

2006

Contents

FOREWORD, <i>Christopher DeMuth</i>	ix
INTRODUCTION	1
1. FROM ENRON TO SOX: SHOOT FIRST, ASK QUESTIONS LATER	7
Enron	7
<i>The Post-Enron Regulatory Panic</i>	8
<i>Mounting Reports of Corporate Wrongdoing</i>	9
<i>The Stock Market Decline</i>	10
<i>The News Media's Role</i>	10
<i>The Lack of Effective Political Opposition by Probusiness Interests</i>	11
<i>The Role of Policy Entrepreneurs</i>	16
<i>Populism and Political Entrepreneurs</i>	18
<i>The Boom-Bust Regulatory Cycle</i>	19
<i>All Action, No Talk</i>	20
The Sarbanes-Oxley Act	20
<i>Increased Internal Monitoring</i>	21
<i>Gatekeeper Regulation</i>	21
<i>More Disclosure</i>	21
<i>Regulation of Insider Misconduct</i>	22
<i>Regulating Securities Analysts</i>	22
2. WHAT SHAREHOLDERS WANT—THE OPTIMAL AMOUNT OF FRAUD	23
3. IMAGINING A WORLD WITHOUT SOX Capital Market Forces	26

Market Monitoring	28
Reputations and Signaling	30
Shareholder Monitoring	32
State and International Competition	33
Regulation by Stock Exchanges and Other Private Institutions	35

4. THE COSTS OF SOX	37
Direct Compliance Costs	38
Section 404 Internal Controls Disclosures and Attestation	38
Audit Committee Independence	42
Managing in the Shadow of SOX	43
Section 404 Internal Controls	44
Impact on Managerial Risk-Taking: Independent Directors	45
Constraining Executive Compensation: Insider Loan Prohibitions	46
Lawyer Monitoring	47
Monitoring by Corporate Executives	49
Building the Paper Trail	49
Whistleblowing	49
Opportunity Costs of SOX	50
Diversion of Managerial Talent	50
From Entrepreneurs to Hall Monitors	51
Reducing Smaller Firms' Access to Public Capital Markets	53
Cutting Off Information	55
Taking the Informed Out of the Loop	55
Reducing Trust	56
Inducing Cover-Ups	57
Perverse Incentives and Undoing Efficient Risk-Bearing	58
Criminalization of Corporate Agency Costs	60
The Folly of Criminalizing Corporate Agency Costs	60
Weakening the Moral Force of the Criminal Law	61
SOX in the Context of Current Prosecutor Practices	62
Auditor Regulation	63

Regulation of Analyst Conflicts	64
Crippling the "Genius" of American Corporate Law	65
Chasing Away Foreign Firms	71
5. THE LITIGATION TIME BOMB	75
A Review of Liability Threats under SOX	75
Using 20/20 Hindsight to Assess Risk	77
Litigators' Incentives	79
The Potential for Blackmail	79
What Can Shareholders Do about the Time Bomb?	81
6. THE BOTTOM LINE: HAS SOX BEEN WORTH IT?	82
7. IMMEDIATE POLICY IMPLICATIONS	86
Defuse the Litigation Time Bomb	87
Allow Opt-Outs or Opt-Ins	88
Foreign Firms	90
Exempt Small Corporations	91
Remove Criminal Penalties	92
Limit Internet Controls Reporting	93
Leave Internal Governance to State Law	93
8. THE FUTURE: REGULATORY HUBRIS OR GREATER HUMILITY?	94
Periodic Review and Sunset Provisions	96
Certification and Opt-Out Approaches	97
Nuanced Regulation	97
Investor Education	98
Deregulation	98
CONCLUSION	100
NOTES	103
ABOUT THE AUTHORS	129
INDEX	131