

Open Issues in European Central Banking

Lorenzo Bini Smaghi
Director for International Affairs
Italian Treasury
Rome

and

Daniel Gros
Deputy Director
Centre for European Policy Studies
Brussels



in association with
THE CENTRE FOR EUROPEAN POLICY STUDIES

CONTENTS

<i>Foreword</i>	ix
Introduction	1
1. Who is in charge of the Eurosystem?	5
Introduction	5
1.1. The decision-making process	6
What the treaty states (and what it doesn't state)	6
The balance of power	9
The risks of a weak ECB	11
1.2. Implementation	17
The interpretation of the treaty	17
The underlying reasons for decentralization	20
The consequences of decentralization	23
1.3. Is (de)centralization sustainable?	25
2. Who takes care of financial stability in Europe?	29
Introduction	29
2.1. Preventing financial crises	30
The instruments	30
Financial regulation in the EU	31
Prudential supervision	35
2.2. Financial crisis management	40
Solvency and liquidity crises	40
Bailing out banks in monetary union	41
The lender-of-last-resort in monetary union	45
Who (in the Eurosystem) should lend in the last resort?	49
2.3. Should the Eurosystem be granted supervisory powers?	51
Conclusions	55
Annex 2.1. Does prudential supervision interfere with monetary policy?	58

3. Are European central banks over-capitalized?	67
Introduction	67
3.1. The Eurosystem and its components	68
3.2. A comparative G-3 perspective	70
Liabilities and size: A comparison with the US and Japan	70
The composition of the asset side: Foreign exchange assets	73
Balance sheet size: Does it matter?	76
3.3. Cleaning up the Eurosystem balance sheet	80
A lean balance sheet	80
Excess foreign exchange reserves?	82
Conclusions	84
Annex 3.1. An example of simplicity: The allocation of assets and returns in the Federal Reserve System	86
Annex 3.2. Estimating the revaluation reserves using a VaR approach	88
4. Who gets the seigniorage?	94
Introduction	94
4.1. What is seigniorage?	95
4.2. The treaty's provisions	96
4.3. The problems	98
4.4. The agreed non-solution	103
4.5. Alternative approaches to phasing-in	105
Conclusions	108
Annex 4.1. Legal Issues	111
Annex 4.2. The distribution of seigniorage in the context of the fiscal constitution of the EU	112

5. How can the Eurosystem become (and remain) independent?...	118
Introduction	118
5.1. The independence provided by the treaty	120
Statutory independence	120
Functional independence	122
Economic independence	123
Personal independence	124
5.2. Measuring the ECB's independence against that of other central banks	125
5.3. The limits of measurement	129
5.4. Potential threats to the ECB's independence	132
The exchange rate regime	132
NCBs' activities 'outside' the ESCB	136
Conclusions	138
6. ...and accountable?	144
Introduction	144
6.1. Democratic control, independence and accountability	144
6.2. The economics of central bank accountability	147
6.3. How to assess central bank accountability?	151
6.4. How accountable is the ECB?	157
Conclusions	166
7. 3 X 2 Concrete Proposals for Strengthening the Eurosystem	171
Introduction	171
7.1. Transform the Eurosystem into a true European Central Bank	171
7.2. Clarify who is responsible for financial stability	172
7.3. Clarify financial relationships within the Eurosystem	174

Annexes

I. Chapters 2 and 3 of Title VI on Economic and Monetary Policy of the Treaty on European Union	177
II. Protocol (No. 3) on the Statute of the European System of Central Banks and of the European Central Bank	186
<i>Index</i>	205
<i>Names Index</i>	208

List of Tables and Figures**Tables**

1.1	Staff levels at the NCBs and the ECB, 1998	10
1.2	Eurozone policy indicators	15
1.3	The Eurosystem's monetary policy operations	18
1.4	Operational steps in the tender procedure	19
2.1	EU bank assets, 1996 (percentage of total assets)	34
2.A.1	Results of regressions	61
3.1	Central bank balance sheets (liability side)	71
3.2	Index of central bank capitalization	72
3.3	The Eurosystem's balance sheet	81
4.1	Basic data for seigniorage distribution in EMU	100
5.1	Ranking of central bank independence	127
6.1	Accountability criteria	153

Figures

3.1	Ratios of foreign assets and gold over monetary base	74
3.2	Average inflation and capitalization indicator	77
3.3	Indicator of central bank independence and lean capitalization	78
4.1	The ratio of currency in circulation to GDP	102
4.A.1	The difference between GNP ratios and the ECB capital key	114