

Sanita van Wyk

# The Impact of Climate Change Law on the Principle of State Sovereignty over Natural Resources



**Nomos**



UNIVERSITEIT  
STELLENBOSCH  
UNIVERSITY



**Konrad  
Adenauer  
Stiftung**

# Inhaltsverzeichnis

List of Abbreviations	15
CHAPTER 1: Introduction	23
1 1 Background to research question	23
1 2 Research question	26
1 3 Hypotheses	27
1 4 Research objectives and assumptions	27
1 5 Research design and methodology	28
1 6 Chapter overview	29
CHAPTER 2: The principle of sovereignty over natural resources	33
2 1 Introduction	33
2 2 Foundation of the principle of sovereignty over natural resources	33
2 3 Legal nature of the principle of sovereignty over natural resources	38
2 4 Objects of the principle of sovereignty over natural resources	46
2 4 1 Identifying key terminology	46
2 4 2 Natural resources	49
2 4 2 1 Definition of natural resources	49
2 4 2 2 Possibility of climate as a natural resource	52
2 4 2 3 Classification of natural resources	54
2 4 2 3 1 Classifying natural resources according to renewability and non-renewability	54
2 4 2 3 2 Classifying natural resources according to location	55
2 4 3 Natural wealth	60
2 4 4 Economic activities	61

2 5	Subjects of the principle of sovereignty over natural resources	62
2 5 1	Ambiguity in UNGA resolutions and instruments of international law	62
2 5 1 1	Introduction	62
2 5 1 2	UNGA resolutions	62
2 5 1 3	Instruments of international law	66
2 5 2	States as the subjects of the principle of sovereignty over natural resources	70
2 5 2 1	Meaning of states	70
2 5 2 2	Permanency as an attribute of state sovereignty	73
2 5 2 3	State sovereignty	76
2 5 2 3 1	Introduction	76
2 5 2 3 2	Brief overview of the development of sovereignty	77
2 5 2 3 3	International environmental law as a limitation of sovereignty	85
i	Introduction	85
ii	Continued existence of sovereignty	87
iii	Denial or criticism of sovereignty	88
iv	Erosion of sovereignty	89
v	The principle of sovereignty over natural resources and global climate justice	95
2 5 3	People as the subjects of sovereignty over natural resources	98
2 5 3 1	Meaning of people	98
2 5 4	Final note on the subjects of the principle of sovereignty over natural resources	101
2 6	Reinterpreting and reconfiguring the principle of sovereignty over natural resources as a means to combat climate change	103
2 7	Conclusion	105
CHAPTER 3: The international legal climate change regime and the question of whether the gravity of climate change warrants a reinterpretation and reconfiguration of the principle of sovereignty over natural resources		107
3 1	Introduction	107

3 2	Nexus between climate change and the principle of sovereignty over natural resources	109
3 3	Defining the international legal climate change regime	111
3 3 1	Definition of climate change	111
3 3 2	Definition of regime	113
3 4	Scientific basis of climate change: linking activity in terms of sovereignty over natural resources with greenhouse gas emissions	114
3 4 1	Link between greenhouse gas emissions and climate change	114
3 4 2	Anthropocentric activity in terms of sovereignty over natural resources and the resulting increase in a specific greenhouse gas emission	117
3 4 2 1	Carbon dioxide and anthropocentric activity	117
3 4 2 2	Methane and anthropocentric activity	119
3 4 2 3	Nitrous oxide and anthropocentric activity	119
3 4 2 4	Fluorinated gases and anthropocentric activity	120
3 5	Illustrating the gravity of climate change in terms of its environmental, social and economic impacts on the well-being of people	121
3 5 1	Introduction	121
3 5 2	Understanding the term ‘well-being’	122
3 5 3	Well-being of people as an objective of the international legal climate change regime and as an objective of the principle of sovereignty over natural resources	124
3 5 4	Environmental effects of climate change on the well-being of people	126
3 5 5	Social effects of climate change on the well-being of people	129
3 5 6	Economic effects of climate change on the well being of people	132
3 6	Development of the international legal climate change regime: pre-United Nations Framework Convention on Climate Change	136
3 6 1	Introduction	136

3 6 2	The emergence of climate change as an intergovernmental issue and the international legal climate change regime as a state-centric regime	137
3 6 3	Targets and timetables negotiations	141
3 7	The United Nations Framework Convention on Climate Change as the cornerstone of the international legal climate change regime and the embedding of the principle of sovereignty over natural resources	143
3 7 1	Introduction to the United Nations Framework Convention on Climate Change	143
3 7 2	Principles of the international legal climate change regime	147
3 7 2 1	Principle of equity	147
3 7 2 2	Principle of common but differentiated responsibility	154
3 7 2 2 1	The principle	154
3 7 2 2 2	The problem with the principle of common but differentiated responsibility as illustrated by the example of China and the United States of America	160
3 7 2 3	Precautionary principle	164
3 7 2 4	Polluter-pays principle	167
3 7 2 5	Principle of sustainable development	169
3 7 3	Conference of the parties	173
3 7 4	Response to climate change	180
3 7 4 1	Mitigation of climate change	180
3 7 4 1 1	Introduction	180
3 7 4 1 2	Example of a mitigation strategy: United Nations Programme on Reducing Emissions from Deforestation and Forest Degradation in Developing Countries	182
3 7 4 2	Adaptation to climate change	185
3 8	The Kyoto Protocol and the effectiveness of the international legal climate change regime	190
3 8 1	Introduction	190
3 8 2	Market-based mechanisms of the Kyoto Protocol	191
3 8 2 1	Introduction to international emissions trading	191
3 8 2 2	Joint implementation mechanism	194

3 8 2 3	Clean development mechanism	196
3 8 2 4	Registry of Kyoto units acquired through market-based mechanisms	198
3 8 3	Effectiveness of the Kyoto Protocol	199
3 8 3 1	Overall effectiveness of the Kyoto Protocol and the possible movement towards a people-based solution	199
3 8 3 2	Reporting as a component of an effective international legal climate change regime	201
3 8 3 3	State compliance as a component of an effective international legal climate change regime	204
3 8 3 3 1	Compliance provisions in the Kyoto Protocol and the inadequate repercussions of non-compliance	204
3 8 3 3 2	Increasing compliance with the Kyoto Protocol and the principle of sovereignty over natural resources as a negative incentive	206
3 9	The Paris Agreement	210
3 9 1	Introduction	210
3 9 2	Outline of differentiation between countries and nationally determined contributions in the Paris Agreement	211
3 9 3	Market-based mechanism of the Paris Agreement	214
3 9 4	Future outlook on the effectiveness of the Paris Agreement and the position of the principle of sovereignty over natural resources	216
3 10	Conclusion	220
CHAPTER 4: The reinterpretation and reconfiguration of the principle of sovereignty over natural resources and the expansion of the means to combat climate change		223
4 1	Introduction	223

4 2	Rights and duties of states in terms of the principle of sovereignty over natural resources and the impact of climate change	225
4 2 1	Introduction to the rights and duties of states in terms of the principle of sovereignty over natural resources	225
4 2 2	Rights of states in terms of the principle of sovereignty over natural resources and the impact of climate change	227
4 2 2 1	Right to dispose freely of, explore, and exploit natural resources	227
4 2 2 2	Right to exercise effective control over natural resources and the right to receive appropriate compensation	231
4 2 2 3	Right to use natural resources for national development	233
4 2 2 4	Right to manage natural resources according to national environmental policy	235
4 2 2 5	Right to an equitable share in benefits of transboundary natural resources	239
4 2 2 6	Rights pertaining to foreign investment	243
4 2 2 6 1	Introduction to and delineation of rights (and duties) pertaining to foreign investment	243
4 2 2 6 2	Rights pertaining to the regulation and exercise of authority over foreign investment	244
4 2 2 6 3	Rights pertaining to the taking of property and the payment of compensation	248
4 2 2 6 4	Possible right pertaining to the settlement of disputes on the basis of national law	254
4 2 3	Duties of states in terms of the principle of sovereignty over natural resources and the impact of climate change	262
4 2 3 1	Duty to exercise sovereignty over natural resources for national development and the well-being of people	262
4 2 3 2	Duty to cooperate in respect of international development	266
4 2 3 3	Duty of conservation and sustainable use of natural resources	269

4 2 3 4	Duty to share transboundary natural resources equitably	274
4 2 3 5	Duty to respect international law	279
4 2 4	Final remarks on the rights and duties of states in terms of sovereignty over natural resources, and the shift in environmental attitudes owing to the effects of climate change	281
4 2 5	Increased importance of the common concern as an indicator of the growing importance of the duties of states in terms of the principle of sovereignty over natural resources	284
4 3	Reinterpreting and reconfiguring the rights of people in terms of the principle of sovereignty over natural resources	289
4 3 1	Introduction	289
4 3 2	People's rights in terms of the principle of sovereignty over natural resources	292
4 3 2 1	Introduction to people's rights in terms of the principle of sovereignty over natural resources	292
4 3 2 2	Right to economic self-determination	293
4 3 2 3	Human rights and the right to economic self-determination	302
4 3 3	Application of the right to economic self-determination	305
4 3 3 1	Introduction	305
4 3 3 2	Application of economic self-determination by indigenous people	306
4 3 3 3	Growing possibilities of the application of economic self-determination in the context of foreign investment	317
4 4	Expanding the means to combat climate change through people's rights in terms of the principle of sovereignty over natural resources	320
4 4 1	Introduction and initial steps for people-based action in holding states accountable for climate commitments	320
4 4 2	People-based action against the state in terms of the Oslo Principles on Global Climate Change	323
4 4 3	Urgenda case and general movement toward people-based climate change litigation	328
4 5	Conclusion	337



CHAPTER 5: Conclusion	340
5 1 Remarks on the original research objectives and hypotheses	340
5 2 Areas of future research	342
5 3 Chapter summaries and outline of research outcomes	344
5 3 1 Chapter 2: The principle of sovereignty over natural resources	344
5 3 2 Chapter 3: The international legal climate change regime and the question of whether the gravity of climate change warrants a reinterpretation and reconfiguration of the principle of sovereignty over natural resources	345
5 3 3 Chapter 4: The reinterpretation and reconfiguration of the principle of sovereignty over natural resources and the expansion of the means to combat climate change	347
5 4 Recommendations	348
Bibliography	351
Case law	370
International instruments and legislation	371
Seminars, lectures and presentations	374
UNGA resolutions and other resolutions or decisions	374
Online media	376